



Review of France by the UN Committee  
on the Elimination of  
Committee on the Elimination of All  
Forms of Racial  
of Racial Discrimination

# Report

October 21, 2022

Coordination nationale Pas sans Nous  
6 rue Arnold Géraux  
93450 L'Île-Saint-Denis

@ coordinationcitoyennationale@gmail.com  
☎ 06.77.33.54.28

# [France] FOLLOW-UP REPORT

## Presented by : Coordination nationale Pas sans Nous

### October 2022

#### [ Preamble ]

Created in 2014, following the Bacqué-Mechmache report "For a radical reform of urban policy. It won't be done without us", la Coordination nationale Pas sans Nous defines itself as a voice for working-class neighbourhoods. The association aims at encouraging, supporting or creating bottom-up participatory dynamics initiated by or with residents. It is in line with the fundamental principles of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and contributes for an active democracy while fighting for equal rights, dignity and the defence of the rights and interests of the inhabitants of working-class neighbourhoods, both urban and rural, throughout the French territory. Its actions and missions rely on the members' solidarity to act collectively. It is a voice for proposals and citizen co-construction based on the dynamics of working-class neighbourhoods in order to create the indispensable power relations to ensure that rights are respected and that locally committed actors are taken into account. Composed of active citizens, collectives and associative representatives who act in working-class neighbourhoods, Pas sans Nous is seen as a key player in social dialogue with all institutions for the co-construction and co-decision of public policies.

La coordination nationale Pas sans Nous agrees with the CNCDH's observations on racism and racist discriminations. The coordination is composed of concerned members and/or committed ones. It is therefore able to report, at the individual, collective, associative, territorial and local policy levels, numerous acts and facts that confirm racist insults, opinions, speeches, acts and defamation. The incitement to racial hatred or violence in the public, political and media spheres is alarming. The over-occupation of political and media discourse with security and migration issues only serves to reinforce existing preconceived ideas. Repeatedly, strategies of "low-key repression" are implemented through the use of methods of disqualification, suspicion, and delegitimation of associations or members of associations. These tactics not only put forward systemic and systematic racism, but also question the principle of acting for equality and social justice, while suspicions of communitarianism weaken the possibilities to build a society.

Therefore, "*Coordination nationale Pas sans Nous*" stands for a multidimensional, multidisciplinary and intersectional approach.

As part of the review of France's record on discrimination, the CNCDH asked the national coordination group Pas sans Nous to produce a report, and the coordination group's members Pas sans Nous set up a working group to draft recommendations. The working group was organised around the collection of testimonies from coordination group's members. The whole report was co-produced consultatively, combining the skills and knowledge of all the actors who compose the coordination. This report is also based on the manifesto "Nos quartiers ont de la gueule!" which is the result of a six-month tour of France meeting residents in the neighbourhoods. Thus, the work is the fruit of active members, PSN coordinations from Toulouse, Isère, Maine-et-Loire, Île-de-France, associations from Tarbes, Montpellier, Angoulême, and lawyers.

The recommendations, although specifically organised by theme, must be taken into account in a historical, global and transversal approach. 2022 is a landmark year in many respects regarding the issue of racism, xenophobia, anti-Semitism, Islamophobia and anti-gypsyism. Indeed, it is worth remembering that 40 years have passed since the march for equality and against racism took place, 40 years since the Dubedout report "Ensemble refaire la ville: rapport au premier ministre du président de la commission nationale pour le développement social des quartiers", and 20 years since the National Agency for Urban



Renovation (ANRU) in a context where the most precarious and invisible people still do not have a right to decent housing. What has happened over the past decades?

This paragraph is therefore a global recommendation linked to point 20<sup>1</sup> of the list of themes proposed by the CERD. Indeed, the issue regarding the struggle against both racial stereotypes and racist bias and the one regarding the modes of action in the fight against discrimination can only be addressed through a set of strategies in a repertoire of actions. Whether it is an advertising campaign to remind people the law and fundamental rights, whether it is a matter of publicising and amplifying the voices of those concerned to raise awareness, whether it is a matter of fortifying the legal issue to restore confidence in the justice system, showing that it is useful to lodge a complaint when one has been a victim, whether it is a question of providing schools and universities with resources, in the first case to train staff but also to educate all pupils from the earliest age and without any conditions to "be part of society", as well as to allocate financial resources for the implementation of participative research. It is also a question of working on history and memory and contributing to ensure that the national narrative is also constructed from the point of view of those concerned, particularly with regard to events that could be embarrassing for France. All these actions are more than necessary and complementary.

## [Report ]

### **The first set of recommendations concerns statistics and socio-economic indicators.**

Indeed, the collection of data through statistics raises many questions, particularly concerning the method and mode of collection. A territory is first and foremost a human reality and the indicators must therefore provide elements for the understanding of these territories. The economic situation of the population should include the notion of living expenses: rent, fixed charges (EDF, GDF, water), compulsory travel, while taking into account the specificity of the inhabitants of the territories (undocumented migrants, lodgers, travellers); but also employment, schooling, health. The demographic structure, the isolation and the size of the communities of reference must also be taken into account. It also seems necessary to evaluate the level of public intervention in the neighbourhoods, in particular common law, and the financial and human resources capacity of local authorities.

Moreover, a few years ago, France was already split by a virulent debate on so-called "ethnic" statistics. Patrick Simon, a researcher at INED, brings to light the impact of discrimination and racism in the trajectories of individuals. It marks an important milestone since until then, statistics on immigration were only used to observe flows: who are the immigrants? How many are there? How many come for family reunification?

INED has therefore launched a research project - Trajectories and Origins (TeO) - with the aim of "improving knowledge of the social trajectories and living conditions of migrants and their descendants in French society". It starts from the people's social situation at the time of the survey, but the title - "trajectories" in the plural - refers to the desire to study different life paths. It seeks to understand the impact of migration backgrounds in accessing goods, services and daily rights, but also to study socio-economic positions and trajectories, and to measure the discrimination and racism experienced in these trajectories. It sheds light on the words we heard many times during our Tour of France *"Nos quartiers ont de la gueule!"*: *"Difficulty in accessing housing according to the sound of the name". "A black person has more difficulty accessing housing. "A priority given to French families" (Manifesto "Nos quartiers ont de la gueule!")"*.

### **Recommendations :**

---

<sup>1</sup> Detailed information on concrete measures taken to prevent and combat racial discrimination, as well as to combat prejudices and stereotypes leading to racial discrimination of minorities, including Roma, Travellers, Arabs, people of African descent,

- **Initiate a territorial approach to statistics**, crossing quantitative and qualitative data, with territorial surveys such as TeO, which make it possible to measure the reality of social inequalities, discrimination and people's experiences;
- **Diversify the level of territorialization of the territories' knowledge** and respect their identity.

*An area such as Seine-Saint-Denis, is experiencing a "double penalty": this area, where "all records are broken" according to INSEE, must be respected for its specificity as a land of welcome for the most disadvantaged and migrants, and not be "melted" into Île-de-France, the wealthiest region in Europe, and not be given the means to conduct the social policies that fall within its remit, on the pretext that the Île-de-France is wealth.*

**The second set of recommendations concerns the institutional framework and the policy for implementing the fight against discrimination**, points 4<sup>2</sup>, 5<sup>3</sup>, 6<sup>4</sup> and 7<sup>5</sup>. For 40 years, there has been a succession of plans to struggle against racist discrimination, but the reality is that the acronyms were changed but the essence of the problem has remained. This demonstrates a certain ineffectiveness in the fight against inequality. It seems necessary to recall that the current context is also the result of a long history. First, it was the notion of integration that took precedence over the term insertion, the socialist and assimilation watchword of the 1980s, marked by colonial usage, and by the idea of acculturation of newcomers to society. It should also be remembered that until the end of the 1990s, France did not recognise the notion of discrimination, since we were a secular, indivisible Republic, where each individual had the same rights. It was Europe that imposed it. Then, during the 2000s, it was equality of opportunity that was spoken of more. Equal opportunities is an expression that means "inequalities", referring to the idea that social factors do not allow us all to be equal, so measures should and are put in place to try to remedy this. It is the generation of quotas and attempts of so-called positive discrimination. Finally, since the 2010s, the notions of diversity, secularism and separatism have dominated the political and media fields, showing a kind of positivism that wants to say "we are wealth in our differences" while reminding us that it is the Republic that takes priority.

### **Recommendations:**

- **For the creation of an independent and transparent authority** regarding the fight against discrimination, refusing therefore that administrations or institutions be judge and jury;
- **For the setting up of a multi-actor and independent think tank**, allowing the co-construction of an anti-discrimination plan and not, currently, exclusively in the hands of the DILCRAH;
- **Fight against the stigmatisation and disqualification of anti-racist groups**, while working towards the systematic condemnation of racist groups or hate ones;
- **Propose the systematic candidates' ineligibility** for elections when they have been condemned, any form of conviction possible, but in particular for acts of racism;
- **Provide the CSA with more substantial and effective resources** in the fight against discrimination in order to take into account referrals from the Human Rights Defender, associations, collectives and civil society / Human Rights Defender.

**The third set of recommendations concerns information on the application of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination.** For

<sup>2</sup> The inclusion in criminal legislation of the criminalisation of the dissemination of ideas based on racial superiority, racial hatred and incitement to racial discrimination and violence; as well as participation in organisations or propaganda activities that promote racial discrimination as provided for in Article 4 of the Convention.

<sup>3</sup> Results achieved in the implementation of measures to address racial hate speech and incitement to racial discrimination. The updated number of complaints filed, investigations conducted and prosecuted, and perpetrators convicted concerning racial hate speech and incitement to racial discrimination and violence

<sup>4</sup> Measures to prevent and combat racist and xenophobic political discourse and racist messages on the Internet.

<sup>5</sup> Implementation, results and evaluation of the National Plan to Combat Racism and Anti-Semitism 2018-2026. Concrete measures to combat racial and structural discrimination of minorities



40 years, urban policy has not led to any lasting improvement in the situation of the inhabitants of working-class neighbourhoods. A "specialisation of territories" is taking hold and is being reinforced, fuelled by a concentration of poverty and the ineffectiveness of the systems of action to fight social and territorial inequalities, territorial and ethno-racial discrimination. The equalisation of wealth, but also of difficulties, remains an idea that struggles to be recognised. The State refuses to face up to this issue since it implies making economic choices that are compatible with the values of the Republic and guarantee everyone access to rights (housing, education, health, for example), and refraining from bias and preconceived ideas that these neighbourhoods constitute a threat to the Republican order.

The issues of health, food and education are particularly acute in these areas, where there is a strong bond between socio-economic insecurity and health fragility, the preponderance of chronic illnesses, greater exposure to environmental pollution and health crises such as Covid-19, and restricted access to healthcare. Besides poverty territorial discriminations contribute to food insecurity, particularly through inaccessibility to local shops offering a varied and healthy food supply. These living conditions and policies generate non-use of care and social rights in these territories, which is increased by the complexity of the benefit system. This constitutes violations of the preamble of the 1946 Constitution, "the Nation shall ensure to the individual and to the family the conditions necessary for their development".

### **Recommendations:**

- **Develop the universal income**, which is a means of fighting the precariousness and insecurity strengthened by the health crisis, in the face of social inequalities, which has been tested in other countries. In this context, it is also necessary to recognise a minimum living allowance;
- **Establish social security for food** that promotes the principle of a right to sustainable food, which guarantees free access to healthy and local products under contract;
- **Organise payment at source:** We demand VAS for all social benefits. Even for known benefits, such as family allowances, non-use is a social scourge.

**The fourth set of recommendations deals with the issue of access to justice and racial discrimination in the judicial system, namely points 18<sup>6</sup> and 19<sup>7</sup>.**

In line with the findings of the CNCDH<sup>8</sup> regarding access to justice on the one hand, and legal treatment of racist acts on the other, it seems necessary to take strong and effective measures. In order to act on the black figure (under-representation and under-recording of racist acts), it seems crucial to act so that racist acts can be qualified, in particular by changing the points at which complaints are recorded. Indeed, victims are often afraid of being inadequately received and considered (and rightly so) when they try to file a complaint. Centres of justice and law or associations act as intermediaries to ease the filing of complaints, with a view to support the victim in qualifying his or her complaint. It also seems necessary to strengthen the resources of the Rights Defender and to organise even more local points of access to the law.

---

<sup>6</sup> Measures taken to facilitate access to justice and effective remedies for victims of racial discrimination. Measures taken to combat prejudices leading to racial discrimination in the judicial system. Statistics on cases of racial discrimination, including results of investigations, convictions and compensation awarded to victims.

<sup>7</sup> Measures to combat racial profiling, excessive use of force and identity checks by police and other law enforcement officials based solely on physical characteristics associated with real or perceived origin. Information on the application of the Code of Ethics of the National Police and Gendarmerie. Number of complaints filed regarding police violence and discriminatory police controls; number of investigations carried out and their results. Developments regarding the investigation into the death of Adama Traoré on 19 July 2016.

<sup>8</sup> Recommendation 2, maintain a qualitative evaluation of the Ministry of the Interior's statistical collection methods, p152. Recommendation 4, fight against the under-reporting of racism, recall the need for "regular and repeated" training of law enforcement officers, p153. Recommendation 23, training for magistrates of anti-discrimination units, p228. Recommendation 43, the CNCDH recalls that rights defence associations can contact the Ministry of the Interior to ensure a presence in police stations and gendarmeries, p284. Recommendation 50 and 51, deepen investigations, quality of the criminal response, take into account accumulation and intersectionality, p294



## Recommendations:

- **The need to inform victims of the existence of a lead prosecutor** for discrimination so that complaints can be made directly to him or her by victims;
- **Provide more resources to the public prosecutor's offices, which are responsible for prosecuting the** majority of complaints from victims of discrimination. Indeed, regarding discrimination's complaints, many ones are not prosecuted by the public prosecutor's office (for systemic reasons, but also due to a lack of resources). Yet, without a complaint with a civil action before the senior investigating judge, it rarely result in a trial;
- **Inform systematically victims in case of prosecution by the public prosecutor's office** so that they can request the production of acts interrupting the statute of limitations (concerning certain offences like insult or defamation);
- **Ensure that the "maisons de justice et du droit"** and associations can provide support to victims when they file a complaint;
- **The recognition of the notion of systemic racism** in the institutional treatment of the people who are discriminated and then accompany this notion with reparations.

*"The police do not do their job well":* they do not intervene when called, they are not reactive, they *"do not always take complaints"* and do not follow them up, they play *"the cowboys"* and are into *"intimidation, have no respect for people"*. It *"uses force disproportionately"* (Manifesto Nos quartiers ont de la gueule!)

Concerning the relations with the police, outstanding measures must be taken to put an end to police violence, to put an end to murders during arrests, to put an end to the repression of racialised people during controls or demonstrations, and to put an end to the persistent stigmatisation of young people from working class neighbourhoods during identity checks. The national coordination Pas sans Nous joins the analysis of many actors mobilised on the territory, such as the ACAT report<sup>9</sup>, Vérité pour Souheil, Vérité pour Adama, Urgence notre police assassine, Stop le contrôle au faciès, to witness and denounce police violence, just like us who are the voice of thousands of people we met during our Tour de France to bear witness showing how police scare people, while showing at the same time how police is indispensable to be and feel protected. It also seems crucial to look at the living conditions of detainees in French prisons, especially those of foreign origin, as well as "travellers", Roma and gypsies, who suffer a muted and unheralded violence. Numerous testimonies, reported by members of the Coordination who act for the living conditions of detainees, put forward the violence exercised, the arbitrary deprivations and the lack of dignity granted to detainees.

## Recommendations:

- **Organise the counting of people killed by the police** (in the same way as feminicides), during controls or stops, by an independent and transparent body;
- **Abolish all arrest techniques that use brutality** and put the arrested person at risk of death (chokeholds, teaser);
- **Extend the training and make it continuous for the forces of order:** gendarmes, policemen, and prison guards with an adapted training aiming at stopping inappropriate gestures, acts, words;
- **Train journalists on the importance of the choice and impact of words** to describe and qualify police violence. It is crucial therefore to remove those expressions such as "skidding, police blunder, routine control". It is the same logic as when feminists are working to remove expressions such as "crime of passion" or "family drama" to qualify a feminicide and therefore violence against women and children.

---

<sup>9</sup> [manage.wix.com/dashboard/3182b919-823c-4e8b-8e7b-87c1c5bb0ba4/shoutout/dashboard?referralInfo=sidebar#/dashboard](https://manage.wix.com/dashboard/3182b919-823c-4e8b-8e7b-87c1c5bb0ba4/shoutout/dashboard?referralInfo=sidebar#/dashboard)



**The fifth series of recommendations concerns the situation of minorities, Travellers, Gypsies, Roma,** dealing with points 8<sup>10</sup>, 9<sup>11</sup>, 10<sup>12</sup>, 11<sup>13</sup> and 12<sup>14</sup> of the CERD. Thus, in line with the findings of the CNCDH<sup>15</sup>, the National Coordination Pas sans Nous is concerned about the living conditions of people perceived as "Travellers", concerned about the number of evictions from shanty towns and informal settlements, and the consequences of these repeated evictions, which lead to deschooling and de-socialisation, while continuing to stigmatise these populations, which ultimately strengthens existing bias. This denial of humanity is simply unbearable.

*"Gypsy identity is stigmatised and associated with theft and drugs in the collective imagination. There is a systematic mistrust of institutions and local authorities with daily discrimination in access to housing, schooling etc. There is a feeling of not being French like everyone else, but of being considered only as a gypsy or a Roma",* comments collected by one of the members of the Cap Gély association, Montpellier.

### **Recommendations:**

- **To support and promote projects and initiatives** from the gypsy or Roma communities;
- **Apply the Besson Law**, which compels all municipalities with more than 5,000 inhabitants to provide a stopping place and to disqualify elected officials who do not respect the law;
- **Ensure the sanitation of transit areas**, as well as the establishment in each city of public sanitation points (showers, washing facilities, dry halls) open 24 hours a day;
- **Stop of the fixed fine (AFD)** for "illicit installation on the land of others" when there is no public land worthy of charter in the locality;
- **Stop financial penalties** against people who take resources from waste storage sites but open up a coordinated access point;
- **Audit of funding** for the so-called integration of Gypsy and Roma families, with provision for sanctions in case of non-compliance and mismanagement of funding.

**The sixth set of recommendations concerns the situations of migrants, asylum seekers, refugees and stateless persons,** addressing points 16<sup>16</sup> and 17<sup>17</sup>.

*"On 5 October 2017, the National Assembly's Committee for the Evaluation and Control of Public Policies included in its work programme, at the request of the Les Républicains group, an evaluation of the State's action in the exercise of three of its central missions in Seine-Saint-Denis. Beyond the analysis of statistics and the activity of the various tools of public action, the originality of this work lies in its focus on the question of the effectiveness of State action in Seine-Saint-Denis, which is both obvious and central but never really asked.*

<sup>10</sup> Information on the implementation of measures adopted to ensure access to adequate housing and to improve the living conditions of Roma people, as well as their protection against forced evictions.

<sup>11</sup> Information on the implementation of concrete measures to ensure access to health care and services and social security for Roma.

<sup>12</sup> Results of the implementation of measures to ensure access to the right to education for Roma children, to increase their enrolment and to combat truancy and school drop-out. Measures to improve access to the labour market for Roma people.

<sup>13</sup> Information on the implementation of measures to eliminate discrimination against Travellers. Progress of measures taken concerning the reception and housing of Travellers. Operation of the National Advisory Commission on Travellers.

<sup>14</sup> Measures taken to combat the multiple forms of discrimination against minority women, as well as migrant, asylum-seeking and refugee women.

<sup>15</sup> La lutte contre le racisme, l'antisémitisme et la xénophobie, CNCDH report, 2021, la documentation française. Recommendation 33, the CNCDH recommends that reception areas be brought into conformity. Recommendation 34, the right to housing and related rights, recognising the caravan as a "dwelling" in its own right. Recommendation 7, school truce to prevent any situation of de-schooling linked to an eviction, as well as taking into account the schooling situation before deciding on an eviction

<sup>16</sup> Information on measures taken to improve access to asylum, as well as reception and living conditions for migrants, asylum seekers and refugees. Measures to promote the social integration of migrants, asylum seekers and refugees, as well as stateless persons, including through access to employment, education and an adequate standard of living.

<sup>17</sup> Information on the protection measures adopted for unaccompanied migrant children and asylum seekers.

This reference to this report, like the aborted project known as the "Seine-Saint-Denis Law" a few years earlier, put forward the abandonment of public policies in the poorest department in metropolitan France, which receives the most migrants, with explosive indicators of economic and social difficulties: the department where 28.4% of people live below the poverty line. 30% of the population is immigrant. This proportion places the department in the 1st place in metropolitan France. A young population: 36% of the population and 28% of young people aged 18 to 24 are unemployed or untrained. It is a department where "all records are broken" according to INSEE. The fact that the National Assembly's Committee for the Evaluation and Control of Public Policies is evaluating the State's action in its three regalian missions in Seine-Saint-Denis show **a systemic discrimination that crosses family living standards, territory and origin**. The report deals with "glass ceiling of public policies in Seine-Saint-Denis". We refer to this report to see the extent of this systemic discrimination. With this concrete and local example, we understand that this is a national observation that can be transposed to many territories.

### **Recommendations:**

- **Guarantee the right to academic success in working-class neighbourhoods:** The National Education System must apply common law in all schools in the Republic and provide qualified human resources to meet education and training needs;
- **Guaranteeing school enrolment for children even if their parents are in an irregular situation: this is the law.** The State must ensure that local authorities respect it;
- **Strengthen access to justice to prosecute racism and discrimination;**
- **Guarantee the right to security** for all through a greater presence of community policing, with trained and experienced community police officers.

All over France, situations, in which the lack of institutions leads to vulnerable and endangered unaccompanied minors being placed on the streets without rights or resources, are increasing. **The rights of the child are not up for discussion.** Migrant minors are above all children. We request that France commits itself to the application of

- **the immediate sheltering of** all unaccompanied minors who present themselves as minors, in the common law child protection system, as hotels are not a suitable solution;
- **respect of the minors' right to benefit from comprehensive and appropriate care that** allows them to access all their fundamental rights: access to schooling, physical and mental health care);
- **the maintenance of care beyond the age of 18 if the situation requires it**, but also the securing of the future of unaccompanied foreign minors when they reach the age of majority through the obtention of a residence permit.

The conditions of reception, life and subsistence of migrants are deplorable and suffer from a permanent denial of humanity, which is itself reinforced by political and media security discourses that encourage rejection and biases. The Not Without Us coordination is taking a stand to ensure that :

- **The offence of solidarity is no longer an offence.** Although it has been partially repealed, it is still very difficult to show solidarity in case of evictions at times when families would be in the process of settling down permanently;
- **Administrative detention centres should be replaced** by reception and orientation centres;

- **The question of reception and care should be addressed in a policy of multi-actor and territorial consultation** (similar to the departmental protocols for combating violence against women<sup>18</sup>);
- **Recognition of anti-racist and migrant-receiving associations as being of "public utility"**;
- **Systematic condemnation of racist or hateful campaigns**, including online hate.

## [ Proposal of " La coordination nationale Pas sans Nous ]

### For cultural rights

Article 27 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights guarantees cultural rights, including the right for everyone to participate freely in the cultural life of the community, to enjoy the arts and to contribute in scientific advancement and its benefits. Cultural rights in France do not impose national lines of action but result in the evasion of the issue through a territorialisation of these rights. They are only included in an organisational approach of the territory without being defined and without specific tools for the local authorities which have to implement them. The inhabitants of working-class neighbourhoods and elsewhere want and ask to be free to take part in society without having to detach themselves from their cultural background. This demand is very disturbing for the State, since it implies questioning its cultural neutrality and its principles according what State must prevail over cultures. The French approach focuses not on the cultural opportunities represented by minority populations, but on the collective risks of division of the social body and the refusal to integrate minorities concentrated in working-class neighbourhoods. This violation of cultural rights prevents the respect of all other rights, because they directly affect the integrity of the person.

### Recommendations :

- **The adoption of the Faro Framework Convention** which allows citizens to have their cultural practices recognised and enables emancipation processes based on cultural rights;
- **The implementation of cultural rights.**

### Tackling racial segregation by tackling spatial segregation

The fight against ethno-racial discrimination in France does not impose national lines of action, but rather results in the majority of people dodging the issue in two ways. Firstly, by territorialising the anti-discrimination policy, which is mainly part of the city policy, whose tools are applied to territories and not to individuals. Moreover, there is no national definition of the problem, and the state discharges itself by relocating the problem locally through plans without resolving the root causes, which are systemic. Secondly, by avoiding a national debate on racism and discrimination, which is disguised by the injunction to national cohesion. Indeed, the latter is seen as threatened by the inhabitants of working-class neighbourhoods. This has the effect of locking these residents into areas where common law and fundamental human rights (access to decent housing, quality food and care, mobility, cultural rights, etc.) do not apply and their citizenship is constantly being called into question.

### Recommendations :

- **Put more resources into human resources and include the inhabitants of working-class neighbourhoods in the decisions and governance of projects;**

<sup>18</sup> <https://www.prefectures-regions.gouv.fr/pays-de-la-loire/content/download/49548/328026/file/Protocole%20lutte%20contre%20violence%2053.pdf>



- **Set up national publicity campaigns** on discrimination (radio, TV, wall posters, spots, reminding that it is a crime, but also all the contributions of diversity in the national history).

### **Taking action against environmental racism**

Working-class neighbourhoods are left aside regarding environmental issues. Their residents, many of whom are racialised, are singled out as doing sparsely in this area without the reality of the issues being addressed. For example, just as in rural areas, the car is essential in terms of mobility and no additional support is put in place to help these residents make the transition to less polluting vehicles. Houses are built with cheap materials that do not allow for good insulation, creating thermal flats and unhealthy housing. While the State has put in place aids for individuals, tenants of social flats are dependent on the work decided by the landlords, which may be subsidised by the State but will still lead to an increase in rent. The local authorities who are in charge of sanitation and waste management establish policies that do not correspond to the actual needs, as the more popular and populated neighbourhoods are as much or less maintained than the less popular and inhabited ones.

### **Recommendations :**

- **Organise consultation with residents**, including an environmental component, for all urban development projects via sustainable development and transition houses.

### **Repeal of the separatism law**

The law for secularism and the values of the Republic, originally called "separatism", must be repealed. It has been denounced by several organizations and submitted to the Council of State and the Constitutional Council. If the latter has not judged it unconstitutional, the discriminatory character of this law as well as the danger for the associative liberties as underlined in the report of the observatory of the associative liberties make that the organizations are ready to make an appeal to the European Court of Human Rights and have already asked the commission to take it up. Under the pretext of defending the values of the Republic, of which the separation of powers is a pillar, the field of justice has been stripped by the executive, which can now decide on its own to dissolve an association on the pretext of hateful comments made by a member on social networks, for example. Even the High Council for Associative Life alerts the Government and elected representatives to the various attempts to restrict associative freedoms, which, particularly since the entry into force of the Republican Commitment Contract, hardly favours the advent of a serene climate of trust and cooperation in the service of the general interest.

### **Recommendations :**

- **Repeal the law on separatism, which only reinforces the stigmatisation** of the inhabitants of working-class neighbourhoods, in particular those who are supposed to be Muslims, their associations and those who defend them. However, for decades, the inhabitants of working-class neighbourhoods have constantly denounced the discrimination and social inequalities of which they are the first victims;
- **Repeal both the Republican Commitment Contract** and the obligation to undergo a training to the values of the Republic and secularism, while the State itself does not respect the values of the Republic by not conducting proactive and effective policies against discrimination.