

WRITTEN COMMENTS

of the European Roma Rights Centre Concerning France

For Consideration by the Human Rights Committee at its 114th session
(29 June – 24 July 2015)



CHALLENGING DISCRIMINATION PROMOTING EQUALITY

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction	3
Forced Evictions of Roma Living in Settlements in France	3
Detention and Expulsion of Roma from France	4
Low Access to Education for Romani Children in France	5
Racially Motivated Attacks Against Roma in France	5
Hate Speech Against Roma in France	6
Recommendations	6
Appendix 1: France Attack List	8
Appendix 2: Hate Speech in France	16

INTRODUCTION

The European Roma Rights Centre¹ (ERRC) submits this parallel report to the Human Rights Committee, for consideration at the 114th session (29 June to 24 July 2015). This report highlights some of the key human rights concerns for Roma in France.

FORCED EVICTIONS OF ROMA LIVING IN SETTLEMENTS IN FRANCE

Since 2010 the ERRC has been closely monitoring the situation of EU-citizen Roma in France. That monitoring has revealed that France deals with Roma living in sub-standard housing by evicting their settlements on a regular basis. Not only do these evictions violate the fundamental rights of Roma, but they are also inefficient and harmful.

Throughout 2014, French authorities continued the systematic eviction of Roma. Those affected are EU citizens who have made use of their right to move freely within the European Union from countries such as Romania or Bulgaria. According to the findings of a survey² conducted by the European Roma Rights Centre (ERRC) and the Ligue des droits de l'homme (LDH), during the year 2014, 13,483 people were evicted by law enforcement agencies from 138 different locations. In other words, the French authorities evicted, on average, three settlements each week, leaving most of those concerned street homeless. These evictions constitute discrimination based on racial origin, a fundamental overarching provision of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR).³ Such actions are unlawful and discriminatory and therefore violate international and European Union law, including Article 2 (1), (3), Article 10, 12, 13, 14, 17, 24, 26 and 27 of the UN ICCPR. Moreover it is a costly policy that does not offer sustainable solution.

According to the findings of the survey based on the figures gathered through media monitoring and from NGO reports, a total of 13,483 Roma or people identified as Roma in France were forced to leave the area where they were living in 2014. A further 966 Roma were left homeless after a fire or a flood.

Compared to the 2013 figures, the numbers in 2014 are lower, but still represent almost 80% of the total population living in the predominantly Roma-populated slums. In other words, there were four evictions for every five people living in a slum in France. This proportion is unacceptable. Furthermore the report shows an uneven approach: some regions of France are evicting Roma at a massive rate whilst others offer a more peaceful climate. This suggests that the harassment perpetrated by the authorities within these critical regions is both unequal and inconsistent in their treatment of Roma across the country.

The eviction policy that the French authorities have eagerly implemented for the past several years is unsustainable, unfair and a short sighted solution to the situation of Roma living in slums. On the contrary, according to our findings, evictions continue to interfere with the education, social progress, medical care, and employment prospects of the inhabitants of the slums; eviction policy hinders all integration efforts, increases the vulnerability of Roma and pushes them further to the margins.

In 2013, the ERRC launched a participatory research⁴ and advocacy project which focused on the human rights of Romanian Roma living in informal settlements in France. ERRC undertook research in three different regions in France, on two settlements in each region, interviewing 118 adults in total.

Of the information collected, the most unsettling development concerned the situation of Romani children and their psychological well-being due to frequent forced evictions: 50% of respondents said that they, their children, or both suffered from psychological problems due to forced evictions. Of respondents reporting that their children had health problems after an eviction, 69% claimed those problems were psychological.

1 The European Roma Rights Centre is an international public interest law organisation working to combat anti-Romani racism and human rights abuse of Roma. The approach of the ERRC involves strategic litigation, international advocacy, research and policy development and training of Romani activists. More information about the organisation is available at: www.errc.org.

2 See: <http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/file/report%20forced%20evictions%20-%20final%20en.pdf>.

3 Article 2 (1) of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights.

4 See: <http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/file/destroying-progress-progressing-destruction.pdf>.

In France, the conditions in informal Romani settlements do not meet international standards on adequate housing. Nearly 30% of Roma are only notified of the eviction on the day they are evicted, which **leaves most families on the street**. No respondent reported having been offered alternative accommodation or emergency housing, depriving them of their right to shelter (*droit à l'hébergement*) under national law. Violent and degrading treatment during forced evictions have affected more than two-thirds of EU-citizen Roma who have been subject to evictions in France. Most Romani children in school at the time of eviction have their education interrupted, engaging Articles 2 (1), 24 and 26 of the UN ICCPR.

The ERRC is representing applicants in a forced eviction case before the European Court of Human Rights, **Hirtu and others v. France**.⁵ The applicants are Roma who are Romanian by nationality. Most of them have been living in France for over ten years and have residence documents in France as EU citizens. They have been subjected to various forced evictions over the years. This case concerns the eviction which was ordered by the Prefect of Seine-Saint-Denis (near Paris) on 29 March 2013 (Good Friday). Despite attempts to challenge the lawfulness of the eviction, the applicants wound up leaving the site where they were living on the night of 11 April 2013 in order to avoid being forcibly removed. They tried to settle nearby and were then moved on by the police on the morning of 12 April 2013. The applicants are still mostly living in France in slums, although some have been given social housing, which they had applied for before the April 2013 eviction. The case was communicated to the French government in April 2014. The Défenseur des Droits (French ombudsman) and the NGO Ligue des Droits de l'Homme submitted third-party interventions.

The ERRC is supporting one other case in the proceedings before the European Court as well. The ERRC is, in particular, challenging the failure of the French legal system to provide Roma with an effective remedy against evictions which automatically suspends the evictions whilst their lawfulness is being considered. Given that this is lack of effective remedy (Article 2 (3) of UN CCPR) promotes a pattern of racial harassment of Roma through evictions, it is the ERRC's view that this also engages Article 2 (1) and 26 of the Covenant.

DETENTION AND EXPULSION OF ROMA FROM FRANCE

For many years, France has applied a restrictive interpretation and application of the EU law governing the possibility of expelling EU citizens, which we believe is unlawful and targets Roma, engaging Articles 12 and 26 of the UN ICCPR.

On 26 February 2015 the ERRC, together with 6 other French NGOs,⁶ submitted a petition to the Petitions Committee of the European Parliament protesting against the deportation and detention of European Union citizens resident in France, including Romanian and Bulgarian nationals, a large majority of whom belong to the Roma community.

While the detention of EU citizens should only be exceptional, administrative detention is widely used in France for European citizens among whom Romanians and Bulgarians are overrepresented. Those detained do not have sufficient tools at their disposal to challenge their detention, despite the serious breach of their right to freedom of movement, asserted by the present covenant. The arbitrary detention of Roma awaiting expulsion directly infringing on their freedom of movement coupled with lack of an effective remedy engages Articles 2 (3), 9, and 10 of the UN ICCPR.

The information gathered by the various signatory organisations reveals that Romanian and Bulgarian citizens are given expulsion decisions in much greater proportions than citizens of other EU Member States. These measures target Roma from Romania and Bulgaria. In September 2010, the Immigration Minister, Eric Besson, said that during the first nine months of the year, 13,241 of the 21,384 foreigners deported from France were Romanian and Bulgarian nationals. Of these, over half were forcibly expelled and another half allegedly left France voluntarily through "assisted humanitarian return".

5 See: <http://hudoc.echr.coe.int/sites/eng/pages/search.aspx?i=001-144127#%7B%22itemid%22:%5B%22001-144127%22%5D%7D>.

6 Association européenne des droits de l'Homme (AEDH), ASSFAM, La Cimade, European Roma Rights Centre (ERRC), Groupe d'information et de soutien des immigré·e·s (GISTI), Ligue des Droits de l'Homme (LDH), Collectif National Droits de l'Homme Romeurope submitted letter to the Petitions Committee of the European Parliament.

As Human Rights Watch said in a report in September 2011: “[...], in practice, the French authorities continue to target Roma EU citizens to send them away, often when they are evacuated from camps or squats, in a way that constitutes unlawful discrimination under European law and human rights”.⁷

A few months later, in February 2011, the Immigration Minister announced that 70% of Roma camps considered “illegal” had been dismantled and 3,700 Roma had been sent back to their country of origin.

Since then, the French authorities have not improved the situation. In 2012, the new government continued to expel Roma EU citizens from France. In 2011 and 2012, the ERRC counted at least 66 collective OQTF (orders to leave French territory). When he was Interior Minister, Manuel Valls said in the press that “Roma are destined to return to Bulgaria and Romania”.

In this racially stigmatising atmosphere, Roma seem to be a particular target for OQTFs. It is currently too difficult to keep ethnic data about persons in detention centres, but many NGO reports clearly show that a disproportionate number of people affected by this policy are of Roma origin.⁸

LOW ACCESS TO EDUCATION FOR ROMANI CHILDREN IN FRANCE

UNICEF statistics for France from December 2013 indicate that 99% of all school-age children attend primary school and 98.1% and 99.8% of all boys and girls, respectively, attend secondary school.⁹ French law states that education is obligatory for all children, French or foreign, from the ages of 6-16.¹⁰

Nevertheless, only 47% of Romani respondents to the ERRC’s survey¹¹ said that their school-age children in France were in school; that is less than half of the enrolment rate of French children. Among respondents with school-age children out of school, 59.4% reported that this was because they had been told by administrators that there is no place in their school.

Refusal to enrol Romani children in schools is discriminatory and in direct violation of international human rights standards, particularly Article 2 (1), 24 and 26 of the UN ICCPR.

The majority, 60%, of respondents with children in school said that their children have no problems, but 27% said that their children had problems concerning money (to pay for food, clothes, supplies etc.), 10% reported that other pupils do not treat them well, and 10% said that the school administration treats them poorly.

RACIALLY MOTIVATED ATTACKS AGAINST ROMA IN FRANCE

The ERRC has been compiling a list of racially motivated attacks against Roma thanks to in-the-field monitoring and media articles, this list is available in appendix 1. The response of the French authorities, which in the ERRC’s view has been inadequate and in direct conflict with Article 2, 7 Article 26 of UN ICCPR.

7 Human Rights Watch, “France’s Compliance with the European Free Movement Directive and the Expulsion of Ethnic Roma EU Citizens”, a Briefing Paper Submitted to the European Commission in July 2011.

8 See: “We ask for justice”: Europe’s failure to protect Roma from racist violence, Amnesty International report, Avril 2014, and Human Rights Watch, “France’s Compliance with the European Free Movement Directive and the Expulsion of Ethnic Roma EU Citizens”, a Briefing Paper Submitted to the European Commission in July 2011.

9 See: http://www.unicef.org/infobycountry/france_statistics.html/.

10 Code de l’éducation. Article L131-1, available at: <http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichCodeArticle.do?idArticle=LEGIARTI00000652442&cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006071191>.

11 See: <http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/file/report%20forced%20evictions%20-%20final%20en.pdf>.

HATE SPEECH AGAINST ROMA IN FRANCE

Roma are among the least tolerated communities in France, reveals a 2014 study¹² from the *Commission National Consultative des Droits de l'Homme* (CNCDH). The opinion poll highlights the worrying prejudices held against Roma by the native population. Of all minority groups in Europe, Roma, disproportionately experience social exclusion beyond that encountered by Muslims and Jews, according to the US-based *Pew Research Center*. In France, two in three respondents have unfavourable opinions of Roma according to this survey¹³. This climate of hate against Roma engages France's responsibility under multiple provisions of the UN ICCPR, particularly Articles 19, 20 and 26.

The European Roma Rights Centre has been compiling a list of anti-Roma statements thanks to in-the-field monitoring and media articles. This list is available in appendix 2.

RECOMMENDATIONS

General recommendations to French authorities for improving respect for the civil and political rights of Roma from other EU Member States residing in France under ICCPR:

1. Introduce appropriate, targeted measures into the French National Roma Integration Strategy to address the inclusion of Roma from other EU Member States residing in France effectively and holistically, and allocate sufficient funds for their implementation and to effectively monitor their results.
2. Give full effect to the rights of Roma to free movement without discrimination (i.e. Article 2 (1), 26 in conjunction with 12 (1) UN ICCPR by:
 - a. requiring authorities, whenever they come into contact with EU Romani citizens, to make an individualised determination of whether that person is exercising free-movement rights; and
 - b. taking advantage of the facilities offered by the European Commission to facilitate the social integration of Roma.¹⁴
3. Immediately cease the costly and ineffective practice of evicting and expelling Roma without undertaking any proportionality analysis. Until such time as all Roma from other Member States are able to access regular housing, ensure the provision of water, sanitation, and other services to informal Romani settlements.
4. Monitor the implementation of the August 2012 Circular requiring local authorities to conduct social assessments to identify alternative housing in advance of evictions.
5. Investigate all reports of violence or degrading treatment by police or public officials during the eviction of Romani communities. Pursue appropriate sanctions against any police officer or public official found to be guilty.
6. Ensure equal access to basic rights, including health insurance and health care, access to emergency housing, education and legal aid, for Roma from other Member States in France.
7. Increase support for NGOs working to facilitate the inclusion and integration of Romani communities in France.

Recommendations to ensure respect for the rights of EU-citizen Romani children in France to access education without discrimination (Article 2 (1), 24 and 26 of UN ICCPR):

1. Investigate all reported instances of refusal by schools to enrol Romani children. Require the immediate enrolment of all school-age Romani children. Pursue sanctions against offending schools, particularly under anti-discrimination laws. Provide special support to help Romani children previously refused enrolment so they can make up the time they have missed in school.

12 See: <http://www.cncdh.fr/fr/publications/rapport-racisme-antisemitisme-et-xenophobie-2013-banalisation-de-la-parole-raciste-et>.

13 See: <http://www.pewglobal.org/2014/05/12/chapter-4-views-of-roma-muslims-jews/>.

14 See: http://ec.europa.eu/justice/citizen/document/files/com_2013_837_free-movement_en.pdf.

2. Instead of refusing enrolment to children who lack proof of vaccination, housing, or any other document not required by law for enrolment, amend the administrative requirements so that such children are enrolled first and these requirements are addressed immediately.
3. Conduct outreach and provide support to Romani families to enrol school-age children not currently enrolled in school.
4. Take the necessary steps to ensure, in accordance with France's obligations under the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child, that the best interest of the child is a primary consideration for local authorities and courts in the consideration of any eviction. Appoint or establish an independent monitor (e.g. within the DDD) to examine the rights of Romani children in the implementation of forced evictions and to work with local authorities and NGOs to ensure that the best interests principle is respected in the context of all evictions.

Where eviction cannot be avoided:

- a. Develop effective plans in collaboration with affected Romani families to ensure that no EU Romani child's education is interrupted or terminated as a result of eviction; and
 - b. Provide medical and psychological support to EU Romani children to help them deal with the trauma experienced.
5. Provide immediate access to medical insurance to all EU Romani children currently without medical coverage in France.

APPENDIX 1: FRANCE ATTACK LIST

Updated 13 March 2015

19. Police Violence on a Formal Settlement in Lille			
Location:	Villeneuve d'Ascq, France	Date of incident	8 February 2015
Source:	Articles in newspapers: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • http://www.nordeclair.fr/info-locale/villeneuve-d-ascq-nouvelles-interpellations-au-camp-rom-jna57b0n632106 • http://www.lavoixdunord.fr/region/villeneuve-d-ascq-intervention-policriere-tendue-dans-ia28b0n2651156 • http://www.20minutes.fr/lille/1538647-20150211-camp-roms-4-cantons-police-pourrait-attaquer-diffamation NGO: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • http://blogs.mediapart.fr/blog/jjmu/090215/camp-de-roms-attaque-de-nuit-par-des-hommes-armes-les-policiers-de-la-bac-tirent-sur-les-victimes 		
<p>On Sunday 8 February, 4 policemen entered the formal settlement of Quatre Cantons, close to the University of Lille.</p> <p>Reports from Roma say the policemen seemed under the influence of some substance, perhaps alcohol or drug. Without reason or explanation, they allegedly attacked several people. Some adults tried to chase them from the settlement, pushing them away non-violently to protect children. The police fired shots into the air. Tear gas was also used, which burned the eyes of the children. A little girl was strangled and an adult was injured on the eye because of a flash-grenade.</p> <p>The policemen gave a quite different account. They allege that an investigation was initiated following an aggressive incident occurred in the late afternoon on the subway, which was later officially confirmed. The victim of this incident described his attackers as two young Romani adults. Consequently five policemen conducted search on the settlement of 4 Cantons. The police allege that upon entering the settlement they were greeted aggressively and were targeted with all sorts of projectiles, forcing them to use tear gas and fire two flash-grenades.</p> <p>The police returned to the settlement on the three following days to conduct “identity checks” and update the national database of DNA (FNAEG). During this, several people were arrested and 5 people who had not against whom expulsions orders were in force were deported.</p> <p>Based on the account of the Roma involved and picture evidence, we can conclude that police used excessive force and basically carried out a raid on the settlement. We call for an investigation into the police conduct as none was carried out.</p>			

18. “Roma Family Chased Away From New House”			
Location:	Roubaix, France	Date of incident	7 November 2014
Source:	Articles in newspapers: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • http://www.lavoixdunord.fr/region/roubaix-une-famille-rom-chassee-par-le-voisinage-ia24b58797n2479877 • http://www.nordeclair.fr/info-locale/roubaix-la-famille-rom-chassee-du-cul-de-four-ia50b12891n586359 		
<p>A family who was living in a squat in Roubaix was relocated into social housing before the eviction of the squat. The Roma family along with housing officials went to their new home to visit it. “After the visit, when we left the house, the neighbours came to us”, said Raj and Luminita with the help of their daughter Loisa, 12, who translated. “They were aggressive. They said they were going to break the windows and play loud music. They said they would set our apartment on fire”. The animosity by the neighbours was so strong that officials who accompanied the Roma family told them they could not move in. Anyway, parents and children were too afraid. They were offered accommodation in a hotel instead and moved in an apartment in another neighbourhood in January 2015.</p> <p>The ERRC thinks that authorities should provide adequate protection to all without discrimination. Instead of sending this family to a hotel, they should have ensured that they can move into the social housing without being harassed by their neighbours.</p>			

17. “A Romani woman violently attacked in Vitry-sur-Seine” Failure of police to adequately investigate a racially motivated attack			
Location:	Vitry-sur-Seine, France	Date of incident	3 October 2014
Source:	Articles in newspapers: Press release from MRAP Vitry Contact details: Charles Bouhanna, Yves Loriette (yvesloriette@free.fr), Didier Poupardin Fédération du Val de Marne 36 rue Audigeois 94400-VITRY		
<p>On 7 October 2014, in the market of Ivry-sur-Seine, a shopkeeper attacked a Romani mother. He violently hit her with an iron bar and smashed her scalp. He also punched her in the ribs while shouting racial insults (“Romanian you are all thieves, go home”). Weakened by poor health Mihaela fell to the ground with a bloodied face. She was rescued by locals and firemen took her to the hospital of the Kremlin-Bicetre, where she was diagnosed with injuries that gave her two days of temporary incapacity for work. Further exploratory examinations were not conducted.</p> <p>Mihaela went to Ivry’s police station to file a complaint. The police officers refused to record it. Then she returned along with a member of a support group (Collectif de soutien aux familles roumaines d’Ivry) and they faced the same refusal. It took the first deputy mayor of Ivry to intervene for the complaint to be recorded. The support group thinks that the investigation will lead to the dismissal of the case because of lack of credible witness.</p>			

16. “Young Roma boy violently assaulted in Pierrefitte-sur-Seine”			
Location:	Pierrefitte-sur-Seine, France	Date of incident	13 June 2014
Source:	Articles in newspapers: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • http://www.nytimes.com/2014/06/18/world/europe/roma-teenager-in-coma-after-attack-near-paris.html • http://www.lemonde.fr/societe/article/2014/06/17/une-vengeance-privee-a-l-origine-du-lynchage-d-un-jeune-rom_4440099_3224.html 		
<p>A 17-year-old boy was seized from his settlement in Pierrefitte-sur-Seine, a northern suburb of Paris, by nearby residents. They took him to a cave where he was beaten to unconsciousness, then stuffed into a shopping trolley and wheeled to the roadside and left there. Police investigators said that following an attempted robbery allegedly by the victim, the residents decided to “take justice into their own hands”.</p> <p>The boy woke up from coma in July and left the hospital in September 2014.</p> <p>Investigations were opened by the attorney general on 17 June 2014. Charges included: attempted pre-meditated murder committed in a group, illegal restriction of one’s liberty.</p> <p>As of March 2015, perpetrators have not been arrested yet.</p>			

15. Law-enforcement Officers Remove Mattress of Roma Family Living on the Streets			
Location:	Paris, France	Date of incident	2 April 2014
Source:	Articles in newspapers: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • http://www.mediapart.fr/journal/france/060514/roms-une-video-revele-les-methodes-des-policiers • http://rue89.nouvelobs.com/zapnet/2014/05/06/methode-policiers-matelas-camionnette-251966 		
<p>Three law-enforcement officers were recorded on videotape as they were removing the mattress of a Roma family living on the streets of Paris. The video was published on 2 April 2014.</p> <p>A lawyer called Lionel Crusoe commented “The confiscation of property without justification, without authorization and by abusing the vulnerability of the owner amounts to the criminal offence of theft”</p> <p>“A policy of deterrence and self-eviction is covertly implemented, but not explicitly declared, or rarely as in the case of the internal note of the police station of the 6th district of Paris, withdrawn after the controversy surrounding its dissemination, which ordered police to “evict systematically” the “Roma families” of the sector.” <i>Mediapart</i>.</p>			

14. "Roma attacked with acid in Paris"			
Location:	Paris, France	Date of incident	16 January 2014
Source:	Articles in newspapers: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • http://www.liberation.fr/societe/2014/02/05/des-roms-agressees-avec-un-produit-caustique-a-paris_978125 • http://www.mediapart.fr/journal/france/050214/des-familles-roms-agressees-lacide-paris 		
<p>Two Roma filed a complaint after being attacked with acid by a man. They live on the street, on one of Paris' biggest place, the Place de la République. They were attacked but nobody was injured, the liquid fortunately only poured on their mattress. Two NGO members witnessed the whole scene and supported the Roma when they filed the complaint. They say it's not the first time this happens, the same man already threw acid on Roma people in the past.</p> <p>The government spokesperson qualified this attack as racist.</p> <p>A preliminary investigation was launched and a suspect was held in custody. He was set free until his trial on 7 April 2014.</p> <p><u>May 2014</u>: he was not convicted as the Court was unsure about the substance of the liquid that was thrown at the Roma</p>			

13. Arson Attack On A Roma Camp in Lille			
Location:	Hellemmes, France	Date of incident	7 June 2013
Source:	Articles in newspapers: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • http://www.rtl.fr/actualites/info/article/lille-jets-de-cocktails-molotov-contre-un-camp-de-roms-7762120674 • http://france3-regions.francetvinfo.fr/nord-pas-de-calais/2013/06/08/hellemmes-des-cocktails-molotov-lances-contre-le-camp-des-roms-266225.html 		
<p>During the night of 6 June 2013, Roma have been the target of an arson attack. Three "Molotov cocktails" were thrown but none reached the caravans. There were no injuries but the perpetrators shouted racist insults. The attacked Roma filed a complaint and the Mayor of Hellemmes said he would not tolerate any racism. An investigation was launched but the Roma never heard back from the police.</p>			

12. Police Attack on a Settlement Near Lyon			
Location:	Saint Fons, France	Date of incident	8 January 2013
Source:	Articles in newspapers: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • « St Fons (69): Un camp de Roms saccagé par la police », France 3 Rhône-Alpes, 9 janvier 2013, http://rhone-alpes.france3.fr/2013/01/09/st-fons-69-un-camp-de-roms-saccage-par-la-police-177027.html • « La police gaze des enfants et saccage un camp de roms », Mediapart, 12 janvier 2013, http://blogs.mediapart.fr/blog/philippe-alain/120113/la-police-gaze-des-enfants-et-saccage-un-camp-de-roms • « A Saint-Fons, la police a-t-elle gazé gratuitement des Roms ? », Rue89 Lyon, 9 janvier 2013, http://www.rue89lyon.fr/2013/01/09/a-saint-fons-la-police-a-t-elle-gaze-gratuitement-des-roms/ Entretien téléphonique avec un militant local: 9 et 14 janvier 2012.		
<p>On 8 January 2013, several policemen came to the largest Roma settlement in Saint-Fons (Lyon) with four dogs.¹⁵ The inhabitants say the policemen broke car windows, sprayed tear-gas on people, insulted them and wrecked the settlement. It seems that earlier in the day, a police car was the target of stone-throwing by children from the settlement. Policemen said the aim of the visit was to identify those responsible for the stone-throwing attack. Press articles suggest it might have been children. The police justify such use of force by having to face thirty “hostile individuals” at the settlement. An investigation was launched to identify who threw stones at the police van, and the Roma also filed a complaint because of the destruction of the car windows. A local activist told the ERRC that the prosecutor decided not to prosecute.</p>			

11. Two Cars Burnt Down In a Roma Settlement			
Location:	Hellemmes, France	Date of incident	21 December 2012
Source:	Articles in newspapers: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • http://www.dailymotion.com/video/xw8wcv_roms-des-vehicules-incendies-dans-le-camp-d-hellemmes_news#.UOPvljnchaU 		
<p>On Monday 21 December at 5:00 AM, two cars were burnt down in the <i>village</i> of Hellemmes, close to Lille. After being evicted from their informal settlement in August the same year, five families were selected to be part of an “<i>housing</i> project”. While small houses are being built, they are still living in caravans. There are strong feelings against the project in Lille and in the suburbs and many protests took place lead by angry inhabitants. The fire resulted in no injuries but the families are left without a car to take their children to school and to work.</p>			

15 See: <http://www.rue89lyon.fr/2013/01/09/a-saint-fons-la-police-a-t-elle-gaze-gratuitement-des-roms/>.

10. Local Residents Chase Roma Away From Their Settlement			
Location:	Marseille, France	Date of incident	27 September 2012
Source:	Articles in newspapers: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • « Marseille, des riverains excédés chassent des Roms », <i>Le Point</i>, 27 September 2012, http://www.lepoint.fr/societe/des-roms-chasses-par-des-riverains-a-marseille-28-09-2012-1511071_23.php • https://www.amnesty.org/fr/documents/EUR01/007/2014/fr/ 		
<p>A group of 35 Roma, including 15 children, were forced to leave the piece of land - where they were living - by local residents, who later returned and even set fire to the belongings of the Roma.</p> <p>The incident took place in Les Créneaux, in the northern district of Marseille in the early evening. According to media reports, police witnessed verbal insults against the Roma and separated the groups, before the Roma fled. The Roma had been living there for four days, after they had already been evicted from their previous housing.</p> <p>“Three of the Roma who were threatened filed a complaint and the investigation is still ongoing. Astonishingly, the police told Amnesty International that the investigation did not identify any suspects for the arson attack because the police had already left the site when the personal belongings were set alight. The police also said that the investigation could not prove that the Roma were threatened with violence.⁶² Some of the neighbors declared to the media that they wanted the Roma to leave the area because they had engaged in criminal activities but denied having threatened them”.¹⁶</p>			

9. Stones thrown at a Roma settlement			
Location:	Metz, France	Date of incident	From July to November 2012
Source:	Articles in newspapers: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • http://tempsreel.nouvelobs.com/societe/20120904.OBS1206/a-metz-au-coeur-du-probleme-de-logement-des-roms.html 		
<p>A settlement of 40 adults and 20 children had been the target of several possibly racially motivated attacks since July 2012 in Metz (north east of France).</p> <p>The Roma from <i>Les Sablons</i> settlement are experiencing threats and harassment, and thus cannot sleep. An unknown group of people gather frequently around their houses to throw rocks and all sort of sharp items at them. From the video published by local activists, these thrown objects can be very big and thus could be very dangerous. Even though the police and the local authorities have been notified about these attacks, nothing has been done so far to prevent an accident.</p>			

8. Fire In a Romani Camp, The Inhabitants Have Seen A Mob Attack			
Location:	Massy, France	Date of incident	26 March 2012
Source:	Articles in newspapers: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Un campement Rom détruit par le feu dans l'Essonne, 26 mars 2012, http://www.liberation.fr/societe/01012398394-un-campement-rom-detruit-par-le-feu-dans-l-essonne 		
<p>On 26 March 2012, in Massy, a city 20 km away from Paris, a fire started and forced the 200 Roma inhabitant of the settlement to flee. In a press release, the Mayor said the fire was accidental and might have come from a stove. Though many inhabitants stated that it was the result of a mob attack. The local police failed to look any deeper into the incident and the case was closed.</p>			

16 Excerpt from Amnesty's report: <https://www.amnesty.org/fr/documents/EUR01/007/2014/fr/>.

7. Double Attacks Against a Romani Squat			
Location:	Vaulx-en-Velin, France	Date of incident	10 March 2012
Source:	Articles in newspapers: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • http://www.20minutes.fr/article/897529/roms-suscitent-vives-tensions; • http://www.lyoncapitale.fr/Journal/univers/Actualite/Faits-divers/Vaulx-en-Velin-situation-explosive-aux-abords-du-campement-Rom; • http://www.lyonmag.com/article/37503/attaque-contre-des-roms-dans-le-rhone-la-lah-denonce-leur-stigmatisation-et-accuse-sarkozy; • http://www.lyon-info.fr/?Un-squat-de-Roms-attaque-a-Vaulx 		
<p>The squat of some Romani families in Vaulx-en-Velin (69) on 3 March 2012, has created tensions within the neighbourhood. On 9 March, a group of young people threw stones at the Romani settlement. The police told the Roma to come back in the shacks, even though the families reported threats of a fire attack. The same group who previously attacked returned the day after and threw a Molotov cocktail at a car that belonged to a Romani individual. No one got hurt but many children were in danger, who were living in this house, including a 15 days-old baby.</p>			

6. One Dead in the Attack of a Roma Camp			
Location:	Paris, France	Date of incident	16 October 2011
Source:	Articles in newspapers: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Paris/incendie : un corps retrouvé”, <i>Le Figaro</i>, 26 October 2011, available at: http://www.lefigaro.fr/flash-actu/2011/10/25/97001-20111025FILWWW00637-parisincendie-un-cors-retrouve.php. 		
<p>On 16 October 2011, a squat in Paris, home to 114 Romani people including 43 children, caught fire. The fire destroyed the sheds, and caused the death of one person and minor injuries to two others. Witnesses reported seeing hooded individuals throwing Molotov cocktails. The prosecutor of Paris asked the police to investigate to verify the testimony of a witness who said he saw “people throw Molotov cocktails”. The ERRC has no further information about the conclusions of the investigation.</p>			

5. Possible Arson Attack on a Romani camp in Montpellier			
Location:	Montpellier, France	Date of incident	10 June 2011
Source:	Articles in newspapers: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • http://www.montpellier-journal.fr/2011/06/attaque-du-camp-de-roms-roumains-de-la-mogere-que-fait-la-police.html 		
<p>A violent attack on a camp of Romanian Roma occurred on 10 June 2011 near Montpellier, in which six men threw two Molotov cocktails at the parked automobiles and caravans. Although, none of the inhabitants were injured, a fire broke out and caused extensive property damage.</p> <p>On 10 June 2010, two Molotov cocktails were thrown on a settlement in Montpellier. Despite it being a very violent attack, it received very small media coverage.</p>			

4. A Farmer Shoots At Two Roma Stealing from His Field			
Location:	Corconne, France	Date of incident	20 April 2011
Source:	Articles in newspapers: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Un viticulteur tire sur deux Roms : quatre mois de prison avec sursis”, 7 June 2011, http://www.midilibre.fr/2011/06/06/coups-de-feu-sursis-pour-le-viticulteur,330970.php 		
<p>A farmer shot two Roma who were stealing a metal stake from his field. He chased them with his car and shot at them with a rifle while they were running away. There were no casualties. The farmer got a suspended sentence of four months, whereas the Roma to six months with three months suspended.</p>			

3. Masked Attack on a Roma Settlement in Marseille			
Location:	Marseille, France	Date of incident	16 January 2011
Source:	Articles in newspapers: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • « La porte d'Aix fermée aux Roms », <i>20minutes</i>, 27 January 2011, available at: http://www.20minutes.fr/article/659764/marseille-la-porte-aix-fermee-roms • http://www.millebords.org/spip.php?article16276 		
<p>A very serious attack happened on 16 January 2011 in Marseille. A group of 20 masked people attacked a Romani family, physically assaulting their children and burning their tents in Porte d'Aix.</p> <p>The alleged perpetrators shouted: “Fucking Roma, We’re hooligans We will rob you!”. Two tents were burned. During the fight, a Roma was injured with iron bars shots. However, his condition did not require hospitalization. The police immediately rushed to the scene and managed to arrest eight people likely to have participated in the attack. The ERRC has no further information about the conclusions of the investigation.</p>			

2. Attacks against The Roma of Triel-sur-Seine by Fake Policemen			
Location:	Triel sur Seine, France	Date of incident	27 October 2010
Source:	Articles in newspapers: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Yvelines, un camp de Roms attaqué”, 30 October 2010, http://www.lefigaro.fr/flash-actu/2010/10/30/97001-20101030FILWWW00393-yvelines-un-camp-de-roms-attaque.php 		
<p>On the night of 27 October 2010, several masked and armed individuals broke into a camp of Roma in Triel-sur-Seine (Yvelines). They arrived on the scene in a vehicle equipped with a flashing light. They opened the doors of the caravans and barged inside with rifles and batons. Some Roma reported to the police, that they were harassed and threatened with firearms. The perpetrators allegedly fired shots into the air, and were dressed as police officers. They also confiscated the identity cards and money of several people in the camp.</p>			

1. Attack Against a Bulgarian Romani Camp			
Location:	Bobigny, France	Date of incident	5 August 2010
Source:	Articles in newspapers: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • « Le campement des exilés bulgares ravagé par le feu », <i>Le Parisien</i>, 6 August 2010, http://www.leparisien.fr/faits-divers/le-campement-des-exiles-bulgares-ravage-par-le-feu-06-08-2010-1023456.php 		
<p>A Bulgarian family had been living in a squat in Bobigny for two years. According to some witnesses a man came, threw something inside the squat and then there was a big flame. The fire resulted in no casualties, but the Bulgarians lost everything. No investigation and prosecution was launched.</p>			

APPENDIX 2: HATE SPEECH IN FRANCE

Hate speech, protests and petitions against Roma 2013-2014

Note: This list is not exhaustive and is done with on-the-field monitoring and media monitoring.

WHAT?	WHEN?	SOURCE
<p><u>Mehdy Mikkiche, local activist for the Union pour un Mouvement Populaire (UMP) political party in Eure-et-Loire:</u></p> <p>On 24 August 2012, he tweeted: “Roma pollute us and I’m not ashamed to say that these people are vermins!” (in French: « <i>Les Roms nous polluent et je n’ai pas honte de le dire : ces gens ne sont que vermine !</i> »)</p> <p>The MRAP filed a complaint. He was expelled from the UMP party.</p>	24 August 2012	Article in French: http://www.leparisien.fr/politique/exclu-de-l-ump-pour-avoir-traite-les-roms-de-vermine-28-08-2012-2140288.php
<p><u>Jean-Marie Le Pen, Front National (FN)</u></p> <p>During an FN congress in the northwestern town of La Baule on 22 September 2012, he likened Roma to birds, adding “they steal naturally.” He said: “Les Roms c’est comme les oiseaux, ils volent naturellement” (in English : Roma are like birds, they “<i>volent</i>” naturally (<i>volent</i> in French can mean “fly” or “steal”))</p> <p><u>UPDATE 14 NOVEMBER 2013</u> Two months of suspended prison and a fine required by the Prosecutor</p> <p><u>UPDATE DECEMBER 2013</u> Le Pen was fined 5.000€.</p> <p><u>UPDATE 20 NOVEMBER 2014</u> The court of appeal of Paris confirmed an earlier decision in December 2013, which found Le Pen guilty of his racist comments against the Roma community. The 5.000€ fine was upheld.</p>	22 September 2012	<p>http://tempsreel.nouvelobs.com/politique/20131114.AFP2113/jean-marie-le-pen-condamne-pour-ses-propos-sur-les-roms.html</p> <p>http://www.pressestv.ir/detail/2014/11/20/386820/french-court-upholds-le-pen-racism-fine/</p>
2013		
<p><u>Dominique Baert, Mayor of Wattrelos, Parti socialiste (PS)</u></p> <p>He called for an eviction of the settlement located in the district of Plouys owned by the urban community of Lille.</p> <p>“We respect and will respect the law on halting sites for travellers. But for Roma, I say NO! Those who were settled in the Plouys should go, the sooner the better. I do not accept that the name of my town is smeared by media headlines because of mafia-like behaviour of people who have nothing to do here. It is a matter of public safety and human dignity.”</p>	1 January 2013	Article in French: http://www.lavoixdunord.fr/region/wattrelos-le-maire-subventionne-le-commissariat-et-pointe-ia24b0n951867

<p><u>Stéphane Raffali, Mayor of Ris-Orangis (PS)</u></p> <p>During a public meeting, a woman says: “They steal [the Roma] but I don’t let them to do so”. The Mayor replies: “You are right. This is a disruption of public order”.</p>	<p>20 February 2013</p>	<p>Source: Romeurope http://www.romeurope.org/IMG/pdf/tableau_-_discours_stigmatisants.pdf</p>
<p><u>Manuel Valls, Minister of Interior (PS)</u></p> <p>In an interview, the Interior Minister, Manuel Valls (PS) stated that Roma “do not want to integrate in our country for cultural reasons or because they are in the hands of begging or prostitution networks”. He also said that he shared the opinion of the Romanian Prime Minister Victor Ponta, who said that Roma “are intended to remain in or return to Romania.”</p> <p>UPDATE: The NGO La Voix des Rroms sued Manuel Valls for these statements. On 4 December 2014, the criminal court (tribunal correctionnel) concluded it did not have jurisdiction as Valls said this while holding the position of a minister. The criminal court referred the case to the Court of justice of the republic (for government’s members only)</p>	<p>14 March 2013</p>	<p>Article in French: http://www.lemonde.fr/societe/article/2013/03/15/pour-m-valls-les-roms-ne-souhaitent-pas-s-integrer_1849054_3224.html</p> <p>http://www.liberation.fr/politiques/2014/12/04/propos-sur-les-roms-le-tribunal-pas-competent-pour-juger-manuel-valls_1156773</p>
<p><u>Samia Ghali, socialist Mayor of the 15th and 16th districts of Marseille (PS)</u></p> <p>During a visit in one of her districts, Samia Ghali stated: “When Roma settle somewhere, it is proved that there is an increase in burglaries”.</p>	<p>9 April 2013</p>	<p>Article in French: http://www.marsactu.fr/politique/quand-les-roms-installent-on-a-une-recrudescence-des-cambriolages-30833.html</p>
<p><u>Marine Le Pen, Front National, press release (FN)</u></p> <p>“Statistically, the thesis of accidental origin [of the fire] is extremely doubtful. One cannot help thinking that these mysterious fires are deliberately triggered to force authorities to rehouse illegal Roma for free. [...] In addition, the organized looting of the country by foreign nomad criminal networks must stop. [...] France must deport all illegal immigrants from its territory, including the Roma.”</p>		<p>PR of the Front National http://www.frontnational.com/2013/04/multiplication-des-incendies-de-campements-de-roms-quand-sar-retera-la-naivete-criminelle-du-gouvernement-francais/</p>
<p><u>Jean-François Noyes, elected representative in the Département (Conseil Général) of Bouches du Rhône (PS)</u></p> <p>During a protest against a project of building a formal settlement: “They cannot live only on what they find in the garbage. Although there are a few who work, they live out of robbery”</p>	<p>25 May 2013</p>	<p>Article in French: http://www.marsactu.fr/societe/tout-ce-que-vous-avez-toujours-voulu-savoir-sur-les-roms-31303.html</p>

<p><u>“Roma in Auschwitz”:</u></p> <p>During a public meeting about the transfer of a Roma settlement to another place, a person said we should send the Roma to Auschwitz.</p> <p>The Mayor of Roubaix and the Ligue des Droits de l’Homme (LDH) filed a complaint for incitement to racial hatred. However, during the preliminary investigation, the mayor did not want to pursue with his complaint and investigators summonses were left with no answer.</p>	<p>End of May 2013</p>	<p>Article in French: http://www.lavoixdunord.fr/region/les-roms-a-auschwitz-le-maire-de-roubaix-depose-ia24b58797n1297259</p> <p>http://www.nordeclair.fr/faits-divers-justice/propos-sur-les-roms-et-auschwitz-la-ldh-de-roubaix-porte-ia0b0n239071</p>
<p><u>Front National of Lille (FN)</u></p> <p>On the website of the Front National of Lille, a message said: “Wasquehal must become a normal city.” It then says that a petition was launched by the shopkeepers of Pavé de Lille, who collected 1,400 signatures in 17 days. It “denounces the growing presence of Roma in the city and demonstrates that the residents and traders facing this exponential rise in insecurity in Wasquehal are fed up” [...] “There is an urgent need, as suggested by the Front National, to send a clear message to Roma who plan on settling on the territory of the municipality of Wasquehal: you must leave the city”.</p>	<p>31 May 2013</p>	<p>Article in French: http://www.nordeclair.fr/info-locale/wasquehal-le-fn-prepare-sa-liste-pour-une-premiere-ia50b0n241828</p>
<p><u>Christian Estrosi, Mayor of Nice (UMP):</u></p> <p>“I want everyone to know that those who do not respect the laws of the Republic, the Roma squatters and illegal immigrants, are not welcome in the city of Nice and I will take all measures necessary to keep on applying pressure”</p> <p><i>« Je souhaite que chacun sache que ceux qui ne respectent pas les lois de la République, que les Roms, les squatteurs et les étrangers en situation irrégulière ne sont pas les bienvenus sur le territoire de la ville de Nice et je prendrai toutes les mesures pour ne pas relâcher la pression. »</i></p>	<p>1 June 2013</p>	<p>Article in French: http://www.nice-premium.com/actualite,42/roms-est-il-impossible-de-concilier-humanitaire-et-securitaire,12057.html</p>
<p><u>René Réthoré, Mayor of Nancy (PS)</u></p> <p>In the issue n°175 Nancy news, the mayor, René Réthoré (PS) declared that the city is “tougher with Roma camps” since 2 January 2013. “The Mayor said he asked the Prefect of Seine-Saint-Marne for “the immediate eviction of the people settling” and ordered “weekly identity checks of vehicles and people”.</p>	<p>June 2013</p>	<p>Source: Romeurope http://www.romeurope.org/IMG/pdf/tableau_-_discours_stigmatisants.pdf</p>

<p><u>Guy Teissier, Member of Parliament from Marseille (UMP):</u></p> <p>Translation of a press article: “We pointed out to Guy Teissier that there are about 2000 Roma in the city. He replied “But it’s 2000 too many! Even if it was ten it would be too many. This is not a problem of quantity, it is the problem of our ability to integrate. We don’t have capacity to integrate anymore. It’s 2000 plus the thousands of illegal and legal immigrants who arrive in the country. And we have to integrate, to educate, to provide health care and housing to all of them. This is the problem. “</p> <p>The speech advocated zero immigration, which has long been the policy of the Front National.“</p>	<p>7 June 2013</p>	<p>Article in French: http://www.marsactu.fr/politique/guy-teissier-sur-integration-des-roms-meme-sils-etaient-dix-cest-encore-trop-31406.html</p>
<p><u>Julien Sanchez, elected representative in the Département (Conseil Général) of Gard (FN)</u></p> <p>“There are 1.5 million people waiting to get social housing. These Romanians settled illegally, the Mayors complain about the nuisance (pilferage, health hazards, prostitution, child labour...) and the situation is not changing an inch despite the fact that they can be evicted since 16 March. Furthermore, these Roma are supported by associations subsidized by governments and MPs [...] We want to be Masters in our on home”</p> <p>According to him, Manuel Valls, Minister of Interior, must implement without further delay the four urgent measures: “eviction of all Roma camps, strengthening sanctions for violating public order, denial of freedom of movement and access to employment for Roma, prevent accession to Schengen for Bulgaria and Romania”.</p>	<p>7 June 2013</p>	<p>Source: Romeurope http://www.romeurope.org/IMG/pdf/tableau_-_discours_stigmatisants.pdf</p>
<p><u>Didier Réault, Mayor and MP in Marseille (UMP):</u></p> <p>After Molotov cocktails were thrown at a settlement in Hellemes (Lille) on 6 June, Didier Réault reacted on twitter saying “Soon in Marseille #Capelette for the same action”. (<i>in French: « bientôt à Marseille #Capelette pour la même action »</i>) Capelette is one of the biggest settlement of Marseille. Then he did not withdraw his statement and said there was an overreaction when people blamed him for “incitement to murder”.</p> <p><u>UPDATE</u> On 5 November 2014, Didier Réault was fined EUR 1000 (suspended) and 600€ for the MRAP (civil party).</p>	<p>8 June 2013</p>	<p>Tweet: https://twitter.com/Clyde_Barrow_/status/344730809091108864/photo/1</p> <p>Article about the tweet in French: http://www.newsring.fr/societe/1203-les-roms-sont-ils-des-europeens-comme-les-autres/57899-guy-teissier-et-didier-reault-deux-elus-marseillais-derapent-sur-les-roms-de-la-capelette</p> <p>http://www.ouest-france.fr/marseille-un-elu-condamne-1000-euros-pour-un-tweet-sur-les-roms-2956188</p>

<p><u>Wallerand de Saint Just, press release (FN)</u></p> <p>“concerted interventions are planned in the streets of the Bastille-République sector, where many Roma families are settled. These operations, that will be renewed indefinitely, cost taxpayers a tremendous amount of money. Wallerand de Saint Just requests that the State, the Prefect and the Mayor of Paris take the necessary measures to ensure that the taxpayers of Paris no longer have to fund the invasion of the capital “</p>	<p>12 June 2013</p>	<p>Source: http://www.frontnational.com/2013/06/les-roms-a-paris-le-tonneau-des-dan-aides/</p>
<p><u>Xenophobic messages in front of a Roma camp:</u></p> <p>« <i>Vous n’aurais pas la France. La France aux français.</i> » « You won’t have France. France is for the French »</p> <p>Friday 28 June, a xenophobic message and a Lorraine cross have been placed in front of a Roma settlement in Gardanne (Bouche-du-Rhône)</p>	<p>28 June 2013</p>	<p>Article in French: http://www.streetpress.com/news/97098-des-inscriptions-xenophobes-devant-un-camp-de-roms</p>
<p><u>Bernard Debré, Member of Parliament (UMP)</u></p> <p>“Who did not see on TV these young Roma roaming the capital to rob and plunder? What does Mr. Valls do? Nothing!”</p>	<p>28 June 2013</p>	<p>http://www.bernarddebre.fr/actualites/les_succ__s_de_manuel_valls</p>
<p><u>Dupont Aignan, Mayor of Yerres, MP of Essonne département, Debout la République (DLR).</u></p> <p>He denounced the “crime and mafias who gravitate around Roma camps”. When he is asked why he associates Roma and crime, he says “because it is the reality”</p>	<p>29 June 2013</p>	<p>Source: Romeurope http://www.romeurope.org/IMG/pdf/tableau_-_discours_stigmatisants.pdf</p>
<p><u>City Council of Marseille, video surveillance</u></p> <p>One of the goals of the mayor of Marseille (UMP) would be to watch Roma. The municipality recognizes it is a mistake, but denies that he wants to stigmatize this population. Yet the word “Roma” appears on some letters sent to companies bidding to install these future video surveillance cameras, along with the words “traffic”, “parking”, “delinquency”.</p>	<p>1 July 2013</p>	<p>Article in French http://www.marsactu.fr/societe/a-marseille-des-cameras-ciblent-roms-et-gens-du-voyage-31653.html</p> <p>See document in the dropbox.</p>
<p><u>Denis Broliquier, Mayor of the 2nd district of Lyon Union des Démocrates Indépendants (UDI)</u></p> <p>“The Place Carnot is only the most visible part of the iceberg. The entire agglomeration is affected by the issue of asylum seekers and Roma. So why, while waiting for real sustainable measures, should not we stop the domiciliation process to show the public that we do not have the means to welcome them decently?”</p>	<p>2 July 2013</p>	<p>Source: Romeurope http://www.romeurope.org/IMG/pdf/tableau_-_discours_stigmatisants.pdf</p>

<p><u>Jean-Marie Le Pen, Front National (FN):</u></p> <p>During a press conference in Nice, Le Pen described the presence of Roma as “irritating and odorous” (en français : “urticante et odorante”) and predicted that in 2014, “50 000 Roma would come and settle in Nice”.</p> <p>The MRAP (anti-racist NGO) filed a complaint against his statement.</p>	<p>5 July 2013</p>	<p>Article in English: http://www.neurope.eu/article/roma-defenders-take-legal-action-against-le-pen-estrosi</p> <p>Article in French: http://www.lexpress.fr/actualite/politique/jean-marie-le-pen-et-les-roms-pour-le-ps-le-fn-n-a-pas-change_1264195.html</p>
<p><u>Christian Estrosi, Mayor of Nice (UMP):</u></p> <p>In an interview on Europe 1, Estrosi answered a question about Gens du Voyage who recently settled illegally in Nice and continued with shocking remarks about Roma migrants.</p> <p>He called for the revolt of all the Mayors of France. A revolt against the Gens du Voyage settling illegally on pieces of land they don't own. He said “I have put down others, I will put them down as well”. He offered his guidelines for “How to use” guide to do so : “put cameras everywhere to monitor their whereabouts”, “monitor those who enter, those who leave, and when and what they are doing anywhere in the city”, go before the court to be able to “impound (...) these beautiful and big cars with which they carry their beautiful and large caravans. Some French would not be able to afford the same in a lifetime “... He also called them “délinquants” (criminals / offenders).</p>	<p>7 July 2013</p>	<p>Article in English: http://www.neurope.eu/article/roma-defenders-take-legal-action-against-le-pen-estrosi</p> <p>Article in French: http://www.lexpress.fr/actualite/politique/roms-les-propos-d-estrosi-sont-imbeciles-et-dangereux-selon-lamy_1264651.html</p> <p>http://www.humanite.fr/politique/escalade-anti-roms-de-le-pen-et-estrosi-545511</p>

<p><u>Gilles Bourdouleix, Member of Parliament and Mayor of Cholet (UDI):</u></p> <p>On Sunday 21 July, an UDI member of Parliament and Mayor arrived on a land where Gens du Voyage (travelers) had settled illegally and said “<i>Comme quoi, Hitler n’en a peut-être pas tué assez</i>” which could be translated as: “Hitler may have not killed enough of them”</p> <p>EGAM and UFAT announced they would file a complaint against Gilles Bourdouleix.</p> <p>UPDATE: On 23 January 2014, Bourdouleix was condemned to a 3.000€ suspended fine. The prosecutor had required 6 months of suspended prison and a 5.000€ fine.</p> <p>Bourdouleix appealed this decision, on 12 August 2014 he was convicted to a 3.000€ fine.</p>	<p>21 July 2013</p>	<p>Article in English: http://www.ibtimes.co.uk/articles/493310/20130722/gilles-bourdouleix-france-gypsy-hitler-kill-cholet.htm</p> <p>Article in French: http://www.lemonde.fr/politique/article/2013/07/22/m-bourdouleix-a-propos-des-gens-du-voyage-hitler-n-en-a-peut-etre-pas-tue-assez_3451117_823448.html</p> <p>In English http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/europe/french-mp-avoids-jail-after-saying-adolf-hitler-may-be-didnt-kill-enough-roma-gypsies-9083781.html</p> <p>In French http://www.liberation.fr/societe/2014/01/28/gilles-bourdouleix-fait-appel-de-sa-condamnation-pour-ses-propos-polemiques_976044</p>
<p><u>Valeurs actuelles</u></p> <p>The magazine “Valeurs Actuelles” published a very stigmatizing front-page saying “Roma: the overdose”.</p> <p><u>Update</u></p> <p>The director of publication of the weekly Valeurs actuelles was sentenced on 5 March 2015 to a fine of 3,000 euros for “incitement to discrimination, hatred or violence against Roma and defamation”. The judges of the 17th chamber of the Paris Criminal Court felt that “repetition and juxtaposition terms of expected [be] descriptors such as” evil “,” overdose “,” sore “,” invasion “, all suggestive of disease or disaster [...] necessarily contribute, beyond the supposed “observation” to oppose the target community, considered from a purely negative prism, to “France” or “French”.</p>	<p>August 2013</p>	<p>http://www.huffingtonpost.fr/2013/08/21/valeurs-actuelles-choque-internautes-couverture-roms-overdose-medias_n_3788926.html</p> <p>http://www.huffingtonpost.fr/2015/03/05/magazine-valeurs-actuelles-condamne-roms-overdose-provocation-discrimination-haine-violence_n_6808394.html</p>

<p><u>Jean-Marie Le Pen, Front National (FN)</u></p> <p>In Nice:</p> <p>Jean-Marie Le Pen criticized a court decision which ordered the State to pay 75 euros per day as compensation to people evicted from their settlement without housing solution.</p> <p>He stated:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - “This announcement caused a fanatical enthusiasm in Romania. So far there was a limited number of people coming but now tens of thousands, hundreds of thousands of these Roma are leaving Romania to come here to loot. 75 euros per day per head is a miracle for them.” - “And one day perhaps maybe you will be forced to rename the “Promenade des Anglais” and call it the “Romenade des Anglais” as many will have answered the message that is sent to them, I guess by the Syndicat de la Magistrature (Judge’s Left-wing Union)”. 	<p>13 August 2013</p>	<p>Article in French: http://www.liberation.fr/politiques/2013/08/13/roms-le-pen-rebaptise-la-promenade-des-anglais-en-romenade_924609</p>
<p><u>Régis Cauche, Mayor of Croix</u></p> <p>The Mayor of Croix, a city close to Lille (Northern France), said something outrageous Saturday 14 Sept and confirmed it on Monday 16 Sept in the media. He said that if a citizen of Croix “would commit an irreparable act” against a Roma, “he would support him”.</p> <p><u>Background</u></p> <p>One of the biggest settlements of Lille is being evicted, part by part, since July 2013. They reduced by third and plan on having it completely evicted by the end of September. At the maximum, there were up to 750 Roma in this settlement. No alternative accommodation is offered during the evictions and Roma go to other cities nearby. Recently, around 200 Roma settled on a piece of land owned by a private person in Croix. Since then, the Mayor says the number of robberies is on the rise. A farmer complained that he was robbed 3 times in one week (15 ducks, 2 goats etc...). In this context, the Mayor said that he would understand if the farmer slept with a gun, and then dropped the sentence: “If something dramatic occurs, a lot of people will stand behind who is responsible for this drama, and me too. I am a defender of property rights”.</p> <p>This was said during a quite tense situation. A few days earlier, a jeweler in Nice murdered a man who had robbed him, with a gun shot in the back while the thief was escaping on his scooter. After this, the reaction was crazy in France, and a lot of people supported the jeweler. More than 1 million French people expressed support to him on Facebook and Marine Le Pen took advantage of this case to blame the immigrants, the government, to say France has a security issue etc.</p>	<p>14 September 2013.</p> <p>Confirmed on 16 September 2013</p>	<p>Article in French: http://www.leparisien.fr/societe/nord-un-maire-soutiendrait-un-administre-s-il-commettait-l-irreparable-contre-un-rom-16-09-2013-3142605.php</p>

<p><u>Hervé Barrié, a judge in Toulouse</u></p> <p>The judge was conducting a hearing of 4 Roma who had stolen 53 kg of copper. He said “Don’t you think France is not fed up with the burglary perpetrated by Roma” and “Do you think we will let you plunder France?”</p> <p>The prosecutor asked for 6 to 8 months of jail time, but the judge decided to convict them to one year of jail + a fine of 41000€. While giving his judgment, he said “There you go, there is no impunity for those who come to France to steal “</p>	<p>16 September 2013</p>	<p>Press article: http://www.lemonde.fr/societe/article/2013/09/23/un-juge-accuse-les-roms-de-piller-la-france-et-suscite-la-colere-de-ses-pairs_3483197_3224.html</p> <p>PR (Syndicat des Avocats de France, Syndicat de la Magistrature, Ligue des Droits de l’Homme): http://ldh-midi-pyrenees.org/2013/09/communiqu-s-m-ldh-sa-f-toulouse-22-septembre-2013-%C2%AB-pensez-vous-que-nous-allons-vous-laisser-piller-la-france-ainsi-%C2%BB/</p>
<p><u>Nathalie Kosciusko-Morizet, (UMP) running for the City Council of Paris</u></p> <p>During the political campaign for the City Council of Paris, the right-wing candidate publicly said the following: “I am under the impression that Roma harass the Parisians a lot”</p>	<p>18 September 2013</p>	<p>http://www.lemonde.fr/politique/article/2013/09/19/nkm-droitise-sa-campagne-en-evoquant-le-harcelement-des-parisiens-par-les-roms_3481070_823448.html</p>
<p><u>Gerard Vignoble, Mayor Wasquehal (UDI)</u></p> <p>He wrote to President François Hollande about Roma, saying he was worried about the “terrible and dangerous climate generated (...) in Lille.” “Roma do not have the appropriate behaviour for our lifestyle, their habits create fear and frustration” he wrote.</p>	<p>19 September 2013</p>	<p>Article in French: http://www.politis.fr/Les-Roms-sont-l-objet-d-un-rejet,23739.html</p>
<p><u>Manuel Valls, Minister of Interior (PS)</u></p> <p>Manuel Valls on the public radio “France Inter”. - Question: is there a minority of Roma who have a life plan in France and want to integrate here? - Answer: “Yes, we must tell the truth to the French people.” “These people have very different lifestyles from ours, and these lifestyles are obviously in confrontation with ours, we must take this into account. It means that Roma are destined to return to Romania or Bulgaria”. After the Council of Ministers, Najat Vallaud-Belkacem defended the “the firm but humane policy led by Manuel Valls” asserting that “the return home is one of the solutions”</p> <p>“Sixteen elected socialists - senators, congressmen or mayors - as Daniel Vaillant and Gérard Collomb, published an article in the Journal du Dimanche to support the action of the Minister of Interior on this issue.</p> <p>On October 2, Manuel Valls reportedly expressed regret and admitted having made a few blunders on the subject. This follows the intervention of first minister in the Parliament who stated: “Roma can be integrated if they respect the laws of the Republic.”</p>	<p>24 September 2013</p>	<p>Article in French: http://www.liberation.fr/societe/2013/09/24/pour-valls-seule-une-minorite-de-roms-veulent-s-integrer-en-france_934265</p>

<p><u>Dominique Baert, Mayor (PS) of Wattrelos</u></p> <p>He said in an interview that “freedom of movement does not imply freedom to settle everywhere [...] I was elected to manage the welfare of my fellow citizens; Roma are not part of them, that’s obvious.”</p>	<p>29 September 2013</p>	<p>Article in French: http://www.nordeclair.fr/info-locale/les-propos-du-maire-de-wattrelos-sur-la-gestion-des-roms-ia59b0n283182</p>
<p><u>Nadine Morano, (UMP)</u></p> <p>Nadine Morano (UMP) launched a petition against Romania and Bulgaria entering the Schengen area, because “the French and primarily, the mayors of our municipalities are overwhelmed by Roma who illegally invade our territories. The countries from which they come deny responsibility. This is unacceptable! That is why France should be opposed to their entry into the Schengen Area on 1st of January.”</p> <p><i>In French: “Les Français et au premier chef, les maires de nos communes sont excédés par les Roms qui envahissent illégalement nos territoires. Les pays dont ils sont originaires s’exonèrent de leur responsabilité d’intégration. C’est inacceptable ! C’est pourquoi la France doit s’opposer à leur entrée dans l’espace Schengen prévue le 1er janvier prochain. »</i></p>	<p>1 October 2013</p>	<p>Article in French: http://www.linternaute.com/actualite/politique/nadine-morano-une-petition-anti-roms-mensongere-1013.shtml</p>
<p><u>Prefect of Val-de-Marne</u></p> <p>He expressed the will to “evict all <u>Roma</u> camps” along the national road no. 19.</p>	<p>7 October 2013</p>	<p>Source: Romeurope http://www.romeurope.org/IMG/pdf/tableau_-_discours_stigmatisants.pdf</p>
<p><u>Christian Estrosi (UMP), Mayor of Nice</u></p> <p>He announced the publication of a municipal bylaw against “wandering” (<i>arrêté anti-bivouac</i>) to “fight more effectively against Roma”</p>	<p>8 October 2013</p>	<p>Source: Romeurope http://www.romeurope.org/IMG/pdf/tableau_-_discours_stigmatisants.pdf</p>
<p><u>François-Noël Buffet, Mayor and MP in Lyon region (UMP)</u></p> <p>Several hundreds of people gathered to protest against the requisition of a land by the Prefecture to settle 300 Albanian identified as Roma. Mr Buffet organized the protest.</p>	<p>9 November 2013</p>	<p>Source: Romeurope http://www.romeurope.org/IMG/pdf/tableau_-_discours_stigmatisants.pdf</p>

<p><u>Luc Jousse, Mayor of Roquebrune (UMP)</u></p> <p>“I remind you that Roma started fires nine times. Nine times outbreaks of fire had to be extinguished by the fire brigade, the last of which was setting their own settlement on fire.</p> <p>You know what they do: they steal electric cables and burn them to retrieve copper out of it and in the process they set themselves on fire in their own caravans! A gag! It is almost a shame that we called emergency service too early! “.”</p> <p><i>In French:</i> <i>«Je vous rappelle quand même que les gens du voyage, que dis-je, les Roms, m’ont mis neuf fois le feu», [...] «Le dernier, ils se le sont mis eux-mêmes. Vous savez ce qu’ils font : ils piquent des câbles électriques et après ils les brûlent pour récupérer le cuivre et ils se sont mis à eux-mêmes le feu dans leurs propres caravanes ! Un gag ! Ce qui est presque dommage c’est qu’on ait appelé trop tôt les secours !»</i></p> <p>UPDATE: After being temporarily suspended, the UMP party decided not to suspend the Mayor of Roquebrune. He ran for the municipal elections and was elected again in March 2014</p> <p>UPDATE OCTOBER 2014: One year of ineligibility and 20,000 euros fine were required against Luc Jousse, mayor of Roquebrune-sur-Argens, for his comments on the Roma community.</p> <p>UPDATE NOVEMBER 2014: On 18 November, he was sentenced to one year of ineligibility and a EUR 10,000 fine</p>	<p>12 November 2013</p>	<p>http://www.mediapart.fr/article/offert/87dec0b764891bac2a582594a6d6baec</p> <p>http://www.leparisien.fr/municipales-2014/en-regions/le-maire-ump-de-roquebrune-sur-argens-derape-a-propos-des-roms-04-12-2013-3376477.php</p> <p>http://provence-alpes.france3.fr/2014/01/26/aucune-sanction-prononcee-contre-luc-jousse-par-le-conseil-national-de-l-ump-402707.html</p> <p>http://www.metronews.fr/marseille/var-un-an-d-ineligibilite-requis-contre-le-maire-de-roquebrune-juge-pour-ses-propos-sur-les-roms/mnjAlSYQr24Oqf90iE/</p> <p>http://www.metronews.fr/marseille/propos-anti-roms-un-an-d-ineligibilite-pour-le-maire-de-roquebrune-sur-argens/mnkqIDViFSPeXWtHrQ/</p>
<p><u>Pierre Lelouche, MP in Paris, (UMP)</u></p> <p>During a session of the municipal council: “It is easier today to remove a car in Paris, it takes 15 minutes. I have experienced it. Fifteen minutes between the time you park and when the car is removed. It can take months, years before removing a Roma beggar, he is there all year, every morning, coming and going. This is insane!” “We are not in the European Union to be the garbage dump to populations that are not taken care of in their country”</p> <p>« Il est plus facile aujourd’hui d’enlever une voiture a Paris ca prend 15 minutes. J’en ai fait l’expérience. 15 minutes entre le moment ou vous vous garez et le moment ou on enlevé la voiture”, a déclaré Pierre Lelouche. Et le député d’ajouter : “Il peut se passer des mois, des années avant que l’on bouge un mendiant rom qui est la, a l’année, tous les matins, qui revient, qui repart. C’est insensé !”. »</p>		<p>Article in French: http://www.lepoint.fr/societe/roms-le-derapage-de-pierre-lelouche-17-12-2013-1771337_23.php</p>

2014

<p><u>Jacques Domergue, candidate running for the City council of Montpellier (UMP)</u></p> <p>“Roma have nothing to do in the city centre. I tell you that. I will be intransigent on security (...). I am on Estrosi’s line. Today, I see Roma who assault young people, old ladies at the ATM. I won’t tolerate that. I will expel them from the city centre <i>with my bare hands</i>”</p> <p>He compared the nuisance created by the creation of a “village d’insertion” to the gasification plant for garbage. He said “the nuisance is maybe worse with Roma”</p> <p>The LDH filed a complaint against his statements on 24 February 2014</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">D e c e m b r e 2013- January 2014</p> <p>Magazine Art- deville, n°42,</p>	<p>Articles in French: http://www.lamarseillaise.fr/herault-du-jour/societe/27410-roms-j-domergue-epingle-par-une-plainte-de-la-ldh</p> <p>http://www.midilibre.fr/2014/03/21/montpellier-la-ligue-des-droits-de-l-homme-porte-plainte-contre-domergue,837475.php</p> <p>Source: Romeurope http://www.romeurope.org/IMG/pdf/tableau_-_discours_stigmatisants.pdf</p>
<p><u>Paul Marie Couteaux, a candidate running for the City Council of Paris (FN)</u></p> <p>He said he wanted the Interior Ministry to deal with the Roma issue by “concentrating” them into “camps” (<i>concentrer ces populations étrangères dans des camps</i>).</p> <p>He also referred to their presence as an “invasion” and compared them to “leprosy”.</p>	<p>3 March 2014</p>	<p>Article in French: http://www.rtl.fr/actualites/info/politique/article/roms-fn-paul-marie-couteaux-sugere-de-concentrer-les-roms-dans-des-camps-7770149746</p> <p>http://www.lemonde.fr/politique/article/2014/03/04/roms-le-ps-outré-par-la-declaration-ignoble-d-un-candidat-fn_4377483_823448.html</p>
<p><u>Stéphane Le Foll Government spokesperson, (PS)</u></p> <p>Talking about Roma: “We must try to get them back to where they came from, Romania or Bulgaria, and prevent them from returning “</p>	<p>16 April 2014</p>	<p>http://www.bfmtv.com/politique/foll-veut-chercher-a-faire-retourner-roms-douviennent-755741.html</p>
<p><u>Mayor of Saint-Etienne</u></p> <p>The Roma population “do not have a lifestyle that is compatible with the one we have in France”</p> <p>« Les populations Roms n’ont pas “un mode de vie qui correspond peut être au mode de vie qui existe en France »</p>	<p>13 August 2014</p>	<p>Article in French http://www.francebleu.fr/infos/roms/solidarite-roms-demande-l-aide-des-autorites-saint-etienne-1702919</p>

<p><u>Judge in Dijon</u> A 53 years-old Traveller man accuses a judge of the Court of Appeal of Dijon of saying in Court: “It involves Travelers who, as everyone knows, have made burglary a part of their lifestyle” I like them, these Travellers people, with their lifestyle made of rapine and tricks of all kinds. Besides, he is collecting scrap metal, it’s smartness, it’s Recycling, it means everything. “ In French: <i>« Cela concerne des gens du voyage qui comme chacun sait, ont fait du vol un mode de vie».</i> <i>«Je les trouve attachants, ces gens du voyage, avec leur mode de vie fait de rapines et de combines en tout genre. D’ailleurs il est ferrailleur, c’est la débrouille, c’est la récup, ça veut tout dire».</i></p>		<p>Article in French http://www.liberation.fr/societe/2014/08/20/un-magistrat-vise-pour-diffamation-rationale-a-dijon_1083741</p>
---	--	---

2015

<p><u>François Lecoufle, Mayor UMP of Limeil-Brévannes</u> In February 2015 the Mayor of Limeil-Brévannes (Parisian region) launched a petition for the eviction of the “Roma camp” in the city. The aim of the petition is to show that the inhabitants of Limeil-Brévanne are worried about their “security and living environment”. The petition directly targets “Roma” as an ethnic group.</p>	<p>February 2015</p>	<p>Article in French: http://94.citoyens.com/2015/la-maire-de-limeil-brevannes-lance-une-petition-pour-evacuer-le-bidonville-de-roms,25-02-2015.html Link to petition: http://cdn.citoyens.com/files/2015/02/P%C3%A9tition-Roms-TD.pdf</p>
--	----------------------	--

Political parties

Left-wing:

PS: Parti socialiste

Centre:

UDI: Union des Démocrates Indépendants

Right-wing

UMP: Union pour un Mouvement Populaire

Far right:

FN: Front National

DLR: Debout la République