

**ALTERNATIVE REPORT OF THE  
"COVCAS CENTER FOR LAW & CONFLICT RESOLUTION  
Submitted to the  
COMMITTEE ON THE ELIMINATION OF RACIAL DISCRIMINATION  
107th Session  
August 8-30, 2022**

**ABOUT THE REPORT  
TENTH to TWELFTH PERIODIC REPORTS  
of AZERBAIJAN**

**International Convention on the Elimination  
of All Forms of Racial Discrimination  
ICERD**

**Part I**

**Article 1**

**1- In this Convention, the term "racial discrimination" shall mean any distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference based on race, color, descent, or national or ethnic origin which has the purpose or effect of nullifying or impairing the recognition, enjoyment or exercise, on an equal footing, of human rights and fundamental freedoms in the political, economic, social, cultural or any other field of public life.**

## **COVCAS CENTER FOR LAW & CONFLICT RESOLUTION**

**Created in 1991, Covcas Center for Law And Conflict Resolution is a non-profit association under French law (loi 1901). Its purpose is to support the principles, objectives and actions of the United Nations, particularly in the field of peaceful conflict resolution, the promotion of human rights and humanitarian law, and the dissemination of information on human rights issues.**

**The publication, from 1991 to 2006, of the bi-monthly, then monthly bilingual French-English "Covcas Bulletin" on the conflicts of nationalities in the North and South Caucasus was aimed at governments, intergovernmental organizations, non-governmental organizations, research centers, media, and academics. In addition, several ad-hoc studies on armed conflicts and minority issues in the Caucasus have been presented to UN treaty bodies and the Council of Europe.**

**Finally, through its periodical publications, Covcas Center disseminates information on the principles of human rights and fundamental freedoms, in particular on minority rights, the rule of law and peaceful conflict resolution.**

**Contact: Hilda TCHOBOIAN**

**President**

**[hilda.tchoboian@gmail.com](mailto:hilda.tchoboian@gmail.com)**

## INTRODUCTION

In her autobiographical book "Caucasian Days" (1947), the French writer of Azeri origin, Banine, whose real name was Əsədullayeva Ümmülbanu Mirzə qızı, (1905-1992), describes her favorite childhood games with her cousins, which consisted of torturing a cousin, Tamara, who was guilty of being the product of a mixed marriage of an uncle with an Armenian woman. On pages 65-66 of "Caucasian Days," she describes these games of "Armenian massacre, a game we preferred to any other. Intoxicated with racist passions, we immolated Tamara on the altar of our ancestral hatreds. First, we would arbitrarily accuse her of murdering Muslims and shoot her on the spot, up to several times in a row to renew the pleasure. Then, when we were very drunk from the sight of her blood, we would resurrect her for the purpose of slaughtering her this time according to all the rules of art. We tied her up, threw her on the ground, cut off her limbs, tongue and head, ripped out her heart and guts and threw them to the dogs to show our contempt for her Armenian flesh.<sup>1</sup>

More than a century after these children's games described by the writer, it is regrettable to note that the sad legacy of racial discrimination against the Armenian as an individual, as well as a collective, continues to be expressed in almost all sections of Azerbaijani society, supported and encouraged by government policy.

In his speech at the victory parade on December 10, 2020 in Baku<sup>2</sup>, Turkish President Recep Tayyip Erdogan, who came to celebrate Azerbaijan's victory with his close ally, paid tribute to two historical figures infamous for being behind the extermination of Armenians in the early 20th century: Enver Pasha, organizer of the 1915-1918 Armenian genocide, and his brother, Nouri Pasha, perpetrator of bloody massacres of Armenians in 1918 in Azerbaijan. President Ilham Aliyev, for his part, has threatened Armenia with his plan to conquer the territories of today's Armenia.

This alternative report consists of two parts:

- I. In the first part, it recalls the studies, investigations and reports of international NGOs, Ombudsmen of Armenia and Artsakh (Nagorno-Karabagh) and press articles that have documented several categories of violations of the provisions of the ICERD committed during and after the war that broke out in September 2020 against the self-determined Armenian Republic of Artsakh (Nagorno-Karabagh)<sup>3</sup> and its inhabitants. It is mainly about the violations of

---

<sup>1</sup> Extracts — pages 65 and 66 — de *Jours caucasiens — Autobiographie*, avant-propos d'Ernst Jünger, nouvelle édition, 1985, Gris Banal éditeur, Montpellier <https://www.monde-diplomatique.fr/1990/02/BANINE/42329>

<sup>2</sup> <https://lesobservateurs.ch/2020/12/17/un-defile-de-la-victoire-azero-turc-aux-accent-genocidaires/>

<sup>3</sup> Art. 13,14 Final Observations of CEDAW on Azerbaijan CEDAW/C/AZE/CO/6, 04/07/2022

ICERD, systemic hate speech employed by several sections of Azerbaijani society, and in particular by political figures, intellectuals, cultural and sports world, with emphasis on the officials at the highest level of the state. These documents report the manifestations of the policy of racial discrimination by the authorities, officials, personalities and society against the Armenians of Nagorno-Karabakh and Armenia.

- II. In the second part, this report documents the export of racial discrimination by Azerbaijan beyond its borders, individually and collectively targeting all persons of Armenian origin living, or bearing an Armenian-sounding name in the world, regardless of their citizenship and place of residence. Hate speech, and acts of anti-Armenian discrimination committed by Azerbaijanis abroad, incitement to hatred of Armenians by foreign groups, peoples and countries through distortion of historical realities, stigmatization of persons because of their Armenian origin or of foreign personalities, institutions or groups because of their support for Armenians, stigmatization of the Armenian diaspora, is carried out both by officials at the top of the state, as well as by artists, sportsmen or ordinary Azerbaijani citizens.

---

### **Preamble: Brief History of the Artsakh (Nagorno-Karabakh) Conflict**

After the fall of the USSR, Azerbaijan began an open policy of deportations of Armenians.<sup>1</sup> Anti-Armenian pogroms were organized in several regions of the country, and from 1990 onwards, the government began the eviction of Armenians from the Shahumyan region in the north of the Nagorno-Karabakh autonomous region. Armenian resistance turned the attempted deportation of Armenians into a full-scale war in spring 1990.

Following the breakup of the USSR, on December 10, 1991, the Republic of Nagorno-Karabakh was proclaimed in accordance with the results of a referendum on independence, held under the bombing of the capital Stepanakert, and several other localities.

The first war started by Azerbaijan (1991-1994), which ended with an Armenian victory, was concluded by a tripartite ceasefire agreement, namely Armenia, Nagorno-Karabakh and Azerbaijan, signed in Bishkek under the mediation of Russia. Following this agreement, a process of negotiations began within the framework of the OSCE Minsk Group, with the aim of finding a peaceful solution to the conflict. However, in the midst of negotiations under the aegis of the Minsk Group, on September 27, 2020, Azerbaijan unleashed a full-scale war against the self-determined Republic of Artsakh (Nagorno-Karabakh)<sup>4</sup>.

---

<sup>4</sup> War Crimes and The Genocidal Policy of Azerbaijan during the Second Artsakh War and THE International Reaction Nelly Minasyan PhD, Khachatur Abovyan Armenian State Pedagogical Univesity

[https://www.academia.edu/50732354/WAR\\_CRIMES\\_AND\\_THE\\_GENOCIDAL\\_POLICY\\_OF\\_AZERBAIJAN\\_DURING\\_THE\\_SECOND\\_ARTSAKH\\_WAR\\_AND\\_THE\\_INTERNATIONAL\\_REACTION](https://www.academia.edu/50732354/WAR_CRIMES_AND_THE_GENOCIDAL_POLICY_OF_AZERBAIJAN_DURING_THE_SECOND_ARTSAKH_WAR_AND_THE_INTERNATIONAL_REACTION)

During 44 days of this war, Azerbaijani army together with Turkish army and Syrian mercenary Jihadists<sup>5</sup> transferred to the war field with the help of pro-Turkish Islamist movements from Northern Syria, committed war crimes, such as: Use of cluster bombs, torture and inhuman treatment of captured military and civilians.

---

<sup>5</sup> <https://www.lefigaro.fr/flash-actu/karabakh-macron-reclame-des-explications-a-la-turquie-et-interpelle-l-otan-20201002>

**I. STUDIES, INVESTIGATIONS AND REPORTS OF NGOs, REPORTS OF THE OMBUDSMEN OF ARMENIA AND ARTSAKH (UPPER KARABAGH), PRESS ARTICLES DOCUMENTING SEVERAL CATEGORIES OF VIOLATIONS OF THE ICERD PROVISIONS COMMITTED DURING AND AFTER THE WAR**

a) The use of cluster bombs and incendiary bombs:

- Cluster bombs:

Amnesty International condemned the use of cluster bombs by the Azerbaijani army in the bombing of Stepanakert, the capital of Nagorno-Karabakh<sup>6</sup>. Cluster bombs are inherently indiscriminate weapons that inflict suffering on the civilian population for years after their use. They are internationally banned under a treaty supported by more than 100 states. Azerbaijan has not signed the convention on cluster munitions.

- Incendiary bombs, phosphorus bombs:

Human Rights Defenders of Armenia and Artsakh have published reports establishing the use of incendiary and mass destruction bombs against civilian targets in Artsakh<sup>7</sup>. They also published photos of the injuries of people exposed to phosphorus<sup>8</sup>.

b) The bombing of civilian targets :

From the first day of the war, the Azerbaijani army bombed civilian targets, aiming particularly at civilian infrastructure throughout the territory of Artsakh. Among them, the Cultural Center of Shoushi, the Cathedral of St. Savior ("Ghazantsetchots") of Shoushi (twice) on October 8, 2020 causing injuries to 2 Russian journalists and their Armenian guide. The headquarters of the Stepanakert Electricity Company, 10 kindergartens, 61 schools representing 28% of all schools in Artsakh. The bombing did not spare the military and civilian hospital structures. Among all can be mentioned the bombing on October 14, 2020 of the military hospital in Martakert where there were also civilians, the bombing by the Azerbaijani air force on October 28, 2020 of the Maternity

---

<sup>6</sup> Haut Karabakh : Les civils sous le feu de bombes à sous munitions 7 octobre 2020

<https://www.amnesty.fr/controle-des-armes/actualites/haut-karabakh--les-civils-sous-le-feu-de-bombes-a>

<sup>7</sup> On the Use of Incendiary Ammunition of Mass Destruction (Incendiary Weapon) Against Civilian Objects of Artsakh (Nagorno-Karabakh) by the Azerbaijani Armed Forces, the Human Rights Defender of Armenia and the Human Rights Defender of Artsakh, Yerevan , Stepanakert, November 2020, p. 4-38, <https://bit.ly/3xCUsij> (10.01.2021)

<sup>8</sup> On the Use of Incendiary Ammunition of Mass Destruction (Incendiary Weapon) Against Civilian Objects of Artsakh (Nagorno-Karabakh) by the Azerbaijani Armed Forces, the Human Rights Defender of Armenia and the Human Rights Defender of Artsakh, Yerevan , Stepanakert, November 2020, p. 15-16, <https://bit.ly/3xCUsij> (10.01.2021)

Hospital in Stepanakert. A few days later, the same hospital structure was hit by Smerch missiles<sup>9</sup>.

c) Torture and inhuman treatment :

Among the many testimonies, we note those of Human Rights Watch<sup>10</sup> reported, on March 19, 2021, about the torture, ill-treatment and summary execution by the armed forces of Azerbaijan of Armenian prisoners of war, as well as arrested civilians. HRW's interviews with released prisoners provided evidence of lengthy beatings, torture through the use of electric shocks, systematic cigarette lighter burns on the body, physical abuse, keeping prisoners in humiliating conditions with little or no food for the first few days. Some 20 videos that appeared on social networks showing Azerbaijani officers mistreating prisoners of war were examined by HRW, which produced a damning report.

In its ad-hoc report published in September 2021, entitled: "Responsibility of Azerbaijan for torture and inhuman treatment of Armenian Captives, Evidence Based Analysis, the 2020 Nagorno-Karabakh War"<sup>11</sup>, the Human Rights Defender of Armenia implicates the responsibility of the entire hierarchy of the Azerbaijani army in serious violations of international humanitarian law. P. 14 "There is also sufficient evidence to conclude that Armenian captives were used as propaganda material by the Azerbaijani government. These illegal propaganda actions were carried out with the participation of high-ranking political figures, the Human Rights Defender (Ombudswoman) and the head of the POW unit of the Azerbaijani army. In between their public appearances, POWs were abused, beaten and tortured. The report includes images and videos captured on social networks, showing unbearable scenes of torture and decapitation of civilians as well as soldiers. Azerbaijan is in violation of Article 6 of the Convention because of the impunity it provides to the perpetrators of these acts of racial discrimination.

d) Racial discrimination against Armenians in Azerbaijan and Armenia:  
Anti-Armenian hate speech - Armenophobia

There is abundant documentation of official statements of Azerbaijan's leaders feeding and explicitly encouraging anti-Armenian xenophobia of the population. At the top of the leadership hierarchy, President Aliyev himself has been regularly declaring his hatred of Armenians, expressed in constant threats against them, since his accession to power, and since the end of the last war, satisfying himself that he "chased them like dogs" during the war.

In its September 2018 report "Armenophobia in Azerbaijan, Organised Hate Speech & Animosity Towards Armenians" the Ombudsman of the Republic of Artsakh (Nagorno-Karabakh), listed dozens of statements falling under racial discrimination and containing blatant elements of hate speech against Armenians, in violation of points a,b,c,d of Article 2, as well as point c of Article 4 of ICERD.

---

<sup>9</sup> (Nelly Minasyan « War Crimes and the Genocidal Policy of Azerbaijan During the Second Artsakh War and the International Reaction » PhD, Khachatur Abovyan Armenian State Pedagogical University  
[https://www.academia.edu/50732354/WAR\\_CRIMES\\_AND\\_THE\\_GENOCIDAL\\_POLICY\\_OF\\_AZERBAIJAN\\_DURING\\_THE\\_SECOND\\_ARTSAKH\\_WAR\\_AND\\_THE\\_INTERNATIONAL\\_REACTION](https://www.academia.edu/50732354/WAR_CRIMES_AND_THE_GENOCIDAL_POLICY_OF_AZERBAIJAN_DURING_THE_SECOND_ARTSAKH_WAR_AND_THE_INTERNATIONAL_REACTION)

<sup>10</sup> <https://www.hrw.org/news/2021/03/19/azerbaijan-armenian-pows-abused-custody>

<sup>11</sup> <https://www.ombuds.am/images/files/8f33e8ccaac978faac7f4cf10442f835.pdf>

Here are some examples:

"If you do not want to die, then get out of Azerbaijani lands (...) We must and are already doing it, unleash an active struggle against Armenia. We have isolated it all international and regional projects"<sup>12</sup>.

"If the Armenian fascist state does not renounce its dirty deeds, the very existence of the Armenian state may be jeopardized"<sup>13</sup>.

In their joint public ad-hoc report, entitled "Organised Hate Speech and Animosity Towards Ethnic Armenians in Azerbaijan as Root Causes of Ethnically Based of Torture and Inhuman Treatment by Azerbaijani Armed Forces, September-November 2020"<sup>14</sup>, and published in December 2020, the Artsakh Ombudsman and the Human Rights Defender of Armenia document 3 categories of hate speech in Azerbaijan:

1. Hate speech by public authorities, including high-ranking officials
2. Hate speech of cultural, sports and other personalities
3. Hate speech against Armenian children

In the first category, hate speech by public authorities, we distinguish hate appeals by the President, Ministers and deputies of the Parliament, and even statements by the Human Rights Defender of Azerbaijan. The cited examples lead the rapporteurs to consider that the anti-Armenian hate speech spread in Azerbaijan is part of a deliberate policy organized by the state. "It is the continuation of a long-standing policy of Armenophobia and widespread hate speech against Armenians, coordinated and supported" by the Azerbaijani authorities<sup>15</sup>.

"Armenia keeps cows and pigs in our mosques (...) Fascists, vandals and savages have done this"<sup>16</sup>.

Deputy Speaker of the Azerbaijani Parliament Ziafat Asgarov calls Armenians "sick" who should be treated.

Elnur Aslanov, head of the political analysis and information department of the presidential administration, compares Armenia to a tumor in the region<sup>17</sup>.

Finally, the postal stamp issued on the occasion of Azerbaijan's victory over Artsakh (Nagorno-Karabakh) sums up the racial hatred towards Armenians propagated by the country's administration and political leadership. On this stamp, Armenians are depicted as microbes that have infected the country, and whose masked Azerbaijani soldiers, dressed in white or professional clothes, would have disinfected the territory through war<sup>18</sup>.

---

<sup>12</sup> President.az, 10 April 2015, accessed February 10, 2018: <http://en.president.az/articles/14805>

<sup>13</sup> <https://president.az/en/articles/view/12487>

<sup>14</sup> <https://artsakhombuds.am/en/document/780>

<sup>15</sup> [https://artsakhombuds.am/en/document/780\\_p4](https://artsakhombuds.am/en/document/780_p4)

<sup>16</sup> <https://artsakhombuds.am/en/document/780>, p4

<sup>17</sup> "Эльнур Асланов: "Армения - Раковая Опухоль Южного Кавказа" - ОБНОВЛЕНО", Day.az, 17 May 2013, accessed February 11, 2018: <https://news.day.az/politics/402615.html>

<sup>18</sup> <https://www.calvertjournal.com/articles/show/12442/azerbaijan-stamps-nagorno-karabakh-war-anti-armenian-propaganda>



All these facts and statements made by the first person of Azerbaijan, are in violation of paragraph (a), (b), (c), (e) of Article 2 of the ICERD. They also violate Azerbaijan's commitments stipulated in Article 4, paragraphs a), b), and c).

In the chapter of hate speech of cultural, media, sports and other personalities, there is the call for killing Armenians, regardless of their age and sex, by the manager of the soccer club, Nurlan Ibrahimov: "We must kill Armenians: it does not matter if they are women, children, old people. We must kill everyone we meet and as many as we can. We must not feel regret, we must not feel pity. If we don't kill them, our children will be killed" He also confirmed and justified the genocide of Armenians by Turkey<sup>19</sup>.

The PR and media manager of the Azerbaijani soccer club "Qarabag", Nurlan Ibrahimov: "We must kill Armenians. No matter whether a woman, a child, an old man. We must kill everyone we can and whoever happens. We should not feel sorry; we should not feel pity. If we do not kill (them), our children will be killed." This person confirmed and justified the fact of Armenian genocide committed by Turkey. Note the racist rant of the newspaper Modern.az in this article: "Armenian women are a time bomb that will inevitably end in death. Armenian strategists have developed a plan to eliminate the Turkish peoples as singular units through genetics and blood mixing, which they have implemented<sup>20</sup>.

---

<sup>19</sup> « UEFA announced Wednesday it has temporarily suspended a staff member of Azerbaijani club Qarabag for "racist and other discriminatory conduct" targeting Armenians. »  
[https://www.worldfootball.net/news/\\_n4230405/\\_uefa-ban-qarabag-official-for-armenia-comments/](https://www.worldfootball.net/news/_n4230405/_uefa-ban-qarabag-official-for-armenia-comments/)

<sup>20</sup> Modern.az, 5 August 2013, accessed February 14, 2018: <http://modern.az/articles/42613/1/>

## II. EXPORT OF SYSTEMIC RACISM OUTSIDE AZERBAIJAN

There is a movement of globalization of racial discrimination conveyed by the decisions and actions of the government, as well as by Azerbaijani personalities abroad. Hostility towards Armenians can be expressed anywhere and anytime an Azerbaijani is confronted with the presence of Armenians or even an Armenian-sounding name. In this respect, the hate speech and anti-Armenian decisions and policies go beyond the strict framework of the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict between Armenia and Azerbaijan and have a universal character of racism and xenophobia, in violation of articles .....

### a) The case of Safarov:

The emblematic case of Ramil Safarov preceded the last war. In February 2004, Safarov beheaded an Armenian officer, Gurgen Margaryan, in his sleep with 16 strokes of an axe in Budapest, during a training course in the framework of NATO's "Partnership for Peace Program". Safarov was convicted by a Hungarian court but was later extradited to Azerbaijan on condition that he serve his sentence there. Not only did the Azerbaijani government ignore Safarov's conviction, but he was welcomed as a hero for the murder of an Armenian; he received back pay, a military promotion, valuable gifts, agreements and the veneration of all. The worst thing for those who believe and work in the field of rights are the disturbing comments of the Azeri Ombudsman:

1. Human Rights Defender (Ombudsman) of Azerbaijan Elmira Suleymanova said that Ramil Safarov should become a model of patriotism for Azerbaijani youth. She also mentioned that he has become another proof of President Ilham Aliyev's humanism, his care for Azerbaijani citizens.
2. Novruz Mammadov, the head of the Foreign Relations Department of the Presidential Administration, made this statement the day after Safarov was extradited to Azerbaijan by Hungary "it is very touching to see that the child of the Fatherland, who was thrown into prison because he defended the honor of his country, and the dignity of the people," noting that "Azerbaijani President Ilham Aliyev signed an order of pardon for Ramil Safarov, as soon as he stepped on the soil of

Azerbaijan. The head of the state once again proved that he is the president of every citizen of the country<sup>21</sup>.

b) Hatred of the Armenian diaspora as a lobby:

Armenian diaspora is also a phenomenon that is a fixation of Azerbaijani elites: it is considered both a danger for Azerbaijan, and a model to be imitated.

In the presentation of his book "The place of the 'Diaspora' in the national politics of post-Soviet Azerbaijan"<sup>22</sup> in February 2010, the researcher Bayram Balci, evokes the will of the Azerbaijani power, since independence, to transform Azeri communities scattered around the world into pressure groups, to imitate the Armenian lobby:

"As soon as it gained independence, Azerbaijan laid the foundations of a state policy towards all Azeri communities scattered around the world in order to encourage them to organize themselves into diasporic groups (...) to serve as relays in its future foreign policy. The discourse - and the policy - towards these populations varies according to the ayas of settlement of each group. Thus, unlike the Azeris of Georgia, who are somewhat forgotten by Baku, the Azeris settled in the West are of great interest to Baku, which dreams of transforming them into a pressure group, a lobby, comparable to the Armenian lobby.

President Aliyev's concluding speech at the conference dedicated to the results of the third year of the implementation of the state program "Socio-economic development of the regions of the Republic of Azerbaijan" openly refers to the Armenians in the Diaspora, presented under the term "lobby", as the main enemy of Azerbaijan: "Our political weight and economic power are growing. (...) However, there are forces that want to harm us and do not like us (...) First of all, our main enemies are the Armenians of the whole world, as well as the hypocritical, corrupt politicians who sell their services, who are under their influence"<sup>23</sup>.

But beyond the considerations of the so-called "Armenian influence", the Armenian Diaspora, as well as the foreign personalities connected with it, are considered as an emanation of the hated and banished Armenians in Azerbaijan. Novruz Mammadov, Deputy Head of Presidential Administration: "Using hypocrisy and flattering manners, the Armenians have created a position for themselves in all the countries. And from there, they are telling the Armenians at home, "Be stronger, be patriotic."

Upon publication of the Azerbaijani Laundromat file on the use of a \$2.8 billion fund that Azerbaijan's elite used to finance the corruption of European elected

---

<sup>21</sup> In the case of Makuchyan and Minasyan v. Azerbaijan and Hungary 17247/13, ECHR 2020, the European Court of Human Rights found that Azerbaijan had granted impunity for the crimes committed against Armenian victims and that the measures taken by the Azerbaijani authorities were racially motivated.

<sup>22</sup> <https://www.editions-harmattan.fr/index.asp?navig=catalogue&obj=article&no=12386>

<sup>23</sup> ("Ilham Aliyev's final speech at a conference dedicated to the outcomes of the third year of implementation of State Program on socio-economic development of regions of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2009-2013", President.az, 28 February 2012, accessed February 10, 2018: <http://ru.president.az/articles/4400>)

officials, President Aliyev attributed this international operation to the «Armenian Lobby »<sup>24 25</sup>

Criticism of the regime in Azerbaijan from outside the country is often interpreted as coming from the Armenian diaspora. Thus, Elnur Aslanov, head of the department of political analysis and information of the presidential administration attributes a forecast of rigged elections by an international organization to the fact that the treasurer of the association is of Armenian origin: "The organization, which reported two months ago that the presidential elections will be rigged in Azerbaijan, not only expresses its lack of seriousness and professionalism, but also points out the fact that it is fulfilling a specific order. It is not accidental that a number of Armenian Diaspora organizations act as partner of Human Rights House. An Armenian called Saro Saroyan is in charge of financial affairs at the secretariat of the organisation."

An example of Azerbaijan's hostility towards the Armenian Diaspora was revealed when President Aliyev, condemning the support of the municipality of Marseille (France) for Armenians during the war, invited France to give the city to Armenia, with the assertion that "half (of the city of Marseille) is Armenian »<sup>26</sup>.

c) Ban on entry of any third country citizen of Armenian origin:

Azerbaijan refuses to allow any person of Armenian origin, or presumed to be of Armenian origin, to enter its territory, regardless of the person's status, connection with Armenia and Armenians, nationality and reasons for traveling to Azerbaijan. In doing so, Azerbaijan is in violation of Article 5 (i) of the ICERD. The book *Armenophobia in Azerbaijan* by Anzhela Elibegova & Armine Adibekyan lists the methods used by the authorities, as well as the cases of sportsmen and journalists from third countries who were refused entry to the territory solely because of their ethnic origins, even if remote<sup>27</sup>. These cases constitute discrimination against foreign visitors to Azerbaijan on the basis of their ethnicity: the entry of Armenian-sounding people into the territory is prohibited and obstructed; travelers are turned away after long hours of administrative harassment.

- A Turkish citizen with an Armenian-sounding name was refused entry to Azerbaijan and sent back to Turkey. "Zafer Noyan, a 24-year-old resident of the Turkish city of Diarbekir, flew to Baku last week to compete in the 2014 European Armwrestling Championship along with other members of Turkey's national team"<sup>28</sup>.

---

<sup>24</sup> <https://asbarez.com/aliyev-blames-armenian-lobby-for-baku-laundromat-report-on-3-billion-slush-fund/>

<sup>25</sup> <https://www.tert.am/en/news/2017/09/06/aliyev/2475354>

<sup>26</sup> <https://www.laprovence.com/actu/en-direct/6135265/haut-karabakh-le-president-de-lazerbaïdjan-invite-la-france-a-donner-la-ville-de-marseille-a-larmenie-a-p>

<sup>27</sup> <https://stophatespeech.net/en/entry-ban-to-azerbaijan.html>

<sup>28</sup> <https://www.azatutyun.am/a/25404877.html>

- A photojournalist of the Bloomberg agency, Diana Markosyan, a citizen of the United States and the Russian Federation was deported to Istanbul in June 2011. The press service of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Russian Federation confirmed that the reason for her deportation was her ethnic origin<sup>29</sup>.

d) Export of racial discrimination in the international cultural world:

In its report on Armenophobia in Azerbaijan, the Ombudsman of the self-determined Republic of Artsakh (Nagorno-Karabakh) analyzes the incomprehension that seizes Azerbaijani officials and personalities, when they see that their Armenophobic ideology is not shared elsewhere in the world<sup>30</sup>.

1) Austria: The ballet Gayane, dedicated to the Armenian artist Gayane Khachatryan, included the participation of Azerbaijani dancers Mehman and Nariman Mardanovs, who were admitted to the Europaballet St.Pölten at the personal request of the Azerbaijani minister of culture. However, the Azerbaijanis refused to participate in the project on the grounds that the artist Gayane Khachatryan was Armenian. Soon after, the Austrian Minister of Culture intervened to investigate the scandal and asked the Azerbaijani dancers to leave the country. The Mardanov brothers have already been sent back to Baku<sup>31</sup>.

2) The same incident occurred in 2020, when the artistic agency of Armenian soprano Ruzan Mantashyan revealed the eviction of the singer from the prestigious opening gala of the 15th Semper Opera Ball shortly before the scheduled date of February 7, 2020, following the refusal of the Azerbaijani singer Yousif Eyvazov.

After the scandal broke out in the music lovers' community and on social networks, the Azerbaijani tenor denied that he was behind the refusal, and the director of Semper Opera refuted this revelation. Finally, following a compromise, the Armenian singer was reinstated in the program of the Opera, but the duet with the Azerbaijani singer, provided for in the proposed contract, did not take place<sup>32</sup>.

e) Censorship by UNESCO :

---

<sup>29</sup> <https://stophatespeech.net/en/entry-ban-to-azerbaijan.html>

<sup>30</sup> <https://artsakhombuds.am/sites/default/files/2019-12/Armenophobia-in-Azerbaijan-1.00-Interactive-25.09.2018.pdf>

<sup>31</sup> Минкультуры Австрии вмешался в скандал с азербайджанскими танцорами армянофобами и их выдворили в Баку. Panorama.am. 30.06.2012. <https://panorama.am/ru/society/2012/06/30/gayane/>

<sup>32</sup> <https://www.olyrix.com/articles/actu-des-artistes/3761/le-bal-de-lopera-de-dresde-victime-du-conflit-armenie-azerbaïdjan-article-actualite-lyrique-musique-2020-ruzan-mantashyan-soprano-yusif-eyvazov-tenor-semper-ball-semperoper-hans-joachim-frey>  
<https://www.olyrix.com/articles/actu-des-artistes/3798/ruzan-mantashyan-chantera-finalement-au-bal-de-dresde-semper-opera-ball-dresden-semper-opernball>

- The case of censorship by UNESCO Director Irina Bokova of the exhibition entitled "The Art of Khachkars" inaugurated on June 15, 2011, in the premises of UNESCO bearing hundreds of photographs on a specific discipline of Armenian Art, that of Khatchkars (carved stone crosses) is an edifying example of the export of Azerbaijan's anti-Armenian policy abroad, especially in the field of culture.

- On that day, on the orders of Director Irina Bokova, UNESCO staff had removed all the captions accompanying the dozens of large-format photos depicting the monuments, under the pretext that some of the monuments shown were located on the current territories of Azerbaijan<sup>33</sup>.

- At the time of this incident, the relationship of Mrs. Bokova, then director of UNESCO, with the Azerbaijan Laundromat scandal was not yet known.

Azerbaijani Laundromat<sup>34</sup>: In the course of the investigation by a group of international media on the money laundering operations organized by Azerbaijan, and used to buy the favors of Western politicians<sup>35</sup> and high officials, it became clear that several personalities benefited from large sums of money in exchange for favors and indulgence to cover up the violations of fundamental human rights by this country.

The Azerbaijani Laundromat project is part of the Global Anti-Corruption Consortium, a collaboration initiated by OCCRP and Transparency International.

Former UNESCO Director General Irina Bukova has been named as one of the beneficiaries of large sums of money by Azerbaijan<sup>36</sup>.

- Among the photographs of monuments on display were tens of thousands of Armenian Khatchkars from the Armenian Cemetery in Jugha, Nakhichevan, which were destroyed by the Azerbaijani army in the latest episode of the state project to eradicate the traces of the Armenian historical presence on the territory of Azerbaijan.

- The destruction of thousands of Khatchkars at the Armenian cemetery of Julfa in Nakhichevan was condemned by a resolution of the European Parliament<sup>37</sup>.

---

<sup>33</sup> <https://laregledujeu.org/2011/06/16/6136/paris-censure-a-lunesco/>

<sup>34</sup> <https://www.occrp.org/en/azerbaijanilaundromat/>

<sup>35</sup> <https://www.france24.com/fr/20180423-conseil-europe-soupcon-corruption-profit-azerbaïdjan-caviargate>

<sup>36</sup> <https://www.occrp.org/en/azerbaijanilaundromat/the-influence-machine>

<sup>37</sup> [https://www.europarl.europa.eu/doceo/document/TA-6-2006-0069\\_FR.pdf?redirect](https://www.europarl.europa.eu/doceo/document/TA-6-2006-0069_FR.pdf?redirect)

f) Genocide:

The theme of genocide is of a central importance in the hate speech in Azerbaijan. The prevailing Armenophobia in Azerbaijan is expressed by denying the reality of the genocide of Armenians in the Ottoman Empire<sup>38 39</sup> at the beginning of the last century, and by elaborating the opposite thesis at the cost of falsifications, presenting Azerbaijanis as victims of a genocide supposedly perpetrated by Armenians.

Moreover, by exploiting the sensitive theme of the Jewish genocide, the Azerbaijani authorities try to convince the Israeli the Jewish diaspora opinion of a genocide that the Armenians would have committed by exterminating the Mountain Jews, a minority living in north Azerbaijan.

The Deputy Speaker of the Parliament, Ziafat Asgarov, denies the genocide of the Armenians.

"The so-called genocide is groundless from historical, legal or spiritual point of view. Simply, Armenians live with this fantasy and disease. The reason for this is their territorial claims against the neighboring countries - Azerbaijan, Georgia, Turkey and even Russia, though it is Russia that is supporting Armenia."

g) A genocide monument in Quba (Guba) :

Azerbaijan tries to create animosity towards Armenians outside its borders by elaborating fanciful theses presenting Armenians as the perpetrators of a supposed "genocide" of Muslims, Jews and other local ethnic minorities.

1- In October 2020, during the Artsakh war, the website of the Jewish Secular Cultural Center (CCLJ) in Brussels (Belgium) published an article about the friendship between Israel and Azerbaijan<sup>40</sup>.

The article referred in particular to a genocide allegedly committed in 1918 by the "Armenian nationalists and Bolsheviks" against the Mountain Jews, which supposedly caused 60,000 Jewish victims in Quba, in the north of the country. He informed that the Haydar Aliyev Foundation had created a memorial to this genocide. When officials of the Committee of Armenians of Belgium requested documents attesting to the existence of this genocide, unable to find serious evidence of crimes committed by Armenians against the Jews of Azerbaijan, the officials of the association preferred to remove this article from their site.

History of the Quba monument

2- In April 2007, during construction work on a site in the city of Quba (Guba), located 180 KM north of Baku, a mass grave of bones was discovered. The government of Baku stopped the construction and sent a mission of the National Academy of Sciences to investigate the identity of these bones. The mission, without revealing any scientific work or expertise, quickly concluded that the Armenians had committed genocide against the Jews in 1918.

3- On the orders of President Aliyev, the Heydar Aliyev Foundation, chaired by the President's wife, herself Vice-President of Azerbaijan, Mehriban Aliyeva,

---

<sup>38</sup> Benjamin Whitaker, UN Special Rapporteur on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide , 1985 <https://digitallibrary.un.org/search?f1=author&as=1&sf=title&so=a&rm=&m1=p&p1=UN.+Special+Rappor+teur+on+Prevention+and+Punishment+of+the+Crime+of+Genocide&ln=fr>

<sup>39</sup> 31 countries that recognize the Armenian genocide (including the USA & Russia) [https://www.armenian-genocide.org/recognition\\_countries.html](https://www.armenian-genocide.org/recognition_countries.html)



began in 2010 the construction of a memorial-museum of the genocide, on the model of Yad Vashem in Israel, completed in 2014, and inaugurated by the President himself.

4- Today, Israelis and people from the Jewish diaspora in third countries represent 60% of the visitors to this memorial.

5- Several Armenian scientists, including historians, geneticists, archaeologists and others, have made several official appeals to the Azerbaijani Academy of Sciences proposing to establish a joint scientific commission to scientifically study the issue, but they have not received any response to these requests.

6- Before the campaign to involve Jewish diaspora organizations in political manipulation, the version that the found remains belonged to Muslims was advanced. "Anthropological research has confirmed that these people are Muslims," according to an Azerbaijani source, said Maisa Rahimova, director of the Institute of Archaeology and Ethnography of the Azerbaijan National Academy of Sciences. She confirmed that the grave found was one of the evidences of the atrocities committed by Armenians in Quba in 1918". In this regard, Doctor of History Asker Aliyev, who participated in the expedition, testifies that "among the numerous skulls and bones of children, only 35 whole skeletons were found. No hair, clothing or remnants of clothing were found in the pits." In other words, the Azerbaijani member of the expedition claims that there are no archaeological facts that could provide evidence of the particular religious affiliation of the buried. Thus, the version of Muslim victims, devoid of any archaeological basis, was expressed. Over time, this unproven hypothesis was adapted to the version of the Jewish victims of Quba.

This alternative report is not intended to restore the historical truth about the Quba mass grave. However, the figures and assumptions that vary according to the target audience, the lightness with which such serious assumptions as genocide are validated by politicians or institutions them, the existence of ample evidence that in 1918, not only did Armenians have cordial relations with Jews in the region, but existing historical evidence attests to the fact that Jews in Eastern Europe, Russia and the Caucasus joined the Armenian Apostolic Church en masse to escape the anti-Semitic measures of the Russian Empire.

## **CONCLUSION**

Threats, institutionalized hate speech, essentialization of the Armenian wherever he is, whatever his citizenship and other characteristics are, added to war crimes, distortions of historical truth by an official narrative, added to the heavy legacy of repeated massacres of Armenian inhabitants all over the territory, (Shoushi 1920, Sumgait<sup>41</sup>, Kirovabad-Ganja 1988, Baku 1990, Maragha 1992), together create a situation that may constitute the preconditions for ethnic cleansing in the making.

## **RECOMMENDATIONS**

---

<sup>41</sup> Cf. La Tragédie de Soumgait : un pogrom d'Arméniens en Union soviétique Ed. Seuil, Présentation Bernard Kouchner <https://www.seuil.com/ouvrage/la-tragedie-de-soumgait-un-pogrom-d-armeniens-en-union-sovietique-anonyme/9782020135795>



1- We draw the attention of the CERD to the need to consider these systematic violations of the provisions of the ICERD by Azerbaijan as precursors of ethnic cleansing of Armenians in Nagorno-Karabakh (Artsakh).

Scholar Alex Otieno wrote in the January 3, 2008 UN column "Eliminating Racial Discrimination: The Challenges of Prevention and Enforcement of Prohibition"<sup>42</sup>: *"It is essential that the international community now take into account the complexity of racial politics and how they fuel human rights abuses, including acts of genocide and crimes against humanity, such as those committed in Darfur and slavery in Mauritania."*

2- We recommend that the Committee condemns the endemic, systemic and systematic State policy and culture of discrimination against Armenians both in Azerbaijan, in Nagorno - Karabagh and abroad, and the severe violations (including against the right to life and physical and mental integrity as well as the dignity of Armenians and the right to peace) committed as a direct consequence of this official Armenophobia. In order to put an immediate stop to this racial discrimination and its manifestations of hatred, concrete measures should be taken such as but not exclusively the prohibition of any State policy of Armenophobia, the urgent necessity to bring to justice the perpetrators of torture, ill-treatments and extra-judicial executions of prisoners of war and civilians captured during and after the last war, to release the illegally detained prisoners of war, to stop official statements of hatred against Armenians including from the President of Azerbaijan, a new policy and related measures of implementation to eradicate racial discrimination in all relevant areas (education, culture, history, etc) in all State institutions and society both in Azerbaijan and abroad, in areas under the authority or influence of Azerbaijan.

---

<sup>42</sup> E-ISSN: 15643913 Eliminating racial discrimination Auteur: [Alex Otieno](#) Source: [UN Chronicle](#), [Volume 44, Issue 3](#), janv. 2008, p. 16 – 17 DOI: <https://doi.org/10.18356/ede38028-en> Language: Anglais, Published online: 15 janv. 2008