

# SOUTH AFRICAN HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

National Human Rights Institution (NHRI) Report on the South African

Government's combined Ninth to Eleventh Periodic Country Report under the

International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial

Discrimination

Submitted to the United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination for consideration at the 111th Session, 27 to 28 November 2023

# Contents

Section 1: Introduction	2
1.1 South Africa's National Human Rights Institution	2
Section: 2 Article 1: Concept of and special measures to combat racial discrimination	3
2.1 General observations	3
2.2 Employment Equity Act	4
2.3 Racial Classification	6
2.4 Education	6
2.5 Housing	7
Section 3: Article 2: Policies and legislation to combat racial discrimination and special measures to develop and protect certain racial groups or individuals	8
3.1 Non-nationals	9
3.2 Indigenous people	10
3.3 Review of existing laws and policies	10
Section 4: Article 4: Condemnation and criminalisation of propaganda based on racial discrimination	11
4.1 Prevention and Combatting of Hate Crimes and Hate Speech Bill	11
4.2 Equality Courts	11
Section 6: Article 6: Effective protection and remedies against any acts of racial discrimination	12
Section 8: Article 7: Measures in the fields of teaching, education, culture, and informati to combat racial discrimination	
Section 9: General issues	13
9.1 Land	13
9.2 The July 2021 Unrest	14
9.3 The Promotion of Harmony and Diversity	15
Section 10: Concluding remarks	16

## **Section 1: Introduction**

- The South African Human Rights Commission (SAHRC or Commission) welcomes the South African government's State report (State report) to the United Nations (UN) Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (Committee).
- 2. The SAHRC appreciates the opportunity to submit a National Human Rights Institution (NHRI) report. The SAHRC's report highlights specific recent developments to provide the Committee with a comprehensive insight regarding the implementation of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (ICERD or Convention) in the country. The SAHRC points out activities, complaints, investigations, and research that the institution has undertaken in matters relating to the rights espoused under the Convention.

# 1.1 South Africa's National Human Rights Institution

- **3.** The SAHRC is mandated by Section 184 of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996 (Constitution), which states that:
  - 184. (1) The South African Human Rights Commission must -
  - (a) promote, respect for human rights and a culture of human rights;
  - (b) promote the protection, development, and attainment of human rights; and
  - (c) monitor and assess the observance of human rights in the Republic.
- 4. Regarding the promotion of international human rights law standards, Section 13(1)(b)(vi) of the South African Human Rights Commission Act 40 of 2013 (SAHRC Act) specifically mandates the SAHRC to monitor the implementation of, and compliance with, international and regional human rights instruments. It is worth noting that the SAHRC is currently advocating for amendments to the SAHRC Act to further strengthen its ability to adequately discharge its mandate.
- 5. As an NHRI, the SAHRC is additionally guided by the Principles relating to the status of National Institutions (the Paris Principles) that were adopted by the United Nations General Assembly in 1993. The SAHRC has consistently been accredited with an "Astatus" by the Global Alliance of National Human Rights Institutions (GANHRI) since 1999.

6. Since the submission of its previous NHRI report to the Committee, the SAHRC has continued to promote, protect, and monitor and assess the observance of human rights in the country. In this regard, during the period 2017 to 2021, the SAHRC has observed that equality related complaints are the highest single-category of complaints received by the institution, constituting 14% of all complaints received.¹ Further disaggregation of the data reveals that 60% of all equality-based complaints related to allegations of racial

discrimination.<sup>2</sup>

7. Financial constraints have limited the SAHRC in expanding its reach to the less urbanised areas of South Africa. Currently, the Commission holds offices in the large cities in each of the nine provinces of the country. The Commission needs to expand its reach throughout the country to ensure easier access of its services to the public. The SAHRC requires a larger workforce but lacks the ability to expand in this area due to fiscal constraints. The Commission as at 31 March 2023, had a workforce of 168 persons servicing the entire country.

Recommendations

**8.** The South African government should allocate appropriate financial resources to enable the SAHRC to discharge its mandate effectively.

9. Additional resources are required to enable the SAHRC to reach peri-urban areas.

Section: 2 Article 1: Concept of and special measures to combat racial discrimination

2.1 General observations

**10.** The SAHRC acknowledges the South African government's efforts in adopting special measures to eradicate racial discrimination. However, South Africa remains the most racially divided and unequal country in the world.<sup>3</sup> There is a need for the State to

\_

SAHRC, Trends Analysis Report 2020-2021 (2022) p.50 available at https://www.sahrc.org.za/home/21/files/SAHRC%20TAR%202020-21%20FINAL.PDF,

SAHRC, Trends Analysis Report 2020-2021 (2022) p.54 available at https://www.sahrc.org.za/home/21/files/SAHRC%20TAR%202020-21%20FINAL.PDF,

<sup>3</sup> Available at <a href="https://www.worldbank.org/en/country/southafrica/overview">https://www.worldbank.org/en/country/southafrica/overview</a>

continue developing special measures for equitable realisation of equality and strengthening implementation thereof.

11. Recognising the equity measures required by Article 1(4) of ICERD, the SAHRC draws the Committee's attention to the importance of explicit disaggregation of vulnerable groups to ensure visibility of minorities and/or marginalised groups. Generic classifications have the effect of erasing the unique identities, experiences, and results in the oppression of minority/marginalised groups.<sup>4</sup> Article 1(4) of ICERD necessitates the recognition of the diversity nuances, so that measures taken to eradicate discrimination do not only benefit certain groups while perpetuating the marginalisation of other groups.

**12.** The SAHRC notes the State's consideration of the Committee's recommendation on statistical data as contained in paragraphs 22 to 23 of the State report. However, the SAHRC is concerned about the entrenched and continued unequal distribution of income and resources along racial lines, that continue to maintain unequal access to resources between the poor Black<sup>5</sup> majority and the rich white minority populations.

## 2.2 Employment Equity Act

**13.** The SAHRC notes the State's special measures in the form of the Employment Equity Act 55 of 1998. In April 2023, the Employment Equity Amendment Act (Amendment Act) of 2022 was enacted. <sup>6</sup> The Amendment Act maintains the generalised definition in which "designated groups" means "Black people, women, and people with disabilities."<sup>7</sup>

**14.** In terms of Section 15 A(3) of the Amendment Act, the Minister may set different numerical targets for different occupational levels, sub-sectors, or regions. Section 15 requires that such targets may only be gazetted following consultation with the relevant sectors. The proposed regulations focus on top and senior management as well as

M Pinto 'The Right to Culture, the Right to Dispute, and the Right to Exclude. A New Perspective on Minorities within Minorities' (2015) 4 Ratio Juris pp. 521-539.

<sup>5 &</sup>quot;Black people" is a generic term which means Africans, Coloureds (meaning people who are of mixed race) and Indians.

Employment Equity Amendment Act No 4 of 2022, available at <a href="https://www.gov.za/sites/default/files/gcis\_document/202304/48418employment-equity-amendment-act42022.pdf">https://www.gov.za/sites/default/files/gcis\_document/202304/48418employment-equity-amendment-act42022.pdf</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Ibid, Sec 1.

professionally qualified, skilled levels and people with disabilities. It should be noted that this provision has been highly contested in South Africa and remains subject to litigation.

- 15. The Commission is of the view that there remains a need for increased transformation in several sub-sectors which continue to marginalise previously disadvantaged groups, particularly at senior levels. The proposed method of instituting targets is welcomed as it allows for specific focus on sub-sectors, or regions that have made slow strides in transformation.
- 16. The SAHRC notes that the Amendment Act deleted the annual turnover criteria in the definition of 'designated employer'.<sup>8</sup> The amended definition means employers with staffing of less than 50 people, whether they generate the same or more revenue than employers with over 50 staff members, are not obligated to comply with "designated employer" obligations such as, *inter alia*, developing and implementing employment equity plans in alignment with affirmative action objectives. The SAHRC views this deletion as a setback for the socio-economic transformation objective as it allows some employers with means to implement affirmative action to ignore the national socio-economic transformation needs merely because they employ less than 50 people.
- 17. It should be noted that the State report does not provide detailed and disaggregated data, as requested by the Committee, in paragraph 15 of its Concluding Observations. The importance of data is explained in paragraph 14 of the Concluding Observations, regarding the impact Broad-Based Black Economic Empowerment (B-BBEE) has in advancing the purpose of Article 1 on special measures.

### Recommendations

- **18.** The State should provide disaggregated and comparative data that represents all categories of people in accordance with correct classification of groups.
- **19.** The State should commission an empirical study on the impact of B-BBEE and whether this policy is effective in advancing equality.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Ibid.

## 2.3 Racial Classification

20. The SAHRC notes the State's progressive approach in allowing citizens to racially self-identify to preserve their right to identity and dignity. However, the SAHRC is concerned that self-identification, on its own, does not achieve the sought objective. If the identity options available are only within the bounds of the classification introduced by apartheid, then people such as, indigenous groups are officially not recognised.

### Recommendations

- **21.** The State should urgently take measures to recognise the Khoi-San people explicitly as a community and as a distinct category of people.
- **22.** The State should provide information on how the apartheid-era racial classification has been or is being transformed, to ensure progressive inclusion of all the diverse racial groups.

# 2.4 Education

23. The SAHRC recognises the progress made by the State in ensuring access to education for all children living in South Africa. The SAHRC further notes that the State contributes substantial financial investment towards the attainment of education. The SAHRC emphasises the importance of assessing the quality of basic education and taking the necessary steps to address unfair resource disparities among races in the country. The SAHRC notes that the quality of education differs based on race. The white population (which accounts for 20% of the population), enjoy a higher quality of education compared to the majority population comprised of black people. This inequality is demonstrated by, inter alia, unequally qualified teachers, unequally / under-resourced schools, and a large ratio of teachers to students. This unequal state of the quality of education perpetuates the apartheid exclusion and deprivation that resulted in unequal education outcomes and access to economic opportunities.

F de Clercq 'The Persistence of South African Educational Inequalities: The need for Understanding and Relying on Analytical Frameworks' (2022) 24 Education as Change.

### Recommendation

**24.** The State should report on its progress in effectively transforming the education system so that it is inclusive and affords all learners the same benefits on an equal basis.

# 2.5 Housing

- 25. The SAHRC notes in paragraph 32 that the State has incorrectly cited Section 25 of the Constitution as the right to housing, which is enshrined in Section 26 of the Constitution. The SAHRC acknowledges the government housing subsidies alluded to in paragraph 33 of the State's report. However, the SAHRC is concerned that policies on the provision of housing, do not give due recognition to the racial patterns of access, ownership use, and enjoyment of well-located affordable housing.
- 26. The legacy of forced removals and spatial segregation mirrors South Africa's social stratification presently. To rexample, urban areas are organised in a manner which places affluent and well-serviced neighbourhoods closer to the economic hubs. Though these affluent neighbourhoods are no longer labelled 'whites only', and people of other races are legally allowed to live in them, they remain inaccessible to the majority of Black people due to among others, their lack of resources to rent or own property in such neighbourhoods.
- 27. Though protective rights have improved vulnerable people's position, they remain trumped by the notion of private property rights that are largely held by a white minority.<sup>13</sup> The system continues to force the majority of Black people out of the centre where resources, opportunities, and amenities are concentrated into the unsafe periphery outskirts.<sup>14</sup> Poor Black people walk the line between being overpoliced in affluent areas

M Strauss 'A historical exposition of spatial injustice and segregated urban settlement in South Africa' (2019) 25 Fundamina, pgs 135-168 available at <a href="https://dx.doi.org/10.17159/2411-7870/2019/v25n2a6">https://dx.doi.org/10.17159/2411-7870/2019/v25n2a6</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Centre for Human Rights (2021) "Spatial (in)justice and the post-apartheid state." University of Pretoria.

<sup>12</sup> Ibid

N Andrew 'South Africa's Land Ownership System as a Barrier to Social Transformation: Land Conflict and the Forced Displacement of Black Farm Dweller Families' (2020) 243 Revue internationale des études du développement pp. 233-261 available at <a href="https://doi.org/10.3917/ried.243.0233">https://doi.org/10.3917/ried.243.0233</a>

SERI 'Informal Settlements and Human Rights in South Africa' (2018), available at <a href="https://www.ohchr.org/sites/default/files/Documents/Issues/Housing/Informal">https://www.ohchr.org/sites/default/files/Documents/Issues/Housing/Informal</a> Settlements/SERI.pdf.

and in historically white neighbourhoods, as compared to the densely populated townships and squatter camps where they may live.<sup>15</sup>

### Recommendation

**28.** The Committee should encourage the State to collaborate with a broad range of stakeholders, including the SAHRC, and civil society organisations (CSOs) regarding housing and land issues.

# Section 3: Article 2: Policies and legislation to combat racial discrimination and special measures to develop and protect certain racial groups or individuals

- 29. The SAHRC welcomes the approval of the National Action Plan to Combat Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance (NAP). The Commission further commends the State for the preliminary work undertaken towards the implementation of the targets set in the NAP.
- 30. In May 2022, the State convened a National Conference to commemorate the 20<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the Third World Conference against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance (WCAR20). During the conference, the Department of Justice and Constitutional Development (DOJCD) launched its Baseline study<sup>16</sup> which aims to determine the levels of racism, xenophobia, and discrimination based on sexual orientation, gender identity and expression, racial incidents inter-racial relations and perceptions of national identity. The study found that racial discrimination remains the most prominent form of discrimination experienced by people in South Africa with 47% of people indicating that they have experienced racial discrimination in workplace.<sup>17</sup>

K Harrisberg 'South Africans Protest Police Brutality Against Poor, Black Communities Under Lockdown' (2020) Global Citizen, available at <a href="https://www.globalcitizen.org/en/content/">https://www.globalcitizen.org/en/content/</a> south-africa-police-brutality-poor-black-protest/

Department of Justice and Constitutional Development, Baseline Study to Determine Levels of Racism, Anti-Foreigner Sentiment, Homophobia, Racial Incidents, Inter Racial Relations and Perceptions of National Identity (2022) available at https://www.justice.gov.za/nap/docs/20220523-WCAR-Booklet.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Ibid, p 2.

## 3.1 Non-nationals

- **31.** Despite South Africa's plethora of laws prohibiting unfair discrimination against non-nationals (foreign nationals) within the country, xenophobia persists. In 2021, South Africa experienced a rise of organised xenophobia through some members of society establishing what was called 'Operation Dudula'. This operation sought to 'push out' immigrants, as it blames non-nationals for South Africa's socio-economic woes such as high levels of unemployment and the high incidence of drug abuse.<sup>18</sup>
- 32. The SAHRC commends the State for taking legal action against the Operation Dudula leader and its members for their incitement of xenophobic attacks. <sup>19</sup> However, the State has not sufficiently addressed the socio-economic challenges, including continued economic inequality, which fuel the hatred for non-nationals. Policing in townships, rural areas and informal settlements remains inadequate and often people resort to taking the law into their own hands.
- **33.** The State has continued to take regulatory measures to advance the protection of the rights of non-nationals including, *inter alia*, the amendment of Circular 1 of 2019 in accordance with the *Centre for Child Law and Others v Minister of Basic Education and Others* judgement that ruled against the denial of admission of undocumented non-national learners, thereby strengthening the right of non-national children to access state-funded schools.<sup>20</sup> It should be noted that the SAHRC was party to these proceedings.

#### Recommendations

- **34.** The State should report on measures taken to address insecurity, and socio-economic inequalities to combat xenophobic attacks especially in townships and informal settlements.
- **35.** The State should provide detailed information on the impact its current measures have had on the protection of the rights of non-national persons.

N Masiko-Mpaka 'Xenophobia Rears its Ugly Head in South Africa: Foreigners Scapegoated for Country's Problems' (2023) Human Rights Watch, available at <a href="https://www.hrw.org/news/2023/09/28/xenophobia-rears-its-ugly-head-south-africa">https://www.hrw.org/news/2023/09/28/xenophobia-rears-its-ugly-head-south-africa</a>

S Feketha & N Nkosi 'Five Dudula members arrested for harassing migrant vendors' (2022) *The Sowetan*, available at <a href="https://www.sowetanlive.co.za/news/south-africa/2022-03-09-five-dudula-members-arrested-for-harassing-migrant-vendors/">https://www.sowetanlive.co.za/news/south-africa/2022-03-09-five-dudula-members-arrested-for-harassing-migrant-vendors/</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Centre for Child Law and Others v Minister of Basic Education and Others (2840/2017) [2019] ZAECGHC 126.

# 3.2 Indigenous people

- **36.** The State report acknowledges the human rights concerns raised by the SAHRC Report on the National Hearing on the Human Rights Situation of the Khoi and San peoples in South Africa. However, the State report does not provide information on measures it has undertaken to address and resolve the acknowledged concerns.
- 37. The Traditional and Khoi-San Leadership Act (TKSL Act), as stated in paragraph 78 of the State report, was promulgated to assist in the process of restoration of the dignity of the Khoi-San people through the advancement of the integrity and legitimacy of the institutions of traditional and Khoi-San leadership, in line with customary law and practices.
- 38. However, it should be noted that the TKSL Act was subject to a Constitutional court challenge in the case of *Mogale and Others v the Speaker of the National Assembly and Others*.<sup>21</sup> The Court found that the State had failed to comply with its constitutional obligation to facilitate public consultation before passing the TKSL Act thus the TKSL Act was found to be unconstitutional. The Constitutional Court has given the State 24 months to re-enact the TKSL Act.<sup>22</sup> This judgement and its consequences are justifiably not in the State report as the judgement was handed down in May 2023, after the State report was submitted.

### Recommendation

**39.** An update is required about the State's progress in the re-enacting the TKSL Act.

## 3.3 Review of existing laws and policies

**40.** Though the Commission is appreciative of the numerous policy and legislative measures undertaken by the State in the period under consideration, it remains concerned that the State has not reported on its efforts in respect of Article 2 (1)(c) of the ICERD. Given the historical background to the laws and policies in South Africa, it is pertinent that the State

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> (CCT 73/22) [2023] ZACC 14

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Ibid

takes targeted steps to rescind or nullify Apartheid era, or colonial-era laws and policies that have the effect of racial discrimination.

### Recommendation

**41.** The State should report on measures taken to nullify or rescind historical laws that have the effect of racial discrimination.

# Section 4: Article 4: Condemnation and criminalisation of propaganda based on racial discrimination

# 4.1 Prevention and Combatting of Hate Crimes and Hate Speech Bill

- **42.** The SAHRC notes the State's submission in respect of the Prevention and Combatting of Hate Crimes and Hate Speech Bill (the Bill) and that much progress has been made in the development and passing of the Bill. The SAHRC has also made inputs to the Bill in both Houses of Parliament.<sup>23</sup>
- **43.** The SAHRC observes that paragraphs 96 to 102 of the State report, focus on the hate crimes component of the Bill and not the "hate speech" component. However, the latter is critical as the hate speech component of the Bill has been subject to scrutiny from the public (and the SAHRC), during the public participation processes before Parliament.

# Recommendation

**44.** The State should provide further information and context regarding the hate speech component of the Prevention and Combatting of Hate Crimes and Hate Speech Bill.

# 4.2 Equality Courts

**45.** The SAHRC concurs with paragraphs 103 and 104 of the State report on the public benefit offered by the Equality Courts. However, the SAHRC is concerned about the lack

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Initial submissions were made to the Portfolio Committee on Justice and Correctional Services of the National Assembly in October 2021, and further submissions were made to the National Council of Provinces in May 2023, followed by an oral presentation before the Select Committee in September 2023.

of public awareness of the courts' existence. Furthermore, the State omits to provide detailed information on the public use of Equality Courts and the impact thereof.

46. The SAHRC has provided information to the South African Judicial Education Institute (SAJEI) on the need for SAJEI to include training on social context for all judicial officers so that they are more aware when dealing with diverse people appearing before their courts. The engagement with the SAJEI revealed that there is insufficient social context content in the training provided to judicial officers. This is concerning as social context training could influence equality and just outcomes at courts, which can only be adequately approached through ongoing diversity education and awareness in a country as diverse and polarised as South Africa.

### Recommendations

- **47.** The State should enhance its Equality Court's promotional and awareness measures.
- **48.** The State should provide a detailed report of the number of judicial officials that have been trained on Equality Courts in comparison to the number of those who have not received any training.
- **49.** The SAJEI should develop on going diversity education and social context training for all Judicial Officers.

# Section 6: Article 6: Effective protection and remedies against any acts of racial discrimination

50. The SAHRC notes the efforts by the State to amend Section 10 of Promotion of Equality and Prevention of Unfair Discrimination Act 4 of 2000 (PEPUDA), relating to the prohibition of hate speech. This is to bring the Act in line with the Qwelane Constitutional Court Judgement which strengthened the protection of the rights of LGBTI+ community. The proposed amendments proposed by the Constitutional Court will indeed go a long way towards improving the understanding of hate speech by all relevant parties.

# Recommendation

**51.** The State should provide an update on the amendment of Section 10 of PEPUDA.

# Section 8: Article 7: Measures in the fields of teaching, education, culture, and information to combat racial discrimination

**52.** The SAHRC notes that the State report does not include an intention to introduce compulsory human rights and diversity education in the formal school curriculum, despite the acknowledgment in paragraph 151, regarding the persistent challenges of racism and inequality in schools. The Commission views this as critical to ensuring that racial prejudices are addressed at a younger age and that diverse mindsets are developed through the schooling system.

### Recommendation

**53.** The State should include compulsory human rights and diversity education subjects in the schooling system both at school and tertiary levels.

### Section 9: General issues

### 9.1 Land

54. The SAHRC is of the view that the intersectionality of race, class, and gender in land related issues should remain a steadfast focus of transformative social policy. The exclusion of women in land ownership persists with Black African women in control of less than 1% of agricultural land use in a country where access to productive resources is tied to access to land.<sup>24</sup> Furthermore, disaggregated data on land ownership highlights racial disparities among women.<sup>25</sup> Evidence shows that women have not been afforded equal consideration in land restitution programmes due to entrenched systems of patriarchy.

N Tekwa & JO Adesina 'Land, Water, and Gender Questions in South Africa: A Transformative Social Policy Perspective' (2023) 12 Agrarian South: Journal of Political Economy, 72-97 available at https://doi.org/10.1177/22779760231151517

<sup>25</sup> Ibid.

#### Recommendation

**55.** In its implementation of land restitution programs, the State should take an equitable approach with priority being given to Black women, particularly African women who suffer disadvantages in respect to racial discrimination, as well as, through pervasive patriarchy, in their communities.

# 9.2 The July 2021 Unrest

- 56. Between 8 and 17 July 2021, South Africa experienced a devastating unrest (July Unrest) with violence and looting taking place across two provinces in the country (namely, KwaZulu-Natal and Gauteng Provinces). Over 350 lives were lost due to the unrest and its related violence, which was characterised by widespread destruction of public and private property and the loss of billions of Rands to South Africa's economy. The events also threatened fragile race relations between neighbouring communities. These incidents of unrest raised numerous questions and concerns about the State's ability to protect the public from harm and assert law and order. Furthermore, the State's ability to alleviate deep poverty, which may have been a factor that fuelled the unrest.
- **57.** On 23 July 2021, in the immediate aftermath of the unrest, the SAHRC hosted an *Imbizo* (Dialogue) as part of its efforts to understand and respond to the unrest and the subsequent human rights violations arising from it. <sup>26</sup>
- **58.** Following the *Imbizo*, the Commission subsequently undertook two further initiatives. Namely, (i) commencing a National Investigative Hearing into the July Unrest, and (ii) conducting an extensive consultative process which culminated in the Social Harmony through National Effort (SHiNE) initiative.
- 59. The SAHRC National Investigative Hearing into the July Unrest commenced in November 2021 and sought to investigate the causes of the unrest and assess its impact on human rights. The investigative hearing further focused on the causes of the alleged racially motivated attacks and killings in the two provinces; the causes of the apparent lapses in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> The report of the Imbizo is available on the Commission's website, available at https://www.sahrc.org.za/home/21/files/Imbizo%20-%20Report%202021.pdf.

law and order, and failure of the various state security agencies; the role of private security companies in the unrest; and the social, economic, spatial and political factors prevalent in the various affected areas and the extent to which these played a role in the unrest.<sup>27</sup>

60. The SAHRC commends the State for its immediate response to the July Unrest through the establishment of an Expert Panel appointed by the President. The expert panel subsequently published its report in November 2023.<sup>28</sup> The report identifies inherited high levels of poverty and deep inequality as key challenges that influenced the unrest. It found that the responses to the violence in some communities "exposed deep-seated racial prejudices and tensions indicating that there is much to be done to achieve racial justice and greater social cohesion."<sup>29</sup> The panel recommended a need for:

Social cohesion and support programmes, including solidarity networks that bridge the racial and class divides in society must be supported by all social partners, to ensure that there is accountability, restorative justice and compensation of those who have suffered harm through the violence.<sup>30</sup>

### Recommendations

- **61.** The State should provide an update on its efforts to promote social cohesion in the wake of the July Unrest.
- **62.** The State should provide information activities that it is doing on social cohesion.

### 9.3 The Promotion of Harmony and Diversity

**63.** The SAHRC's SHiNE initiative<sup>31</sup> was conceptualised to promote social harmony in South Africa, through positive action and dialogue among all who live in South Africa. It encourages self-reflection, family meetings and dialogues aimed at learning about the diverse cultures, belief systems and practices of fellow colleagues at the workplace and in other organisations. The initiative encourages humane conduct and actions as part of the National Effort.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> The report is currently being finalised and will be published in due course.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Available at https://www.thepresidency.gov.za/content/report-expert-panel-july-2021-civil-unrest

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Report of the Expert Panel into the July 2021 Civil Unrest, (2021) para 7.3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Ibid. para 7.9

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Available at <a href="https://sahrc.org.za/index.php/shine-home">https://sahrc.org.za/index.php/shine-home</a>

- **64.** The emphasis on self-reflection is especially important for the purpose of cohesion as it is a mechanism through which every individual is challenged to take responsibility for ones own contribution to disharmony, and to recognise one's own diverse nature and consider how one would want to be treated if one walked in the shoes of the next person.
- **65.** The National Effort's approach to building harmony can be implemented in all social and professional settings. The SHiNE project's is social-centred and seeks to promote a more inclusive society through self-awareness, positive dialogue and compassion.
- **66.** The SAHRC believes that the State's efforts to achieve social cohesion, will significantly benefit from the National Effort which complements its efforts to build national solidarity and build resilient and diverse communities.

## Recommendation

**67.** The State should formally collaborate and resource the Social Harmony through National Effort (SHiNE) as an important measure to foster respectful tolerance and harmony.

## **Section 10: Concluding remarks**

68. The SAHRC acknowledges the strides the State has made to advance human rights protection and combat unfair discrimination. Furthermore, the SAHRC appreciates the Committee's commitment to monitor and guide South Africa's progress in building a human rights-centred society. The SAHRC encourages the State to uphold and enforce human rights as envisaged by the ICERD and therefore encourages the State to implement the recommendations emanating from the Committee.

\*\*\*