

# Racial Discrimination in Great Britain July 2024

## **Contents**

Introduction	3
1. Cross-Cutting Infrastructure for addressing racial discrimination	12
1.1 Equality Act 2010	13
1.2 Approaches to tackling racism across the nations	15
1.3 Special Measures	16
2. Criminal Justice System	18
2.1 Sentencing, Court Orders and Detention Rates	18
2.2 Treatment in Custody	26
2.3 Policing	27
3. Rights at Work	32
3.1 Employment gaps, pay gaps and insecure work	32
3.2 Discrimination at work	41
4. Living Standards	43
4.1 Poverty rates	43
4.2 Housing and accommodation	47
5. Health	55
5.1 State of health	55
5.2 Mental Health	60
6. Education	70
6.1 Attainment Gaps	70
6.2 Attendance Rates	74
6.3 Exclusions	77
6.4 Bullying	80
7. Recommendations	83
Criminal Justice	83
Rights at Work	83

	Housing	84
	Mental Health	84
	State of Health	85
C	Contacts	
	EASS	86

## Introduction

The Equality and Human Rights Commission (EHRC) is an independent statutory body and A-status National Human Rights Institution. It has a mandate covering equality in Great Britain, human rights in England and Wales, and human rights in Scotland for issues reserved to the UK Parliament. We have a statutory duty to promote understanding and protection of human rights and to encourage good practice. This includes a responsibility to assess and report on the UK's progress in upholding the human rights in the treaties it has chosen to ratify and to encourage ratification of relevant international human rights instruments.

We submit this report to the United Nations Committee on the Elimination of all forms of Racial Discrimination ('the CERD Committee') in advance of its 19<sup>th</sup> periodic examination of the UK's compliance with the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (the CERD). A shorter submission to inform the List of Themes (LOT) for this examination was shared with the CERD Committee in May 2024.<sup>2</sup>

The CERD requires that the UK, among other things:

- prohibit direct and indirect discrimination on the grounds of race, including hate speech, and ensure effective remedies against any acts of racial discrimination
- take measures to ensure the equal enjoyment of human rights by all, without distinction on the grounds of race, including

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Equality Act 2006, section 9(1) [accessed: 21 June 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Equality and Human Rights Commission (EHRC) (2024), <u>UN CERD 19th periodic examination of the UK - Letter to inform the List of Themes</u> [accessed: 05 July 2024].

special measures unique to certain ethnic groups where necessary

The aim of this report is to provide the Committee with up-to-date evidence and analysis of the enjoyment of certain CERD rights in Great Britain. There is a particular focus on:

- cross-cutting infrastructure for addressing racial discrimination
- criminal justice
- rights at work
- living standards
- health
- education

Within these areas, we have provided additional in-depth analysis and recommendations on four key areas where we consider there to be most scope for progress in the enjoyment of rights under the Convention:

- sentencing, court orders and detention rates
- insecure work, pay and employment gaps
- housing and accommodation
- mental health

We have not included information and analysis already provided in our other recent treaty monitoring reports, but request that the Committee review the following publications in parallel to this report:

 Our February 2024 report to the UN Human Rights Committee for its 8<sup>th</sup> periodic review of the UK's compliance with the International Convention on Civil and Political Rights.<sup>3</sup> This includes information on the disapplication of sections of the Human Rights Act (pp. 7-8), hate crime (pp. 22-23), restrictive practices in schools (p. 29), changes in the provision of legal aid in the reporting period which may impact the ability of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> EHRC (2024), Civil and Political Rights in Great Britain [accessed: 30 April 2024].

- individuals to enforce their rights under the CERD (pp. 60-62), funding for legal services (pp. 61-62), the use of strip searches on children (p. 74), and political participation (pp. 76-80).
- Our March 2024 submission to the Council of Europe Group of Experts on Action against Violence against Women and Domestic Violence<sup>4</sup> for its Baseline Evaluation of compliance with the Istanbul Convention. This includes information on the positive impact of specialist support services and the challenges accessing them for some migrant and ethnic minority women (pp. 62-66). It also highlights the impact of migrant data sharing between public services, such as the police, and Immigration Enforcement, which deters vulnerable migrant victims from reporting crime (pp. 88-91).<sup>4</sup>

We would also encourage the Committee to review our three Equality and Human Rights Monitor 2023 reports, which provide a comprehensive overview of equality and human rights in Britain, Scotland, and Wales.<sup>5</sup> These reports fulfil our duty under section 12 of the Equality Act 2006 to report on progress towards our aims of promoting equality and human rights. Much of the information in this report is drawn from them.

## **Terminology**

Throughout this report, we use the following key terms:

- **Ethnic group** refers to a group of people who all share the same protected characteristic of ethnicity or race.
- Ethnic minority group refers to a group of individuals who share any ethnicity other than White British/Welsh/Scottish or Northern Irish.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> EHRC (2024), <u>UK Implementation of the Istanbul Convention: Baseline Evaluation</u> [accessed: 30 April 2024], pp. 62-66 and 88-91.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> EHRC (2023), <u>Equality and Human Rights Monitor</u> [accessed: 21 June 2024].; EHRC (2023), <u>Equality and Human Rights Monitor – Is Wales Fairer?</u> [accessed: 21 June 2024; EHRC (2023), <u>Equality and Human Rights Monitor – Is Wales Fairer?</u> [accessed: 21 June 2024].

- Racial discrimination refers to both direct and indirect discrimination. The principle of non-discrimination under the CERD also protects the equal enjoyment of human rights and requires State parties to guarantee these rights for all without distinction on the grounds of race.
- **Disparities** refers to differences in outcomes in the enjoyment of human rights, measured by quantitative data indicators (for example, poverty rates) or qualitative data indicators (for example, experiences).<sup>6</sup>

Throughout this report, we have reproduced the language from our sources to ensure accuracy. For example, where a dataset is disaggregated using categories of ethnic group, we refer to these categories when discussing the dataset. We seek to disaggregate our analysis as far as the available data allow.

## **Overview of implementation**

The UK is increasingly ethnically diverse. The 2021 Census showed that fewer people (74.4%) in England and Wales identified as 'White English, Welsh, Scottish, Northern Irish or British' than in the 2011 Census (80.5%).<sup>7</sup> In Wales, the figure stands at 90.6%, a decrease from 2011 (93.2%).<sup>8</sup> In Scotland, the 2022 Census showed that fewer

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> For more information on why certain disparities of outcome would engage the CERD, read CERD Committee (1993), <u>General Recommendation 14 on article 1, paragraph 1</u> [accessed: 21 June 2024], para. 3; CERD Committee (2009), <u>General Recommendation No. 32 on the meaning and scope of special measures</u> [accessed: 21 June 2024], paras. 6-8 on equality and non discrimination under the CERD.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Office for National Statistics (2022), <u>Ethnic Group: England and Wales: Census 2021</u> [accessed: 21 June 2024]. and Office for National Statistics (2012), <u>Ethnicity and National Identity in England and Wales: 2011</u> [accessed 03 July 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Welsh Government (2022), <u>Ethnic Group, National Identity, language and religion in Wales (Census 2021)</u> [accessed: 21 June 2024], see Heading 'White'.

people (87.1%) identified as 'White Scottish' or 'Other British' than in the 2011 census (91.8%).<sup>9</sup>

As is made apparent by our analysis in the Equality and Human Rights Monitor 2023, outcomes can vary significantly for different ethnic minority groups, and an ethnic minority group may have different outcomes depending on the domain that is being examined (for example outcomes in education may differ significantly from outcomes in health).<sup>10</sup>

Different concepts and frameworks are used by the three governments in Great Britain in relation to racial equality. The Welsh and Scottish Governments have committed to addressing institutional and systemic racism through policies they describe as anti-racist, such as the Anti-racist Wales Action Plan. The UK Government has focussed on tackling disparities, including racism, where they occur through the 'Inclusive Britain' action plan. Its approach is '[...] to make improvements that benefit everyone, targeting interventions based on need rather than ethnicity'. 12

The legal framework in the UK prohibits direct and indirect discrimination, harassment, and victimisation. The Equality Act 2010 prohibits discrimination on the grounds of race in many areas of life including the workplace, accessing services and in the delivery of public functions.<sup>13</sup> The Human Rights Act 1998, which incorporates the European Convention of Human Rights (ECHR) into UK domestic

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Scotland's Census 2022 (2024), <u>Scotland's Census 2022 – Ethnic group, national identity, language and religion</u> [accessed: 24 June 2024] and Scotland's Census 2011 (2012), <u>Ethnicity</u> [accessed: 03 July 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> EHRC (2023), <u>Equality and Human Rights Monitor</u> [accessed: 21 June 2024].; EHRC (2023), <u>Equality and Human Rights Monitor – Is Wales Fairer?</u> [accessed: 21 June 2024; EHRC (2023), <u>Equality and Human Rights Monitor – Is Wales Fairer?</u> [accessed: 21 June 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Welsh Government (2022), Anti-Racist Wales Action Plan, [accessed: 21 June 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> UK Government (2022), <u>Inclusive Britain Action Plan</u> [accessed: 21 June 2024]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Equality Act 2010 [accessed: 21 June 2024].

law, provides individuals with a way to challenge violations of their right to non-discrimination in the enjoyment of their rights under the ECHR before the UK courts.<sup>14</sup>

In addition to the core prohibitions, the above Acts contain additional tools to promote and mainstream racial equality into public services. The Public Sector Equality Duty (PSED), which originated from the Race Equality Duty,<sup>15</sup> is a legal requirement for public authorities and organisations carrying out public functions.<sup>16</sup> The PSED has a general duty common across Great Britain and specific duties that vary in England, Scotland, and Wales.

The three aims of the general duty are to make sure that public authorities have due regard to the need to:

- put an end to unlawful behaviour that is banned by the Equality Act 2010, including discrimination, harassment and victimisation
- advance equal opportunities between people who have a protected characteristic and those who do not
- foster good relations between people who share a protected characteristic and those who do not

Individuals can bring claims in the employment tribunal for discrimination at work, generally without having to pay any court fees, and have access to different courts for discrimination claims arising in other areas. We have supported victims of race discrimination to access justice by funding legal representation through our Legal Support Scheme Fund for Race Discrimination Cases, which has also made organisations aware of our role as a regulator of equality law.<sup>17</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Human Rights Act 1998 [accessed: 21 June 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Race Relations Act 1976 (Repealed), Section 71 [accessed: 21 June 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Equality Act 2010, Section 149 [accessed:21 June 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> EHRC (2022), Legal Support Scheme [accessed: 21 June 2024].

We have powers under Section 20 of the Equality Act 2006 to investigate possible unlawful acts under the Equality Act 2010. In the reporting period, we used these powers to take action against Pontins holiday parks for its discriminatory practices against the Gypsy/Roma and Traveller community. We entered into a legally binding agreement with the Home Office to improve their treatment of people from ethnic minorities after we found they had failed to comply with the PSED.

Since the UK's last review under the CERD in 2016, positive steps have been taken to measure and report on race and ethnicity. The Welsh Government established a new evidence unit on race in 2021.<sup>20</sup> The UK government's Race Disparity Unit has consulted on and published new standards for government departments and other public bodies on how to record, understand and communicate ethnicity data in 2023.<sup>21</sup> The 2021 Census ethnicity categories were expanded to include 'White: Roma'.<sup>22</sup>

Positive steps have also been taken to address racial disparities in education and work. In 2023, the UK government published new research on outcomes by ethnicity in schools and after leaving school, and new research on how schools have closed ethnicity attainment gaps.<sup>23</sup> The Welsh government published statutory guidance on education support for children from Gypsy, Roma and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Equality Act 2006, Section 20. For the scope of unlawful act, read Section 34.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> EHRC (2023), Investigation into Pontins [accessed: 21 June 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Welsh Government (2022), <u>Equality, Race and Disability Evidence Units strategy</u>, [accessed:22 April 2024]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Race Disparity Unit and Equality Hub (2023), <u>Standards for Ethnicity Data</u> [accessed: 21 June 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Office for National Statistics (2023), <u>Ethnic Group Classifications: Census 2021</u> [accessed:21 June 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> UK Government (2023), <u>Inclusive Britain update report</u> [accessed:1 May 2024], Actions 29 and 30.

Traveller ethnic groups.<sup>24</sup> The UK government published guidance for employers who choose to report ethnicity pay data voluntarily, including support to understand and address any disparities.<sup>25</sup> Our Equality and Human Rights Monitor report highlighted that there have been improvements in some outcomes for some ethnic groups within education and work.<sup>26</sup>

This report focuses on areas where racial discrimination and disparities continue to exist in the enjoyment of civil, political, economic, social, and cultural rights under the CERD. Poverty and geography are important factors in inequalities experienced by all ethnic groups. These factors can be made worse by other factors that disproportionately affect some ethnic minorities, such as cultural differences, stereotyping, power imbalances and discrimination. Some of these can lead to structural racial inequalities. Where data is unavailable or limited, it can be challenging to identify the causes of disparities in outcomes, or there may be multiple contributory factors. We have explored these possible causes where reliable evidence is available, with a view to identifying targeted action.

Our assessment shows where this action is needed to ensure equal enjoyment of rights and fundamental freedoms under the CERD. Action is particularly necessary to tackle significant disparities experienced by Gypsies, Roma and Traveller, Black, Pakistani, and Bangladeshi ethnic groups in relation to their:

- living standards
- employment and health outcomes
- experiences of the criminal justice system.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Welsh Government (2023), <u>Celebrate and participate: Education guidance to support Gypsy</u>, <u>Roma and Traveller children and young people</u>, [accessed:18 April 2024

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> UK Government (2023), <u>Ethnicity Pay Reporting: guidance for employers</u> [accessed:15 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> EHRC (2023), <u>Equality and Human Rights Monitor</u> [accessed: 21 June 2024], p. 148 and EHRC (2023), <u>Equality and Human Rights Monitor – Is Wales Fairer?</u> [accessed: 05 July 2024], p. 168.

#### Devolution and geographic scope of this report

The UK includes four nations – England, Scotland, Wales, and Northern Ireland. Great Britain includes England, Scotland, and Wales. The UK Parliament is the supreme legislative body of the UK, but it has devolved various powers to the Scottish Parliament, the Welsh Parliament (Senedd) and the Northern Ireland Assembly. The UK Parliament maintains responsibility for policy matters that have not been devolved and for England. Non-devolved matters differ depending on the jurisdiction, but generally include social security and national security. The rest – including education, some employment issues, health, housing, culture, and most transport – sit with the devolved institutions.

The UK government is accountable for complying with the CERD. Devolved governments are responsible for implementation relating to devolved matters. In line with our statutory mandate, we have considered both UK and Welsh government action. This submission covers England and Wales for all the thematic areas, and Scotland for those issues reserved to the UK Parliament. Our recommendations are aimed at the UK and Welsh governments.

## 1. Cross-Cutting Infrastructure for

## addressing racial discrimination

Article 2 (1) of the CERD requires the UK to 'undertake to pursue by all appropriate means [...] a policy of eliminating racial discrimination in all its forms'. This requires the UK to put in place an effective legal and policy framework to address racial discrimination (including indirect and direct discrimination), as well as 'effective measures to review governmental, national and local policies, and to amend, rescind or nullify any laws and regulations which have the effect of creating or perpetuating racial discrimination wherever it exists'.

In addition to the information provided in this section, we refer the Committee to our earlier submission to inform its List of Themes in relation to:

- the differing approaches to incorporation of the CERD across the three nations of Great Britain<sup>27</sup>
- the need for a formalised, cross-government mechanism for monitoring and following-up on the implementation of recommendations from international human rights reviews<sup>28</sup>
- the measures taken to address the disproportionate impact of the hostile environment policy on people from the 'Windrush Generation'<sup>29</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> EHRC (2024), <u>UN CERD 19th periodic examination of the UK - Letter to inform the</u> List of Themes [accessed: 05 July 2024], pp. 3-4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> EHRC (2024), <u>UN CERD 19th periodic examination of the UK - Letter to inform the List of Themes</u> [accessed: 05 July 2024], p. 4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> EHRC (2024), <u>UN CERD 19th periodic examination of the UK - Letter to inform the List of Themes</u> [accessed: 05 July 2024], pp. 5-6.

## **1.1 Equality Act 2010**

The Equality Act 2010 underpins the UK's domestic equality legal framework and is the key legal tool giving effect to the provisions of the CERD, alongside the Human Rights Act 1998.<sup>30</sup> The Equality Act prohibits discrimination on the grounds of race in many areas of life including the workplace, accessing services and in the delivery of public functions.

The Act also contains the Public Sector Equality Duty (PSED), which places a positive duty on public authorities to promote equality and take proactive steps to tackle discrimination.<sup>31</sup> Specific duties, created through regulations made under the Equality Act, require public authorities in England, Scotland and Wales to publish information demonstrating their compliance with the PSED, and to publish equality objectives.<sup>32</sup> There are additional duties in Wales.<sup>33</sup> Amongst these are duties for public bodies to publish strategic equality plans, which should include equality objectives. The Equality and Human Rights Monitor<sup>34</sup> contains evidence-based recommendations for public authorities on strategic action they can take to tackle the most significant inequalities. However, there is no requirement that equality objectives which public bodies set, publish,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> The Equality Act 2010 [accessed:14 May 2024]. The Human Rights Act 1998 [accessed:14 May 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Equality Act 2010, section 149. See also: EHRC (2018), <u>Reviewing the aims and effectiveness of the Public Sector Equality Duty (PSED) in Great Britain</u> [accessed: 23 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Read, for example, <u>The Equality Act 2010 (Specific Duties and Public Authorities)</u> <u>Regulations 2017</u> [accessed:14 May 2024], Schedule 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> The Equality Act 2010 (Statutory Duties) (Wales) Regulations 2011.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> EHRC (2023), The Equality and Human Rights Monitor [accessed:25 June 2024)

and pursue under the PSED in England and Wales should be evidence-based or focused on the most significant inequalities.<sup>35</sup>

Future change in this area could be achieved through improved practice under the current specific duties, or through secondary legislation to reform the specific duties, for example to include additional requirements to take action to address inequalities for protected characteristic groups, including racial inequalities.<sup>36</sup> The Anti-Racist Wales Action Plan (ArWAP) states many public bodies are not meeting the PSED or their obligations to 'dismantle systemic and institutional racism'.<sup>37</sup> The Welsh Government has committed to reviewing the Wales-specific PSED duties 'to ensure they are up to date, proportionate and effective'.<sup>38</sup> The review is currently on hold and the Welsh Government have not provided a timetable for when it will start. The Welsh Government consulted on its Strategic Equality Plan 2024-2028 in February 2024,<sup>39</sup> and in March 2024 published National Equality Objectives which are linked to the actions set out in individual equality plans.<sup>40</sup>

Some provisions of the Equality Act 2010 remain unimplemented, including:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> See, for example, House of Lords (2020), <u>Public Services Committee inquiry into the lessons learned from coronavirus (2020), Evidence from the Equality and Human Rights Commission [accessed: 23 April 2024], Annex A.</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Joint Committee on Human Rights (2021), <u>Government response to the Joint Committee on Human Right's Inquiry into Black People</u>, <u>Racism and Human Rights</u> [accessed: 23 April 2024], paras. 62–65.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Welsh Government (2022), <u>Anti-Racist Wales Action Plan</u>, [accessed:21 May 2024], p.9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Welsh Government (2020), <u>Strategic Equality Plan 2020-2024</u> [accessed: 23 April 2024], p. 22.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Welsh Government (2024), <u>Plan for Equality in Wales, Principles and Goals for 2024-2028</u>, [accessed: 24 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Welsh Government, <u>Written statement: Achieving an equitable Wales: The National Equality Objectives 2024-28</u>, {accessed:10 June 2024].

- section 1, requiring public authorities to consider socioeconomic inequality when making strategic decisions (in force in Scotland and Wales but not in England)
- section 106, which would require political parties to collect and publish information relating to the protected characteristics of candidates
- provisions of section 14, which prohibit discrimination on the basis of a combination of protected characteristics.

Any change in these areas would require secondary legislation by the UK Government.

# 1.2 Approaches to tackling racism across the nations

In our List of Themes submission,<sup>41</sup> we shared information on the UK government's Inclusive Britain Action Plan<sup>42</sup> and the Welsh government's ArWAP.<sup>43</sup> We highlighted that neither plan is yet accompanied by an impact measurement and monitoring framework. Since our submission, the Welsh Government has updated on its Equality, Race and Disability Evidence Units work plan.<sup>44</sup> It stated that the Race Disparity Evidence unit is developing an impact evaluation framework for the ArWAP. This will be published before

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> EHRC (2024), <u>UN CERD 19th periodic examination of the UK - Letter to inform the List of Themes</u> [accessed: 05 July 2024], pp. 4-5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> UK Government (2022), Inclusive Britain Action Plan [accessed: 23 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Welsh Government (2022), <u>An Introduction to Anti-Racist Wales</u> [accessed: 23 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Welsh Government (2024), <u>Equality, Race and Disability Evidence Units Work Plan</u> [accessed: 23 May 2024].

October 2024.<sup>45</sup> A re-iteration of the ArWAP for 2024-2026<sup>46</sup> has been confirmed by the Welsh Government. Throughout this report, we refer to the effectiveness of these plans in tackling racial discrimination.

## 1.3 Special Measures

Article 2(2) of the CERD requires the UK to take 'special and concrete measures to ensure the adequate development and protection of certain racial groups [...] for the purpose of guaranteeing them the full and equal enjoyment of human rights'. In its last review of the UK's compliance with the CERD, the Committee highlighted the need to take 'special measures' in relation to 'Gypsies, Travellers and Roma' and 'People of African descent'.<sup>47</sup>

This report highlights where significant disparities exist in the enjoyment of human rights for certain groups, for instance:

 there is insufficient available data on people from Gypsy, Roma and Traveler ethnic groups across both England and Wales.
 Where data is available, it shows disparities in the enjoyment of the rights to adequate housing, work, and education<sup>48</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Welsh Government (2024), <u>Written response to the report of the Equality and Social Justice Committee – Actions not Words</u> [accessed:10 June 2024], pg 6

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> Welsh Government (2024), <u>Written response to the report of the Equality and Social Justice Committee – Actions not Words</u> [accessed:10 June 2024], p. 1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> CERD Committee (2016), <u>Concluding observations on the combined twenty-first to twenty-third periodic reports of the United Kingdom of Britain and Northern Ireland</u> [accessed: 01 July 2024], Paras. 24 and 25.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> EHRC (2023), <u>Equality and Human Rights Monitor</u> [accessed: 5 March 2024], p. 148. See also UK Statistics Authority (2022), <u>Inclusive Data Taskforce Report: Leaving Nobody Behind</u> [accessed: 5 March 2024].

- individuals from Black ethnic groups continue to see lower outcomes than all other major ethnic groups<sup>49</sup> in most of the areas covered in this report
- individuals from Bangladeshi and Pakistani ethnic groups also see lower outcomes than all other major ethnic groups in pay, poverty rates, housing, and health

<sup>49</sup> 'Gypsy or Irish Traveller and Roma tend not to be included as 'major' ethnic group within data sources. Due to small sample sizes, these groups are normally combined with other white ethnic groups to form a 'White Other' group.

## 2. Criminal Justice System

## 2.1 Sentencing, Court Orders and Detention Rates

Article 5(a) of the CERD requires State parties to 'guarantee the right of everyone, without distinction as to race, colour, or national or ethnic origin, to equality before the law [...] in the enjoyment of [...] the right to equal treatment before the tribunals and all other organs administering justice'.

The Committee has noted that disparities in rates of detention and disproportionate sentencing of people belonging to racial and ethnic minority groups can be indicators of racial discrimination, and that states should seek to collect data and take steps to address racial discrimination in the justice system.<sup>50</sup>

Criminal justice is devolved in Scotland, so policies, statistics and legislation referred to in this section apply only to England and Wales.

## Remand in Custody

In all criminal courts in 2022, defendants from the 'Other' ethnic group were 35% more likely to be remanded in custody than White defendants, Black defendants 26% more likely, defendants of mixed ethnicities 22% more likely and Asian defendants 17% more likely.<sup>51</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> UN Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (2009), <u>General recommendation No. 32 - The meaning and scope of special measures in the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms Racial Discrimination, CERD/C/GC/32 [accessed:18 April 2024].</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> UK Government Ministry of Justice (2024), <u>Statistics on Ethnicity and the Criminal Justice System</u> [accessed:16 April 2024].para 5.3. This is based on relative rate index analysis, and does not take into account individual or case factors.

Between 2017 and 2019, Black and mixed ethnicity children were more likely to be held in custodial remand than White children.<sup>52</sup> Research suggests that Black and mixed ethnicity young people are more likely to be assessed as higher risk and more vulnerable and that bias in practitioner assessments contributes to increased likelihood of custodial remand.<sup>53</sup> There is evidence that they are often subject to 'adultification bias' by decision makers.<sup>54</sup> Young people from Black and mixed ethnicity groups on average have more previous court orders than White children; previous court orders increase the likelihood of custodial remand.<sup>55</sup>

According to research commissioned by the Crown Prosecution Service (CPS) for England and Wales on charging decisions, analysis of data for 2018 to 2021 showed that 'ethnic minority defendants are significantly more likely to be charged for a comparable offence than White British defendants'.<sup>56</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Youth Justice Board (2021), <u>Ethnic disproportionality in remand and sentencing in the youth justice system: Analysis of administrative data</u> [accessed:18 April 2024].p. 9. When controlling for demographic and offence related factors.

<sup>53</sup> Youth Justice Board (2021), Ethnic disproportionality in remand and sentencing in the youth justice system: Analysis of administrative data [accessed:18 April 2024].p. 10; HM Inspectorate of Probation (2021), The experiences of black and mixed heritage boys in the youth justice system, p. 21 [accessed:26 April 2024]; Traverse (2023), Understanding ethnic disparity in reoffending rates in the youth justice system: Child and practitioner perspectives report, [accessed:26 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> See Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Probation (2022), <u>Adultification bias within child protection and safeguarding</u>, [accessed:14 May 2024] and See Ministry of Justice and Home Office (2023), <u>Inquiry into Support for Vulnerable Adolescents - Recommendation Response</u> [accessed: 25 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> Youth Justice Board (2021), <u>Ethnic disproportionality in remand and sentencing in the youth justice system: Analysis of administrative data</u> [accessed:18 April 2024]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> CPS (2023), <u>CPS charging decisions - examining demographic disparities in the outcomes of our decision making [accessed:22 April 2024]. Analysis controlling for sex, age and crime type. Research into why these disparities exist is not available.</u>

#### Sentencing and court orders

Between 2018 and 2022, White defendants had consistently lower average sentence lengths than all other ethnic groups combined.<sup>57</sup> It has been suggested that factors including offence type and the higher rate of guilty pleas in the White ethnic group, which result in shorter sentences, contribute to this.<sup>58</sup> Other analysis has found that the differences in sentence length between defendants from most ethnic minority groups and White British offenders are mostly explained by these legal factors, such as the severity of the offence, whether a defendant pled guilty or not, and whether the defendant had been remanded in custody.<sup>59</sup>

Analysis of indictable offences between 2018 and 2022 shows an association between ethnicity and receiving a custodial sentence. When controlling for offender and case characteristics, Black offenders and those of mixed ethnicity were more likely to receive a custodial sentence than White offenders. Looking at specific offences, this analysis found the clearest disparity for drug offences, where offenders from most ethnic minority groups were more likely to receive a custodial sentence, when controlling for offender and case characteristics.<sup>60</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> UK Government Ministry of Justice (2024), <u>Statistics on Ethnicity and the Criminal Justice System</u> [accessed:16 April 2024].para 5 and 5.5. In 2022, Asian offenders had a 44% higher average sentence and Black offenders had a 32% higher average sentence than White offenders.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> UK Government Ministry of Justice (2024), <u>Statistics on Ethnicity and the Criminal Justice System</u> [accessed:16 April 2024].para 5 and 5.5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> With the exception of Pakistani, Bangladeshi and Black Caribbean groups who receive 4% -11% longer sentences. Action for Race Equality, Kitty Lymperopoulou (2023), Ethnic Inequalities in the Criminal Justice System [accessed:18 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> UK Government Ministry of Justice (2024), <u>Statistics on Ethnicity and the Criminal Justice System</u> [accessed:16 April 2024], para. 9

Other analysis similarly found that while legal or case factors<sup>61</sup> are associated with an increased likelihood of imprisonment, these factors do not fully explain ethnic disparities in sentencing.<sup>62</sup>

#### **Detention rates**

In 2023 over a quarter of those in prison in England and Wales belonged to an ethnic minority group, compared to just 18% of the general population.<sup>63</sup> This proportion has remained similar since 2013.<sup>64</sup> Of those imprisoned on remand, 34% belonged to an ethnic minority group.<sup>65</sup>

Research suggests that factors which impact the increased likelihood of imprisonment for Black and Black British defendants and other ethnic minority groups include:

- Black defendants are more likely to plead not guilty<sup>66</sup>
- increased likelihood of being held on remand (in custody ahead of trial)<sup>67</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> These include pleading not-guilty, offence severity, pre-trial detention and previous convictions.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> Action for Race Equality, Kitty Lymperopoulou (2023), <u>Ethnic Inequalities in the Criminal Justice System</u> [accessed:18 April 2024]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> Ministry of Justice (2023), <u>HM Prison and Probation Service Offender Equalities Annual Report 2022/23 [accessed: 13 May 2024].</u>; House of Commons Library (2023), <u>UK Prison Population Statistics</u> [accessed:18 April 2024]. p. 14.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> EHRC (2023), <u>Equality and Human Rights Monitor 2023</u> [accessed:22 April 2024].p183

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>65</sup> Ministry of Justice (2023), <u>HM Prison and Probation Service Offender Equalities Annual Report 2022/23 [accessed:13 May 2024].</u>

<sup>66</sup> The Lammy Review (2017), An independent review into the treatment of, and outcomes for, Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic individuals in the Criminal Justice System [accessed:22 April 2024].and Kitty Lymperopoulou (2024), Ethnic Inequalities in Sentencing: Evidence from the Crown Court in England and Wales, in *The British Journal of Criminology* [accessed: 01 July 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> Kitty Lymperopoulou (2024), <u>Ethnic Inequalities in Sentencing: Evidence from the Crown Court in England and Wales, in *The British Journal of Criminology*</u>

Academic research suggests that disparities cannot be fully explained by these factors, and that the experience of the criminal justice system and rights both at arrest, trial and in detention, are affected by a person's ethnicity. This research also suggests that discrimination and bias within the criminal justice system plays a role.<sup>68</sup>

Disparities in detention rates and sentencing are particularly pronounced among young people in the youth justice system. In 2023, 50% of the youth custody population belonged to the Black, Asian, Mixed and Other ethnic groups. Black children made up 26% of the youth custody population compared with 6% of the general population aged 10 to 17.70

Between 2017 and 2019, Black and mixed ethnicity children were less likely to receive an out of court disposal and received harsher sentences than White children.<sup>71</sup>

Young people belonging to ethnic minority groups are more likely to be convicted of a more serious offence, including offences involving a knife. As a result, their cases are more likely to be heard in Crown Court. However, these combined factors do not fully explain why Black children receive harsher sentences.<sup>72</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> Kitty Lymperopoulou (2024), <u>Ethnic Inequalities in Sentencing</u>: <u>Evidence from the Crown Court in England and Wales, in *The British Journal of Criminology*, [accessed: 24 April 2024].</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> Youth Justice Board (2024), <u>Youth Justice Statistics: 2022 to 2023 (accessible version)</u>, para 7 [accessed:14 May 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> Youth Justice Board (2024), <u>Youth Justice Statistics: 2022 to 2023 (accessible version)</u>, para 7 [accessed:14 May 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup> Youth Justice Board (2021), <u>Ethnic disproportionality in remand and sentencing in the youth justice system: Analysis of administrative data</u> [accessed:18 April 2024], p. 10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>72</sup> Youth Justice Board (2021), <u>Ethnic disproportionality in remand and sentencing in the youth justice system: Analysis of administrative data</u> [accessed:18 April 2024].

#### Approaches to tackling disparities

The 2017 Lammy Review on the treatment of, and outcomes for, ethnic minority people in the criminal justice system in England and Wales identified many similar significant disparities in the criminal justice system. It made 35 recommendations to address these, focusing on:

- improved data collection
- transparency
- improvements to the youth justice system
- increased diversity among staff.<sup>73</sup>

The UK government accepted 33 of these recommendations and made commitments to act on them. The latest update on progress was in 2020.<sup>74</sup> The UK government has since stated that it has completed almost all of the actions it committed to and is considering what further updates could be provided on work to address racial disparities in the criminal justice system.<sup>75</sup> The actual degree of implementation has been questioned by David Lammy himself. He noted for example that in some areas marked as complete there had been no demonstrable action.<sup>76</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup> The Lammy Review (2017), <u>An independent review into the treatment of, and outcomes for, Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic individuals in the Criminal Justice</u> System, [accessed: 22 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup> UK Government Ministry of Justice (2020), <u>Tackling Racial Disparity in the Criminal Justice System: 2020 Update</u> [accessed: 22 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup> See UK Parliament Hansard (2024), <u>Written answer from Lord Bellamy</u> [accessed:24 April 2024].and UK Parliament Hansard (2023), <u>Written answer from Mike Freer MP</u> [accessed: 24 April 2024].Later initiatives include a two-year research project into ethnic disparities in sentencing launched in 2022 and a CPS research programme to identify reasons for disparities in charging decisions. See Sentencing Council for England and Wales, Cabinet Race Disparity Unit and Crown Prosecution Service (2022), <u>Disproportionality: Exploring the Nature of Ethnic Disparities in Sentencing through Causal Inference</u> and CPS (2023), <u>CPS action to understand disproportionality in charging decisions</u> [accessed: 20 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>76</sup> See UK Parliament Hansard (2020), <u>House of Commons Debate: Lammy Review</u> [accessed: 30 April 2024] and BBC News (2020), <u>Black Lives Matter: Have racial inequality reviews led to action?</u> [accessed: 30 April 2024].

The UK government-commissioned Commission on Race and Ethnic Disparities (CRED) 2022 review noted continuing disparities in the criminal justice system. It did not address sentencing or detention specifically.<sup>77</sup> The UK Government's response, in its 2022 Inclusive Britain action plan, which most recently reported on progress in May 2024, included some commitments on areas similar to those raised in the Lammy review, including improved ethnicity data collection.<sup>78</sup> It also included trialling an automatic opt-in to independent legal advice for young people in police custody, and a commitment to increase representation of ethnic minority groups in the judiciary.<sup>79</sup>

Criminal justice matters for England and Wales are reserved to the UK government. However, the Criminal Justice Board for Wales commissioned a criminal justice anti-racism action plan for Wales within devolved competencies. <sup>80</sup> The Welsh Government's Anti-Racist Wales Action Plan (ArWAP) <sup>81</sup> includes five commitments to support the Criminal Justice Board plan, such as training and more diverse recruitment within criminal justice. The ArWAP progress report 2022/23<sup>82</sup> acknowledges the gap between policy intent and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>77</sup> Recommendations 4, 14, 21 23 and 24 of the report relate to policing, and focus on improved data collection, transparency, and diversity in police forces. Read CRED (2021), <u>The report of the Commission on Race and Ethnic Disparities</u> [accessed:22 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup> UK Government (2022), <u>Inclusive Britain: government response to the Commission on Race and Ethnic Disparities</u> [accessed:22 April 2024]. See also UK Government (2024), <u>Inclusive Britain second update report – May 2024</u> [accessed:31 May 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>79</sup> UK Government (2022), <u>Inclusive Britain: government response to the Commission on</u> Race and Ethnic Disparities [accessed:22 April 2024]. Actions 40, 67, 68.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>80</sup> Welsh Government (2022, <u>Criminal justice anti-racism action plan for Wales,</u> [accessed:22 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>81</sup> Welsh Government (2022), <u>Anti-racist Wales action plan,</u> [accessed:22 April 2024], p. 115 - 119.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>82</sup> Welsh Government (2023), <u>Anti-racist Wales Action Plan – A Year On,</u> [accessed:17 May 2024], p. 63.

implementation as a key challenge in the delivery of these objectives.<sup>83</sup>

In 2022, the Police, Crime, Sentencing and Courts Act was passed into law. It includes measures to criminalise certain types of trespass in England and Wales.<sup>84</sup> During the passage of the legislation, we stated that these measures were likely to have a profound effect on Gypsy, Roma and Traveller people.<sup>85</sup> In May 2024, the High Court of Justice, a Senior Court of England and Wales, found that certain sections of this legislation amounted to unjustified discrimination against Romani Gypsies and Irish Travellers, and were incompatible with the relevant provisions of the European Convention on Human Rights.<sup>86</sup>

#### Recommendations:

The UK and Welsh Governments, where appropriate, should:

- Complete implementation of recommendations from the Lammy review and monitor and report on the impact of initiatives taken
- Increase efforts to improve data collection, monitoring and analysis around ethnic disparities in the criminal justice system, including qualitative research to better identify and address the causes of unexplained disparities, and the potential role of bias and discrimination in these

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>83</sup> Welsh Government (2023), <u>Anti-racist Wales Action Plan – A Year On,</u> [accessed:17 May 2024], p. 63.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>84</sup> Police Crime Sentencing and Courts Act 2022 [accessed: 21 June 2024]. Part 4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>85</sup> EQUAL and others (2021), <u>Entrenching Racial Disparities Response to the Police, Crime, Sentencing and Courts (PCSC) Bill May 2021</u> [accessed:30 April 2024].and EHRC (2021), <u>Police, Crime, Sentencing and Courts Bill - Equality and Human Rights Commission briefing</u> [accessed:14 May 2024], p. 7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>86</sup> R (Smith) v SSHD [2024].EWHC 1137 (Admin) [accessed: 10 June 2024], paras. 54-56.

## 2.2 Treatment in Custody

Black male prisoners describe persistent racial discrimination in prison, ranging from explicit racism to more subtle forms of discrimination.<sup>87</sup> They are more likely to have force used against them in detention than other ethnic groups, and racist stereotyping contributes to this.<sup>88</sup> HM Prison and Probation Service issued a new Policy Framework on the use of force in prisons in 2023, and committed to improved provision of data on use of force, but this has not yet been implemented.<sup>89</sup>

The roll-out of the synthetic pepper spray PAVA, used to incapacitate, across the adult male estate, engages the rights of those in custody. <sup>90</sup> Evidence shows that PAVA is used disproportionately against Black, Black British, and Muslim prisoners. Between April 2019 and December 2022, the use of PAVA spray on Black and Black British prisoners steadily increased, and by December 2022, 43% of prisoners on whom PAVA spray was used were Black/Black British, despite making up 13% of the prison population. <sup>91</sup> Before the announcement of the 2024 General Election,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>87</sup> HM Chief Inspector of Prisons (2022), <u>Thematic review: The experiences of adult black male prisoners and black prison staff</u> [accessed:24 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>88</sup> HM Inspectorate of Prisons (2022), <u>The experiences of adult black male prisoners and black prison staff</u>, p. 8 [accessed: 24 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>89</sup> HM Prison and Probation Service (2023), <u>A Response to: HMIP Thematic Review – The experiences of adult Black male prisoners and Black prison staff</u>, [accessed:24 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>90</sup> EHRC (2024), <u>Civil and Political Rights in Great Britain</u>, p. 44 [accessed: 24 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>91</sup> UK Parliament Hansard (2022), <u>Written answer from Lord Bellamy on Prisons: Pepper Spray</u> [accessed:14 May 2024].and Prison Reform Trust (2023), <u>Equality incapacitated: the disproportionate impact of PAVA spray on Black, Muslim and disabled prisoners</u>, p. 3 [accessed: 24 April 2024].

the UK government was in the process of publishing a review of the use of PAVA spray in prisons.<sup>92</sup>

PAVA is currently used in the youth estate in response to serious incidents only, but the UK government has been considering rolling out the same approach to the use of PAVA spray in youth custody as in the adult estate.<sup>93</sup> The Children's Commissioner for England has stated that such an extension would breach children's right to be free from violence and inhumane treatment.<sup>94</sup>

## 2.3 Policing

Data shows people belonging to ethnic minority groups in England are Wales are subject to more forceful policing, in particular Black and Black British people.

#### Stop and search and use of force

Disparities in the use of stop and search powers by police continue. In 2022/23, people from Black or Black British were searched at a rate 5.5 times higher than those from a White ethnic group across England and Wales (using the combined disparity measure). This was a decrease compared with the year ending March 2022, which may be linked to a reduction in the proportion of stop and searches in London.<sup>95</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>92</sup> UK Parliament Hansard (2024), <u>Written answer from Lord Bellamy</u>, [accessed:24 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>93</sup> UK Parliament Hansard (2024), <u>Written answer from Lord Bellamy</u>, [accessed:24 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>94</sup> Children's Commissioner (2023), <u>Children's Commissioner raises concern about the possible introduction of incapacitant spray into Young Offenders Institutions</u>, [accessed:24 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>95</sup> Home Office (2024) <u>Police powers and procedures: Stop and search and arrests, England and Wales, year ending 31 March 2023 (second edition),</u> [accessed:16 May 2024], para. 2.6.1.

In England and Wales, excluding the Metropolitan Police for London, 8% of all stop and searches in 2022/23 were against Black or Black British individuals (compared with 2% in the population of England and Wales, excluding the London Metropolitan Area). Over a third (35%) of searches by the Metropolitan Police for London were against Black or Black British individuals. These groups account for 14% of the population covered by the Metropolitan Police.<sup>96</sup>

In 2022/23, 69% of children arrested in London were from ethnic minorities (excluding White ethnic minorities).<sup>97</sup>

The disproportionate use of stop and search towards Black people is a controversial issue. Many claim it represents continued prejudice against Black people and an overpolicing of areas where people from Black ethnic groups live. 98 Others note Black people are four times more likely than White people to be victims of homicide and are significantly over-represented in convictions for robbery, drug offences and possession of weapons. 98

The Public Order Act 2023 introduced new stop and search powers for England and Wales.<sup>99</sup> The government-commissioned CRED report recommended increasing transparency in the use of stop and search, and the government has committed to implementing changes in data gathering.<sup>100</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>96</sup> Home Office (2024) <u>Police powers and procedures: Stop and search and arrests, England and Wales, year ending 31 March 2023 (second edition),</u> [accessed:16 May 2024], Table 2.6.

<sup>98</sup> College of Policing (2022), Police Race Action Plan [accessed:20 June 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>98</sup> CRED (2021), <u>Independent Report of the Commission on Race and Ethnic Disparities:</u> <u>Crime and Policing</u> [accessed: 20 June 2024]. Office for National Statistics (2024), <u>Homicide in England and Wales: year ending March 2023</u> [accessed: 20 June 2024].

<sup>99</sup> Public Order Act 2023 [accessed: 21 June 2024], sections 10-14

ORED (2021), Independent Report of the Commission on Race and Ethnic Disparities: Crime and Policing [accessed: 20 June 2024] and UK Government (2022), Inclusive Britain Action Plan [accessed: 21 June 2024].

Data shows Black and Black British people are 3.3-3.5 times more likely to be subject to use of force by police than people from a White ethnic group.<sup>101</sup> Black men aged 18 to 34 were involved in use of force incidents at a rate 3.8 times higher than White men in the same age group in England and Wales.<sup>102</sup>

National data on treatment by police is not sufficiently disaggregated to provide specific data on people from Gypsy, Roma, and Traveller ethnic groups within the justice system. Office for National Statistics research has found that Gypsy and Traveller communities perceive differential treatment in their interactions with police, including relating to use of force.<sup>103</sup>

In 2022, all 43 Chief Constables of police forces in England and Wales committed to the Police Race Action Plan, developed jointly between the National Police Chiefs Council and the College of Policing.<sup>104</sup> This plan aims to 'improve outcomes for Black people who work within or interact with policing'.

A 2023 independent review into the Metropolitan Police for London described the organisation as institutionally racist and highlighted the over-policing of Black people in London, as well as wider problems with racial discrimination within the force.<sup>105</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>101</sup> This is the range in disparities between data looking at England and Wales, excluding London, and data looking exclusively at London. Research notes limitations in data make it hard to identify the degree of the disparity. UK Government (2023), <u>Police use of force statistics</u>, <u>England and Wales</u>: <u>April 2022 to March 2023</u>, paras 4.4 and 4.5 [accessed: 24 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>102</sup> UK Government (2023), <u>Police use of force statistics</u>, <u>England and Wales: April 2022</u> to March 2023, paras 4.4 and 4.5 [accessed: 24 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>103</sup> Office for National Statistics (2022), <u>Gypsies' and Travellers' lived experiences, justice, England and Wales: 2022,</u> [accessed:24 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>104</sup> College of Policing (2022), Police Race Action Plan [accessed:20 June 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>105</sup> Baroness Casey Review (2023), <u>Final Report: An independent review into the standards of behaviour and internal culture of the Metropolitan Police Service</u>, [accessed:30 April 2024]. For an overview of similar announcements by Police Chiefs, read also See also Independent Scrutiny and Oversight Board (2023), <u>Police Race</u>

The Gangs Violence Matrix, a tool used by the Metropolitan Police for London to identify and risk-assess gang members in London, was discontinued in February 2024 as a result of its disproportionate targeting of people from ethnic minorities, particularly young Black men.<sup>106</sup> It has been replaced by a Violence Harm Assessment tool, described as an intelligence tool "used to identify and risk assess individuals, who are involved, or likely to be involved, in violence in London".<sup>107</sup>

### Facial recognition technology

Police use of Facial Recognition Technology (FRT) is also increasing with limited safeguards to defend against discriminatory use on the grounds of race and ethnicity. At particular thresholds, FRT has lower accuracy rates for certain ethnic minorities due to inbuilt bias within the data. <sup>108</sup> In addition, a study into the effectiveness of facial recognition found that the technology was accurate when tested on good, high-resolution photographs that were 1 to 2 days old, but that accuracy would decline with poorer quality and less recent images. <sup>109</sup>

The UK Government had stated its intent to support wider roll out of FRT through publishing a three-year roadmap for its use.

Action Plan – Independent Scrutiny and Oversight Board Annual Report May 2022-May 2023 [accessed:20 June 2024], p. 6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>106</sup> Amnesty International (2018), <u>Trapped in the matrix</u> [accessed: 2 February 2021], p. 3, and pp. 20–22. In March 2022, 79% of those included on the matrix were Black. See Met Police (2022) <u>Gangs Matrix figures – Headlines 2021/2022 Q4</u>, [accessed: 25 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>107</sup> See BBC (2024), <u>Met Police scraps controversial gang database</u> [accessed:25 April 2024] and Metropolitan Police (2024), <u>Violence Harm Assessment</u> [accessed:25 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>108</sup> Big Brother Watch (2023), <u>Biometric Britain: The expansion of Facial Recognition</u>
<u>Surveillance [accessed: 21 June 2024]. FRT selects a level at which the system calls a match, depending on the similarity the system sees between images. At a higher threshold, the system is 'more certain' of a match, at a lower threshold, it is less certain.</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>109</sup> National Physical Laboratory (March 2023), <u>Facial Recognition Technology in Law Enforcement Equitability Study</u> [accessed: 21 June 2024].

The UK Government had also proposed changes to the oversight of biometric surveillance technology including FRT and to make it easier for police to access other government photo databases, such as for driving licences. The proposals risked reducing existing safeguards against unnecessary and disproportionate surveillance and increasing the potential for discrimination and bias, concerns echoed in a 2023 independent report commissioned by the Biometrics and Surveillance Camera Commissioner.

The draft legislation had not completed the legislative process prior to the General Election being called for 4 July 2024. Any new Government would need to bring forward new draft legislation.

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>110</sup> UK Parliament (2023), <u>Data Protection and Digital Information Bill</u> [accessed: 04 July 2024]; for more analysis, read Equality and Human Rights Commission (2023), <u>Data Protection and Digital Information Bill Parliamentary Briefing</u>, <u>House of Commons Committee Stage</u> [accessed: 04 July 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>111</sup> Office of the Biometrics and Surveillance Camera Commissioner (2023), <u>The use of overt surveillance camera systems in public places by police forces in England and Wales</u> [accessed:04 July 2024].

## 3. Rights at Work

# 3.1 Employment gaps, pay gaps and insecure work

Article 5(e)(i) of the CERD requires the UK to 'guarantee the right of everyone without distinction as to race, colour, or national or ethnic origin, to equality before the law [...] in the enjoyment of [...] the right [...] to just and favourable conditions at work, [...] to equal pay for equal work and to just and favourable remuneration'.

#### Employment gaps

In Britain, employment rates have consistently been lowest for Pakistani and Bangladeshi groups. The gap between those groups and the White British group has narrowed significantly between 2011/12 and 2021/22. Pakistani, Bangladeshi and Black groups in Britain also have the highest unemployment rates at 8.7%, 8.8% and 9.5% respectively, compared to 3.6% among White British people in 2021/22. There are substantial differences between male and female rates of economic inactivity within Pakistani and Bangladeshi

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>112</sup> Rates for Gypsy Roma Travellers are not measured in this analysis to low sample sizes.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>113</sup> EHRC (2023), <u>Equality and Human Rights Monitor 2023: Supporting data:</u> <u>Employment rates (adult)</u> [accessed:10 May 2024].Pakistani and Bangladeshi employment gaps are even larger when workers aged 65+ are excluded from the analysis. Please see: UK Government (2023), <u>Employment</u> [accessed:21 May 2024]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>114</sup> EHRC (2023), <u>Equality and Human Rights Monitor 2023: Supporting data:</u> <u>Unemployment rates (adult)</u> [accessed:10 May 2024]

groups, where women have higher rates of economic inactivity than men of the same ethnic background.<sup>115</sup>

Data from the Census 2021 shows that in England and Wales, Gypsy and Traveller employment rates are lower, and rates of economic inactivity are higher, than all other ethnic groups.<sup>116</sup>

Analysis suggests that, in England and Wales, the employment gap for adults from Pakistani and Bangladeshi ethnic groups cannot be fully explained by controlling for other differences, such as educational levels or geographical location.<sup>117</sup> This is particularly the case for women, specifically women not born in the UK.<sup>118</sup>

A range of explanations have been suggested, including cultural-religious reasons, differences in preferences and norms between ethnic groups, as well as discrimination.<sup>119</sup> Among Gypsies and Travellers, lived experience research suggests that literacy issues and low educational attainment, along with perceived negative employer attitudes and stereotypes, may contribute to employment gaps for this group.<sup>120</sup>

Employment gaps have been highlighted by the independent McGregor-Smith review into race in the workplace (2017)<sup>121</sup> and the independent Commission on Race and Ethnic Disparities (CRED) in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>115</sup> EHRC (2023), <u>Equality and Human Rights Monitor - Work Fact Sheet - GB</u> [accessed:15 April 2024], p.3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>116</sup> EHRC (2023), <u>Equality and Human Rights Monitor - Work Fact Sheet - GB</u> [accessed:15 April 2024], p.3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>117</sup> Mirza, H. S., and Warwick, R. (2022), Race and Ethnicity [accessed:15 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>118</sup> Mirza, H. S., and Warwick, R. (2022), Race and Ethnicity [accessed:15 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>119</sup> Commission on Race and Ethnic Disparities (2021), <u>Commission on Race and Ethnic Disparities: The Report</u> [accessed:15 April 2024], p.108; Mirza, H. S., and Warwick, R. (2022), <u>Race and Ethnicity</u> [accessed:15 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>120</sup> Office for National Statistics (2022), <u>Gypsies' and Travellers' lived experiences</u>, education and employment, England and Wales: 2022 [accessed:13 May 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>121</sup> UK Government (2017), <u>Race in the workplace: The McGregor-Smith Review</u> [accessed:15 April 2024].

2021.<sup>122</sup> These reviews have not led to any policy or legislative initiatives that directly tackle disparities in employment rates between ethnic groups.

The UK government's post-pandemic economic development strategy, broadly known as 'Levelling Up', intended – amongst other things – to create job opportunities and improve conditions at work for communities facing regional and other disparities. These policies focused primarily on addressing socio-economic inequality, but had no specific requirement to address ethnicity pay and employment gaps. As a result, there is no evidence to suggest these initiatives have had an impact on employment gaps between and within ethnic groups. The Anti-racist Wales Action Plan (ArWAP) includes an action to improve data on ethnic minority participation in employability programmes, 124 but progress has been limited.

#### Pay gaps

Our analysis of the Annual Population Survey found that some ethnic minority groups are on average paid significant less than White British workers. Bangladeshi and Pakistani workers in Great Britain consistently have the largest pay gap compared to White British workers – being paid 17.7% and 9.3% less respectively in 2021/2022. There is some evidence that these groups have seen improvements in earnings over time. Pay gaps are also particularly high for Black people, who are paid on average 7.8% less than White British workers. Chinese, Indian, and White Irish workers have

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>122</sup> Commission on Race and Ethnic Disparities (2021), <u>Commission on Race and Ethnic Disparities: The Report</u> [accessed:15 April 2024], p.105.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>123</sup> UK Government, <u>Levelling Up</u> [accessed:29 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>124</sup> Welsh Government, Anti-racist Wales Action Plan, [accessed:21 May 2024], p.102

EHRC (2023), Equality and Human Rights Monitor 2023: Supporting data: Median Hourly Earnings [accessed:10 May 2024]. Our analysis found Pakistani, Bangladeshi and Black groups earn staticially significantly less than White British workers. Read also Office for National Statistics (2023), Ethnicity pay gaps, UK 2012 to 2022 [accessed:19 June 2024], discussion on p. 2.

consistently higher earnings than white British workers and are paid 38.2%, 20.7% and 34.4% more respectively. 126

Occupational segregation is reflected in pay gaps, as ethnic minority workers are over-represented in low-paid occupations, which include caring, leisure and other services, sales and customer services, and elementary occupations, such as labouring.<sup>127</sup> Black workers are most likely to be in low-paid work. Gypsy, Irish Traveller, and Roma workers are also over-represented in certain lower occupational classes.<sup>128</sup> Although there has been a decline in the proportion of Bangladeshi workers in a low-paid occupation, they also remain one of the most likely groups to work in these occupations.<sup>129</sup>

Research suggests that pay gaps experienced by people from ethnic minorities may be linked to the multiple and complex barriers they face accessing and progressing in work. For example, some people from ethnic minorities report feeling discriminated against when it comes to recruitment, promotion and pay decisions. Survey data suggests disparities in access to mentors, role models, career support programmes and professional networks.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>126</sup> EHRC (2023), <u>Equality and Human Rights Monitor 2023: Supporting data: Median Hourly Earnings</u> [accessed:10 May 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>127</sup> EHRC (2023), Equality and Human Rights Monitor [accessed:15 April 2024], p. 288.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>128</sup> EHRC (2023), Equality and Human Rights Monitor [accessed:15 April 2024], p. 173.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>129</sup> EHRC (2023), <u>Equality and Human Rights Monitor - Work Fact Sheet - GB</u> [accessed:15 April 2024], p.5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>130</sup> Longhi, S. and Brynin, M. (2017), <u>The Ethnicity Pay Gap. EHRC Research report 108</u> [accessed:15 April 2024]; Adams, L. et al. (2018), <u>Measuring and reporting on disability and ethnicity pay gaps. EHRC Research report 117</u> [accessed:15 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>131</sup> Business in the Community (2018), <u>Race at Work 2018: the McGregor-Smith Review one year on [accessed:15 April 2024]</u>, p. 4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>132</sup> Race Alliance Wales (2022), <u>Deconstructing Unsafe Spaces – How to create a truly inclusive workplace culture for racialised staff</u>, [accessed:11 April 2024], p.6 and Business in the Community (2018), <u>Race at Work 2018: the McGregor-Smith Review one year on [accessed: 02 July 2024].</u>

There is evidence that differences in qualification levels and geographical location can contribute to disparities in earnings for some ethnic minority groups, 133 and pay gaps tend to be larger for non-UK born ethnic minority groups compared to ethnic minorities that are UK born. 134 Despite this, further analysis indicates that there are still persistent unexplained pay gaps, even when a wide range of factors (including those mentioned above) are controlled for. Possible explanations could include discrimination, or expectation of discrimination, access to social networks and ability to travel, each of which may affect job choices and labour market behaviour. 135

The Commission on Race and Ethnic Disparities 2021 report included recommendations to investigate the causes of existing ethnic pay disparities. It noted the usefulness of pay reporting but cited statistical challenges and the unreliability of sample sizes. <sup>136</sup> In response, in April 2023 the UK government published guidance to employers who choose to report ethnicity pay data voluntarily, including support to understand and address any disparities. <sup>137</sup> No wider plans to monitor uptake or assess impact of the guidance have been shared. Evidence suggests that the introduction of mandatory reporting on recruitment, retention, and progression rates by

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>133</sup> Office for National Statistics (2023), <u>Ethnicity pay gaps, UK: 2012 to 2022</u> [accessed:24 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>134</sup> Office for National Statistics (2023), <u>Ethnicity pay gaps</u>, <u>UK: 2012 to 2022</u> [accessed:24 April 2024].and Mirza, H. and Warwick, R. (2022), <u>Race and ethnicity: IFS Deaton Review of Inequalities</u>, [accessed:13 May 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>135</sup> Mirza, H. and Warwick, R. (2022), <u>Race and ethnicity: IFS Deaton Review of</u> Inequalities, [accessed:13 May 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>136</sup> Commission on Race and Ethnic Disparities (2021), <u>Commission on Race and Ethnic Disparities: The Report</u> [accessed:15 April 2024], p.13.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>137</sup> UK Government (2023), <u>Ethnicity Pay Reporting: guidance for employers</u> [accessed:15 April 2024].

ethnicity, supplemented by action plans, may be a more useful way of understanding race disparities at work than pay reporting.<sup>138</sup>

The Welsh Government has set a national milestone to eliminate the ethnicity pay gap by 2050, 139 including a commitment to this in its Programme for Government 2021-26. However, little progress on mitigating the gap has been recorded in the Welsh government's update on the ArWAP. Due to small population sizes in Wales, it is difficult to disaggregate data to specific minority ethnic groups. This limits opportunities to understand pay gaps and monitor the effectiveness of efforts to reduce pay gaps. As part of their Public Sector Equality Duty reform programme, the Scottish Government have committed to extending the existing duty to publish gender pay gap information (regulation 7 of the Scottish Specific Duties) to include ethnicity and disability. 142

#### Insecure work

In Britain, ethnic minority workers are more likely than White British workers to be in insecure employment, which includes:

- agency work
- casual work
- seasonal work
- employment based on zero-hours contracts

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>138</sup> Business in the Community (2021), <u>Race at Work 2021: McGregor-Smith Review</u> Four Years On [accessed:15 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>139</sup> Welsh Government (2021), <u>Shaping Wales' Future</u>, <u>The first national milestones for Wales</u>, [accessed:11 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>140</sup> Welsh Government (2021), <u>Programme for Government 2021-26</u>, [accessed:21 May 2024], p. 6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>141</sup> Race Disparity Unit (2023), <u>Unemployment figures</u> [accessed:11 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>142</sup> Scottish Government (2022), <u>Public Sector Equality Duty - operation review:</u> <u>consultation analysis</u> [accessed:30 May 2024.

## • self-employment. 143

In 2021/22 in England, 17.6% of Pakistani workers were in insecure employment compared to 7.6% of White British workers. Black, Bangladeshi, White Other, Mixed Multiple and 'Other' workers were also more likely than White British to be in insecure employment. In 2021/22 in Wales, 12.8% of ethnic minority workers were in insecure employment, compared to 8.8% of White British workers. In 2021/22 in Wales, 12.8% of ethnic minority workers were in insecure employment, compared to 8.8% of White British workers. In 2021/22 in Wales, 12.8% of ethnic minority workers. In 2021/22 in Wales, 12.8% of ethnic minority workers were in insecure ethnic minority workers (excluding White minorities) have become increasingly more likely than White British workers to be in insecure employment between 2010/11 and 2021/22.

The growth in zero-hours contracts, an increasingly common form of insecure work with no minimum set contracted hours, has disproportionately impacted ethnic minority workers. Between 2013 and 2019 the number of ethnic minority workers on zero-hours contracts increased by 96%, while for White British workers the increase was 29%.<sup>148</sup>

Workers in insecure employment may be more likely to lack basic employment rights and protections, such as sick pay or the right to protection from unfair dismissal. During the COVID-19 pandemic, evidence suggests that workers in insecure employment faced specific barriers accessing government support schemes such as

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>143</sup> EHRC (2023), Equality and Human Rights Monitor [accessed:15 April 2024], p.288.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>144</sup> Including Gypsy, Roma and Traveller workers.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>145</sup> EHRC (2023), <u>Equality and Human Rights Monitor 2023: Supporting data:</u> <u>Percentage in a job classed as insecure</u> [accessed:10 May 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>146</sup> EHRC (2023), <u>Equality and Human Rights Monitor 2023: Supporting data:</u> Percentage in a job classed as insecure [accessed:10 May 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>147</sup> EHRC (2023), <u>Equality and Human Rights Monitor - Work Fact Sheet - GB</u> [accessed:15 April 2024], p.2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>148</sup> EHRC (2023), Future of Work Report [accessed:15 April 2024], p. 35.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>149</sup> Florisson, R., (2022), <u>The UK Insecure Work Index: Two decades of insecurity</u>. Work Foundation [accessed:24 April 2024], p.11.

Statutory Sick Pay and the Coronavirus Job Retention Scheme. This temporary scheme provided government grants to employers to enable them to continue paying employees' wages through the pandemic.<sup>150</sup>

There are a range of possible explanations for the disproportionate number of ethnic minority workers in insecure employment. Some researchers point to limited opportunities in more traditional forms of employment. Others argue ethnic minority workers are more likely to have limited choices in pursuit of flexibility, which insecure work can, in some cases, offer. Evidence suggests that the limited labour market choices that some ethnic minority workers have may, to some extent, be due to discriminatory behaviour that leads to labour market exclusion and low overall employment. 153

Following recommendations in the 2017 independent Taylor Review of Modern Working Practices,<sup>154</sup> the UK government published the Good Work Plan (2018) and committed to increasing transparency and fairness in the use of zero-hours contracts.<sup>155</sup> It also proposed labour market reforms to improve conditions for those in insecure work. This included the introduction of a single enforcement body that would bring together the work of several existing labour market

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>150</sup> Women and Equalities Committee (2020), <u>Unequal impact? Coronavirus and BAME people</u> [accessed:15 April 2024], paras. 80–83.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>151</sup> Clark, K. (2015), <u>Ethnic minority self-employment. IZA World of Labor</u> [accessed:15 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>152</sup> Martin, A., Williams, G., Atay, A. and Florisson, R., (2024), <u>Zero Choices: Swapping zero-hour contracts for secure, flexible working.</u> Work Foundation [accessed:15 April 2024], p.11.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>153</sup> Commission on Race and Ethnic Disparities (2021), <u>Employment, fairness at work,</u> and enterprise [accessed:19 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>154</sup> UK Government (2017), <u>Good Work: The Taylor Review of Modern Working</u> Practices [accessed:22 April 2024], p.48.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>155</sup> UK Government (2018), Good Work Plan [accessed:22 April 2024], p.46.

enforcement bodies.<sup>156</sup> The government has yet to proceed with plans to introduce such a body.

The Welsh Government produced a 'guide to fair work' for employers.<sup>157</sup> It includes guidance on inclusive working environments including equalities data collection and actions to address under-representation across protected characteristic groups, including ethnic minorities.

The Workers (Predictable Terms and Conditions) Act 2023 – expected to come into force in September 2024 – introduces a right for workers, including those on zero-hours contracts, to request a more predictable working pattern in England and Wales.<sup>158</sup>

#### Recommendations:

The UK and Welsh governments, where appropriate, should:

- Improve the evidence base on employment gaps to better understand the factors driving economic participation and inactivity, and on how the experience of insecure work differs by race and ethnicity
- Introduce a mandatory duty on public sector employers in England and private sector employers in England, Scotland, and Wales with more than 250 staff to monitor and report on ethnicity recruitment, retention, and progression, with a requirement for mandatory action plans that outline how gaps and inequalities are going to be addressed

The Welsh Government should:

ensure its commitment to address the ethnicity pay gap in its
 Programme for Government is progressed, within its legislative

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>156</sup> UK Government (2018), Good Work Plan [accessed:22 April 2024], p.42.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>157</sup> Welsh Government (2022), A guide to fair work, [accessed:21 May 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>158</sup> UK Parliament (2023), <u>Workers (Predictable Terms and Conditions) Act 2023</u> [accessed:23 April 2024].

competence, including addressing inequalities in recruitment, retention, and progression in the public sector for people from ethnic minority groups

## 3.2 Discrimination at work

Article 5 of the CERD requires UK to 'guarantee the right of everyone without distinction as to race, colour, or national or ethnic origin, to equality before the law [...] in the enjoyment of [...] the right [...] to just and favourable conditions at work'. Combined with Article 2(1)(c) which requires the UK to end racial discrimination by any person, group or organisation, the UK must take steps to prevent racial discrimination by private and public sector employers.

Race discrimination remains prevalent within UK workplaces. A large-scale representative survey from 2023 shows that almost 30% of people from ethnic minority backgrounds report experience of racial discrimination at work. This trend is higher for individuals from Black Caribbean, Bangladeshi, Gypsy, Roma, and Traveller ethnic groups.<sup>159</sup>

Extensive research has been undertaken to understand discriminatory behaviour within certain workplaces and sectors. For example, the independent 2023 Casey Review found that ethnic minority officers and staff in the Metropolitan Police experience racism at work that is routinely ignored, dismissed, or not spoken about, to the extent that many do not think it is worth reporting.<sup>160</sup>

Our 2022 inquiry into ethnic minority workers in the health and social care sector also gathered substantial evidence of poor treatment.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>159</sup> Ochmann et al (2023), <u>Evidence for Equality National Survey (EVENS)</u> [accessed:22 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>160</sup> London Metropolitan Police (2023), <u>Baroness Casey Review Final Report: March</u> <u>2023</u> [accessed:23 April 2024], p.17.

Many workers felt that others were treating them in a negative or unfavourable way because of their race or nationality. Examples of this treatment include being treated with contempt, being belittled by managers and colleagues, and having concerns unreasonably dismissed.<sup>161</sup>

The Welsh Government's Anti-Racist Wales Action Plan (ArWAP)<sup>162</sup> includes a commitment to incorporate our inquiry recommendations and improve conditions across the public sector workforce. This includes a new workforce race equality standard to address poor experiences for social care workers.

The UK government's Inclusive Britain Action Plan contained several commitments to address race disparities in certain sectors, including a commitment to tackle bias and ensure fairness in the workplace by creating an 'Inclusion at Work Panel'. The panel's report was published in March 2024 and focuses on improving workplace diversity and inclusion practices. It does not make specific recommendations on how to combat race discrimination at work. Inclusive Britain also committed the UK government to creating new guidance for employers on the use of positive action to create opportunity for groups underrepresented in their workforce. This guidance was published in 2023.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>161</sup> EHRC (2022), <u>Experiences from health and social care: the treatment of lower-paid ethnic minority workers</u> [accessed:23 April 2024], p.25.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>162</sup> Welsh Government, [Anti-Racist Wales Action Plan].accessed:11 April 2024

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>163</sup> UK Government (2022), <u>Inclusive Britain: government response to the Commission</u> on Race and Ethnic Disparities [accessed:16 April 2024], p.94.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>164</sup> Inclusion at Work Panel (2024) <u>Inclusion at Work Panel: report on improving</u> workplace diversity and inclusion [accessed:13 May 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>165</sup> UK Government (2023), Positive action in the workplace [accessed:24 April 2024].

## 4. Living Standards

Article 5(e) of the CERD requires the UK to 'guarantee the right of everyone without distinction as to race, colour, or national or ethnic origin, to equality before the law [...] in the enjoyment of [...] economic, social, and cultural rights'. The right to an adequate standard of living is contained in Article 11 of the International Covenant on Economic Social and Cultural Rights and contains 'adequate food, clothing, and housing, and [...] the continuous improvement of living conditions'. 166

## 4.1 Poverty rates

In 2022/23, 14.3 million people (21%) in the UK were in relative poverty and 12 million people (18%) were in absolute poverty, both after household costs.<sup>167</sup> 30% of children live in relative poverty.

Based on our analysis of data between 2010 and 2020, severe material deprivation and disparities between certain ethnic minority groups prevail in Great Britain. This is particularly so in both adult and child poverty rates between Black African, Black Caribbean, Bangladeshi and Pakistani groups, and the White British group.<sup>168</sup>

In England, between 2010/11 and 2019/20 disparities in relative poverty rates between individuals from certain ethnic groups and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>166</sup> International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights [accessed:21 June 2024], Article 11.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>167</sup> Department for Work and Pensions (2024), <u>National Statistics – Households Below Average Income</u>: an analysis of the UK income distribution: FYE 1995 to FYE 2023 [accessed:22 April 2024], figures 13 and 14.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>168</sup> EHRC (2023), Equality and Human Rights Monitor 2023 [accessed:13 May 2024], pp. 176-179

White British individuals prevailed but had reduced. By 2020, individuals from Bangladeshi and Pakistani ethnic groups had the highest rates (over 40%), compared with individuals from White Irish and White British ethnic groups who had the lowest rates (under 20%). In Wales, between March 2019 and March 2023, households headed by a person from a Black, Asian or ethnic minority group had a 50% likelihood of living in relative poverty – an increase from 40% between 2018 to 2022 Iro – compared with a 22% likelihood for those whose head of household comes from a White ethnic group. Iro

In England, between 2010/11 and 2019/20, child poverty rates increased for households headed by a Black Caribbean adult, from 31.1% to 54.6%, and for White British headed households, from 24.1% to 25.7%.<sup>172</sup> Robust data was not available at this level for Wales.

It is difficult to establish the extent to which discrimination plays a role in poverty outcomes. There are multiple drivers that contribute to poverty rates. Some of these may be more prevalent within certain ethnic minority groups, and therefore increase the likelihood of poverty within those groups. These drivers include household composition, the number of household earners, level of income from work, welfare benefits and other sources, housing costs, and geographical location.

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>169</sup> EHRC (2023), <u>Equality and Human Rights Monitor 2023: Supporting data.</u>

<u>Percentage living in households below 60% contemporary median income after housing costs (AHC) (adults) [accessed:18 April 2024]. Data for 2020/21 was subject to additional uncertainty and therefore cannot be analysed.</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>170</sup> Caution is advised when interepreting short-term changes in this dataset.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>171</sup> Welsh Government (2024), <u>Relative Income Poverty: April 2022 to March 2023</u> [accessed:18 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>172</sup> EHRC (2023), <u>Equality and Human Rights Monitor 2023: Supporting data.</u>

<u>Percentage living in households below 60% contemporary median income after housing costs (AHC) (children)[accessed:18 April 2024]</u>, Data for 2020/21 was subject to additional uncertainty and therefore cannot be analysed.

### For example,

- Bangladeshi (61%) and Pakistani (64%) households take a similar proportion of their household income from earnings to White British households (63%)<sup>173</sup>
- However, Bangladeshi, and Pakistani workers have the two lowest median hourly earning rates of all ethnic groups, meaning their income from earnings is lower<sup>174</sup>
- Therefore, Bangladeshi (7%) and Pakistani (6%) households take a higher proportion of their income from tax credits compared to White British households (1%), which do not automatically adjust for inflation<sup>175</sup>
- A greater proportion of ethnic minorities spend more than a third of their net household income on housing compared to White households<sup>176</sup>

## Social security system

The social security system (known also as 'Welfare' or 'Benefits' system) in Great Britain is reserved to the UK Parliament. Some benefits are now devolved to the Scottish Government.

A prominent change to the social security system in the reporting period (2016 - 2024) is the introduction of the 'two-child' limit on claims for two types of social security in the UK: Universal Credit and Child Tax Credits.<sup>177</sup> The Resolution Foundation has estimated that low-income families lose 'around £3200 for any third or subsequent

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>173</sup> UK Government (2023) <u>Ethnicity Facts and Figures: Sources of household income</u> [accessed: 21 June 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>174</sup> EHRC (2023), Equality and Human Rights Monitor 2023 [accessed:13 May 2024]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>175</sup> UK Government (2023) <u>Ethnicity Facts and Figures: Sources of household income</u> [accessed: 21 June 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>176</sup> The Health Foundation (2024), <u>Inequalities in housing affordability</u> [accessed: 21 June 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>177</sup> Welfare Reform and Work Act (2016), Sections 13 and 14 [accessed:13 May 2024].

child born after April 2017' as a result.<sup>178</sup> The impact assessment accompanying this policy acknowledged that 'ethnic minority households may be more likely to be impacted by these changes. This is because they are, on average, more likely to be in receipt of these benefits, and on average have larger families'.<sup>179</sup>

The UK government has not assessed the cumulative impact of these and broader changes to social security since 2013. Our own analysis found that the uprating freeze, the two-child limit, and the cuts to Universal Credit work allowances have an especially large impact on Pakistani and Bangladeshi households. The 'bedroom tax' - reductions in Housing Benefit for households in social housing deemed to have 'spare' bedrooms - has a particularly large impact on Bangladeshi, Black and Other ethnicity households.<sup>180</sup>

The UK government introduced legislation providing for additional support payments to assist individuals in receipt of certain benefits with increases in the cost of living between 2022 and 2024. The equality impact assessments for this assistance only considered age, gender, and geography.<sup>181</sup>

Neither the Inclusive Britain Action Plan nor the report of the Commission on Racial and Ethnic Disparities contain actions or recommendations to address disparities in poverty rates for individuals from ethnic minority groups in England.<sup>182</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>178</sup> Resolution Foundation (2024), <u>Catastrophic Caps: an analysis of the two-child limit and the benefit cap</u> [accessed: 19 June 2024], p 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>179</sup> Her Majesty's Treasury / Department for Work and Pensions (2015), Welfare Reform and Work Bill: Impact Assessment of Tax Credits and Universal Credit, changes to Child Element and Family Element [accessed: 13 May 2024], para. 31.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>180</sup> EHRC (2018), <u>Cumulative Impact of tax and welfare reforms</u> [accessed: 21 June 2024], pp.133-134.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>181</sup> See <u>Social Security (Additional Payments) Act 2022</u> [accessed:22 April 2024].and <u>Social Security (Additional Payments) Act 2023.</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>182</sup> See UK Government (2022), <u>Inclusive Britain Action Plan</u> [accessed:18 April 2024].and Commission on Racial and Ethnic Disparities [2021], <u>Summary of Recommendations</u> [accessed:18 April 2024].

The revised Child Poverty Strategy from the Welsh Government acknowledges the intersection between poverty and protected characteristics, including race. Despite its commitment to tackling child poverty as 'an absolute priority' the Welsh Government missed its own target of eradicating this by 2020. 184

## 4.2 Housing and accommodation

## Poor-quality housing

4.4% of households in England were overcrowded in 2021. Of these, the highest levels of overcrowding were in Bangladeshi (28.7%), Pakistani (20.7%), and Black African (20.7%) headed households. Overcrowding rates overall were lower in Wales compared to England (2.2%). The highest levels of overcrowding were in Bangladeshi (17.2%) and Black African (14.7%) headed households. Headed

In England, in the two years to March 2019, 17% of households in England on average lived in a 'non-decent' home. Mixed White and Black African households (33%) were more likely to live in a non-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>183</sup> Welsh Government (2024), <u>Child Poverty Strategy for Wales 2024</u>, [accessed:24 April 2024]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>184</sup> Audit Wales (2022), Time for Change – Poverty in Wales[accessed: 26 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>185</sup> Office for National Statistics (2023), <u>Household reference person. Country (England).</u> <u>Ethnic group (20 categories). Occupancy rating for bedrooms (5 categories)</u> [accessed:22 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>186</sup>Office for National Statistics (2023), <u>Household reference person, Country (Wales),</u> <u>Ethnic group (8 categories, 20 categories) and Occupancy rating for bedrooms (5 categories)</u>, [accessed:24 April 2024]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>187</sup> A non-decent home is a home where any of the following apply: the home does not meet the basic legal health and safety standards for housing; no modern facilities; no effective insulation or heating, or in a state of disrepair. Read UK Government (2023), Ethnicity Facts and Figures – Housing Conditions – Non-Decent Homes [accessed:15 May 2024].

decent home than White British households (18%).<sup>188</sup> Sample sizes for White Gypsy/Traveller households were too small to be disclosed in this dataset.<sup>189</sup> Unlike in England, statistical data on housing conditions and ethnicity are not routinely published in Wales. While some data is collected, it is not always easily available.<sup>190</sup>

In 2022, the UK government commissioned research to explore household overcrowding in South-Asian communities. <sup>191</sup> Four types of overcrowded household were identified:

- young families
- families with older children
- small families in one-bedroom properties
- multigenerational, extended families
- houses of multiple occupation

The availability of suitable and affordable housing was a critical factor that pushed South-Asian communities into overcrowding. Underpinning this were personal circumstances and an attachment to local areas. In some cases, this local attachment and sense of belonging derived from perceptions of greater acceptance of their race and cultural practices. The research proposed various recommendations, including making information about housing, financial support, mortgages, and benefits more accessible to individuals from South-Asian ethnic groups living in overcrowded accommodation. The Department noted that the research would inform their housing policies. They have not yet clarified whether and how this has been done.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>188</sup> UK Government (2020), <u>Ethnicty Facts and Figures – Housing Conditions – Non-</u>Decent Homes [accessed:22 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>189</sup> UK Government (2020), <u>Ethnicty Facts and Figures – Housing Conditions – Non-</u>Decent Homes [accessed:22 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>190</sup> Wales Centre for Public Policy (2021), Improving Race Eqaulity in Housing and Accomodation, [accessed:24 April 2024]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>191</sup> UK Department for Levelling-Up, Housing and Communities (2022), <u>Overcrowding in South Asian Households – a Qualitative Report</u> [accessed:13 May 2024].

Two prominent case studies from the reporting period highlight the dangers of non-decent homes. In 2017, 72 people lost their lives following a fire in Grenfell Tower, a high-rise residential building in London. The majority of those who died were from an ethnic minority group.<sup>192</sup> In 2020, two-year old Awaab Ishak died from environmental mould exposure in his social housing flat.<sup>193</sup> These deaths have led to legal and policy changes, including:

- the Homes (Fitness for Human Habitation) Act 2018, requiring all landlords to ensure that residential properties in England are put and kept in a condition that is safe and healthy for people to live in<sup>194</sup>
- the Building Safety Act 2022, intended to secure the safety of people in, and to improve the standard of, higher-risk buildings<sup>195</sup>
- the Social Housing (Regulation) Act 2023, which includes legal requirements to strengthen standards for managers of social housing, increase the oversight powers of the Regulator for Social Housing and the Housing Ombudsman and for social housing providers to take action to combat hazards.<sup>196</sup>

In December 2022, the Renting Homes (Wales) Act 2016<sup>197</sup> came into force in Wales. Under this legislation, landlords are required to ensure that properties are fit for human habitation and are safe to live

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>192</sup> Grenfell Tower Inquiry (2020), <u>Submission on behalf of the bereaved, residents and survivors</u> [accessed: 23 April 2024], para. 10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>193</sup> See Coroner for Coroner area of Manchester North (2023), <u>Awaab Ishak – Prevention of Future Deaths Report</u> [accessed: 23 April 2024], section 4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>194</sup> Home (Fitness for Human Habitation) Act 2018 [accessed: 10 June 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>195</sup> <u>Building Safety Act 2022</u> [accessed:23 April 2024]. Read also <u>Building safety</u> (Responsible Actors and Prohibitions) Regulations 2023 [accessed: 11 June 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>196</sup> <u>Social Housing (Regulation) Act 2023</u> [accessed:23 April 2024]. See UK government (2022), <u>Social Housing Regulatory Reform Impact Assessment</u> [accessed: 23 April 2024], para 1.3.5, noting the impact on individuals from Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic Backgrounds.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>197</sup> Renting Homes (Wales) Act 2016 [accessed:14 May 2024].

in. The Welsh Government produced guidance for landlords in 2022. 198

The Welsh Government also recognises gaps in the provision of adequate housing. Homes and Places is a key policy area in the Antiracist Wales Action Plan (ArWAP). Commitments include increasing ethnic minority representation among senior leadership within the housing sector and ensuring the needs and priorities of ethnic minority people are reflected in Welsh Government policies on the provision of homes, through engaging communities across Wales. In 2022, the Welsh Government also developed guidance on local housing market assessments to analyse the need for homes of ethnic minority people within each local authority. Welsh Local Authorities submitted their assessments to the Welsh Government in March 2024. A reference group for housing has been set up to oversee implementation of the ArWAP commitments.

### Gypsy, Roma, and Traveller sites

Government data indicates that the need for Traveller sites is growing in England year on year, but provision is not increasing. There were 25,220 Traveller caravans in England in July 2023 compared with 23,464 in July 2019. The caravan capacity of Traveller Caravan Sites provided by Local Authorities and private providers in England declined from 7,671 in July 2019 to 6,975 in July 2023.<sup>202</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>198</sup> Welsh Government, <u>Fitness of homes for human habitation: guidance for landlords</u>, [accessed:14 May 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>199</sup> Welsh Government 2022, <u>Anti-racist Wales Action Plan</u>, [accessed: 24 April 2024], p. 81.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>200</sup> Welsh Government, <u>Undertaking Local Housing Market Assessments</u>, [accessed:21 May 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>201</sup> Welsh Government 2022, <u>Anti-racist Wales Action Plan</u>, [accessed: 24 April 2024], p. 82.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>202</sup> <u>UK Department for Levelling-Up, Housing and Communities (2023), Count of Traveller Caravans: Live Tables</u> [accessed:14 May 2024], Table 2.

In Wales, 1,128 Gypsy and Traveller caravans were recorded in July 2023<sup>203</sup> compared to 1,051 in July 2019.<sup>204</sup> Of these, 87% were on authorised sites, compared to 89% in 2019.

Research into the locations of 242 local authority sites across England and 21 sites in Wales found that 36% of sites in England and 62% of sites in Wales are within 50 metres of at least one environmental hazard.<sup>205</sup>

Planning policy for traveller sites introduced in England in 2012 requires local authorities to set pitch targets over a five-year period and identify sufficient sites for this five-year period. However, research in 2022 found that from a sample of 100 local planning authorities, 64% had failed to allocate sites in their development plan process. 207

The Housing (Wales) Act 2014 places statutory duties on local authorities to provide Gypsy and Traveller sites where need has been identified, with the aim of reducing evictions from unauthorised sites.<sup>208</sup> The Senedd Equality and Social Justice Committee found in 2022 that there had been very little progress towards developing culturally appropriate sites since the legislation came into force.<sup>209</sup> In March 2024, the Public Services Ombudsman Wales found the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>203</sup> Welsh Government (2023), <u>Gypsy and Traveller Caravan Count: July 2023</u> [accessed:13 May 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>204</sup> Welsh Government (2019), <u>Gypsy and Traveller Caravan Count: July 2019</u> [accessed: 13 May 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>205</sup> Bloch and Quarmby (2024), 'Environmental racism, segregation and discrimination: Gypsy and Traveller sites in Great Britain' in *Critical Social Policy* 1-21, p. 8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>206</sup> UK Government (2023), <u>Planning policy for traveller sites</u> [accessed: 21 June 2024], p. 9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>207</sup> Friends, Families and Travellers (2022), <u>Kicking the can down the road; the planning and provision of Gypsy and Traveller sites in England 1960-2023</u> [accessed: 01 July 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>208</sup> Housing (Wales) Act 2014, [accessed:26 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>209</sup> Senedd Local Government and Housing Committee (2022), <u>Provision of sites for Gypsy, Roma and Travellers</u> [accessed: 24 April 2024], p. 5.

Welsh Government had failed to use its powers to ensure two local authorities in Wales were taking action to meet the accommodation needs of Gypsies and Travellers as required under the 2014 Act. <sup>210</sup>

#### Homelessness

Certain ethnic minority groups are disproportionately more likely to be assessed as being, or at risk of becoming, homeless in England and Wales. In England, 298,430 individuals were assessed as homeless in the year ending March 2023, and adults from Black (10%), and 'other' ethnic groups (4%) were over-represented in these applications with each of these groups representing 4.2% and 2.2% in the population respectively.<sup>211</sup>

In Wales 21,786 people were either threatened with homelessness or assessed as homeless in 2022/23.<sup>212</sup> Adults from Black (3%) and Other ethnic groups (2.5%) were over-represented in these applications, with each ethnic group representing 0.9% of the population respectively.

Academic research shows that, after holding other contributory factors constant, ethnicity-related variables including race, migration background and experience of discrimination increase the chances of experiencing homelessness substantially for Black and, in most analyses, Mixed and / or other ethnic households.<sup>213</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>210</sup> Ombudsman Wales 2024, <u>The investigation of a complaint against Welsh Government – Case 202206003</u>, [accessed: 24 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>211</sup> UK Government (2024), <u>Statutory Homelessness in England – Statutory homelessness live tables</u> [accessed:23 April 2024], Table A 8. Demographic population detail can be found in Office for National Statistics (2022), <u>Ethnic Group</u>, <u>England and Wales:Census 2021</u> [accessed: 21 June 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>212</sup> Stats Wales 2023, <u>Households for which assistance has been provided during the year, by ethnic group of applicant [accessed: 30 April 2024]</u>, Sections 66 and 73.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>213</sup> Bramley et. Al (2022), '<u>Homelessness among Black and minoritised ethnic communities in the UK: a statistical report on the state of the nation'</u> [accessed:13 May 2024]. Read also Finnee, Nazroo, Bécares et al (2023), '<u>Race and Racial Discrimination' in Racism and Ethnic Inequality in a Time of Crisis – Findings from the Evidence for Equality National Survey [accessed:13 May 2024].</u>

Actions to address homelessness in England are not targeted at the elimination of racial disparities. The Inclusive Britain Action Plan did not include an action targeting homelessness to address this disparity.<sup>214</sup> The Renters (Reform) Bill was introduced in 2023 and would abolish no-fault evictions in England,<sup>215</sup> which contribute to homelessness.<sup>216</sup> The Bill did not complete the legislative process before the announcement of the 2024 General Election. This means that any new government would need to bring forward new draft legislation.

The Renting Homes (Wales) Act 2016 provides greater security for tenants in Wales. Notice periods have been increased to six months for most tenants and retaliatory evictions (where a landlord can serve notice rather than deal with a tenant's complaint) are now unlawful.<sup>217</sup> Under this legislation, and related guidance, landlords are required to ensure that properties are fit for human habitation and are safe to live in. <sup>218</sup> The ArWAP also includes actions to address homelessness for people from ethnic minority groups. It includes an action for the Welsh Government to ensure that, by May 2026, the needs of ethnic minority people are included in reviews of homes/housing related legislation and policy.<sup>219</sup> A reference group for housing has been set up to oversee implementation of the ArWAP actions.<sup>220</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>214</sup> UK Government (2022), <u>Inclusive Britain Action Plan</u> [accessed: 21 June 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>215</sup> Shelter (2023), <u>50% Rise in Homelessness due to No-Fault Evictions in a Year</u> [accessed: 15 May 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>216</sup> Renters Reform Bill 2023 [accessed: 21 June 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>217</sup> Renting Homes (Wales) Act 2016, [accessed:14 May 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>218</sup> Welsh Government, <u>Fitness of homes for human habitation: guidance for landlords</u>, [accessed:14 May 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>219</sup> Welsh Government 2022, <u>Anti-racist Wales Action Plan</u>, [accessed: 24 April 2024], p. 86.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>220</sup> Welsh Government (2023), <u>Anti-racist Wales Action Plan Annual Report 2022 to 2023</u> [accessed: 01 July 2024], p. 28.

In 2022, Welsh Government also developed guidance on local housing market assessments to analyse the specific housing need requirements of people from ethnic minority groups. <sup>221</sup> Assessments were submitted to the Welsh Government, from Welsh local authorities, in March 2024.

#### Recommendations

The UK and Welsh governments, where appropriate, should:

- Ensure that local authorities provide adequate, safe traveller sites and regularly report on how and where funding for housing is used for Gypsy and Traveller site provision
- Ensure that policies and funding for homelessness prevention take into account the need to reduce disparities for protected characteristic groups, including individuals from ethnic minority groups

<sup>221</sup> Welsh Government, <u>Undertaking Local Housing Market Assessments</u>, [accessed: 21 May 2024].

# 5. Health

Article 5(e)(iv) of the CERD requires the UK to 'guarantee the right of everyone without distinction as to race, colour, or national or ethnic origin, to equality before the law [...] in the enjoyment of [...] the right to public health and medical care'.

The CERD Committee has clarified that 'health' means both 'the highest attainable standard of physical and mental health' as set out in the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, and '[...] a state of complete physical, mental and social well-being and not merely the absence of disease or infirmity' as used by the World Health Organisation.<sup>222</sup>

## 5.1 State of health

There are patterns of higher prevalence of certain health conditions among specific ethnic minority populations in England.<sup>223</sup> For example, infant and maternal mortality, cardiovascular disease and diabetes rates are higher among Black and South Asian groups than White groups.<sup>224</sup> There is evidence that people from Gypsy and Traveller groups experience poor health outcomes in multiple areas,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>222</sup> CERD Committee (2023), <u>First draft General recommendation No. 37 (2023) on</u> Racial discrimination in the enjoyment of the right to health [accessed:18 April 2024].

The King's Fund [accessed:18 April 2024]. See also Institute for Health and Human Development (2014), Explaining levels of wellbeing in Black and Minority Ethnic populations in England [accessed:18 April 2024], pp. 22–24. See also Public Health England (2017), Public Health Outcomes Framework: Health Equity Report, Focus on ethnicity, p. 6. [accessed:18 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>224</sup> See Raleigh, V. and Holmes, J. (2021), <u>'The health of people from ethnic minority groups in England'</u> [accessed: 02 July 2024].

with the average health of a 60 year old Gypsy or Traveller being comparable to that of an 80 year-old in the wider population.<sup>225</sup> There is limited disaggregated data about health outcomes for different groups within the 'White' ethnicity category.<sup>226</sup>

A 2010 independent review into health inequalities in England (the Marmot Review), and the 2020 report examining progress in addressing those inequalities (The Marmot Review 10 years on), identified that socio-economic inequalities strongly contribute to health inequalities. The Review also found that ethnic minorities are more likely to experience poorer socio-economic circumstances, leading to poor health.<sup>227</sup> The Kings Fund (a health and care charity) reported that racism and discrimination can negatively impact the health of people from ethnic minorities.<sup>228</sup>

Barriers to access can affect outcomes. For instance, Maternity Action and Doctors of the World have reported that NHS charges for

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>225</sup> McFadden, A. et al. (2018), Enhancing Gypsy, Roma and Traveller peoples' trust: using maternity and early years' health services and dental health services as exemplars of mainstream service provision. University of Dundee. See also ONS (2022), Gypsies' and Travellers' lived experiences, health, England and Wales: 2022 See also Watkinson, R, et al. (2021), Ethnic inequalities in health-related quality of life among older adults in England: secondary analysis of a national cross-sectional survey in the Lancet Public Health [accessed: 02 July 2024].

NHS bodies are required to collect ethnicity data in line with the 2001 census. This does not include more granular data, such as about the Gypsy, Roma or Traveller ethnic groups. See NHS (2024) NHS data model and dictionary. [accessed:29 April 2024.]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>227</sup> Institute of Health Equity (2020), <u>Health Equity in England: The Marmot Review 10 Years On [accessed: 18 April 2024]</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>228</sup> Kings Fund (2023) <u>The health of people from ethnic minority groups in England</u>. [accessed:18 April 2024].

secondary care (which includes hospital care) in England<sup>229</sup> has led to adverse outcomes for people with insecure immigration status. <sup>230</sup>

The pandemic emphasised longstanding health inequalities. Initially, death rates involving Covid-19 in England were higher for many ethnic minority groups, compared to White British people.<sup>231</sup>

Healthcare is mainly devolved to the Welsh Government. In Wales, there is a lack of data on race disparities in health. In 2024 the Senedd Equality and Social Justice Committee found that the existing data held lacks sufficient detail to be useful. It also noted the effects of racism on health cannot be properly addressed due to lack of data.<sup>232</sup> The Committee also found that language can be a barrier in healthcare and raised concerns that children can be used as translators for parents in medical examinations.<sup>233</sup> The Welsh government have accepted the Committee's recommendation to eliminate the use of family members as interpreters in full.<sup>234</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>229</sup> Department for Health and Social Care (2015) NHS visitor and migrant cost recovery programme. [accessed:18 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>230</sup> Maternity Action (2021) <u>Breach of Trust: A review of implementation of the NHS charging programme in maternity services in England.</u> [accessed:29 April 2024].and Drs of the World (2020) <u>Delays & Destitution: An Audit of Doctors of the World's Hospital Access Project</u> [accessed:18 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>231</sup> ONS (2022), <u>Updating ethnic and religious contrasts in deaths involving the coronavirus (COVID-19)</u>, <u>England: 24 January 2020 to 23 November 2022</u>. Section 3 [accessed: 24 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>232</sup> Welsh Parliament Equality and Social Justice Committee (2024), <u>Action, not words:</u> towards an anti-racist Wales by 2030 [accessed:18 April 2024], p. 26

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>233</sup> Welsh Parliament Equality and Social Justice Committee (2024), <u>Action, not words:</u> towards an anti-racist Wales by 2030 [accessed:18 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>234</sup> Welsh Government (2024), Written response to the Equality and Social Justice Committee – Actions, not words, [accessed:10 June 2024], p. 6.

Refugees and asylum seekers (including refused asylum seekers) can access free secondary care in Wales.<sup>235</sup>

### Maternal and neonatal health

There are differences in outcomes for users of maternity services. According to the latest available data (2020 - 2022), maternal mortality rates are three times as high for Black women and twice as high for Asian women, compared to White women in the UK.<sup>236</sup> Disparities in outcomes also exist for babies. Stillbirth rates are around twice as high for Black African, Black Caribbean, and Pakistani babies, compared to White babies. <sup>237</sup>

The causes of racial disparities in maternity and neonatal outcomes are complex. The UK Parliament's Women and Equalities Committee reported many contributing factors, including: 'pre-existing conditions; socio-economic factors, ignorance and racism'.<sup>238</sup> There is evidence that ethnic minority women face inequalities when using maternity services, such as interpreters not being provided.<sup>239</sup> Gypsy or Traveller women may face particular barriers, including low literacy rates and digital exclusion.<sup>240</sup> Birthrights, an advice and information charity, undertook an inquiry which found that ethnic minority women

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>235</sup>The National Health Service (Charges to Overseas Visitors) Regulations 1989 (as amended) [accessed:3 May 2024]. Welsh Government (2019) Nation of sanctuary - refugee and asylum seeker action plan. [accessed:18 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>236</sup> MBRRACE (2024), <u>Maternal Mortality 2020-2022</u> [accessed: 02 July 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>237</sup> MBRACCE UK (2022), <u>Perinatal Mortality Surveillance: report for births in 2021</u> [accessed: 18 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>238</sup> Women and Equality Committee (2023) <u>Black maternal health [accessed: 23 April 2024].</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>239</sup> Kapadia, D. and others (2022), <u>Ethnic Inequalities in Healthcare: A Rapid Evidence Review</u>, NHS Race and Health Observatory, p. 47-51. [accessed: 18 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>240</sup> Friends, families, travellers (2023), <u>Guidance: Tackling Maternal Health Inequalities in Gypsy</u>, Roma and <u>Traveller Communities</u> [accessed: 18 April 2024].

experienced racism and stereotyping from healthcare staff.<sup>241</sup> Migrants using maternity care may face NHS charges or be concerned about information-sharing with immigration bodies in England.<sup>242</sup> People from ethnic minorities are more likely to live in deprived areas, affecting maternal outcomes.<sup>243</sup>

Various reviews have considered these racial disparities and made recommendations.<sup>244</sup> Policy developments within the sector<sup>245</sup> include guidance for local maternity and neonatal systems (2021);<sup>246</sup> parliamentary committee inquiries (2023);<sup>247</sup> and a national maternity disparities taskforce (2022).<sup>248</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>241</sup> Birthrights (2022), Systemic Racism, not Broken Bodies [accessed: 18 April 2024]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>242</sup> Maternity Action (2018), What price safe motherhood? [accessed: 18 April 2024]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>243</sup> See Institute of Health Equity, <u>Fair Society, Healthy Lives: The Marmot Review</u> (February 2010), p 15; See also MBRRACE-UK, <u>Saving Lives, Improving Mothers' Care: Lessons learned to inform maternity care from the UK and Ireland Confidential Enquiries into Maternal Deaths and Morbidity 2018–20 (November 2022), p 13. See also Office for National Statistics, <u>Births and infant mortality by ethnicity in England and Wales: 2007 to 2019, 26 May 2021, [accessed:9 February 2023]. See also Institute of Health Equity (2020) Health equity in England: The Marmot Review 10 years on. P23. [Accessed:13 5 2024)</u></u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>244</sup> See: Birthrights (2022) <u>Systemic Racism</u>, not Broken Bodies [accessed: 04 July <u>2024</u>]. <u>See also Independent Maternity Review (2022)</u>, <u>Ockenden Report - Final:</u> <u>Findings</u>, <u>Conclusions and Essential Actions from the Independent Review of Maternity Services at the Shrewsbury and Telford Hospital NHS Trust [accessed: 04 July 2024], p. 31.</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>245</sup> NHS Race and health observatory (2022), <u>Mapping of Existing Policy Interventions to Tackle Ethnic Health Inequalities in Maternity and Neonatal Health in England: A Systematic Scoping Review with Stakeholder Engagement [accessed: 18 April 2024]</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>246</sup> NHS England (2021), <u>Equity and equality: Guidance for local maternity systems;</u> [accessed: 18 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>247</sup> Women and Equality Committee (2023), <u>Black maternal health</u>, [accessed: 18 April 2024], para. 56.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>248</sup> See Department for Health and Social Care (2022), New taskforce to level-up maternity care and tackle disparities [accessed: 18 April 2024].

The Anti-Racist Wales Action Plan (ArWAP) includes an action to implement the Maternity and Neonatal Safety Support Programme, with the aim of improving perinatal mortality outcomes and experiences for ethnic minority women and families using maternity services.<sup>249</sup>

#### Recommendations

The UK and Welsh Governments as appropriate should:

- Implement evidence-based solutions to reduce race health inequalities, with the aim of reducing maternity and neo-natal disparities. This includes relevant action to address or mitigate against the impacts of underlying determinants of health such as poverty, housing, unemployment.
- Develop action plans to address higher levels of infant mortality for ethnic minority groups and improve data collection.

## 5.2 Mental Health

### Mental health detention

In the year to March 2023, over 50,000 people were detained under the Mental Health Act in England.<sup>250</sup> Detention rates for people from Black or Black British ethnic groups were 3.5 times higher than the White group. There were around 227 detentions per 100,000 of the population for Black and Black British ethnic groups compared to 64 per 100,000 for the White group.<sup>251</sup> Black or Black British people

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>249</sup> Welsh Government (2022) Anti-racist action plan. [accessed: 23 April 2024], p. 69.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>250</sup> NHS Digital (2024), <u>Mental Health Act Statistics: Annual Figures 2022-23</u> [accessed: 17 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>251</sup> NHS Digital (2024), Mental Health Act Statistics, Annual Figures 2022-23: Detentions differences between groups of people [accessed: 17 April 2024]. 'White' may contain individuals who define themselves as Gypsy, Roma or Traveller, but the NHS cannot

were also more likely to have subsequent readmissions than White people.<sup>252</sup> Detention rates for all other broad ethnic minority groups (Mixed, Asian, and Asian British and Other Ethnic Groups) were also higher than the White group.

Analysis of detentions under the Mental Health Act in Wales, indicate less clear racial disproportionality in detentions in 2023. However, smaller populations mean that trends are more changeable so further research is needed to understand these. In 2023, average rates of detention were 9.0 per 100,000 of the population for Asian and Asian British people, 17.2 per 100,000 for Black African, Black Caribbean, and Black British people, 8.2 for mixed and multiple ethnic groups, and 11.3 for other ethnic groups. This is compared to 17.7 per 100,000 for White British people.<sup>253</sup> Patients in Wales may also be transferred to England for treatment and would therefore be recorded in England's statistics.<sup>254</sup>

A report by the Parliamentary Office of Science and Technology explains that the reasons for racial disparities in detention rates are 'complex and disputed' and 'driven by wider inequalities both within and beyond the mental health system'.<sup>255</sup> Previous evidence reviews

produce separate rates for these groups. For further details of this discussion, please see: <u>Table 1c, NHS England (2024) Mental Health Act Statistics, Annual Figures 2022-23</u> [accessed:28 May 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>252</sup> NHS Digital (2024), <u>Mental Health Act Statistics: Annual Figures 2022-23: People subjected to repeated detention [accessed: 17 April 2024].</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>253</sup> Calculated using: StatsWales (2024), <u>Section 135 and 136 Detentions by local health board, ethnicity and quarter [accessed: 04 July 2024] and Office of National Statistics (2022), <u>Ethnic group in England and Wales</u> [accessed: 04 July 2024].</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>254</sup> Statistics for Wales (2019), <u>Detentions under Section 135 and 134 of the Mental</u> Health Act [accessed: 03 July 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>255</sup> Parliamentary Office of Science and Technology (2022), <u>Mental Health Act Reform - Race and Ethnic Inequalities</u> [accessed:18 April 2024].

have also highlighted a lack of national data suitable for robust analysis of ethnic inequalities.<sup>256</sup>

A 2019 review found some evidence that disparities in detention rates may be linked to an increased prevalence of psychosis among some ethnic groups, increased perceived risk of violence, increased police contact and mistrust of GPs.<sup>257</sup> A 2020 report argues that greater consideration should be given to the impact of racism and discrimination on the increased prevalence of mental ill health among ethnic minority groups.<sup>258</sup>

Evidence also suggests that ethnic minority groups may be disproportionately impacted by social determinants of mental ill-health, including factors relating to employment, socioeconomic status, and discrimination.<sup>259</sup> <sup>260</sup> In our 'Equality and Human Rights Monitor – Is Wales Fairer?' report, we assessed evidence that found that the COVID pandemic had a detrimental impact on the mental health of ethnic minorities who experienced a disproportionate loss of protective factors such as stable, secure employment.<sup>261</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>256</sup> NHS Race and Health Observatory (2022), <u>Ethnic Inequalities in Healthcare: A Rapid Evidence Review</u> [accessed:17 April 2024].p. 11.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>257</sup> Barnett, P. et al. in the Lancet Psychiatry (2019), <u>Ethnic variations in compulsory detention under the Mental Health Act: a systematic review and meta-analysis of international data</u> [accessed:13 April 2024], Vol 6, 305–317. p.31.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>258</sup> Nazroo J, Bhui K, Rhodes J (March 2022) <u>Where next for understanding race/ethnic inequalities in severe mental illness? Structural, interpersonal and institutional racism, Sociology of Health & Illness Vol. 42 No. 2 [accessed:10 May 2024].p. 262–276.</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>259</sup> Bignall, T., Jeraj, S., Helsby, E. and Butt, J. (March 2020), <u>Racial disparities in mental health: literature and evidence review [accessed: 23 April 2024]</u>, p. 4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>260</sup> Kirkbride JB, Anglin DM, Colman I, Dykxhoorn J, Jones PB, Patalay P, Pitman A, Soneson E, Steare T, Wright T, Griffiths SL. (Feb 2024) <u>The social determinants of mental health and disorder: evidence, prevention and recommendations. World Psychiatry.</u> [accessed:24 April 2024].p. 58.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>261</sup> Equality and Human Rights Commission (2023) <u>Equality and Human Rights Monitor</u> <u>– Is Wales Fairer?</u>, [accessed:15 April 2024], p. 191.

### Treatment in mental health services

As well as being more likely to be detained, Black or Black British people are around eight times more likely than White people to be subject to a Community Treatment Order (CTO), which allows previously detained patients to instead live in the community, provided certain criteria are met.<sup>262</sup> In the year to March 2023, CTO use for the Black or Black British group was around 48 uses per 100,000 of the population, compared to 6 per 100,000 for the White group.<sup>263</sup>

People from Black ethnic groups are also more likely to receive harsher treatment in inpatient settings, such as being restrained in the prone position, <sup>264</sup> placed in seclusion and being beaten on wards. <sup>265</sup> The use of such restrictive practices may breach a person's human rights, including their right to freedom from inhuman or degrading treatment under Article 7 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, among others.

In November 2018, the UK government enacted the Mental Health Units (Use of Force) Act 2018, to reduce racial disparities in, and overall use of force on mental health wards.<sup>266</sup> The Act requires mental health providers in England to publish policies and record

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>262</sup> CQC guidance explains that a responsible clinician can set criteria such as living in a certain place, attending appointments with mental health professionals, or not taking drugs and drinking alcohol. The individual remains subject to powers under the MHA and, if they don't comply with the criteria, they may be recalled to hospital.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>263</sup> NHS Digital (2024), <u>Mental Health Act Statistics: Annual Figures 2022-23:</u> <u>Community Treatment Orders [accessed:17 April 2024].</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>264</sup> Where a person is forcibly laid on their front. Statutory guidance in the <u>Mental Health Act (1983) Code of Practice</u> states that there must be no planned or intentional restraint of a person in a prone position on any surface, unless there are cogent reasons for doing so.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>265</sup> NHS Race and Health Observatory (2022), <u>Ethnic Inequalities in Healthcare: A Rapid Evidence Review</u> [accessed:17 April 2024].p. 44.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>266</sup> Mental Health Units (Use of Force) Act 2018 [accessed: 04 July 2024].

data on use of force (such as restraint) on patients by staff. The data must be disaggregated by protected characteristics,<sup>267</sup> including race.

Data published in line with these statutory requirements is incomplete,<sup>268</sup> and accompanied by caveats that it should be considered 'experimental' and 'subject to further change'.<sup>269</sup> The data does not currently provide a clear picture of current rates of use of restraint among different ethnic groups.

The Welsh Government's 2022 Reducing Restrictive Practices Framework notes the statutory duties for public authorities regarding restraint and cautions against disproportionate use of restraint on protected characteristic groups.<sup>270</sup> Health Inspectorate Wales impatient mental health inspections found very low levels of compliance with restrictive physical restraint training<sup>271</sup>. There are no equivalent data collection requirements to those in the Mental Health Units (Use of Force) Act 2018 that apply to Wales.

In addition to introducing the Use of Force Act 2018, the UK government has also committed to reforming the Mental Health Act 1983 (MHA). One of the stated aims is to address racial disparities in mental health services, including reducing disparities in detention

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>267</sup> The nine protected characteristics as defined in the <u>Equality Act 2010</u> are: age, disability, gender reassignment, marriage and civil partnership, pregnancy and maternity, race, religion or belief, sex and sexual orientation.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>268</sup> NHS Digital (Jan 2024) <u>Mental health services monthly statistics – Restrictive Interventions</u> [accessed:April 18 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>269</sup> NHS Digital (2024), Mental Health Services Monthly Statistics, Performance January 2024 [accessed:17 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>270</sup> Welsh Government 2022, <u>Reducing Restrictive Practices Framework</u>, [accessed:22 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>271</sup> Health Inspectorate Wales, <u>The value of NHS Physical Restraint Training</u>, [accessed: 21 May 2024].

rates.<sup>272</sup> Following an independent review of the MHA in 2017,<sup>273</sup> the UK government published the draft Mental Health Bill, which will apply in England and Wales, in June 2022.<sup>274</sup> The intention behind the Bill was to reform the legislation.<sup>275</sup> This Bill was not introduced to parliament before the announcement of the 2024 General Election, meaning any new government would need to bring forward new draft legislation. In Wales, the Mental Health Standards of Care (Wales) Bill has been proposed as a Private Members Bill.<sup>276</sup>

In October 2023, NHS England published their Patient and Carer Race Equality Framework (PCREF), which provides mental health services with a framework to ensure they are effectively supporting patients from ethnic minority backgrounds. This includes:

- ensuring that boards are developing and monitoring action plans to address inequalities
- improving and publishing data on disparities in detention rates and use of restraint
- ensuring there are effective feedback mechanisms for patients and carers.<sup>277</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>272</sup> UK Government (2022), <u>Better mental health support for people in crisis</u> [accessed: 18 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>273</sup> DHSC (2018) Modernising the Mental Health Act – final report from the independent review, [accessed: 17 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>274</sup> DHSC (2022) Draft Mental Health Bill 2022 [accessed:17 April 2024]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>275</sup> The Conservative Party (2019) <u>The Conservative and Unionist Party Manifesto 2019</u> [accessed: 24 April 2024].p. 11.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>276</sup>Senedd Cymru, <u>Development of the Mental Health Standards of Care (Wales) Bill,</u> [accessed: 28 June 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>277</sup> NHS England (2023) <u>Patient and carer race equality framework</u> [accessed: 17 April 2024].

NHS England will be introducing the PCREF to all mental health trusts<sup>278</sup> this year.<sup>279</sup> The development and implementation of the PCREF was the MHA independent review's primary recommendation for reducing racial inequalities in mental health care.<sup>280</sup> Similarly, we had recommended that trusts should be required to report on, and explain, trends in detention rates. This reporting should be disaggregated by protected characteristic. Trusts should also produce action plans to address inequalities.<sup>281</sup>

## Access to mental health support

Despite the fact that they are more likely to be detained, evidence suggests that people from ethnic minority backgrounds are less likely than White British people to self-refer or be referred by their General Practitioner to psychological and talking therapies.<sup>282</sup>

In Wales, the Senedd Cymru Health and Social Care Committee reported that ethnic minority groups and racialised communities, including Gypsies and Travellers, face more difficulty in accessing services.<sup>283</sup>

In January 2024, Improvement Cymru developed guidance and an associated action plan to improve access to, and provision of,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>278</sup> Mental health trusts are local NHS organisations which provide specialist mental health care and treatment. Read The Kings Fund (2020), <u>The NHS: how providers are</u> regulated and commissioned [accessed: 05 July 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>279</sup> Department for Health and Social Care (2024) <u>Government response to the Joint Committee on the draft Mental Health Bill</u> [accessed:18 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>280</sup> Independent Review of the Mental Health Act 1983 (2018) Modernising the Mental Health Act: Increasing choice, reducing compulsion [accessed:18 April 2024], pp. 164–166.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>281</sup> EHRC (2022) Written evidence submitted by the Equality and Human Rights Commission (MHB0014) [accessed:17 April 2024], p. 28.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>282</sup> NHS Race and Health Observatory (2022), <u>Ethnic Inequalities in Healthcare: A Rapid Evidence Review</u> [accessed:17 April 2024].p. 11

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>283</sup> Senedd Cymru Health and Social Care Committee, 2022, <u>Connecting the dots;</u> <u>tacking mental health inequalities in Wales,</u> [accessed:16 April 2024], p. 22.

psychological interventions for Black, Asian, and ethnic minority people in Wales.<sup>284</sup>

In January 2023, the UK government announced that it would publish a new Major Conditions Strategy (MCS).<sup>285</sup> The MCS will set out the government's approach to addressing the six health conditions which account for the majority of ill health and early death in England. This includes mental ill health.

The full MCS has yet to be published. However, in August 2023, the UK government published the strategic framework that will underpin it. This states that the MCS will consider ethnic disparities across the six conditions.<sup>286</sup>

Additionally, the Department for Health and Social Care in England is currently conducting pilots to identify effective models of culturally appropriate advocacy<sup>287</sup> to ensure patients have access to advocacy support that meets their religious, cultural and language needs.<sup>288</sup>

The Welsh Government has recently consulted on a new, ten-year draft Mental Health and Wellbeing Strategy and a new Suicide and Self-harm Prevention Strategy.<sup>289</sup> Both include commitments to equity of access, experience, and outcomes, as well as a

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>284</sup> NHS Cymru (2024), <u>Summary Report of a Rapid Review</u>, [accessed:27 June 2024]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>285</sup> Written statement HCWS514 (Jan 2023) <u>Government Action on Major Conditions</u> and Diseases [accessed:17 April 2024]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>286</sup> DHSC (2023), <u>Major conditions strategy: case for change and our strategic framework</u> [accessed:18 April 2024]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>287</sup> DHSC (2024) <u>Government response to the Joint Committee on the draft Mental Health Bill</u> [accessed:18 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>288</sup> Joint Committee on the Draft Mental Health Bill (2024) <u>Comment on Government</u> <u>Response to Joint Committee's report on the draft Mental Health Bill</u> [accessed:18 April 2024].p. 95.

Welsh Government 2024, <u>Draft Mental Health and Wellbeing Strategy 2024 – 2034</u>, [accessed:16 April 2024].and Welsh Government (2024), <u>Draft Suicide and Self-harm Prevention Strategy 2023-2034</u>, [accessed:28 June 2024]

commitment to understanding barriers for people from ethnic minority groups to mental health services.

The Welsh Government established an Ethnic Minorities Mental Health Task and Finish group aimed at improving access to mental health support for people from ethnic minority groups.<sup>290</sup> In 2021, the Welsh government funded Traumatic Stress Wales to dedicate a workstream improving access to mental health support for asylum seekers, refugees and migrants.<sup>291</sup> In February 2022, the Welsh Government provided £1.4m funding for the delivery of an anti-racist and anti-stigma mental health programme, co-designed with people with lived experience, up to March 2025.<sup>292</sup>

#### Recommendations

The UK and Welsh Governments should, where appropriate:

- Require mental health trusts and local health boards to explain rates of their use of CTOs, and to take action to address disparities between protected characteristic groups.
   Government should annually monitor the impact of reforms on racial disparities in the use of CTOs, and considering abolishing CTOs after five years if disparities persist.
- Set out clear standards for assessing risk of harm to ensure a consistent and unbiased approach. This should include standardised processes for documenting risk assessments, which should be scrutinised by the CQC and CIW as part of their inspections.

Welsh Government (Date unknown), <u>Written Response from the Welsh Government to the report by the Health and Social Care Committee: Connecting the dots: tackling mental health inequalities in Wales [accessed: 02 July 2024]</u>, p. 20.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>291</sup> NHS Wales (date unknown), <u>Traumatic Stress Wales Refugee and Asylum Seeker</u> Workstream [accessed:02 July 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>292</sup> Time to Change Wales 2022, [<u>Time to Change Wales extended by three years</u>], [accessed:15 April 2024].and Welsh Government 2023, <u>Anti-Racist Wales Action Plan – Annual Report 2022-23</u>, [accessed:15 April 2024].

 Regularly collect good quality data at national and local levels to improve understanding of racial disparities in mental health services. In particular, data collected should enable analysis of racial disparities in the prevalence of mental health conditions, experiences of care and treatment in mental health services, and in health outcomes. This data should inform future policies seeking to address racial disparities in mental health care.

## 6. Education

## **6.1 Attainment Gaps**

Under Article 5(e)(v) the UK is required to prohibit and seek to eliminate racial discrimination in any aspect of education and training. In our measurement framework for equality and human rights, we set educational attainment as a key indicator for the right to education.<sup>293</sup> Data for early years attainment shows Gypsy/Roma and Traveller (GRT) children in Wales are significantly underperforming compared to all other groups.<sup>294</sup> In England, ethnic minorities typically start out behind their White British peers, but most groups make faster progress and all major ethnic groups are more likely to have an Alevel or equivalent qualification by age 19.<sup>295</sup>

In 2022/23, in England, White and Black Caribbean and 'Any Other Black Background'<sup>296</sup> pupils are all less likely to achieve GCSE<sup>297</sup> grade 5 or above in English and Mathematics than White British pupils.<sup>298</sup> Gypsy, Roma and Traveller pupils are least likely to achieve

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>293</sup> EHRC (2017), Our Measurement Framework [accessed: 01 May 2024], p. 66.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>294</sup> EHRC (2023), <u>Equality and Human Rights Monitor: Is Wales Fairer?</u> [accessed: 25 April 2024], p. 180

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>295</sup> EHRC (2023), Equality and Human Rights Monitor [accessed:19 April 2024], p. 160.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>296</sup> This is anyone who identifies as Black other than Black Caribbean, Black African, Black Caribbean and White or Black African and White

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>297</sup> This is the main qualification taken by 15/16 year olds.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>298</sup> Department for Education (2024), <u>Academic year 2022/23: Key stage 4 performance</u> [accessed:19 April 2024]. This report also highlights that Chinese and Indian pupils are more likely than any other ethnic group to achieve GCSE grade 5 or above in English and mathematics.

GCSE grade 5 or above in English and mathematics.<sup>299</sup> In Wales, ethnic minority pupils, as a whole group, consistently achieve higher rates of attainment at school leaving age than White British children.<sup>300</sup>

Analysis for England suggests that there is a link between ethnicity, socio-economic status, and subsequent attainment outcomes at GCSE. When socioeconomic status is controlled for, ethnic minority pupils' performance improves compared to their White British peers. However, this is not the case for Black Caribbean pupils, who show a negative attainment gap of over 10 percentage points when accounting for a lower socio-economic status. Furthermore, ethnic minority pupils from higher socio-economic backgrounds tend to underperform compared to White British pupils from similar backgrounds. However, this is not the case for Black Caribbean pupils, who show a negative attainment gap of over 10 percentage points when accounting for a lower socio-economic status. Furthermore, ethnic minority pupils from higher socio-economic backgrounds tend to underperform compared to White British pupils from similar backgrounds.

Evidence deriving primarily from England suggests that persistent attainment gaps may be indicative of the discriminatory impacts of school policies and practices.<sup>303</sup> Other factors that are suggested as being associated with attainment gaps for particular ethnic groups include:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>299</sup> Department for Education (2024), <u>Academic year 2022/23: Key stage 4 performance</u> [accessed:19 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>300</sup> EHRC (2023), Equality and Human Rights Monitor – Is Wales Fairer?, [accessed:30 April 2024].p. 181

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>301</sup> Please note this approach is debated in the literature. See Commission on Race and Ethnic Disparities (2021), <u>Ethnic, socio-economic and sex inequalities in educational achievement at age 16, by Professor Steve Strand</u>; and Gilborn, D. Bhopal, B. Crawford, Demack. Gholami, R. Kitching, Kiwan K. and Warmington, P. (2021) <u>Evidence for the Commission on Race and Ethnic Disparities</u> [accessed:07 May 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>302</sup> Mirza, H. and Warwick, R. (2022), 'Race and ethnicity', IFS Deaton Review of Inequalities [accessed:25 April 2024]. Commission on Race and Ethnic Disparities (2021), Ethnic, socio-economic and sex inequalities in educational achievement at age 16, by Professor Steve Strand.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>303</sup> Gilborn, D. Bhopal, B. Crawford, Demack. Gholami, R. Kitching, Kiwan K. and Warmington, P. (2021) <u>Evidence for the Commission on Race and Ethnic Disparities</u> [accessed:07 May 2024]. Mirza, H. S., and Warwicks, R. (2022), <u>Race and ethnicity</u> [accessed:21 May 2024].

- geography of ethnic groups<sup>304</sup>
- a lack of visibility in the curriculum<sup>305</sup>
- a lack of diversity and representation within the teaching profession<sup>306</sup>

In addition, research from England suggests that some ethnic minority groups, are more likely to be identified as having Special Educational Needs (SEN). Evidence suggests that higher rates of SEN in ethnic minority groups may be linked to lower socio-economic status, though evidence of this association is not completely clear. However, it is possible that, to some extent, SEN identification may be caused by inappropriate cultural understanding or interpretation of ethnic minority pupils' behaviour. This may lead to misidentification and subsequent lowering of opportunities and expectations for misdiagnosed pupils.<sup>307</sup>

In 2021/22 the ethnic groups least likely to progress to Higher Education in England included White, mixed White / Black Caribbean, and Gypsy, Roma, and Traveller pupils. Just 12.6% of Gypsy or Roma and 9.0% of Irish Traveller students accessed higher

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>304</sup> Mirza, H. S., and Warwick, R. (2022), Race and ethnicity [accessed:21 May 2024].

<sup>305</sup> The Traveller Movement (2020), Gypsy, Roma and Traveller experiences in Secondary Education: Issues, barriers and recommendations [accessed:26 April 2024]. Friends, Families and Travellers (2023), Education inequalities facing Gypsies, Roma and Travellers in England [accessed:26 April 2024]. I-cubed, The Voice, University of Cambridge (2023), Black British Voices Project report [accessed:23 April 2024]. Anti-Bullying Alliance and Friends, Families and Travellers (2020), Bullied, not believed and blamed - The Experiences of Gypsy, Roma and Traveller Pupils: Recommendations for Schools and Other Settings.

Mirza, H. and Warwick, R. (2022), 'Race and ethnicity', IFS Deaton Review of Inequalities [accessed:25 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>307</sup> Strand, S. and Lindorff, A. (2018), <u>Ethnic disproportionality in the identification of Special Educational Needs (SEN) in England: extent, causes and consequences.</u> University of Oxford [accessed: 23 April 2024].

education by the age of 19 in 2021/22<sup>308</sup> While Black African and Black Caribbean students were more likely to progress to university than White British students by age 19 in 2021/2022, they mostly attended 'low tariff'<sup>309</sup> universities, were least likely to achieve a first-class degree<sup>310</sup> and most likely to drop out.<sup>311</sup>

The UK government recognises that 'some ethnic minority groups are overrepresented in the cohort not meeting expected literacy and numeracy standards in schools'<sup>312</sup> and has implemented activities to improve attainment levels. This includes funding a National Tutoring Programme, which is due to end in Summer 2024, and publishing new research on outcomes by ethnicity and how schools have closed ethnicity attainment gaps.<sup>313</sup> An expert panel has also been appointed to develop a more inclusive model history curriculum for England.<sup>314</sup>

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>308</sup> Gov.uk (2023), <u>Academic year 2021/22: Widening participation in higher education</u> [accessed:10 May 2024]. Progression rates can be volatile over time due to the very small number of pupils in the Gypsy/Roma and Traveller of Irish Heritage groups. It is also possible that Gypsy, Roma, Traveller, Showmen and Boaters participation in education is under-represented as it has been found that students avoid outwardly ascribing as GRTSB as a way of avoiding racial prejudice. Brassington, L. (2022), 'Gypsies, Roma and Travellers: the ethnic minorities most excluded from UK education'[accessed:25 April 2024], p. 32. Derrington, C. (2007), Fight, flight and playing white: An examination of coping strategies adopted by Gypsy Traveller Adolescents in English secondary schools.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>309</sup> HESA (2023), <u>Table 27 - UK domiciled first year students by ethnicity and higher education provider tariff grouping 2014/15 to 2021/22</u> [accessed:01 July 2024]. 'High', 'medium' and 'low' tariff providers are categorised according to the average number of Universities and Colleges Admissions Service (UCAS) points achieved by students.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>310</sup> Office for Students (2022), <u>Key Performance Measure 7</u> [accessed:01 July 2024]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>311</sup> EHRC (2023), Equality and Human Rights Monitor [accessed:19 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>312</sup> UK Government (2023), <u>Inclusive Britain update report</u> [accessed:2 May 2024], Actions 29 and 30.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>313</sup> UK Government (2023), <u>Inclusive Britain update report</u> [accessed:2 May 2024], Actions 29 and 30.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>314</sup> UK Government (2022), <u>Inclusive Britain: the government's response to the Commission on Race and Ethnic Disparities</u> [accessed:26 April 2024].

The Welsh Government has set out commitments to improve education standards. The new curriculum for Wales mandates teaching Black, Asian and ethnic minority histories. 19,000 education professionals directly engaged with diversity and anti-racist professional learning in 2022/23, including through in-person events or via regional consortia, consultation, guidance and asynchronous sessions. The Welsh Government published statutory guidance on education support for Gypsy, Roma and Traveller children in 2023. The lack of data and evidence related to inequality and protected characteristics in Wales continues to pose a challenge to policymaking. Despite the creation of three new evidence units (on equality, race and disability) in 2021, 320 significant data gaps remain. 321

#### **6.2 Attendance Rates**

There is a link between low attainment and school absence. As the Children's Commissioner for England reports, those with a history of persistent or severe absenteeism were less likely to pass at least 5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>315</sup> Welsh Government (2021), <u>Programme for Government 2021-2026</u>, [accessed:18 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>316</sup> Welsh Government (2022), <u>Written statement: Welsh history in the Curriculum for Wales</u>, [accessed:21 May 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>317</sup> Welsh Government (2023), <u>Anti-racist Wales action plan progress report 2022 – 2023</u>, [accessed:18 April 2024], p.16.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>318</sup> Welsh Government (2023), <u>Celebrate and participate: Education guidance to support</u> Gypsy, Roma and Traveller children and young people, [accessed:18 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>319</sup> EHRC (2023), Equality and Human Rights Monitor <u>- Is Wales Fairer?</u>, [accessed:22 April 2024], p.169

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>320</sup> Welsh Government (2022), <u>Equality, Race and Disability Evidence Units strategy</u>, [accessed:22 April 2024]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>321</sup> The consultation on the 'Strategic Equality Plan 2024-2028' refers to the Welsh Government working to improve data, but there is no reference to tackling gaps in the draft national equality objectives.

GCSEs including maths and English compared to peers who were 'rarely absent'. 322 School attendance declined during the pandemic and has not returned to pre-pandemic levels in England. 323 Some ethnic groups have particularly low attendance levels. For example, in 2021/22, the overall absence rate in schools in England was 7.6%. However, it was 22.1% for Irish Traveller pupils, 17.8% for Gypsy and Roma pupils and 9.4% for Mixed White and Black Caribbean. These groups are also the three most likely groups to be persistently absent, which means missing 10% of sessions or more. 324 Pupils with Special Educational Needs and Disabilities, which are more prevalent for some ethnic groups, 325 also have higher rates of absence than pupils with no identified Special Educational Needs. 326

In Wales, the Senedd Children, Young People and Education Committee held an inquiry into pupil absence in 2022, following the COVID-19 pandemic. The inquiry report finds that children from ethnic minority backgrounds, including Gypsy, Roma, and Traveller backgrounds, are more likely to be absent.<sup>327</sup> The Welsh Government has previously noted that absence for Gypsy, Roma and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>322</sup> Children's Commissioner (2023), <u>Missing Children, Missing Grades</u> [accessed:25 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>323</sup> EHRC (2023), <u>Equality and Human Rights Monitor</u> [accessed:9 May 2024],p.60. Gov.uk (2024), <u>Academic year 2022/23: Pupil absence in schools in England</u> [accessed:9 May 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>324</sup> UK Government (2024), <u>Ethnicity facts and figures: Absence from school</u> [accessed:24 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>325</sup> UK Government Equalities Office (2023), <u>Inclusive Britain update report</u> [accessed:24 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>326</sup> UK Government (2024), <u>Academic year 2022/23: Pupil absence in schools in England</u> [accessed:21 May 2024].and UK Government (2024), <u>Academic year 2022/23: Special educational needs in England</u> [accessed:9 May 2024]. As mentioned above, there are also issues of disproportionality in the identification of special educational needs for some ethnic groups.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>327</sup> Senedd Cymru Children, Young People and Education Committee (2022), <u>Pupil absence</u>, [accessed:18 April 2024], p.33

Traveller learners is of particular concern, one which predates the pandemic.<sup>328</sup>

In order to address this issue, the Welsh Government published new attendance guidance in October 2023.<sup>329</sup> Its aim is to take a learner-centred approach, based on the Convention on the Rights of the Child. It commits to providing children with learning opportunities, to be fully included and to received individual support. The guidance includes a dedicated section on learners from Gypsy, Roma, and Traveller communities.<sup>330</sup> However, the Anti-racist Wales Action Plan does not include a specific action on school attendance.<sup>331</sup>

Current evidence around the drivers of ethnicity gaps in absenteeism is limited, as we do not have a complete picture of all contributing factors. However, key stakeholders fed evidence into a 2023 UK parliamentary Education Committee inquiry which focused on England. Stakeholders provided clear examples of some factors which are related to absenteeism and may be contributing to ethnicity gaps. The Committee found that barriers for GRT pupils include racism and bullying, inconsistency between schools in the use of the T-code which authorises school absences for Travelling families, and reductions in specialist support services. For other ethnic minority groups with above average absence rates, the Committee received evidence on the impact racism has on mental health and the ability to engage with learning.<sup>332</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>328</sup> Senedd Cymru Children, Young People and Education Committee (2022), <u>Pupil absence</u>, [accessed:18 April 2024], p. 33.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>329</sup> Welsh Government, <u>Belonging</u>, <u>engaging</u> and <u>participating</u>: <u>Guidance on improving</u> <u>learner engagement and attendance</u>, [accessed:18 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>330</sup> Senedd Cymru Children, Young People and Education Committee (2022), <u>Pupil absence</u>, [accessed:18 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>331</sup> Welsh Government (2022), Anti-racist Wales action plan, [accessed:18 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>332</sup> Education committee (2023), <u>Persistent absence and support for disadvantaged pupils</u> [accessed:25 April 2024].

The UK government has taken various actions to improve attendance. This includes a daily data pilot (which is to become mandatory)<sup>333</sup> to provide near real-time attendance data, and non-statutory guidance 'Working together to improve school attendance'. An updated version will become statutory from August 2024.<sup>334</sup> This places an expectation on schools to monitor and analyse attendance patterns. Trusts and governing bodies should provide support and challenge on attendance trends, which may include those relating to ethnicity.<sup>335</sup> The UK government stated it will also continue to convene the Gypsy, Roma and Traveller stakeholder group which covers a range of issues, including attendance.<sup>336</sup> Before the announcement of the 2024 General Election, the UK government was supporting a Private Members Bill that would have placed a general duty on local authorities to promote attendance and reduce absence.<sup>337</sup>

#### 6.3 Exclusions

Permanent exclusions and suspensions / fixed-term exclusions are associated with poorer educational outcomes. For example, over 90% of those permanently excluded at primary school subsequently

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>333</sup> Department for Education (Department for Education) (2024), <u>Guidance: Share your daily school attendance data</u> [accessed:14 May 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>334</sup> Department for Education (2022), <u>Working together to improve school attendance</u> [accessed:25 April 2024]. Department for Education (2024), <u>Working together to improve school attendance</u> [accessed:29 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>335</sup> Department for Education (2024), <u>Working together to improve school attendance</u> [accessed:24 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>336</sup> Education Committee (2023), <u>Persistent absence and support for disadvantaged pupils: Government response to the Committee's Seventh Report</u> [accessed:14 May 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>337</sup> House of Commons library (2024), <u>School attendance in England</u> [accessed:10 May 2024]. <u>School Attendance (Duties of Local Authorities and Proprietors of Schools) Bill</u>

fail to pass GCSE English and Maths.<sup>338</sup> In the 2021/22 school year in English state-schools, data shows that Gypsy / Roma and Irish Traveller pupils were the two most likely groups to be suspended<sup>339</sup> or permanently excluded,<sup>340</sup> followed by Black Caribbean and Mixed White / Black Caribbean groups. Some ethnic groups are disproportionately represented in different types of SEND identification,<sup>341</sup> and children with special educational needs are significantly more likely to be excluded.<sup>342</sup>

Research in Wales found that Roma pupils have the highest rate of fixed-term exclusions (5 days or less), and White pupils have the highest rate of fixed-term exclusions over 5 days. Black pupils have the highest rate of permanent exclusions.<sup>343</sup>

Reasons for differences in suspension / permanent exclusion rates are complex but may include discriminatory impacts of policy and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>338</sup> Chance UK (2024), <u>Too young to leave behind: The long-term negative impact of exclusions [accessed: 24 June 2024].</u>

and suspensions in primary school [accessed:24 April 2024].

<sup>339</sup> UK Government (2024) Suspensions [accessed:08 May 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>340</sup> UK Government (2024) Permanent Exclusions [accessed:08 May 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>341</sup> Where we use SEN or SEND this reflects the original source. For example read: UK Government (2023), Inclusive Britain update report [accessed:9 May 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>342</sup> UK Government (2024), <u>Suspensions and permanent exclusions in England</u> [accessed:24 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>343</sup> EYST (2024), <u>Right to Education – reflecting upon school exclusions experienced by minority ethnic pupils in Wales</u>, [accessed:18 April 2024], p. 10.

practice in schools,<sup>344</sup> geography and socioeconomic disadvantage.<sup>345</sup>

The Welsh Government published updated guidance on exclusions from school and pupil referral units in April 2024.<sup>346</sup> This is part of a two-phase approach to updating its guidance on exclusions. As part of the second phase, it has commissioned research<sup>347</sup> to identify approaches that are effective in avoiding exclusions for learners who can be disproportionately subject to permanent or temporary exclusions.

The ARWAP includes an action to strengthen the guidance for schools about learners who may be disproportionately subject to permanent or temporary exclusions, including ethnic minority learners.<sup>348</sup> The UK has published updated guidance on behaviour in schools<sup>349</sup> and suspension and permanent exclusion guidance,<sup>350</sup> including provision to identify and address ethnic disparities in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>344</sup> Mirza, H. S., and Warwick, R. (2022), <u>Race and Ethnicity</u> [accessed:15 April 2024]. EHRC (2020), <u>Legal action: Stopping a school from using a discriminatory hairstyle policy</u> [accessed:2 May 2024]. EHRC (2022), <u>Preventing hair discrimination in schools</u> [accessed:2 May 2024]. Timpson (2019), Gilborn, D. Bhopal, B. Crawford, Demack. Gholami, R. Kitching, Kiwan K. and Warmington, P. (2021) <u>Evidence for the Commission on Race and Ethnic Disparities</u> [accessed:02 July 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>345</sup> Timpson (2019), <u>Timpson Review of School Exclusion</u> [accessed:29 April 2024]. Mirza, H. S., and Warwick, R. (2022), <u>Race and Ethnicity</u> [accessed:15 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>346</sup> Welsh Government (2024), <u>Exclusion for schools and pupil referral units</u> [accessed:02 July 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>347</sup> Welsh Government (2024), <u>Review of practices used in maintained schools and pupil referral units to prevent exclusions: summary</u>, [accessed:27 June 2024]

Welsh Government (2022), <u>Anti-racist Wales Action Plan</u>, [accessed:7 May 2024], p.
 52.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>349</sup> Department for Education (2024), <u>Behaviour in Schools: Advice for headteachers and school staff</u> [accessed:24 April 2024]. There have been updates to the guidance since it was published in 2022 including to the section on mobile phones.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>350</sup> Department for Education (2023), <u>Suspension and Permanent Exclusion from</u> maintained schools, academies and pupil referral units in England, including pupil movement [accessed:24 April 2024]. This latest version includes subsequent updates.

exclusion rates.<sup>351</sup> However, the guidance removed specific reference to groups such as Gypsy, Roma and Traveller and Black Caribbean pupils who have consistently higher-than-average exclusion rates.<sup>352</sup>

### 6.4 Bullying

Evidence suggests that bullying and harassment linked to race in schools continues to be a particular issue for certain ethnic groups. A 2023 UK government survey found that 31% of leaders and teachers had seen or received reports of racist bullying in the last 12 months, with Asian and Black leaders (47% and 46% respectively) more likely to say that they had at least sometimes seen or received reports of racist bullying. Qualitative evidence drawing on the experiences of pupils suggests that some staff are unable to appropriately deal with racist incidents (partly due to a lack of cultural understanding/sensitivity) and, in some cases, that staff behaviour is

\_\_\_\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>351</sup> Government Equalities Office (2023), <u>Inclusive Britain update report</u> [accessed:24 April 2024]. See UK Government (2023), <u>Inclusive Britain Action Plan Update Report</u> [accessed:11 April 2024], Actions 35 – 38.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>352</sup> Department for Education (2023), <u>Suspension and Permanent Exclusion from maintained schools</u>, academies and pupil referral units in England, including pupil movement [accessed:24 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>353</sup> Ditch the Label (2020), <u>The annual bullying survey 2020</u> [accessed: 25 April 2024]. The absence of official recording of bullying by schools makes it difficult to measure the prevalence of bullying linked to race. See also: Eilenberg, J. (2020), <u>Racist and Faith Targeted Bullying in the UK: A review of existing literature 2020.</u> National Children's Bureau, Anti-Bullying Alliance [accessed: 26 April 2024]. ONS (2022), <u>Gypsies' and Travellers' lived experiences</u>, education and employment, <u>England and Wales: 2022</u> [accessed: 9 May 2024]. The Traveller Movement (2020), <u>Gypsy, Roma and Traveller experiences in Secondary Education: Issues, barriers and recommendations</u> [accessed: 25 April 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>354</sup> Department for Education (2023), <u>School and College Panel – April 2023</u> [accessed:25 April 2024].

interpreted by pupils as racist.<sup>355</sup> Evidence in Wales suggests that Gypsy, Roma and Traveller children and White Irish children reported the highest rates of being bullied in person (45% and 48% respectively) and cyberbullying (33% and 27%) and also reported as most likely to have bullied another person.<sup>356</sup>

The Anti-racist Wales Action Plan, notes the lack of data on racist bullying and harassment in education settlings and consideration of a Wales-wide system. <sup>357</sup> There is no update on this in the 2022/23 progress report. <sup>358</sup>

For England, the UK Government provided funding to anti-bullying organisations to prevent and tackle bullying of pupils with protected characteristics, including Gypsy, Roma, and Traveller children. However, there is no mandatory requirement for schools to record bullying incidents, which is also the case for Wales. However, the Welsh Government provides advice to schools in its 'Rights, Respect, Equality' statutory guidance, including advising schools to collect data and respond effectively to reports of bullying, including racist incidents. However, and the school of the school of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>355</sup> Children's Commissioner for Wales, <u>Take it Seriously: Children's experiences of Racism within Secondary Schools</u>, [accessed:18 April 2024]. Anti-Bullying Alliance and Friends, Families and Travellers (2020), <u>Bullied</u>, <u>Not Believed and Blamed</u>. <u>The Experiences of Gypsy</u>, <u>Roma and Traveller Pupils: Recommendations for Schools and Other Settings [accessed: 05 July 2024].</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>356</sup> EHRC (2023), <u>Equality and Human Rights Monitor: Is Wales Fairer?</u> [accessed:14 May 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>357</sup> Welsh Government (2022), <u>Anti-Racist Wales Action Plan</u> [accessed:18 April 2024], p .40.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>358</sup> Welsh Government (2023) <u>Anti-Racist Wales Action Plan – A Year On 2022-23,</u> [accessed:27 June 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>359</sup> House of Commons Library (2023) <u>Racial Discrimination in Schools – Debate Pack</u> [accessed: 24 June 2024].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>360</sup> Education and Inspections Act 2006; Education (Independent School Standards) Regulations 2014. Department for Education (2017), Preventing and tackling bullying. Advice for headteachers, staff and governing bodies [accessed: 5 July 2024]; Welsh Government (2019), Rights, respect, equality: guidance for schools [accessed: 5 July



### 7. Recommendations

#### **Criminal Justice**

The UK and Welsh Governments, where appropriate, should:

- Complete implementation of recommendations from the Lammy review and monitor and report on the impact of initiatives taken
- Increase efforts to improve data collection, monitoring and analysis around ethnic disparities in the criminal justice system, including qualitative research to better identify and address the causes of unexplained disparities, and the potential role of bias and discrimination in these.

### **Rights at Work**

The UK and Welsh Governments should, where appropriate

- Improve the evidence base on employment gaps to better understand the factors driving economic participation and inactivity, and on how the experience of insecure work differs by race and ethnicity
- Introduce a mandatory duty on public sector employers in England and private sector employers in England, Scotland, and Wales with more than 250 staff to monitor and report on ethnicity recruitment, retention, and progression, with a requirement for mandatory action plans that outline how gaps and inequalities are going to be addressed

#### The Welsh Government should:

 ensure its commitment to address the ethnicity pay gap in its Programme for Government is progressed, within its legislative competence, including addressing inequalities in recruitment, retention, and progression in the public sector for people from ethnic minority groups

### Housing

The UK and Welsh governments, where appropriate, should:

- Ensure that local authorities provide adequate, safe traveller sites and regularly report on how and where funding for housing is used for Gypsy and Traveller site provision
- Ensure that policies and funding for homelessness prevention take into account the need to reduce disparities for protected characteristic groups, including individuals from ethnic minority groups

#### **Mental Health**

The UK and Welsh Governments should, where appropriate:

- Require mental health trusts and local health boards to explain rates of their use of CTOs, and to take action to address disparities between protected characteristic groups.
   Government should annually monitor the impact of reforms on racial disparities in the use of CTOs, and considering abolishing CTOs after five years if disparities persist
- Set out clear standards for assessing risk of harm to ensure a consistent and unbiased approach. This should include standardised processes for documenting risk assessments, which should be scrutinised by the CQC and CIW as part of their inspections
- Regularly collect good quality data at national and local levels
  to improve understanding of racial disparities in mental health
  services. In particular, data collected should enable analysis of
  racial disparities in the prevalence of mental health conditions,
  experiences of care and treatment in mental health services,
  and in health outcomes. This data should inform future policies
  seeking to address racial disparities in mental health care

#### **State of Health**

- Implement evidence-based solutions to reduce race health inequalities, with the aim of reducing maternity and neo-natal disparities. This includes relevant action to address or mitigate against the impacts of underlying determinants of health such as poverty, housing, unemployment
- Develop action plans to address higher levels of infant mortality for ethnic minority groups and improve data collection



This publication and related equality and human rights resources are available from our website.

Questions and comments regarding this publication may be addressed to: <a href="mailto:correspondence@equalityhumanrights.com">correspondence@equalityhumanrights.com</a>. We welcome your feedback.

For information on accessing one of our publications in an alternative format, please contact: <a href="mailto:correspondence@equalityhumanrights.com">correspondence@equalityhumanrights.com</a>.

Keep up to date with our latest news, events and publications by signing up to our e-newsletter.

#### **EASS**

For advice, information or guidance on equality, discrimination, or human rights issues, please contact the <u>Equality Advisory and Support Service</u>, a free and independent service.

Telephone 0808 800 0082

Hours 09:00 to 19:00 (Monday to Friday)

10:00 to 14:00 (Saturday)

Post FREEPOST EASS HELPLINE FPN6521

© 2024 Equality and Human Rights Commission

Published July 2024

ISBN: 978-1-84206-883-0