



## NGOs information to the United Nations Committee against Torture

# for consideration when compiling the List of Issues (LOI) in respect of

## CZECHIA

## for the Seventh Periodic Report under the United Nations Convention Against Torture

# FORCED MEDICAL TREATMENT AND STERILISATION OF TRANSGENDER PERSONS

Submitted by:

## TRANS\*PARENT

Forum for Human Rights (FORUM)

25 January 2021

## OVERVIEW

- The objective of this submission, written by the Forum for Human Rights (FORUM)<sup>1</sup> and TRANS\*PARENT,<sup>2</sup> is to provide the UN Committee against Torture (hereinafter "the Committee") with relevant information when compiling the list of issues for the seventh periodic report of Czechia under the UN Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman and Degrading Treatment or Punishment (hereinafter "the CAT").
- 2. In summary, the main concern in this submission is that in Czechia, transgender persons wishing to obtain legal recognition of their gender identity must undergo, as a precondition to changing their administratively registered gender, an invasive and irreversible surgical operation, including sterilisation.
- 3. FORUM and TRANS\*PARENT submit that such practice constitutes illtreatment and discriminates against transgender persons and violates their rights under the CAT.

#### **RELEVANT DOMESTIC LAW**

4. Pursuant to Section 29(1) of the Civil Code (Act no. 89/2012) the change of a registered gender of a person is made after a surgical operation with concurrent sterilisation and modification of reproductive organs. This provision is further specified in the Act on Specific Health Services (Act no. 373/2011), which states in Section 21(1) that for the purposes of the law, the gender reassignment includes performing medical operation, whose aim is to surgically modify the sex of the patient together with sterilising. In order to obtain legal recognition of their gender identity, the Czech transgender person therefore must undergo an irreversible surgical treatment accompanied by mandatory sterilisation.

#### **RELEVANT INTERNATIONAL STANDARDS**

5. Various international organisations have repeatedly expressed their

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> FORUM is an international human rights organisation active in the Central European region. It provides support to domestic and international human rights organisations in advocacy and litigation and also leads domestic and international litigation activities. FORUM has been supporting a number of cases pending before domestic judicial authorities and international bodies, and authored and co-authored a number of reports and information for the UN and Council of Europe.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> TRANS\*PARENT is a Czech non-governmental organisation striving for the empowerment, social justice, promotion of rights and positive social changes for the benefit of trans, non-binary and intersex persons. TRANS\*PARENT thus works towards understanding and acceptance of trans and non-cis persons on both the social and the legislative level.

concerns that the *de facto* involuntary surgical intervention and sterilisation gravely violates rights of transgender persons and constitute a harmful practice. The WHO, together with HCHR, UN Women, UNAIDS, UNDP, UNFPA and UNICEF strongly expressed their concern about the practice in 2014 in their common statement "Eliminating forced, coercive and otherwise involuntary sterilisation: An interagency statement".<sup>3</sup>

- 6. In Europe, the practice of conditioning gender reassignment by surgical operation and sterilisation as forced medical treatment has been criticised by the Committee of Ministers<sup>4</sup> and the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe, which later adopted a resolution, directly suggesting to member states to adopt laws, which will not oblige transgender persons to undergo surgery for the purpose of legal recognition of their gender.<sup>5</sup> The practice was already condemned by the European Court of Human Rights as a violation of the right to privacy in the judgment A.P., Garçon and Nicot v. France (6 April 2017, nos. 9885/12, 52471/13, 52596/13). The practice however still persists in some European states, including Czechia.
- 7. According to the Yogyakarta principles, a professional soft-law document regarding the rights of LGBTI persons, ensuring the respect for bodily and mental integrity of a person presumes the prohibition of involuntary invasive medical treatment, such as sterilisation and surgery.<sup>6</sup> A number of United Nations experts<sup>7</sup> participated in drafting of the Yogyakarta principles, which represent universal guide to human rights which affirm binding international legal standards with which all States must comply.
- 8. In his report, the UN Special Rapporteur on Torture, Juan Mendez, described disabling of transgender person reproductive functions as a condition for obtaining legal recognition of gender as a form of medical care that causes suffering without a legitimate reason. He called upon

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The Interagency statement is available online:

http://www.who.int/reproductivehealth/publications/gender\_rights/eliminating-forcedsterilization/en/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Recommendation CM/Rec(2010)5 of the Committee of Ministers to member states on measures to combat discrimination on grounds of sexual orientation or gender identity, § 20.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Resolution of the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe no. 2048 (2015).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Yogyakarta principles, principle no. 3.The principles can be found online:

http://www.yogyakartaprinciples.org

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Paul Hunt, Manfred Nowak, Philip Alston or Roman Wieruszewski.

all states to repeal any law allowing intrusive and irreversible treatments, including forced genital-normalising surgery and involuntary sterilisation<sup>8</sup>.

- 9. Similarly, in 2010, the UN Committee on Elimination of Discrimination Against Women called on Netherlands to abandon the practice of requiring surgical sterilisation for the purposes of gender reassignment,<sup>9</sup>and repeated the recommendation to Belgium in 2014.<sup>10</sup> Such suggestions were also adopted by the UN Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights in their recommendations to Lithuania.<sup>11</sup>
- 10. In relation to Slovakia in 2015, the CEDAW Committee expressed concern that (w)hen trying to change their legally recognised gender, transgender and intersex women are reportedly required to undergo medical treatment which does not respect their freedom to control one's body. The Committee recommended the state to(r) eview current laws and take measures to ensure respecting and protecting the rights of transgender and intersex women and girls to control their body and to be free from non-consensual medical treatment, including by **abolishing the requirement of compulsory sterilisation and surgery for transgender** women who wish to obtain legal recognition of their gender.<sup>12</sup>
- 11. In its core, the requirement of invasive, irreversible surgery and sterilisation for obtaining legal recognition of gender is a serious interference with the someone's bodily and mental integrity without proper justification and **constitutes ill-treatment and discrimination**. As such, it was also criticised by the Committee in its Concluding Observations, for example, to China (Hong Kong). Namely, in Hong Kong, the law obliged transgender persons to undergo "sex-reassignment surgery" to obtain legal gender recognition. The Committee suggested the state party to (*t*)ake the necessary legislative, administrative and other measures to guarantee respect for the autonomy and physical and psychological integrity of transgender and intersex persons, including by removing abusive preconditions for the legal recognition.<sup>13</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Report of the Special Rapporteur on torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment, Juan E. Mendéz, 1. 2. 2013, OSN doc. A/HRC/22/53, § 88.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> CEDAW Concluding Observations to the Netherlands, UN doc. CEDAW/C/NLD/CO/5, §§ 46-47.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> CEDAW Concluding Observations to Belgium, UN doc. CEDAW/C/BEL/CO/7, § 45.

 $<sup>^{11}</sup>$  CESR Concluding Observations to Lithuania, UN doc. E/C.12/LTU/CO/2, § 8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> CEDAW Concluding Observations to Slovakia, UN doc. CEDAW/C/SVK/CO/5-6., §§ 36-38.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> UN CAT Concluding Observations to Hong Kong, CAT/C/CHN-HKG/CO/5, §§ 28-29.

## CONCLUSION

12. We respectfully submit that the relevant provisions of the Czech legal system are in violation of transgender persons' **rights to bodily and mental integrity and constitute ill-treatment**, and therefore invites the Committee to ask the Government about their intention to repeal the problematic provision from the Civil Code.

Proposed question:

• Please inform the Committee about the legislative measures adopted or planned in order to repeal Article 29(1) of the Civil Code that provides for the requirement of compulsory surgery and sterilisation for transgender persons who wish to obtain legal recognition of their gender.

For further information please contact:

**Ms Bara Soukup**, Chairwoman, Trans\*parent bara@transparentprague.cz

Mr Maroš Matiaško, Senior Lawyer, Forum for Human Rights matiasko@forumhr.eu