General Union of Palestinian Women **General Secretariat** 



# Report on The status of women and girls in the State of Palestine

Submitted by: The Non-Governmental and Women Coalition for the Implementation of CEDAW in the Occupied State of Palestine

Submitted to: The Committee on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women-Geneva  $\,$ 

May 2018

# **Contents**

	Introduction	3
	Executive summary	5
	Articles 1-5: Discrimination against Palestinian Women and Girls	9
	Articles (7), (8), (9) and Recommendation (23): Women's Political Participation and Decision -making	
	Article (12): Girls and Women's Health Rights	. 18
	-Articles (15) and (16): Equality before the law and women rights in family and marriage and General Recommendation (21) on equality and family relations:	
	General Recommendations of the Coalition	0 <u>29</u>
A	nnex: Responses to the responses of the State of Palestine	

#### Introduction

This report is submitted by the General Union for Palestinian Women (GUPW), and the non-governmental and women civil society organizations in Palestine. The aim is to clarify the vision of the women of Palestine and their comments on the policies and the official intervention mechanisms adopted by the State of Palestine, as provided in the first official report the state had submitted to the Committee on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women in March 2017. The Palestinian women aspire to achieve their rights in realizing the sovereignty of the independent State of Palestine on the 4<sup>th</sup> of June 1967 borders, with East Jerusalem as its capital, a democratic and secular state for all Palestinians, in which they consolidate their national identity without discrimination based on sex, race, religion, confession or disability, and in which equality and social justice are realized.

We highly appreciate the accession of the State of Palestine to the Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women on 1 April 2014 without any reservations on any of its articles, and the government's promise to accede to CEDAW's Optional Protocol. We also value the commitment of the State of Palestine to fulfill its obligations in accordance with Article (18) of that Convention, by submitting its report to the Committee on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women. We also appreciate the mechanism adopted by the state upon preparing its report through the several consultations it had conducted with the participation of the governmental institutions and civil society organizations.

Since we are keen on the joint national responsibility between us, the national institutions and the state, we are in consensus over the correctness of the information and statistical data mentioned in the State Report, particularly those related to the Israeli violations against the Palestinian society in general and women in particular. We assert our support to all the efforts exerted at the national level to achieve legal and actual equality between men and women, and the intervention mechanisms that aim at building a state of law, gender equality and respect for human rights. We also confirm the information contained in the State Report about the refugee Palestinian women inside Palestine and in the places of refuge and the diaspora. We note the substantial problem in both the State and shadow reports, which include the women inside the State of Palestine, but exclude refugee Palestinian women. This deprives them from the opportunity to present their situation and living conditions in the countries of refuge and exile, which in turn excluded them from their reports to the Committee This led to depriving them from the opportunity to receive international and local protection and aggravating their marginalization and exclusion.

We affirm that we, and the State of Palestine, face major challenges in implementing the Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW), in the wake of the continued Israeli military occupation regime of Palestine for more than fifty years. The occupying state failed to meet its obligations and to implement the agreements signed with the Palestine Liberation Organization (PLO). It failed to comply with neither the International Human Rights Law nor the International Humanitarian Law. It continued committing its systematic colonial settlement policies of

ethnic cleansing, racial segregation "apartheid" and collective punishments, including land and resource confiscation and theft, house demolitions and forcible displacement to expand colonial settlements. Such regime includes building the Apartheid Wall; erecting military checkpoints, the settlers' terrorism and violence against innocent civilians, especially women, under the absolute protection and immunity of the occupation army; assaulting Christian and Islamic holy sites; depriving women from performing their religious rituals because of the policy of Judaization and isolation of the Jerusalem and the full blockade imposed on Gaza Strip since more than 11 years, in addition to executing girls and women, targeting women paramedics that occurred during peaceful protests in Gaza Strip; premeditated murder and execution from point zero of girls under the pretext of suspicions of activities against the Occupation Army; targeted extrajudicial killings and detaining bodies of martyrs. It also includes the continued illegal blockade and the military aggression against Gaza Strip, which resulted in thousands of casualties from both sexes, especially children, and displaced over half a million Palestinians, wounded tens of thousands, of whom hundreds suffered permanent disabilities, in addition to the massive destruction of private and public property, infrastructure, agricultural lands and industrial and commercial enterprises. This aggression took its worst form during the years 2008, 2012 and 2014, and continues escalating through settlement activity, and the declaration by the US Administration that Jerusalem is the capital of Israel, and moving the US Embassy to East Jerusalem, which constitute a blatant violation of UN Security Council and General Assembly resolutions and encourage interrelated and expanding waves of violence against Palestinian women, and left its destructive impact on the political, developmental, economic and psychosocial structures and strengthened the separation between the West Bank and Gaza Strip. Gaza Strip remains under the continuous Israeli military threat, which faced the peaceful popular demonstrations that started on 30 March with shooting live bullets against the demonstrators. In two months, 115 citizens, including 13 children and women were martyred, while 13,200 persons were wounded, of whom 34 cases suffered permanent disabilities because of extremity amputations. 1036 women and 2096 children were among the wounded.

These repressive Israeli policies against our Palestinian people reflect a lack of compliance of the occupying state with its duties as an occupying power in accordance with the International Humanitarian Law (IHL) and the International Human Rights Law (IHRL), which must be applied to provide protection to civilians under Israeli occupation. The disrespect of the occupying state to these international laws and conventions has adversely affected Palestine's programs and plans regarding fulfilling its obligations towards the implementation of human right conventions in general and women conditions in particular, and the ability of the Palestinian National Authority (PNA) to fulfil its obligations under the control of Israeli occupation and its continued repression and aggression. Furthermore, the occupation is responsible for obstructing women's rights to movement, travel, health, education, citizenship and family reunion, in contravention with recommendation 30 of the CEDAW Committee. Based on this recommendation, we demand that the CEDAW Committee supports the demand of Palestinian women, to provide them with international protection until the implementation of the international legitimacy resolutions that consider settlement activity illegal, grant the Palestinian

women refugees the right of return in accordance with Resolution 194 and do not recognize the annexation of Jerusalem. These also include binding resolutions about the right to self-determination of the Palestinian people and their right to establish their independent state over the Palestinian territories occupied on 5 June 1967 with East Jerusalem as its capital.

The US President Donald Trump's step to move his country's embassy to Occupied Jerusalem constitutes a grave breach of the International Law and the International Humanitarian Law, prejudices final status issues and imposes new facts on the ground in a manner that adversely affects the peace process as a whole.

We request that the CEDAW Committee adopt the recommendations identified in this report, which has been prepared with a high degree of accuracy, objectivity, and transparency, with the aim of unveiling the reality of Palestinian women and their legal and community status. We also request the Committee to lobby with the occupying state and bind it with the signed agreements and the rules of the international law, to enable the State of Palestine to fulfil its obligations towards eliminating discrimination against women during the forthcoming years. This is achieved through supporting the development of national policies that consider providing protection to Palestinian women, ending discrimination and violence against them, ensuring their rights in equality and equal opportunities, providing an enabling legal and social environment to increase women participation in the public and political life and in decision-making without discrimination, providing access to basic services without discrimination and ensuring their wide participation in the labor market.

### **Executive summary**

This report was developed with the cooperation of women and legal institutions, and in coordination with the party responsible for its preparation, the General Union for Palestinian Women (GUPW), within the framework of the Non-Governmental and Women Coalition for the Implementation of CEDAW. A specialized women team was trained on shadow report preparation and means of using it as a lobbying tool at the local and global levels. A central training on CEDAW, its importance and methods of preparing shadow reports was held with the participation of senior members from all women organizations in the West Bank and Gaza Strip, who participated later in preparing the shadow report. A set of meetings were held to identify the priorities addressed in the report, with the report of the State of Palestine used as reference. During this process, six main themes were identified in accordance with CEDAW articles. During the second stage, the organizations were allocated to several specialized subcommittees, each addressing one theme according to its specialization. A Shadow Report Drafting Committee was formed, consisting of several women leaders. GUPW supervised holding several meetings for each theme, and followed up the work to identify the priorities under every theme within each sub-committee. A process of data collection and analysis started for each theme. The Drafting Committee drafted this report that reflects the consensus of all the organizations participating in the preparation of the adopted themes and information.

-The occupation policies impeded the natural course of political, social and cultural transformations in the Palestinian society in the West Bank and Gaza Strip. They also impeded the relevant official Palestinian institutions from conducting their functions steadily in accordance with their political and legislative powers, because of the blockade and the command and control policy, including obstructing freedom of movement, building the Apartheid Wall, continuous closures, lack of contiguity between the West Bank, Gaza Strip and Jerusalem. This had a negative impact on women, keeping their issues at the bottom of the list of priorities of the state, and separated Palestinian women in different legal frameworks according to the political control in each region.

-The Palestinian political division since 2007 had a negative impact on women, as it led to shifting their issues to the bottom of the list of priorities of the state. For example, since the division, the President of the State of Palestine has issued around 770 decrees and decisions by law<sup>1</sup>, most of which were irrelevant to women rights, except for a few that maintained unofficial inequality. This indicates that women and girls' issues, and providing them with the necessary protection are not part of the priorities and commitments of the State of Palestine. Division has also had its repercussions in terms of failure to adopt or harmonize the laws relevant to women and their rights, particularly the Civil Status and Penal Laws. Members of the Change and Reform Bloc in Gaza Strip issued around 82 laws and over 200 decisions, in addition to hundreds of decisions of the Council of Ministers (COM) and decrees issued by the Prime Minister who exercised the powers of the head of the executive during the past years, none of which heeded on gender equality.

-A package of inherited discriminatory laws against women continue to be applicable in the State of Palestine, which adversely affects achieving actual results in equality and eliminating discrimination against women.,

-Since the State of Palestine ratified CEDAW, it did not put in place the necessary policies or adopt the measures, interventions and procedures to embark on harmonizing the local laws and legislations with the ratified Convention and its different articles. However, in early 2017, a committee for harmonizing legislations was formed with COM decision, and then was amended in 2018 to embark on examining the Draft Decision by Law on Family Protection from Violence

-The State of Palestine has not signed so far the Optional Protocol of CEDAW, which enable women to access justice.

-The State of Palestine enhanced tribal control through adopting the Tribal Affairs Department as a recognized entity within the structure of governmental institutions, which had a negative impact on women issues, because of the supremacy of tribal rulings over the rule of law in family affairs, particularly in light of the prevalent culture and stereotypes.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>Ghuneimi, Zeinab, 2016; Fact Sheet on the Mechanisms of the Rule of Law, Justice and Women; Legislations and Laws Enacted in the West Bank and Gaza Strip since the Division in 2007and the amendments on the Paper of April 2018

- -The poor and limited legal and procedural measures taken by the State of Palestine to effect social and cultural change that contributes to realizing equality and social justice for women, and which led to the marginalization and discrimination against women on the ground.
- -The 2017-2022 Intersectional National Strategy was developed based on the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs 2030) and in accordance with several frameworks of reference, including CEDAW. Nevertheless, this strategy requires budgets to activate it.
- Women political participation continues to be low, despite the active participation of women in the various states of the Palestinian national struggle. The vision of the State of Palestine towards women political participation continues to be restricted to electoral participation.
- -Regarding economic participation, women are absented from economic development programs, and the measures that encourage women to engage in private sector activity, start their own businesses and enable women to access resources and property are still deficient. The larger rate of women participation in the informal sector continues to be unaccounted for in the official statistics and in its contribution to the national income. Women continue to suffer from the lack of legal or executive protection, especially protection from violence at the workplace. Regarding vocational training and rehabilitation, the State of Palestine continues to adopt a stereotypical approach based on gender-based division of roles, which orients women towards the service sector, considered complementary to their reproductive role. On the other hand, most available professions for women lie at the bottom of the professional pyramid, hence aggravating the process of marginalization.
- -Regarding the health, social and cultural rights, women continue to suffer from various forms of violence. The State of Palestine did not strengthen its legal or procedural measures to alleviate violence against women, considered a private case in the private domain. Regarding the right to health, the vision of the Ministry of Health towards providing health services is restricted to married women, excluding a large rate of single women and girls from obtaining the necessary health care and services. The medical staff also lack the professional experience to maintain privacy and secrecy of women at different stages, especially in cases of violence, as the health centers constitute the first responders that receive women.
- -Women with disabilities are exposed the most to all forms of marginalization, discrimination, exclusion and violence based on their disability and on their sex, at the level of public policies, programs and services as well as the adopted procedures that provide male and female citizens with access to such services. Furthermore, they are clearly absent from the agendas of the civil society, whether the organizations that lead the women movement, or those that stem from the disability movement. It is obvious that there is a lack of information about the living conditions of this group, because of the lack of segregated indicators in most national reports and official statistics in the country. Based on this report, we demand that the State of Palestine work on the following recommendations to guarantee the rights and dignity of Palestinian women and girls based on equality and justice.

**Recommendation 1:** The commitment of the State of Palestine to amend and change legislations, develop policies that conform to the content of CEDAW and put in place appropriate mechanisms for their implementation.

**Recommendation 2:** The commitment of the State of Palestine to conduct special surveys and statistics on discrimination and violence against women, girls and women with disabilities.

**Recommendation 3:** Urge the State of Palestine to ratify the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women, recognize the Convention in the Basic Law with clear and explicit provision, and put in place the appropriate mechanisms for their implementation.

**Recommendation 4:** Publish the ratification of the CEDAW Convention in the official Gazette.

#### **Introduction of the General Union for Palestinian Women**

The General Union for Palestinian Women (GUPW) is a popular democratic organization. It constitutes the framework that represents Palestinian women inside the country and in the places of refuge and exile. It advocates their rights and contributes to working towards the achievement of the national rights of the Palestinian people. GUPW aims at organizing the efforts and potential of the Palestinian women to activate their role in political, social and economic participation, and seek their advancement on all Palestinian territories and wherever they are. Hence, GUPW constitutes an umbrella for all women and non-governmental women organizations. For further information, please contact Ms. Mona Alkhalili at the following e-mail:

Mona.alkhalili@gmail.comwww.gupw.ps, gupw@palnet.com

# **Introduction of the Non-Governmental and Women Coalition for the Implementation of CEDAW**

This coalition was formed with the aim of preparing and monitoring the Shadow Report under the leadership of GUPW. The coalition consists of 35 legal and women organizations, labor unions, women frameworks that work in various specializations pertaining to the advocacy, protection and empowerment of women in the social, economic, political, health, educational fields, local and international legal affairs and the protection of persons with disabilities in the West Bank including Jerusalem and Gaza Strip.

# Names of the institutions in the coalition, which participated in completing the shadow report

General Union for Palestinian Women	The Union for Palestinian Women Action
	Committee
The Union of Palestinian Women Committees	the Union of Palestinian Working Women
	Committee
The Union of Women's Struggle Committee	Union of Women Committee for Social Work
The Federation of Palestinian Women Action	Al Najdeh Association for Women Development
Committee	
Union of Palestinian Working Women Committees	The Federation of Independent Unions
Association of Women Committee for Social Work	Palestinian Working Woman Society for
	Development
Culture and Free Though Association (CFTA)	Aisha Association for Woman and Child Protection

Women Media and Development TAM	The Association of Women's Action for Training
	and Rehabilitation
Rural Women's Development Society RWDS	Palestinian Family Development Association
The Alimony Fund	Women Health-Palestinian Red Crescent Society
	(PRCS)
Women's Affairs Technical Committee (WATC)	Women Struggle Bloc
Palestinian Women Liberation Bloc	Health Work Committees (HWC)
Women's Center for Legal Aid and Counselling	Center for Women's Legal Research & Counseling
(WCLAC)	and Protection-Gaza
Qader for Community Development	Juzoor for Health and Social Development
Palestinian Non-Governmental Organization	Women's Affairs Center-Gaza
Against Domestic Violence Against Women (Al-	
Muntada)	
Community Media Center	Jerusalem Center for Women
The Palestinian Initiative for the Promotion of	Al-Najd Development Forum
Global Dialogue and Democracy- MIFTAH	
Palestinian Medical Relief Society (PMRC)	Young Women's Christian Association - Palestine

# **Articles 1-5: Discrimination against Palestinian Women and Girls**

The State of Palestine ratified (CEDAW). However, despite this positive step, and four years after its ratification, the state did not take any measures to include CEDAW explicitly as a reference in the Palestinian Amended Basic Law of 2005. Furthermore, the Convention was not published in the Official Gazette to become legally binding, which indicates that the ratification was a mere formality with no substantial positive change to the situation of women and girls in the Palestinian society.

- The State of Palestine did not sign the First Optional Protocol of CEDAW. This is a necessary step the state must take as soon as possible, to show its interest in women's rights, not only at the official level, but to grant legitimacy and transparency to the different agencies in performing their roles to monitor and follow up the government's commitment to protect women against negative discrimination. Signing the Protocol also asserts the importance of social change from the existing patriarchal culture and norms toward achieving social justice and equity in the Palestinian society. It also gives women the opportunity to use state mechanisms for protection, through the complaints system against violations they may face.
- -Despite the official commitment of the State of Palestine to gender equality in the Amended Basic Law of 2003, which prohibits gender-based discrimination, several applicable laws that regulate social relations and role distribution contradict <sup>2</sup>with this

<sup>2</sup>Gender-perspective Legal analytical studies on women rights held by WCLAC, which reveal the blatant discrimination against Palestinian women: Mu'aqet, Fatima, 2009 Palestinian women and personal status

9

principle. The Basic Law (Temporary Constitution in the Palestinian case) constitutes the reference for specialized laws in different areas. However, so far, applicable inherited laws are based on unfair discrimination against women and girls, with adverse impact on achieving actual equality to which the state is committed. The state has not taken any measures to harmonize local laws to CEDAW, a commitment officially declared in 2009 and followed by the ratification of the Convention in 2014. Official accession has not yielded any positive outcome so far, despite establishing the committee on harmonizing legislations with a COM decision in early 2017. This committee did not start operating, but following the amendment decision in March 2018, the committee started working on the Draft Law on Family Protection from Violence

-Some laws that PNA had enacted provide for limited gender equality. However, women cannot enjoy this equality because of continuing application of old local laws that maintain the domination of patriarchal traditions in the society, such as the Penal Code. Although the State of Palestine introduced some amendments to the provisions of this Law, applicable in the West Bank, such as Article 99<sup>3</sup>, by adding Paragraph (5) which excludes offenses against women and children from the provision of this Article, which provides for mitigated sentence for the killer to half if the family of the victim waives personal claims. Moreover, Article 308 of the same Law, which provided for dropping charges if the rapist marries the victim, was revoked. It is worth noting that no such provision exists in the Palestinian Penal Code no. 74 for 1936, applicable in Gaza. The decision of the President of the State<sup>4</sup> to restrict the use of the mitigating excuse did not help protecting the right of women to life, in light of the absence of a unified law to protect women in all the territories of the State of Palestine against all forms of violence, including sexual abuse and harassment. The Personal Status Law has blatant examples for violations against women and girls, as it allows polygamy, marriage of underage girls and other issues that compromise actual equality, which would positively affect all social segments, including women and men. The same applies to custody, joint accounts and age at marriage.

-The State Report of Palestine elaborated on the fragmented legal reality of Palestine because of the political division<sup>5</sup>, which contributed to the division of the Palestinian society. However, it did not elaborate on the impact of this reality on women and girls compared to men under the different legal frameworks. Palestinian women suffer from

law, demands and trends, WCLAC. Abu Hayyeh, Ashraf and Hmeidat, Hanadi, A series of reports on the status of Palestinian women in legislations, WCLAC, 2013. Shamasneh, Fatima, The civil status law in practice. WCLAC

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Decision By Law No (5) for 2018, Palestinian Gazette, Issue No. 141, published on 25/3/2018

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Decision by Law no. (7) For 2011 on amending the applicable Penal Code in the northern governorates and the applicable Penal Code in the southern governorates. It provides for annulling Article (340) pf the Jordanian Penal Code applicable in the West Bank. As for Article (2), of the Decision, it provided for amending Article (18) by adding (and this does not include crimes of killing women on the pretext of "family honour") - issued in Ramallah on 15/05/2011. The Official Gazette, Issue No. 91, published on 10/10/2011.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup>For further information on the legal situation in Palestine, see: Ludsin.Hallie.2011.Women and the draft Constitution of Palestine. Women Centre For legal Aid and Counselling, and Arrayes, Nasser, 2003, The Judiciary in Palestine, Obstacles to its development, Al-Haq

conflicting and multiple legal systems because of the prevailing political conditions. This conflict contributed to the fragmentation of girls and women in Palestine, adversely affected their rights and enhanced men's control over them. Court judgments in Gaza Strip or Jerusalem are not binding or enforceable in the State of Palestine. This undermines women's rights, especially in personal status cases<sup>6</sup>.

-The State Report indicated under Article (5) that it has taken legal measures to eliminate all forms of discrimination against women, all of which are draft laws that have not been approved yet. Their justification was "the dysfunction of the Legislative Council (PLC) which contributed to delaying the adoption of the amended Penal Code and the Law on Family Protection from Violence, and other laws". Nevertheless, such justification becomes meaningless upon considering the applications of Article (43) of the Basic Law, which grants the President of the Palestinian Authority the power to issue decisions that have the power of law in cases of necessity that cannot be delayed, in case of the absence of the PLC. The President has used these powers to issue 770 Decrees and Decisions by Law since the division in 2007 and until end of April 2018, most of which were irrelevant to women rights, and a few on unofficial equality. This asserts that the issues of women and girls do not constitute a priority or an obligation for the State of Palestine, which has the obligation of guaranteeing their protection.

-The State of Palestine has taken some measures for gender mainstreaming of its developmental plans, most notably at the planning level, through setting up the gender units in the different government institutions, with the aim of gender mainstreaming the public plans of the governmental institutions and monitor the gender-sensitive budget<sup>9</sup>. However, the more marginalized groups of women, such as women and girls with disabilities were absent from the agendas and priorities of these gender units in the different ministries, and any such efforts to include them constitute mere formalities that are not reflected seriously in the relevant plans, programs or practices.

-Despite some limited progress, these units did not realize the vision and goal behind setting them up. They did not grant them decision-making powers as provided in the COM decision. On the other hand, establishing those units contributed to increasing discrimination against women, since all cases related to women are considered special cases and referred to the gender units, which aggravated the discrimination against women and led to their exclusion from the general scene of the governmental institution as a whole <sup>10</sup>.

-The Ministry of Women Affairs completed the 2017-2022 intersect oral National Strategy, but it is moving slowly since it requires unavailable budgets for implementation.

Ghuneimi, Zeinab, Fact Sheet on the Mechanisms of the Rule of Law, Justice and Women; Legislations <sup>8</sup> and Laws Enacted in the West Bank and Gaza Strip since the Division in 2007 and the amendments on the Paper of April 2018

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup>Internal reports of the Palestinian Alimony Fund 2011-2015

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup>Article no. (43) Of the Amended Basic Law.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup>UN-Women- Palestine Country office, examining the needs of gender units in PNA institutions, 2014 <sup>10</sup> Ibid

-The State of Palestine increased the tribal control by adopting the Tribal Affairs department as a major recognized body within the governmental structures, headed by the President's Office and the governorates. This had a negative impact on women, as it deepened the patriarchy and discrimination because of the domination of the tribal judiciary over the rule of law particularly in family cases, including domestic violence cases, which constitute the core of tribal judiciary. The tribal judiciary resorts to covering matters, considers them part of the private domain, and considers disclosing family affairs a taboo<sup>11</sup>.

-The State Report did not address at all discrimination against women with disabilities, who suffer from double discrimination, based on gender and disability. Moreover, they suffer from discrimination related to their reproductive role, as they are considered unfit because they are dependent on others. The PCBS studies and statistical data are not gender segregated (The persons with disabilities survey, 2011)<sup>12</sup> and (the survey of violence in the Palestinian society, 2011)<sup>13</sup>; both reports did not address domestic and community violence against females with disabilities.

#### Recommendations

- 1- Seek to incorporate CEDAW definition of discrimination in the Palestinian Basic Law.
- 2- Criminalize gender-based discrimination by law.
- 3- Develop a national monitoring and oversight mechanism to monitor the implementation of CEDAW and the conformity of its provisions with the Palestinian reality.
- 4- Allocate gender-sensitive budgets to ensure the implementation of inter-sectoral policies that ensure equality and non- discrimination based on gender, and identify the administrative and financial measures that ensure that in the future.

# Articles (7), (8), (9) and Recommendation (23): Women's Political Participation and Decision -making

The State of Palestine has not taken sufficient legal and procedural measures to help change the negative trends in the society's culture, which impedes active women participation in the political life in general and in decision making positions in particular. The prevalent patriarchy excludes women from participation, or exploits and benefits from their participation rather than enhance it, as in 2006 legislative elections, 2012 local elections, and the preparations for the new round of local elections, which was supposed to be held in October 2016, and was held on 13/5/2018 in the West Bank, but not in Jerusalem or Gaza. It has become clear that the tribal culture has dominated even political parties, influencing candidatures within the various parties, and exploiting the "women's

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup>For further information, see PNGO Forum study on combatting violence against women: Femicide in Palestine during 2004-2006, and Al-Wadad Society for Community Rehabilitation, a participatory project to contribute to more effective access to justice: Position paper about the role of tribal committees in supporting the elimination of discrimination, Program of assistance to the Palestinian people (PAPP).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup>The Palestinian Central Bureau of Statistics, 2011 Survey of persons with disabilities

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup>The Palestinian Central Bureau of Statistics, 2011 Survey of violence in the Palestinian society

quota" to achieve tribal gains at the expense of true women representation. This established and deepened women's marginalization away from real participation. The names or photos of women were concealed in some electoral lists, while other lists did not comply with the quota requirements as provided in the Elections Law. Despite all the violations that establish marginalization and discrimination, the state did not uphold its obligation to monitor such violations and hold their perpetrators accountable.

-The State of Palestine did not comply with the decision of the Palestinian Central Council issued in March 2015 to raise the quota to 30%, and which the Council confirmed in its meeting held on 16/1/2018. Furthermore, during that meeting, the Central Council decided to put in place the mechanisms for implementation of previous Central Council decisions on women representation of no less than 30% in all the institutions of the State of Palestine, and to amend the laws in accordance with CEDAW. At the Palestinian National Council (PNC) meeting held in May 2018, women representation at PNC was 12% only, while the elections resulted in one woman only in the Executive Committee, and five women at the Central Council. Among the measures that the State of Palestine took is adopting an electoral quota in the new General Elections Law by which a number of seats (10%) is designated for women by including women in electoral lists with specific order, as indicated in the State Report. This contributed to increasing women's access to the Legislative Council (PLC) and raised the rate of women's in PLC from 5% in 1996 to 13% in 2006 elections. The 'Quota' adopted in the Local Elections Law also raised women members in local councils to 21%, which increased women's participation in municipal and local councils.

These positive results did not increase women's opportunities to reach senior positions of decision-making<sup>14</sup>. Local and General Elections laws still suffer from gaps that entrench negative discrimination against women because the 'quota' did not provide women's participation with immunity, especially in rural and marginalized areas. The reality necessitates putting in place more policies and monitoring and oversight mechanisms to combat discrimination against women. This is particularly important amid the failure of political parties to comply with the memorandum of understanding with women organizations on increasing women representation in political parties to 30%, which was evident in the PNC elections.

-Though the strategic plan of the Ministry of Women's Affairs addressed the issue of empowering rural women, the Ministry's actions and interventions were restricted to areas close to cities, although marginalization and exclusion are at their worst form in remote areas and rural and Bedouin communities. Such absence has created a political vacuum that strengthened male and tribal domination<sup>15</sup>. The justifications of the State of Palestine, that the law does not prohibit access to rural women, reflects the limited attention that it gives to achieve objective equality through taking the necessary measures to facilitate access of women and not restrict it to actual equality, which constitutes the basis of the plans and policies State of Palestine.

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> MIFTAH, Fact Sheet: Women Participation in Local Government Units Elections of 2012-2013.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Meetings with women in remote and Bedouin areas held by local organizations indicate the marginalization of women and the absence of governmental programs to empower women.

-Regarding the right to political participation for women with disabilities, the Basic Law guarantees their participation without discrimination based on gender or disability, and their right to candidature and voting is asserted in the Elections Law, which indicates the right of every Palestinian (male or female) to run for elections and vote. A study conducted by YMCA in 2016 confirmed that 52% of females with disabilities said they were unable to participate in elections because of transportation difficulties, inaccessibility of voting centers and the negative attitudes and perception of the society. Moreover, 23% of females with disabilities said that they were unable to participate or join community organizations, and only 18% were able to vote and participate in 2012 elections<sup>16</sup>. This confirms that women with disabilities are less likely to enjoy their right to participate in political life, in terms of actual participation in the electoral process, since it is not designed to take into account the sensory, motor, and mental differences among women with disabilities, and in terms of candidature for various positions at various levels.

#### **Recommendations:**

- Develop monitoring, oversight and accountability mechanisms that help to enforce laws and procedures that facilitate political participation of women and their access to decision-making positions.
- Put in place mechanisms that ensure conforming to CEDAW to guarantee the right to political participation for women without discrimination.
- Raise awareness on the rights of persons with disabilities, renounce the negative perception of them, and adapt structures and procedures to facilitate the participation of women with disabilities.

#### **Article (11): Economic rights of women**

Discrimination against women continues to exist, indicating that they do not enjoy their economic rights. A closer look at the situation of Palestinian women reveals discrimination against them in the labor market and investment, poor opportunities in technical and vocational education and no active women participation because of several social, legal, and economic factors. At the legal level, although the Labor Law no. (7) for 2000and its Regulations, are considered a turning point in the provisions pertaining to women's employment<sup>17</sup>, as Article (100) provided for no gender-based discrimination: "In accordance with the provisions of this Law and Regulations, discrimination between men and women is prohibited". However, Article (2) of the Law stipulates that, "every able citizen shall have the right to work, and the Authority shall seek to provide it based on equal opportunity and without any form of discrimination" However, it failed to mention gender-based discrimination explicitly, and was left open for interpretation and analysis especially with the use of masculine language in drafting the article.

14

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup>A Study on Monitoring the Needs of Youth with Disabilities in the West Bank, YMCA-Jerusalem, Rehabilitation Program 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup>http://muqtafi.birzeit.edu/pg/getleg.asp?id=13975<sup>17</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup>Ibid

-Some articles in the Labor Law or Regulations need amendment. Article (3) of the Labor Law excluded domestic workers and persons with similar jobs, and first-degree family members of the employer. In both cases, women constitute the higher rate. A report issued by the Palestinian Non-Governmental Organizations Network (PNGO) indicated that women in the informal sector constitute the larger rate, especially in the agriculture, the majority of which are family-based businesses with high concentration of women working without pay. Hence, excluding them from the Law leads to excluding them from legal protection. Although the Regulations regulate the work of domestic workers <sup>19</sup>, the majority of whom are women, the Regulations did not provide for non-discrimination based on gender, and it uses the masculine language.

The Regulations do not provide deterrent penalties against employers in cases of sexual harassment or assaults against domestic workers. Furthermore, Article (42) does not grant women the right to quit work and receive full financial benefits in cases of sexual assault, and does not treat those cases as arbitrary dismissal. The Law did not define sexual assault or sexual abuse, thus leaving many women vulnerable to various forms of harassment and assault that may compel them to quit.

-Some provisions of the Law are ambiguous and has no Regulations, and it derogates women's rights in the labor market. Moreover, some provisions are controversial, such as Paragraph (C) of Article (101), which prohibits women's work at night, except for specific jobs to be identified by the Council of Ministers. Some within the women movement consider this a blatant discrimination against women, as it deprives them from the freedom of decision-making because they are in need of protection<sup>20</sup>. Others consider it a form of protection of women from abuse in the labor market, using as references the international and Arab conventions for the protection of women in the labor market With the objection for failing to issue regulations that identify the types of night work allowed for women, the penalties stipulated in the Law against employers who violate the provisions of women's work are light, as such offenses are considered (misdemeanors) and their penalties consist of small fines. This is unfair to women and facilitates violation of their rights.

-Regarding vocational training, Article (18) does not include the phrase (without discrimination) to clarify the intended meaning of vocational orientation and training. The Article should not have adopted clear-cut distinction in vocational specializations between men and women, as this compromises equal opportunities. Moreover, the training provided by the Ministry of Labor is restricted to stereotypical and traditional training for women. There has been no updating or diversification of the specializations to alleviate stereotypes and engage women in new fields.

15

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> The decision of the Minister of Labor No. (2) For 2013 on domestic workers in accordance with the provisions of the Labor Law no. (7) For 2000.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup>Darawi, Daoud, and Mu'aqet Fatima, 2010. A Gender-Perspective Review of the labor law and International Labor Standards, UNDP MDGF, a legal analytical comparative study, ILO, the participatory project

- -Regarding women's participation in the labor market, the stereotypical perception of the roles of women deepens the traditional division of roles between men and women in the available employment opportunities. The service sector ranked first in absorbing women at 57%, followed by agriculture, the second largest sector that employs women<sup>21</sup>. The rate of women working in the informal sector reached 4.9% of women in the labor force in 2012, of whom 60.2% have no job security<sup>22</sup>. This continues to be the reality today. For example, female university graduates in Gaza work at kindergartens for very low monthly wages that range between 300-400 Shekels (100\$), because of the lack of other alternatives, with the soaring unemployment rates in the Gaza Strip because of the blockade against Gaza Strip<sup>23</sup>.
- -Women suffer a wage gap because of gender-based discrimination because of the prevalent culture that believes that the productive work of men must cover the financial burdens, which establishes the notion of the male head of household. However, 10.6% of households are headed by women, according to the press release of the Palestinian Central Bureau of Statistics (PCBS) in March 2018. The statement also pointed out the gender wage gap, whereby the average daily wage for females amounted to (84.6 Israeli Shekels (ILS) compared to (119.6 ILS) for males.
- PCBS statement pointed out that 47.4% of women participating in the labor force are unemployed, compared with 22.3% of men, and that the rate of unemployment among educated women with 13 years of education or higher reaches 53.8% of the overall number of unemployed women.
- -The measures that the State of Palestine took to facilitate the participation of women with disabilities in political and public life are problematic, pertaining to the conditions for work in the public sector. The Civil Service Law requires all the persons appointed in any position in the public sector to receive a 'medical fitness' certificate. Hence, the Regulations must identify health conditions that preclude appointments in the public sector so that they do not include disabilities<sup>24</sup>.
- -A recent study by the YMCA (272 male and female respondents, of whom 41% were females) indicated that 83% of the women with disabilities suffer from discrimination in getting jobs, 69% said that transportation and the place of work are unsuitable for people with disabilities, and 59% suffered social isolation and discriminatory treatment by their employers and colleagues at work<sup>25</sup>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup>ILO, Report of the General-Director, Appendix, The Situation of the Workers of the Occupied Arab territories, ILO, Session 104, 2015

http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---Arab states/---robeirut/documents/publication/wcms 218024.pdf.p.4

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Based on internal unpublished reports of legal organizations in Gaza that were used for the Shadow Report, 2016

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Qader for Community Development; a report about CEDAW and the rights of girls and women with disabilities, 2016

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup>A Study on Monitoring the Needs of Youth with Disabilities in the West Bank, YMCA-Jerusalem, Rehabilitation Program 2016.

-Regarding women in investments, although the aim of the Palestinian Investment Law no. (1) For 1998 is to fulfill the economic development needs within the parameters and regulations of investment in Palestine, and whereas the economy is a free market economy for all investors, which guarantees capital and profits as provided in Article (10) of the same law. However, the law does not take into consideration the work systems and conditions for women to engage in the process, as it marginalized the role of women and their engagement in investments.

-The obstacles that impede women from starting their own businesses include inequity in access to sources and resources, because of the lack of financial resources or stable source of income or property (such as land)<sup>26</sup> that may be accepted as collateral for getting loans. The rate of women wishing to start their own businesses but failed to do so reached 65% in 2015, for the following reasons:

- 1- Israel destroyed the Palestinian infrastructure for both the agricultural and manufacturing sectors, which contributed to decreasing women's opportunities to find work.
- 2- The checkpoints and the continuous Israeli closures restrict women's ability to go to work in areas far from their local communities.
- 3- Lack of suitable vocational training.
- 4- Lack of financing for such enterprises.
- 5- The Neo-Liberal policies adopted by the PNA, which do not provide protection to the local market against unfair competition, especially by Israeli goods, which ruins the productive capacity of the Palestinian economy.

-Women membership in labor unions in Palestine is clearly lower than that of men because women lack confidence in the use of unions in protecting their rights at the workplace. Moreover, women demands, such as sexual harassment, maternity leave, summary dismissal due to pregnancy, or demands to establish daycare centers are not given priority compared to other labor issues. Gaza Strip is witnessing a decline in the rates of women membership in labor unions because of restrictions imposed on union activity, the low rate of women in the private sector, the absence of maternity allowances and cultural taboos that restrict their movement<sup>27</sup>.

-The Labor Law includes affirmative action in favor of women with disabilities, as Article (13) of the Labor Law no. (7) For 2000 stipulates, "the employer must employ a minimum of 5% of the total workforce at the enterprise, from qualified persons with disabilities in jobs suitable to their disability". However, there are no instructions or regulations at the Ministry of Labor for implementing Article (13). It is also worth noting that the indicators that monitor the working conditions and their suitability to the

<sup>27</sup>Qader for Community Development; a Report about CEDAW and the Rights of Girls and Women with Disabilities, 2016

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup>Al-Botmeh, Samia. 2010. Unlocking the Labour Market for Palestinian Women. Al-Shabaka. (July 22), https://al-shabaka.org/briefs/labor-market-palestinian-women/

requirements of decent work for women with disabilities are limited, such as making buildings accessible or reasonable arrangements, administrative measures, supporting tools and others. This adversely affects their productivity and ability to continue working, and keeps a large rate of women with disabilities outside the workforce<sup>28</sup>.

-The State Report mentioned under Article (11), the achievements of the Ministry of Labor in control and inspection. Nevertheless, we note extreme weakness in control and inspection, especially over enforcing the minimum wage, monitoring conditions of working women, and the absence of a real gender-based perspective of rights, an issue of great importance in monitoring and documenting violations against working women, especially in terms of violence at the workplace. The Ministry also lacks the necessary human resources to perform its duties. The State of Palestine did not seek to provide the necessary budget to activate this extremely important department for accountability and monitoring to ensure decent work. These gaps restricted the work of this department to providing limited services in the areas near cities, while marginalized areas remain absent from the control and inspection policies of the Ministry of Labor. It is worth noting that there are only 40 inspectors in the West Bank and none in Gaza Strip. The oversight bodies do not have a policy of employing women in parallel to men and train them on the concepts of women rights and gender-based violence to enable them to address such cases<sup>29</sup>. Furthermore, they lack decision-making powers, and the Labor Law Regulations lack provisions that protect workingwomen rights, through taking measures to enforce the provisions of the Law. The State of Palestine has not set up labor courts to facilitate for workers, particularly women, receiving their rights.

#### **Recommendations:**

- The Labor Law must stipulate non-discrimination based on gender.
- Seek changing vocational training curricula to encourage non-stereotypical professions and facilitate women's inclusion in unconventional professions.
- Set up labor courts to facilitate women's access to their rights in accordance with the Labor Law.
- Develop the necessary policies and procedures for women's participation in the labor market and enforce the minimum wage in both formal and informal sectors.
- Develop the procedures that ensure the right of women with disabilities to participate in the labor market.

## **Article (12): Girls and Women's Health Rights**

#### - Access to health services

-In providing its health services to girls and women, the Palestinian Ministry of Health (MoH) focuses on family planning and antenatal care, paying much less attention to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup>The National Women's Employment Committee and ILO, the working women rights in Palestine, guidebook, 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup>Middle East Centre and BirZeit University. Policy Brief 9.Women's Health in the occupied Palestinian territory: Health problems reported by 15-54 years old women two weeks preceding the family Health Survey 2010. March 2016. At:

women's health needs throughout their life-cycle. This neglect originates in the fact that the vision of the MoH draws on women's stereotypical roles, whereby it focuses on perinatal care and neglects women's other health needs which affects the quality and distribution of services provided and their compatibility with the needs of all members of the society. This reality contributed to a multiplicity of service providers, standards and quality.

- The variation in the standards of service provided by the public and private sectors and the inability of women to afford quality services of the private sector. The percentage of women covered by the health insurance system, whereby 78.3% of the population were covered by health insurance services in 2017, (65.7% in the West Bank and 95.4% in Gaza) taking into consideration that poorer women usually do not subscribe to health insurance programs due to their inability to pay their fees. It is worth noting the injustice in the geographic distribution of services, since the services provided by the health insurance are not comprehensive and do not cover all health needs. At the same time, people must pay around 25% of the cost of major surgeries or pay in full for surgeries that are not conducted at official health facilities bur must be conducted outside the public health system. Undoubtedly, women do not have the financial resources to cover their rate. Moreover, the geographic distribution of services is not fair, particularly in marginalized areas and in Area 'C', under the full control of the occupation. There are questions regarding the comprehensiveness of services provided and whether they are culturally well suited to women. Women in Gaza Strip do not enjoy insurance, since the health facilities lack the minimum requirements for health services. Neither do they receive external health services, especially patients of serious diseases such as cancer, kidney failure, or hepatitis. This is attributed to several reasons, including the lack of permits issued by the Israeli authorities, and which are necessary to enable them to seek treatment at hospitals in the West Bank or inside the Green Line, and the poor responsiveness of the Ministry of Health to cover the financial cost of external treatment for Gazan citizens under various excuses.

#### - Maternal mortality:

A (3.3%) annual reduction in maternal mortality rate was reached. However, there was a failure in achieving the targeted annual reduction rate of (5.5%), provided in Development Goals. Other problems include reporting and documentation of mortalities and the entry of mortality file data; for example, many mortality cases are recorded as caused by cardiac arrest, without researching the real and root causes of death. Other causes of such mortalities relate to erroneous medical case management, the non-application of medical protocols despite their availability and the ineffective accountability system for medical errors, taking into consideration that the category worst affected by such errors is maternal mortality. Nevertheless, most often than not, files are closed without the official authorities taking any deterrent measures.

- Lack of integrated and comprehensive sexual and reproductive health services, whereby most services focus on providing family planning, maternal, antenatal and post-natal services. They lack services such as counselling, pap smear, breast cancer and AIDS preventive testing, adolescence and youth friendly services, and fertility treatments

which, if available, would only be provided in central clinics and in short supply for marginalized groups in remote areas. <sup>30</sup>Women in Area "C" become even more exposed to marginalization in receiving health services due to the difficulty to access central health centres due to the check points that hinder their movement and the obstacles the occupation imposes in Area "C", preventing the establishment or development of health centres up to the minimum accepted health standards. Furthermore, the masculine culture limits women's movement, particularly disabled women.

- Ineffective health policies regarding safe abortion and post abortion services, including awareness raising of family planning methods and psychological support. Palestinian laws criminalize abortion without valid medical reason, and there is a marked lack of statistics on abortion and abortion rates in general, and on hysterectomy among disabled women in particular.
- All women do not receive family planning services (unmet needs), for many reasons including ignorance, lack of knowledge of services provided at health centres; women's poor financial means; community culture and lack of awareness- raising on the use of contraceptives. Most modern family planning methods used are directed to women, such as injections, family planning pills and intra-uterine devices- all of which have adverse health effects on women, poor promotion for using male condoms and their low rate of usage, despite the lack of adverse health effects on men.
- School curricula are void of reproductive health subjects, despite the availability of training manuals on sexual and reproductive health for adolescents and youth. Some target parents and service providers, such as teachers and counsellors.
- Lack of information on AIDS, including methods of contracting its virus and methods of prevention. The social stigma attached to AIDS is a big obstacle deterring testing for it or disclosing affliction with it, and seeking treatment services. This situation creates a high risk for spreading the AIDS virus on the one hand, and depriving patients from health services, on the other hand.
- The national referral system for abused women (TAKAMUL), approved by the Council of Ministers, remains unimplemented. Therefore, women victims of abuse do not have at their disposal appropriate counselling services in all areas. In addition, if uninsured, abused women have to pay for the services they receive. Many health service providers also remain unaware of their role in dealing with cases of physically abused women, of the role of other sectors, and means of cooperation amongst them. Health centres, and hospitals in particular, lack special spaces for receiving cases of physical violence and the specialized staff capable of dealing with cases of violence against women. The national referral system also overlooked the specificity of disabled women and their protection from violence in terms of mechanisms of intervention, protection and services provided to them.

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup>Essential packages of SRH services t: Family planning/birth spacing services • Antenatal care, skilled attendance at delivery, and postnatal care • Management of obstetric and neonatal complications and emergencies • Prevention of abortion and management of complications resulting from unsafe abortion • Prevention and treatment of reproductive tract infections andsexually transmitted infections including HIV/AIDS • Early diagnosis and treatment for breast and cervical cancer • Promotion, education and support for exclusive breast feeding • Prevention and appropriate treatment of sub-fertility and infertility• Active discouragement of harmful practices such as female genital cutting • Adolescent sexual and reproductive health • Prevention and management of gender-based violence.

- A report by the World Health Organization (WHO) Regional Office for the Eastern Mediterranean (EMRO), noted a gender-based gap in the number of medical referrals issued by MOH, whereby the number of male patient referrals was higher than female patient referrals in the period of 2011-2013. The reasons for this gap were neither mentioned nor addressed in any other report.
- There is a lack of healthcare protocols for elderly women, and social security is not applied.
- <u>Mental Health</u>: Mental health services are not integrated in the primary health care program, despite their significance for all community and age groups.
- Females prisoners in occupation prisons are deprived of basic and specialized health services, and from medications, in addition to the failure of the occupation authorities to provide reproductive and mental health services.
- The health of disabled women is not included in the national strategic health plans, in addition to the absence of a special section dedicated to them in the national protocols on sexual and reproductive health.
- A study on the disabled conducted by YMCA in 2016 indicated a growth in health services quantitative indicators. The study further showed women with disabilities of 60% or less are excluded from health insurance. In other words, only severely disabled women of over 60% disability are provided with health insurance. However, it does not cover many costly medications, rehabilitation services, and medical devices related to their disabilities. Moreover, the reference used for identifying the type and degree of disability, which is used to determine interventions and for the provision of a number of services, is very old and is not compatible with even the minimum relevant international standards. A study conducted by the Friends of the Disabled Society<sup>31</sup> in 2016 revealed that most health centres and state hospitals are not physically accessible to disabled people.

#### **Recommendations:**

- Raise-awareness among women and facilitate their subscription in public health insurance.
- Monitor and improve public health services provided by the state to include women's full life-cycle.
- Address the conditions of female prisoners in Israeli prisons within political priorities.
- Develop a protocol for addressing abortion cases.
- Develop health centres to ensure physical accessibility of disabled women patients.
- Train medical staff on dealing with physically abused women from a legal, human rights perspective.

### Article 14 (1,2,3): Rural women rights in Palestine

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Friends of the Disabled Society 2016, the Health (Medical) Facilities and their Accommodation of Persons with Disabilities

The 2015 statistics indicated that rural women perform65% of agricultural work in Palestine without wages, since such activity often occurs within the family. On the other hand, reports of the Rural Women Society reveal a large gap between those who work in agriculture and those who own agricultural land. Women constitute the lower rate of landowners. Difficulties for rural women increase amid the continued occupation and its control over 61% of the agricultural lands in Area C, which in turn influences the role of rural women. Reports of the Rural Women Society indicate that the political conditions led to changing the role of rural women, as they no more work solely in agriculture, but seek a role in the labour market. The rate of working women in the Palestinian labour market reached 19% in 2017. A major challenge is whether women, especially younger women, would be willing to go back to agriculture. Meetings with women organizations that work on women economic empowerment revealed that rural women's work in agriculture has become casual, such as during the olive season.

Despite some local initiatives for supporting and empowering rural women through small enterprises or productive cooperatives, to help their families in the wake of general increasing unemployment, those women do not control the financial revenues, and mostly do not have the necessary management and marketing skills, as indicated by the Rural Women Society report.

Based on the work of the Rural Women Society, the main obstacles that face rural women in Palestine are:

- Women farmers are deprived of capital and basic resources, most importantly land, access to finance, and lack of training courses and extension.
- They receive only 10% of the income, 71% do not receive wages for their work (since it is within the family).
- Rural women work more than 14 hours daily and the wage for their work mostly goes to the husband or family.
- Rural women play a tripartite role (productive, social, reproductive), which is the prevailing tribal based culture of the social heritage.
- Women's work is not appreciated or calculated in the national income, since it mostly falls outside the formal sector, which marginalizes the role of women.
- This is linked to their reproductive role, since women work in small family owned plots of land, rather than in large farms or plots of land.
- The use of technology (tractors, irrigation pumps, etc) is mostly restricted to men, which increases physical effort and time invested in agriculture for women.
- Women farmers receive 20-40% lower wages than men who work in the same profession.
- No legal or social protection exists for women working in agriculture (no work contracts, insurance compensations... In addition, the society considers their work in agriculture as an extension to their house chores.
- No media strategy linked to comprehensive development projects, while the media ignores the role of rural women.
- No comprehensive studies or regular surveys about rural women in Palestine exist.

- Some agricultural women workers work inside 1948 land or inside the
  agricultural settlements, especially in the Jordan Valley, and face all forms of
  violence and blackmail by employers, such as low wages, long working hours and
  the lack of adequate sanitation. Palestinian labour force is considered cheap and
  hence they are exploited in the Israeli market.
- Since the Palestinian government adopts the free market economy and does not provide protection to the Palestinian products, rural women in particular and the rural society in general suffer from strong competition, which gradually pushes them away from agriculture because it is becoming economically unfeasible.
- Water constitutes a major challenge for rural women, because Israeli occupation
  controls sources of water in the Palestinian territories, and provides it to the Israeli
  settlements that surround the rural areas in the Occupied Territories, and that have
  the highest rate of water consumption. The burden of water provision,
  rationalizing water use, and striking a balance between water use for agriculture
  and for household use constitute a burden on rural women, and is a bigger burden
  on Bedouin women.

-Articles (15) and (16): Equality before the law and women rights in family and marriage and General Recommendation (21) on equality and family relations:

- The concept of marriage: The definition of marriage in the Jordanian law applicable in the West Bank is limited to the union of a man and a woman for the formation of a family with the purpose of reproduction. The Family Rights Law applicable in Gaza Strip did not define marriage. Although marriage constitutes the foundation of the family, the primary building block of the society, the parties responsible for the formation of such a family are not equal in their rights and obligations as provided in the personal status laws, in contravention of CEDAW. The Convention stressed the full equal rights and responsibilities of men and women in a marriage, without any confinement in relation to reproduction. The applicable laws in Palestine identified the responsibilities and obligations between the spouses, which are based on patriarchal hegemony that give authority to men to treat women as dependents. Hence, the Personal Status Law, for both Muslims and Christians, under the control of the Islamic Shari 'a results in a clear discrimination in guardianship, divorce, inheritance and ownership, testimony and polygamy. Hence, a new personal status law, based on eliminating discrimination against women and equality with men in obligations and duties must be enacted.

- Age of Marriage: Marrying-off underage girls continues to prevail in Palestine despite the marked rise of the average age at first marriage. Local statistics indicate that one out of five women in the age group 20-49 had been married during their childhood years (under 18).. The rate of women who were married during childhood reached 20.5%, 21.6% in Gaza and 19.9% in the West Bank.

Applicable laws in Palestine do not take into consideration that the marriage contract, just like all other contracts, is concluded with consent. The precondition for the validity of the contracting parties' competence is the age of majority of 18 solar years. This is in line with the agreed age of majority for all other transactions. Entering in a marriage contract requires as mental maturity and competence as all other contracts that entail reciprocal

obligations, as provided in CEDAW and the UN Convention on Consent to Marriage, Minimum age for Marriage, and Registration of Marriages for 1962. *Firsthand contracting:* Women are still not recognized a primary party to the marriage contract. They may not choose their husbands and may not enter a marriage contract on their own. A woman is considered a minor if she is a virgin and the contract is reached through the male guardian, despite the direct impact of the marriage contract on the contracting parties and not on their guardians... Women have no right to enter a marriage contract with out restrictions other than those provided by law on documentation, declaration of marriage, and the control of the marriage competent court. This is a contravention of the Palestinian Basic Law, which provides for full equality. Therefore, the State of Palestine must amend the relevant legislation and recognize women's competence and equality to men, allowing for concluding the marriage contract with the direct agreement of the two parties or through representatives acting on their behalf, and revoke provisions of the presumed guardianship of male family members over women wishing to get married.

- <u>Women's right to inheritance</u>: The provisions of Islamic Shari 'a on inheritance remain in effect in Palestine, for both Muslims and Christians, and there is discrimination and flagrant violation of women's economic rights in these provisions in some cases. Although the state has taken several measures to enable women to obtain the right to inheritance, they are not applicable so far. A decision was taken by the Chief Justice to restrict the so-called "Takharuj" However, these measures failed to protect these rights due to deception and the use of other legal methods to force women into foregoing their inheritance rights, such as approaching the notary public. Despite the lack of a legal mechanism to provide protection and control, it is essential for the State of Palestine to take preventive measures, such as monitoring violations and providing free legal aid. In many cases, legal fees are too high for women to afford. It is of utmost importance to work on changing the socio-cultural realities through the media, and to change the school curricula to ensure and safeguard women's rights.
- <u>Mixed marriages and inheritance</u>: The Personal Status Law for Muslims discriminates between a Christian woman marrying a Muslim and a Muslim woman marrying a Muslim man. In mixed marriages, women may neither inherit nor bequeath an inheritance. Hence, women in mixed marriages are subject to violation of their right to ownership, and to renunciation by their families because of their departure from social norms that prohibit mixed marriages, thus becoming more vulnerable to violation and marginalization. The state has taken no measures to harmonize the law to conform to CEDAW provisions.
- <u>Married couples' financial system:</u> The applicable Personal Status Law for both religions emphasizes the principle of the separate, independent financial entity of each partner in marriage. Despite the importance of acknowledging this principle, it constitutes flagrant discrimination against women, since it is not possible to overlook women's contribution to improving families' economic conditions. Palestinian women, in the desert, cities, villages or camps, exert effort throughout their marriage years inside and outside their families. Moreover, they often play multiple roles because of the need to improve family income. Eventually, the financial gains achieved throughout their marriage, resulting from the hard work of both partners, is mostly registered to the name

of husbands for male socio-cultural considerations. Should a dispute arise between the partners, only the husband would reap the financial yields, while the wife would only get her alimony during the waiting period following their divorce. Furthermore, when the husband is deceased and survived by offspring, the wife's entitlement is only one-eighth of the inheritance that she had contributed to raising and formation, or to one quarter of the inheritance, should there be no offspring surviving the father.

<u>- Divorce:</u> This is a thorny issue in both Muslim and Christian faiths of the Palestinian community, and which ultimately constitutes a flagrant violation of women's rights. The Personal Status Law for Muslims provides that men have the absolute power to divorce their wives. On the other hand, most women do not have the right to end their marriages. Nevertheless, there are cases where the Law allows women to request a judge to divorce them from their husbands. However, proving the validity of her claim for seeking separation requires lengthy periods. It is worth noting that the Chief Justice of Palestine took a decision in the West Bank in 2014, allowing the wife, before the consummation of marriage, to divorce herself, by paying the price for this divorce through completely foregoing all of the husband's financial obligations (so-called Khulu'). This law is not applicable in Gaza Strip because of the reality of the political Palestinian division. In the case of Christians, divorce is prohibited except in extremely restricted conditions, which prompts women to remain silent, due to the social taboos. Thus, women are forced to choose either separation without a divorce, or to stay in their marriages.

- Alimony: Following a hard struggle by women's organizations, the state approved a special law for the establishment of the Alimony Fund. The Fund aims to enforce alimony rulings that are not carried out. These are important measures the State of Palestine took despite the obstacles, with the increasing numbers of women seeking the Fund's assistance. Based on Alimony Fund reports, the majority of beneficiaries are divorced or abandoned women. Women seek assistance in collecting alimony due to their inability to provide for their families following their divorce or abandonment, resulting in losing their housing and income. Such situations limit options available to women, and expose them to violence by their own families, or to having to accept returning back to their husbands and surrendering to their conditions due to lack of alternatives. This requires that they pursue the person charged with paying the alimony, be it the husband, father or son, in order to regain their dignity and social standing, collecting their rights and providing for their families without dependence on extended families. The Fund is an important protection mechanism for women. The State of Palestine must commit to providing the necessary resources and in setting up Fund branches all over the country to enable women to access its services easily. Although the alimony is a solution for divorced women, however, state appropriations do not cover the various basic needs of women and their families, as they only account for 10% of the Fund's expenses. This is due to the state overlooking the appropriation of sufficient resources to the Fund. In Gaza Strip, on the other hand and due to the division, women have no access to the Alimony Fund services, because the Chief Justice of the Shari 'a Judiciary in the West Bank does not recognize the judicial structures and Sharia' courts that report to the Chief Justice in Gaza Strip nor their rulings.

<u>- Women's Testimony</u>: Personal status laws usually do not consider women who are not a party to the marriage contract eligible to bear witness to a marriage contract, unless the

testimony of two women witnesses is coupled with the testimony of a male witness. This means that marriage contracts are not valid with only two women witnesses without the third male witness, nor with three or four women witnesses without a male witness. This constitutes a flagrant discrimination against women, constitutes a violation of human dignity, and contravenes with the principle of equality before the law and the provision of the Basic Law particularly that the state documents and controls all the marriage contracts through the competent court. Hence, state authorities through the Personal Status Law and the competent courts carry out this discrimination.

- Polygamy: The Personal Status Law for Muslims allows polygamy, the biggest violation of women's rights. It insults women as human beings, and carries with it the seeds of several social ailments that result in consolidating poverty, ignorance and family disputes. The State of Palestine, and its relevant institutions, turns a blind eye to prohibiting polygamy, similarly to other Arab countries, such as Tunisia, or restraining it as in other countries, and justifies this with religion and norms. Polygamy constitutes a cause of violence against women. A study on gender-based violence in Palestine, identified polygamy as one of the reasons for violence against women, as an individual is brought up to believe that women are a replaceable commodity<sup>32</sup>.

- Women's Access to Justice<sup>33</sup> Local women studies indicate that when the women who have experienced any form of violence seek the assistance, or the intervention of the Palestinian justice system, "are either completely deprived from their right to access justice, or the justice system fails in meeting their needs". The studies also revealed that according to abused women, seeking assistance or merely disclosing their abuse in public or to the police, or confiding to local community or religious leaders, or to politicians, has in fact exacerbated their problems, and that the failure of women in attaining their rights has undermined women's confidence in these systems". 34The Services of various organizations, both local and international, constitute mere dressing to women's wounds, to help them tolerate the reality, because the solutions they provide are instantaneous. Reinforcement of patriarchy, through the lack of interest of the State of Palestine in taking the necessary measures to provide legal or procedural protection for women, or failure to allocate the necessary resources, contribute to silencing women and undermining their confidence in approaching governmental or non-governmental organizations for protection<sup>35</sup>.

#### **Recommendations:**

- Adopt a standardized Palestinian civil family law.

<sup>32</sup> Saada, Luna. 2016. Women Media and Development. Al Mawarid for Human Resource Development. Gender-based violence. Femicide in the West Bank in the years 2011-2015. (not published)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup>Shalhoub-Kevorkian. Nadera, (2002).Femicide and the Palestinian Criminal Justice System: Seeds of Change in the Context of State Building? Vol. 36, No. 3

<sup>34</sup> Ibid

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup>Saada, Luna. 2016. Women Media and Development. Al Mawarid for Human Resource Development. Gender-based violence. Femicide in the West Bank in the years 2011-2015.

# **Violence Against Women: General Recommendation (19) on violence against women and General Recommendation (9) on statistics**

- Despite their importance, statistical data are not systemic and regular enough to reflect violence against women in Palestine. The periodic surveys on violence against women is dependent on foreign funding. Since PNA inception in 1994, only two surveys have been conducted on gender-based violence, one in 2005 and another in 2011, both with foreign funding. We agree with the statistics mentioned in the State Report, because they were endorsed at the national level. However, monitoring violence and conducting comparative studies is challenging with the lack of regular surveys. At the institutional documentation level, governmental institutions started since 2013 to document cases of violence. However, the lack of standardized variables and criteria adopted by governmental institutions in documenting these cases is problematic, and aggravates the monitoring gap<sup>36</sup>.

<u>- The prevalence of the tribal system vis-à-vis the Law</u> The social system in the Palestinian society is based on the importance of the role of the extended family in an individual's life, particularly regarding family relationships and dealing with domestic violence in the Palestinian society. The Tribal Affairs Department is a fundamental part of the administrative body of the Palestinian State, and constitutes a fundamental pillar and point of reference in the governorates. The tribal system has its own common laws, which contradict with the principle of the rule of law, yet are invoked. The executive bodies or the governors mostly deny most cases of violence against women, and refer them to the tribal authority, a patriarchy- consolidating system. An example of negative flagrant discriminatory rules that violate women's rights, are tribal solutions that call for marrying-off a raped woman to her rapist<sup>37</sup>.

- Local women studies show that the Personal Status Law and the Penal Code have the highest impact on women's lives. They are the legal system that directly regulates social relationships among individuals in the private domain (the family) and the public domain (society and state). Analysis of laws revealed that they are unfair and unable to provide protection to women, or guarantee Palestinian women's rights throughout women's life cycle (CEDAW, Article 16). Furthermore, applicable laws allow for controlling women, stripping them from effective citizenry and derogating their rights. <sup>38</sup>These two laws are mechanisms that contribute to allowing violence against women and stripping them of the rights to equality before and in the Law (ref. item 16 of Shadow Report).

Women experience emotional, physical and sexual abuse at an almost equal to other women. However, women with disabilities experience violence and assault for longer periods compared to other women, and the impact of the abuse is deeper and more harmful because of the challenges they have, which may limit their ability to defend themselves, or because of their fear of reporting or disclosing the abuse. The reason is the wide gap in laws and lack of enforcement, which does not grant a sense of safety and security, even by state institutions, which are supposed to play this role. Add to that the failure of the judicial and legislative system to enact laws that secure their rights. A 2016

<sup>36</sup> Ibid

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup>. Documented cases from Women centers in Ramallah, indicated in the preparation of the Shadow Report.

<sup>38</sup> Ibid

study by YMCA revealed that 39% of the respondents were abused, out of which 37% was domestic abuse, 34% community abuse, and 28% abuse by the Occupation. Physical abuse accounted for 49%, while emotional abuse accounted for 81%<sup>39</sup>.

- Poverty is a main reason for lack of security in the Palestinian society, and in the family. In particular, women made evident the relationship between poverty and violence, including domestic violence<sup>40</sup>. The 2011 violence survey results indicated that in comparison to working women, non-working women are at a higher risk of abuse by their husband<sup>41</sup>. Women already married, from poor or very poor families, reported they were emotionally, physically, sexually, socially and economically abused more often than their counterparts who had classified their families' economic conditions between average and excellent<sup>42</sup>. Despite the initiatives taken by the State of Palestine at the official level against violence, work on the practical level, however, remains irregular and limited to government institutions that deal with women, namely the ministries of Women Affairs, Social Development and Health. (The occupation plays a major role in spreading poverty).

<u>- Femicide</u>: Femicide, the so-called killing with the pretext of preserving "family honour" is a persistent practice in the Palestinian society. The number of women killed on the pretext of honour varies annually in the West Bank and Gaza Strip according to the circumstances of crimes and how quickly they are discovered. Some murders are recorded as suicides or accidental killings when they are declared.

Measures taken by the State of Palestine are insufficient in eliminating femicide; they are merely casual responses to the effective efforts of women organizations in lobbying for ending this phenomenon. These measures include the President's decision to freeze Article 340 of the applicable Penal Code in the West Bank, which used to pardon the offender of murder against women on the pretext of defending honour. Moreover, the provisions of Article 18 of the Penal Code Number 74 of 1936, applicable in Gaza, which provide for mitigating the sentence of the murderer if proven that his crime was committed for preserving the honour, were also revoked. On the other hand, families resort to waive personal claims against the offender and accept financial compensation (diyyeh) which exonerates the offender and mitigates the sentence against him. This is a mechanism widely used in the Gaza Strip for preserving the men of the family, in accordance with the tribal law. Article (97) of the Penal Code applied in the West Bank allows beating for disciplinary reasons, which has claimed numerous women victims due to severe beating. Local studies reveal<sup>43</sup> that men convicted for femicide motivated by

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup>Qader for Community Development; a Report about CEDAW and the Rights of Girls and Women with Disabilities, 2016

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup>Geneva Centre for the Democratic Control of Armed Forces (DCAF). 2009. Palestinian Women and Security: Why Palestinian Women and Girls Do not feel Secure.p29

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup>Palestinian Central Bureau of Statistics. 2011. Survey on violence in Palestine.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup>Prof. Haj- Yahia, Muhammad. 2011. Violence against Women in Palestinian Society. Survey Presentation and Analysis, page 27

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup>Saada, Luna. 2016. Women Media and Development. Al Mawarid for Human Resource Development. Gender-based violence. Femicide in the West Bank in the years 2011-2015.

defending "family honour" are fully aware and cognizant of Article 99 on waiving personal claims against the offender and its impact on mitigating their sentences, which was finally revoked in March 2018 after lobbying efforts of the women movement. The authorities' failure to enact and adopt women protecting laws contributed to women's lack of confidence in the executive and judicial systems of the State of Palestine<sup>44</sup>.

- The applicable Penal Code consolidates men's hegemony over women's lives. The Penal Code no. (16) for 1960 applicable in the West Bank, sets a precondition in prosecuting incest that submitting the complaint is done by up to the fourth degree relative or son-in-law of one of perpetrators. The problem is that this law considers both parties to the crime (the male and the female) guilty, invoking the aspect of mutual consent, and that the female consented to sexual intercourse. The Law has overlooked the nature of power and control relations within the family, practiced by the female's caretakers. The State Report did not indicate the injustice in the applicable Penal Code, and only mentioned the draft law, which the State of Palestine has not adopted yet.
- The small budget allocated by the Ministry of Social Development for safe homes to protect abused women, which puts at risk the lives of women threatened with death. UN Women-Palestine's reports on the evaluation of safe homes indicated the inability of the Ministry of Social Development to provide basic services to abused women in protection homes. Hence, providing basic services and empowering abused women is dependent on the availability of funding, which puts safe homes at the risk of being unsustainable as centres that provide adequate services to women<sup>45</sup>.
- None of the ministries directly involved in eliminating violence against women, such as the ministries of Women Affairs, Social Development, Education, Health, Justice and the Interior, have established a training and rehabilitation program for their staff on dealing with cases of violence. Training is rather dependent on non-governmental organizations' programs and funding, and if these are not available, no training, follow up or accountability for performance is carried out by relevant institutions<sup>46</sup>.

#### **Recommendations:**

- Support and increase the numbers of safe homes for abused women, improve the quality of the services offered to abused women and developing the capabilities of their staff.
- Approve the draft Penal Code and the draft Law on Family Protection from Violence which were prepared with the participation of governmental and non-governmental women and legal organizations, and which guarantee protecting women from violence. Specify the measures the State of Palestine will take to adopt criminal legislations based on equality and non-discrimination, including the Law on Family Protection from Violence.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup>Shalhoub-Kevorkian. Nadera, (2002).Femicide and the Palestinian Criminal Justice System: Seeds of Change in the Context of State Building? Vol. 36, No. 3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup>Interviews with social workers at safe homes for abused women in Bethlehem and Nablus, 2015

<sup>46</sup> http://www.ohchr.org/AR/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID=20565&LangID=A

- Conduct regular and periodic statistical surveys to identify the situation of discrimination against women, and violence against women and girls and women with disabilities.
- Allocate the necessary budget for developing services at safe homes, and develop the capacities of their staff to ensure their sustainability.
- Establish specialized family courts to address cases of abuse and develop the capacities of their staff.

#### **General Recommendations of the Coalition**

Based on the information incorporated in this report, we request the State of Palestine to act on the following substantial issues to guarantee the rights and dignity of Palestinian women and girls based on justice and equality:

- **Recommendation** (1): The State of Palestine commits itself to amending and changing legislation, and drawing up policies that conform to the provisions of CEDAW.
- **Recommendation (2):** The State of Palestine commits itself to conducting surveys and compiling statistics on discrimination and violence against women and girls and women with disabilities.
- **Recommendation (3):** Urge the State of Palestine to ratify the Optional Protocol to CEDAW, and to recognize the Convention in the Basic Law in a clear and explicit provision.
- **Recommendation (4):** Publish the ratification of the Convention in the Official Gazette.

#### **Annex**

# Comments of the Non-Governmental and Women Coalition for the Implementation of CEDAW in the Occupied State of Palestine on the responses of the State of Palestine

#### 1- Discrimination

Addressing discrimination against women should not be restricted to one law only, such as the Law on Family Protection from Violence, as in the State's justification in its response on the list of issues. CEDAW Coalition believes that the state must address discrimination through harmonizing laws and legislations, and developing general and comprehensive policies at all aspects related to women that the Basic Law, and the Palestinian constitution, must provide for, as stipulated in CEDAW.

# 2- Publishing in the Official Gazette

Delaying publishing for four years after ratification of the Convention constitutes a violation of the Basic Law that makes its impact nil on the ground.

### 3- Legislative and policy framework and harmonizing laws

3.1 The jurisdiction of the measures taken or pledged by the state is restricted to the West Bank only, not Gaza Strip, which deprives a third of the women of Palestine from enjoying their rights in accordance with CEDAW because of division.

3.2 The response of the State of Palestine indicated that it should comply with the decision of the Constitutional Court Number (4/2017) which stipulates that the international conventions, including CEDAW, are supreme to national legislations.

We believe that this decision does not confirm that the state will comply with CEDAW because it is supreme to the national legislation, since the Constitutional Court decision adopted fully by the state places a restriction on such supremacy, whereby it states (in a manner that conforms with the national, religious and cultural identity of the Arab Palestinian people). Hence, we cannot consider this decision a conclusive affirmation of the state's commitment with CEDAW for the following reasons:

- -Paragraph (Para.) (1) contravenes with Para. (3), since CEDAW has not been published in the Official Gazette. It is inadmissible to implement any legislation unless it has been published in accordance with the Palestinian Basic law.
- -Para. (1) contravenes with the provisions of Para. (5), pertaining to the affirmation that local courts cannot use the provisions of CEDAW in their sentences unless it is published in the Official Gazette, since resorting to CEDAW has been linked to harmonizing the national legislations, which means that it cannot be considered supreme to national legislation.

- 3.3 The state has not issued the Law on Family Protection from Violence in line with the articles of CEDAW.
- 3.4 In its response, the state reiterated what had been mentioned in the Report on the partial revocation of some provisions of the applicable Penal Code No. 16 of 1960, applicable in the West Bank, while CEDAW Coalition considers that partial solutions are not an alternative to issuing and approving the Penal Code, and do not provide protection for women, but contribute to increasing and escalating violence against them.
- 3.5 Partial solutions in the Personal Status Law do not address discrimination against women and achieving gender equality, but leads to postponing issuing a personal status law that is in line with CEDAW articles.
- 3.6 The state did not comply with the implementation of the Palestine Liberation Organization (PLO) Central Council Decisions taken in 2015 and 2018, regarding allocating 30% of seats for women in all the state structures, including the National Council (PNC), the fundamental legislative body of the PLO. The rate of women PNC members did not exceed 10%, while only one woman made it to the Executive Committee, i.e. 6.6% and only 4% of the Central Council members were women. CEDAW Coalition believes that the state should have issued a Decision by Law on allocating 30% of seats for women, on the way towards attaining half.

### 4- The measures taken to annul discriminatory legislations against women

- 4.1 The implementation of the measures and plans mentioned in the state's Response and which aim at eliminating discrimination against women is still restricted to some limited training.
- 4.2 The Legislation Harmonization Committee does not adopt the methodology of gender equality in rights, but stems from the existing outdated legislative framework, and continues to adopt the prevailing patriarchal culture that marginalizes women.

#### 5. The Palestinian Central Bureau of Statistics

While the Palestinian Central Bureau of Statistics (PCBS) produced several regular surveys, gender related reports are casual and sporadic, and the excuse is lack of funding. The state does not develop gender-sensitive budgets. CEDAW Coalition believes that it is necessary to conduct surveys about women and work in the informal sector, women with disabilities, divorce and early marriage, and not suffice with quantitative statistics, but link the figures to the existing reality of discrimination against women.

### 6-Women access to justice

Although the state of Palestine took certain measures for gender mainstreaming, such as establishing gender units in the different ministries, especially at the prosecution and the police, women access to justice continues to be problematic. The inequality gap stems from inequality in the national laws and is reflected in enforcement at the different levels within the justice system. Moreover, the patriarchal culture prevails among the staff within the justice system, particularly the judges, prosecutors and the police. This is aggravated by the lack of confidentiality or private spaces for women at the Shari'a courts to maintain their dignity. The male and female employees neither have the conviction nor the knowledge, which constitutes a violation of the rights of women and girls, aggravates discrimination against women and impedes access to institutions because of lack of confidence in such institutions. Access to justice is more difficult for women with disabilities because they face several challenges. These include the lack of knowledge and information about the available institutions and their services, the financial costs of access to courts and justice, the difficulty of public transportation because of the lack of special facilities, and the influence of the negative attitude of the patriarchal culture towards women with disabilities on the staff in the different justice institutions<sup>47</sup>.

On the other hand, local studies lack an analysis of access to justice for women in the marginalized areas. Since the tribal laws prevail in rural areas more than elsewhere, women access to formal justice becomes almost impossible. Furthermore, there is a lack of civil society organizations and awareness programs about legal procedures and rights in the marginalized areas, in addition to difficulties in movement because of lack of transportation, mainly because of the isolation policy of the Israeli occupation against Area C. Despite all the afore-mentioned challenges, the State of Palestine did not take the necessary measures to facilitate access to justice for all women without discrimination.

The Response of the State of Palestine towards CEDAW inquiries on the procedures and measures did not reveal the real gap that obstructs women access to justice and the limited measures taken by the State of Palestine to facilitate women access. Most initiatives in the Palestinian society are those of local NGOs, which end with the end of the program or funding, hence lack sustainability and complementarity to facilitate women access to justice<sup>48</sup>. The Israeli occupation constitutes the major obstacle that impedes access of Palestinian women to justice because of military checkpoints, lack of freedom of movement because of eleven years of blockade imposed on Gaza Strip, the closure of Jerusalem in front of Palestinian men and women from the West Bank and Gaza, the full control of occupation over Area C in accordance with the Oslo

http://sites.birzeit.edu/cds/new-

cds/sites/default/files/sites/default/files/publications/%D8%AF%D8%B1%D8%A7%D8%B3%D8%A9%2 0%D9%88%D8%B5%D9%88%D9%84%20%D8%A7%D9%84%D9%86%D8%B3%D8%A7%D8%A1% 20%D8%B0%D9%88%D8%A7%D8%AA%20%D8%A7%D9%84%D8%A7%D8%B9%D8%A7%D9%8 2%D8%A9.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> Center for Development Studies, 2013, Access of women with Disabilities to Formal Justice Birzeit University, وصول النساء ذوات الاعاقة لاركان العدالة الرسمية.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> Interviews with lawyers from women rights institutions such as Qader and Women's Centre for Legal Aid and Counselling (WCLAC)

Accords, which deepened the legal and legislative differences, and which require holding the occupation accountable in accordance with CEDAW General Recommendation No.30.

# 7- Stereotypes and harmful practices

- 7.1 The presence of households headed by women does not constitute official efforts to remove stereotypes and traditional roles of men and women, as the State Report claims, since it addresses the problem from a relief perspective and does not link it to the developmental goals. Most of those women are widows, and the Ministry of Social Development put them on the list of the poorest of the poor program, which depends on external funding. This does not develop the status of those women.
  7.2 We do not believe that the slight relative increase in employing women in the judiciary is sufficient, as the rate did not exceed 23% in the West Bank, and 10% in Gaza Strip, bearing in mind that most of them were appointed as magistrates, which is the lowest level in the court structure.
- 7.3 The State's Response regarding the national dialogue and consultations to raise the marriage age does not absolve it from the responsibility. Since the inception of the Palestinian National Authority (PNA), women institutions and other civil society organizations exerted all possible efforts to officially raise the marriage age and criminalize child marriage. Nevertheless, this was not approved, in light of the prevailing patriarchal and tribal culture. The same applies to all other issues that directly involve discrimination against and objectification of women, and granting men control over women's lives as if women are lifetime minors who have no right to take decisions even when they reach the age of majority.