Comments of the Republic of Azerbaijan on the Concluding Observations of the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights – E/C.12/AZE/CO/4

The Republic of Azerbaijan (Azerbaijan) is committed to its obligations under international legal instruments in the field of promotion and protection of human rights, including the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.

In general, Azerbaijan will review the Concluding Observations (E/C.12/AZE/CO/4) of the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (CESCR) on the fourth periodic report of Azerbaijan. Azerbaijan objects to Paragraphs 6 and 7 of the Concluding Observations and considers them as politically motivated, biased and not reflecting the reality on the ground.

In Paragraph 6, a reference was made to a non-existent territorial unit - "Nagorno-Karabakh" which is questioning the belonging of this territory to Azerbaijan and is contrary to the official territorial-administrative division (See the Annex – Report submitted to the United Nations Group of Experts on Geographical Names). At the same time, Paragraph 6 fails to refer to military aggression by Armenia against Azerbaijan and its occupation of close to 20 per cent of the territory of Azerbaijan for almost the last 30 years, as well as did not refer to Armenia as a party to the former conflict.

Azerbaijan considers such an intentional misinterpretation as a favour to Armenia by the CESCR and departure from the language of the text the CESCR used in its previous Concluding Observations of 22 December 1997 and 14 December 2004, which were adopted in relation to initial and second periodic reports of Azerbaijan, wherein the CESCR had referred to armed hostilities with Armenia as the "conflict with Armenia" rather than as "military hostilities that took place in and around Nagorno-Karabakh" (See Paragraph 12 (E/C.12/1/Add.20) and Paragraph 11 (E/C.12/1/Add.104) of the said Concluding Observations respectively).

It should be further reminded that the "military hostilities" mentioned in Paragraph 6, took place in response to the repeated armed attacks and series of military provocations by Armenia carried out in July and August of 2020, which constituted an act of armed aggression by this country. In its turn, Azerbaijan had exercised its inherent right of self-defence under international law, launched counter-offensive operation and liberated its territories from the illegal occupation of Armenia during the 44 Days of Patriotic War that took place on 27 September – 10 November 2020, which resulted in the further withdrawal of Armenian troops from the Aghdam, Kalbajar and Lachin regions of Azerbaijan, in the later period. Thus, Azerbaijan put an end to the Armenia-Azerbaijan Nagorno-Karabakh conflict.

In view of the above-mentioned arguments presented in detail by the Azerbaijani side during the consideration of the periodic report by the CESCR, Paragraph 6 as it was reflected in the Concluding Observations, cannot be considered as a just and objective basis for the formulation of the recommendations contained in Paragraph 7. The fact that the CESCR in Paragraph 7 demonstrated a biased and accusatory approach against Azerbaijan, made it clear that the information sources mostly used by the CESCR were unreliable and non-credible, while the facts presented by the Azerbaijani side were completely disregarded.

Although the Delegation of Azerbaijan, during the interactive dialogue, had provided detailed information on the violations of economic, social and cultural rights of the expelled Azerbaijani population by Armenia during its almost 30-year-long occupation of the territories of Azerbaijan, it is regretful that the CESCR did not address this matter in its Concluding Observations.

Based on the above-mentioned, Azerbaijan rejects Paragraph 6 and Paragraph 7 of the Concluding Observations in their entirety and demands that the CESCR be guided both by the principles of international law, in particular those relating to respect to the sovereignty, territorial integrity and internationally recognized borders of the Member States of the United Nations as well as objective and impartial working methods.

22 April 2021

English

United Nations Group of Experts on
Geographical Names
Second session
New York, 3 – 7 May 2021
Item 4 (a) of the provisional agenda *
Reports: Governments on the situation in their countries and on the progress made in standardization of geographical names

Report by the Republic of Azerbaijan

Submitted by the Republic of Azerbaijan **

^{*} GEGN.2/2021/1

^{**} Prepared by the Ministry of Ecology and Natural Resources of the Republic of Azerbaijan

Summary:

The report summarizes the work done by the Government of the Republic of Azerbaijan in the field of standardization of the geographical names since its last report presented to the Group of Experts. It particularly outlines the major developments in the field of legislation. The report also highlights the progress in finalization of national transliteration rules and tables, which is of utmost importance for translation of national geographical names into the English and Russian languages. The report also outlines the approach of Azerbaijan in terms of digitalization of geographical data in light of increased use of geographic data and toponyms. In this regard, the report informs that geographic data, including the names of 4589 settlements have been placed in the open web sources to facilitate their use by third parties while preparing maps reflecting the territory of the Republic of Azerbaijan.

The document also highlights the challenge stemming from the use of inaccurate and falsified geographic names, and in this regard, points out the necessity for all stakeholders, first and foremost the UN and its agencies to refrain from using such falsified names in accordance with the relevant recommendations reflected in resolutions of UN Conferences on Standardization of Geographical Names.

Improvement of the legal framework for the standardization of geographical names

Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan dated September 30, 2002 "On the state language in the Republic of Azerbaijan" was adopted. According to Article 10.2 of the Law, the assignment of geographical names of Azerbaijan in foreign languages is determined in accordance with the pronunciation of the Azerbaijani language and the rules of international spelling of geographical names.

The Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan dated December 18, 2007 "On the names of geographical objects" was adopted. According to the law, the Ministry of Ecology and Natural Resources of the Republic of Azerbaijan was designated as the competent national authority for registration of the names of geographical objects, and tasked to ensure uniform and stable use of the names of geographical objects located in the territory of the Republic of Azerbaijan, and to preserve them. The said Ministry was also identified as the state body responsible for the creation of a state catalogue, preparation and publication of maps and atlases of the Republic of Azerbaijan.

By Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Azerbaijan dated May 6, 2008 the "Regulations for registration of names of geographical objects, requirements for dictionaries and reference books of names of geographical objects, rules for creating and maintaining a state catalogue of names of geographical objects" were approved.

The "Manual for the National Standardization of Geographical Names" was translated into Azerbaijani in 2016, and trainings were conducted in the Republic of Azerbaijan to organize work on the standardization of geographical names based on international experience and the application of the standardization procedure.

Based on the requirements of these standards, "Geodesy and Cartography" LLC under the Ministry of Ecology and Natural Resources prepared "Manual for creating a state catalogue of names of geographical objects" and "Manual on the rules for registering and accounting for names of geographical objects".

By resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Azerbaijan dated 16 December 2020 "Rules for transliteration of the names of geographical objects of the Republic of Azerbaijan from the Azerbaijani alphabet into the Russian alphabet" and the "Rules for transliteration of the names of geographical objects of the Republic of Azerbaijan from the Azerbaijani alphabet into English" were approved.

Standardization of geographical names, the creation of a state catalogue and the sharing of information

The collection of geographical names was carried out in accordance with the requirements of the approved instructions. In this context, maps of scales 1: 50,000 and 1: 100,000, various literature, research, information from central executive authorities, etc. were used. The database was created by systematic analysis of information obtained from sources. This information was transferred to an automated information system.

To date, 31,459 geographical names for 86 administrative districts and cities of the country have been collected in the database and checked by editors. Geographical names to be included in the state catalogue of geographical objects will be reflected in 3 languages - Azerbaijani, English and Russian. The names of the settlements are being clarified by the Azerbaijan National Academy of Sciences after transliteration from Azerbaijani into English and Russian. The completion of the state catalogue of geographic objects of the Republic of Azerbaijan is expected in 2022.

At the same time, the names of 4589 settlements of the Republic of Azerbaijan were transliterated into English and Russian and posted on an open information portal in all 3 languages. The portal also include geographic names of 11 types, such as districts, towns, roads, railways, lakes, mountains etc. Portal Link: https://www.opendata.az/en/services?catld=92. API interfaces were also developed enabling the re-use of the data by outside map makers.

The list of names of 4589 settlements as standardized by the competent national authority of the Republic of Azerbaijan can be reached through the following link: https://drive.google.com/file/d/1QdHRUsaEGryG11Y2P4w2o51AUdGNb6jb/view?usp=sharing.

The list reflects the standardized names of the settlements as defined by the Second UN Conference on Standardization of Geographical Names (Vol. II, 1972, p. 52). Thus, those names have the official sanction of the Ministry of Ecology and Natural Resources, which is the legally constituted entity responsible for standardization of geographic names in the Republic of Azerbaijan.

Inaccurate and falsified geographic names

The ungrounded territorial claims by Armenia against the Republic of Azerbaijan is accompanied by massive falsification of standardized geographic names of Azerbaijan, in particular with regard to those geographic objects located in the territories of Azerbaijan that were under military occupation of Armenia. It was identified by the State Agency for Geodesy and Cartography that at least 125 such geographic names have been falsified by Armenia (the list is attached herewith as Annex 1).

Such a deliberate falsification of geographic names standardized by the relevant state body of Azerbaijan represent a gross violation of letter and spirit of UNGEGN resolutions and recommendations reflected therein. It is particularly disturbing that some of these falsified names have also been used by UN agencies and specialized bodies in contravention to recommendations developed by the UN Conference on the Standardization of Geographical Names. Thus, it is of particular relevance here to recall Resolution 16 adopted by the Third Conference held in 1977, which recommends, *inter alia*, that "any changes made by other authorities in the names standardized by the competent national geographical names authority should not be recognized by the United Nations".

Furthermore, Resolution 9 of the Sixth Conference of 1993 specifically discouraged unauthorized changing of geographical names that have already been established by a legally constituted entity and are nationally recognized.

In light of the above-mentioned, any name used with regard to the settlement located in the territory of the Republic of Azerbaijan other than the one officially adopted by the competent state body should be resolutely rejected.

Conclusions and recommendations

The coordination and leadership role of the "Geodesy and Cartography" LLC under the Ministry of Ecology and Natural Resources continues to be a very important in bringing the national practice in the area of standardization of geographical names in the Republic of Azerbaijan. At the same time, in view of technological developments, as well as increased use of maps and other geographical products in information-communication technologies, such as mobile applications, the State Agency will continue to liaise with other state institutions in order to ensure that geographic data related to the Republic of Azerbaijan is up to date and fit to the latest technological requirements.

The list of geographical names in the Republic of Azerbaijan as an annex to this report is presented as the only official reference point for the geographical names of the Republic of Azerbaijan.

The Republic of Azerbaijan strongly calls on all stakeholders, such as map makers and other users of geographic data, including those operating for the UN and its institutions to refrain from using falsified names of the geographic objects located in the territory of Azerbaijan and standardized by the competent national authority.

The Group of Experts is invited to take into account the report. It is also recommended for the Group to consider the ways of strengthening implementation of recommendations adopted by previous UN Conferences related to non-recognition of unathorized changes made to geographic names standartized by competent authorities of UN Member-States.

Annex 1

National report of the Republic of Azerbaijan submitted to the Second Session of the UN Group of Experts on Geographic Names under the agenda item 4 (a)

List of geographical names of the Republic of Azerbaijan identified as falsified

	Standartized name of geographical objects			Falsified geographical names	Administrative territorial unit to which it belongs
	Azerbaijani	Russian	English		
1	Ağbiz	Агбиз	Aghbiz	Spitakaxbur	Zangilan
2	Ağbulaq	Агбулаг	Aghbulag	Aknaxpur	Khojali
3	Ağbulaq	Агбулаг	Aghbulag	Sarnaxbur,Mismina	Khojavand
4	Ağdam	Агдам	Aghdam	Akna,Akaku	Aghdam
5	Ağdərə	Агдере	Aghdere	Mardakert	Tartar
6	Ağkənd	Агкянд	Aghkend	Spitakaşen	Khojavand
7	Almalı	Алмалы	Almali	Xındırıstan	Khojali
8	Almaliq	Алмалыг	Almalig	Avtasaq	Kalbajar
9	Arakül	Аракюль	Arakul	Arakel	Khojavand
10	Aşağı Ağcakənd	Ашагы Агджакянд	Ashaghi Aghjakend	Nerkin Şen, Şaumyanovsk	Goranboy
11	Aşağı Yemişcan	Ашагы Емишджан	Ashaghi Yemishjan	Nerkin Sznek	Khojali
12	Azıx	Азых	Azikh	Azox	Khojavand
13	Bağlıpəyə	Баглыпяя	Baghlipeye	Nor Yerenka, Nor Erkec	Kalbajar
14	Baharlı	Бахарлы	Baharli	Moşxmat	Khojali
15	Baharlı	Бахарлы	Baharli	Qarnavan	Zangilan

16	Baldırğanlı	Балдырганлы	Baldirghanli	Xtsaberd	Lachin
17	Ballica	Баллыджа	Ballija	Ayqestan, Xanasax	Khojali
18	Bartaz	Бартаз	Bartaz	Bartudax	Zangilan
19	Barxudarlı	Бархударлы	Barkhudarli	Azatamut	Gazakh
20	Binə	Биня	Bina	Tumi	Khojavand
21	Birinci Alıbəyli	Биринджи Алыбейли	Birinji Alibeyli	Yeritsvank	Zangilan
22	Böyük Tağlar	Бёюк Таглар	Boyuk Taghlar	Mets Tager	Khojavand
23	Çağadüz	Чагадюз	Chaghaduz	Sarqsaşen	Khojavand
24	Çanaqçı	Чанагчы	Chanagchi	Avetaranots	Khojali
25	Çardaqlı	Чардаглы	Chardagli	Maqavuz, Çharikatoğ	Tartar
26	Çaykənd	Чайкянд	Chaykend	Qetaşen	Goygol
27	Cəbrayıl	Джебраил	Jabrayil	Jrakan	Jabrayil
28	Cəmilli	Джамилли	Jamilli	Nor Karaçinar	Kalbajar
29	Cəmiyyət	Джамиййат	Jamiyyat	Ninqi	Khojavand
30	Cilən	Джилян	Jilan	Saraland	Khojavand
31	Çöpədərə	Чопедере	Chopadere	Sobadzor	Zangilan
32	Dağdağan	Дагдаган	Daghdaghan	Krasnı	Khojali
33	Dağdöşü	Дагдёшу	Daghdoshu	Tyak	Khojavand
34		20000 0000	Vanue - 20 20 25		Knojavana
35	Dağlıq Qarabağ	Нагорный Карабах	Nagorno-Garabagh	Artsax Saruşen	
1000	Dağyurd	Дагьюрд	Daghyurd	100000000000000000000000000000000000000	Khojali
36	Daşaltı	Дашалты	Dashalti	Karintak	Shusha
37	Daşbulaq	Дашбулаг	Dashbulag	Astxaşen	Khojali
38	Daşkənd	Дашкянд	Dashkend	Qaraşen	Khojali

39	Dəlləkli	Деллекли	Dallakli	Dalk	Zangilan
40	Dəmirçilər	Дамирчиляр	Damirchilar	Jrağhatsner	Khojali
41	Dəvədaşı	Деведашы	Devedashi	Paqosaqaler	Kalbajar
42	Divanalılar	Диваналылар	Divanalilar	Maçkalaşen	Fuzuli
43	Dovsanlı	Довшанлы	Dovshanli	Araçadzor	Kalbajar
44	Düdükçü	Дюдюкчу	Dudukchu	Kürataq	Khojavand
45	Edilli	Эдилли	Edilli	Uxtadzor	Khojavand
46	Edişə	Эдиша	Edisha	Vardaşat	Khojavand
47	Ələsgərli	Алескерли	Alasgarli	Nerimaniya	Tartar
48	Əliağalı	Алиагалы	Aliaghali	Ovtașen	Aghdam
49	Fətəlipəyə	Фаталипяя	Fatalipeye	Aparan	Lachin
50	Füzuli	Физули	Fuzuli	Varanda	Fuzuli
51	Gövtala	Гёйтала	Govtala	Qanaçtala	Shusha
52	Gülyataq	Гюльятаг	Gulyatag	Vardadzor	Tartar
53	Heşan	Гешан	Heshan	Aşan	Khojavand
54	Həsənabad	Гасанабад	Hasanabad	Bernadzor	Shusha
55	Həsənriz	Гасанриз	Hasanriz	Aterk	Kalbajar
56	Heyvalı	Хейвалы	Heyvali	Drmbon	Kalbajar
57	İstisu	Истису	İstisu	Cermacur	Kalbajar
58	Kavdadıq	Кавдадыг	Kavdadig	Karotan	Gubadli
59	Kəlbəcər	Кельбаджар	Kalbajar	Karvaçar	Kalbajar
60	Kərki	Кярки	Karki	Yerasx	Sadarak
61	Kiçik Qarabəy	Кичик Гарабей	Kichik Garabey	Moxratax	Tartar

62	Kiş	Киш	Kish	Gişi	Khojavand
63	Laçın	Лачын	Lachin	Berdzor	Lachin
64	Malıbəyli	Малыбейли	Malibeyli	Aqapnyak	Shusha
65	Malxələf	Малхалаф	Malkhalaf	Maratuk	Lachin
66	Mədətkənd	Мадаткянд	Madatkend	Madataşen	Khojali
67	Mehdibəyli	Мехтибейли	Mehdibeyli	Lusadzor	Khojali
68	Mülküdərə	Мюлкюдере	Mulkudere	Craberd	Khojavand
69	Murovdağ (dağ)	Муровдаг	Murovdagh	Mrav	
70	Muxtar	Мухтар	Mukhtar	Mxitaraşen	Khojali
71	Naxçıvanlı	Нахчыванлы	Nakhchiyanli	Naxçivanik, Navsepavan	Khojali
72	Oxçuçay (çay)	Охчучай	Okhshuchay	Voxçi	
73	Papravənd	Паправенд	Papravand	Nor Karmiravan	Aghdam
74	Pircamal	Пирджамал	Pirjamal	Vardadzor	Khojali
75	Pirlər	Пирляр	Pirlar	Xramort	Khojali
76	Qacar	Гаджар	Gajar	Civani	Fuzuli
77	Qamışlı	Гамышлы	Gamishli	Yexequut	Kalbajar
78	Qanlıkənd	Ганлыкянд	Ganlikend	Knaravan	Kalbajar
79	Qaradağlı	Гарадаглы	Garadaghli	Varanda, Nonașen	Khojavand
80	Qaragöl	Гарагёль	Garagol	Keren	Zangilan
81	Oarakənd	Гаракянд	Garakend	Berdaşen	Khojavand
82	Qarakötük	Гаракётюк	Garakotuk	İlis	Khojali
83	Qaraqoyunlu	Гарагоюнлу	Garagoyunlu	Tar, Vardabuts	Gubadli
84	Qayabaşı	Гаябашы	Gayabashi	Daqrav	Khojali

85	Qırmızı Bazar	Гырмызы Базар	Girmizi Bazar	Karmir Şuka	Khojavand
86	Qızıloba	Гызылоба	Giziloba	Karmirğyuğ	Khojali
87	Qızılqaya	Гызылгая	Gizilgaya	Arutqonaqomer,Arutuno- qomer	Kalbajar
88	Qoçbəyli	Гочбейли	Gochbeyli	Ayqestan	Khojavand
89	Qozlu	Гозлу	Gozlu	Vaquas	Kalbajar
90	Qozlukörpü	Гозлукёрпю	Gozlukorpu	Qetavan	Kalbajar
91	Qubadlı	Губадлы	Gubadli	Sanasar	Gubadli
92	Şamlı	Шамлы	Shamli	Vanatun	Zangilan
93	Sarıdaş	Сарыдаш	Saridash	Yexeqnut,Şikakor, Berdaşen	Kalbajar
94	Səlvə	Шалва	Shalva	Rev, Rev Şalva	Khojali
95	Sərdarkənd	Сярдаркянд	Sardarkend	Sardaraşen	Khojali
96	Seyidbəyli	Сеидбейли	Seyidbeyli	Xaçen, Seyidşen	Khojali
97	Sevidlər	Сеидляр	Seyidlar	Nor Xarxaput, Nor Kraşnar	Kalbajar
98	Sığnaq	Сыгнах	Sighnag	Sxnax	Khojali
99	Sırxavənd	Сырхавенд	Sirkhavand	Nor Qazançi	Aghdam
100	Six Dursun	Шых Дурсун	Shikh Dursun	Sxtorașen	Khojavand
101	Şıxarx	Шыхарх	Shikharkh	Leninavan, Maraqaşen	Tartar
102	Susa	Шуша	Shusha	Şuşi	Shusha
103	Şuşikənd	Шушикянд	Shushikend	Şoş	Khojali
104	Təzəbinə	Тезебиня	Tezebina	Noragüh	Khojali
105	Toğanalı	Тоганалы	Toghanali	Todan, Çirakidzor	Goygol
106	Tuğ	Туг	Tugh	Toğ	Khojavand
107	Turşsu	Туршсу	Turshsu	Lisaqor	Lachin

108	Ulu Qarabəy	Улу Гарабей	Ulu Garabey	Mets Şen	Tartar
109	Vəng	Вянг	Vang	Dadivank	Kalbajar
110	Vəngli	Венгли	Vangli	Vank	Kalbajar
111	Xanabad	Ханабад	Khanabad	Xnapat,Noragiuh	Khojali
112	Xankəndi	Ханкянди	Khankendi	Stepanakert	Xankəndi
113	Xanlıq	Ханлыг	Khanlig	İşxanadzor	Gubadli
114	Xanyeri	Ханъери	Khanyeri	Xantsk	Khojali
115	Xanyurdu	Ханъюрду	Khanyurdu	Xnadsax, Lernavan	Khojali
116	Xərxan	Хархан	Kharkhan	Sxtorașen	Khojavand
117	Xocalı	Ходжалы	Khojali	İvanyan, Algestan	Khojali
118	Xocavənd	Ходжавенд	Khojavand	Martuni	Khojavand
119	Yuxarı Ağcakənd	Юхары Агджакянд	Yukhari Aghjakend	Verin Şen	Goranboy
120	Yuxarı Əskipara	Юхары Эскипара	Yukhari Askipara	Voskepar	Gazakh
121	Yuxarı Məzrə	Юхары Мазра	Yukhari Mazra	Dzoraqux	Jabrayil
122	Zabux	Забух	Zabukh	Axavno	Lachin
123	Zabuxçay (çay)	Забухчай	Zabukhchay	Axovno	
124	Zoğalbulaq	Зогалбулаг	Zoghalbulag	Draxtik	Khojavand
125	Zülfüqarlı	Зулфюгарлы	Zulfugarli	Zuar	Kalbajar