COMPLEMENTARY INFORMATION ON

THE RESPONSES BY THE GOVERNMENT OF THE UNITED REPUBLIC OF TANZANIA TO THE LIST OF ISSUES IN RELATION TO THE COMBINED 3^{RD} TO 5^{TH} PERIODIC REPORTS TO THE COMMITTEE ON THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD

Prepared and submitted to the Committee on the Rights of Child $By \ Tanzania \ Child \ Rights \ Forum \ (TCRF)$

- 1. On 15 October 2014 the Government of the United Republic of Tanzania (the State Party) submitted its respnses to the List of Issues raised by the Committee on the Rights of the Child (CROC) after it conducted a pre-session in respect of the State Party's 3rd to 5th consolidated reports to the CROC submitted in January 2012. The Tanzania Child Rights Forum (TCRF), on behalf of its 145 members, would like to commend the State Party for its concerted efforts to ensure that the Convention on the Rights of the Child is being increasingly implemented. TCRF also commend the State Party for its sincerity in the formulation of the responses to the CROC's List of Issues and for its involvement of CSOs in the preparation of the same.
- 2. Furthermore, the State Party is applauded for its positive efforts to ensure that the rights of the child are enshrined in the envisaged constitution. It should be noted that on 2 October 2014 the Constituent Assembly (the CA) adopted the "Proposed Constitution" by the required two-thirds majority and handed it over the President of the State Party and his Zanzibar counterpart on 8 October 2014. The Proposed Constitution, which is going to be voted for or against in a referendum scheduled to take place in April 2015, contains a very progressive Bill of Rights that guarantees, *inter alia*, the rights of the child and women. TCRF sees this as a very solid foundation for the implementation of the rights enshrined in the Convention.
- 3. However, there several areas where in the State Party has not provided sufficient information. TCRF, therefore, wishes to point out those areas, as herein below:

PART I

(a) Coordination

(i) Ineffective Coordination Mechanism at the Union Level

4. There is yet to be put in place an effective coordination mechanisms between the two ministries (for Zanzibar and for the Mainland¹), as children issues are currently not Union Matters.

Recommendation

5. The State Party should ensure that child rights and welfare issues are made Union Matters so that they could be dealt with under one Union ministry, which will ensure smooth and effective coordination amongst stakeholders.

(ii) Inadequate Recourse Allocation to Implement Various Action Plans and Strategies

6. Although the State Party has made a number of progress in the implementation and coordination of various existing national action plans, strategies, programmes and Child laws, the State Party, it hs not yet effectively been able to allocate sufficient resources to implement these initiatives.

Recommendation

¹ Ministry of Community Development Gender and Children (MCDGC) with jurisdiction in Tanzania Mainland and Ministry of Empowerment, Social Welfare, Youth, Women and Children (MESWYWC) that has jurisdiction over Zanzibar.

7. The State should allocate adequate budget and ensure that concerned personnel have teh requisite capacity to facilitate the implementation and coordination of various existing national action plans, strategies, programmes and Child laws, the State Party.

(iii) The Need for Full Implementation of Child Law and Regulations in Zanzibar

- 8. The State Party is commended for enacting the Zanzibar Children's Act (2011) and for developing several sets of Regulations.² The State Party is also commended for establishing the Zanzibar Children's Court and for establishing 6 One-stop Centres in each Region of Zanzibar as well as for estalishing Gender and Children's Desks in every police stattion. However, there are several challenges facing the State Party facing in this regard, including:
 - (a) the Children's Court is not yet established in the four regions in Zanzibar³;
 - (b) although Regional Magistrates have been designated to have jurisdiction to entertain and determine cases concerning children in regions where there is Children's Court, the courts in these regions are not child friendly as compared to the one at Vuga in Unguja. The Regional Magistrates have also not been trained to specifically deal with children's cases and they do not have requisite facilities to enable them handle cases involving children in accordance with the Children's Act;
 - (c) it has taken the State Party a long time to adopt rules of procedure to regulate the conduct and proceedings in the Children's Court;
 - (d) there is inadequate budgetary allocation towards the implementation of the Children's Act and other related actional plans, strategies, and initiaves; and
 - (e) there is poor coordination amongst the Children's Court, the One-stop Centres and the Gender and Children's Desks. There is also no standard operating procedures to guide the conduct of these important child protection institutions.

Recommendations

- 9. The State Party is urged to address the foregoing shortcomings within a prescribed timeframe. In particular, the State Party is urged to undertake measures to ensure that:
 - (a) the Children's Court is established in the four remaining regions in Zanzibar4;
 - (b) where Regional Magistrates have been designated to have jurisdiction to entertain and determine cases concerning children in regions where there is Children's Court, the courts should be made child friendly in the same manner as it is in the Children's Court;

² These include draft Regulations on Child Protection, draft Regulations on Children's Residential Homes, draft Regulations on Adoption, draft Regulations on Day Care Centres and draft Regulations for effective function of children's court that was established in 2013.

³ Currently, the Children's Court is housed in the Zanzibar High Court premises at Vuga in Unguja. The other four regions, particularly those in Pemba, do not have a children's court. This makes it practically impossible for cases concerning children to be referred to the Children's Court in Zanzibar.

⁴ Currently, the Children's Court is housed in the Zanzibar High Court premises at Vuga in Unguja. The other four regions, particularly those in Pemba, do not have a children's court. This makes it practically impossible for cases concerning children to be referred to the Children's Court in Zanzibar.

- (c) the Regional Magistrates should be trained to specifically deal with children's cases and they should supplied with adequate and requisite facilities to enable them handle cases involving children in accordance with the Children's Act;
- (d) the State Party should expedite the adoption of rules of procedure to regulate the conduct and proceedings in the Children's Court;
- (e) there should be adequate budgetary allocation towards the implementation of the Children's Act and other related actional plans, strategies, and initiaves; and
- (f) there should be put in place an effective coordination amongst the Children's Court, the One-stop Centres and the Gender and Children's Desks. This should be but ressed with the adoption of standard operating procedures to guide the conduct of these important child protection institutions.

(b) Allocation of Resources

10. Although the State Party has acknowledged that it still faces a major challenge in respect of minimum resources that are available for the implementation of the Convention, it has not indicated how it going to address this challenge. It has also not been able to explain how it is going to mitigate its over-reliance on the respective UN agencies and development partners support.

Recommendation

11. The State Party is urged to undertake concrete measures that will ensure that its budgetary plans effectively and seriously take into account issues relating to children; and, in particular, the implementation of the Convention and other child related international human rights treaties. It has also to formulate strategies on how it will ensure that its budgetary allocations are greater than the support and contributions it receives from the UN agencies in implementing the Convention.

(c) Measures to Enhance Capacity of Professionals Working with Children

12. The State Party is commended for its efforts to ensure that it builds the capacity of professionals working with children in various sectors in light of the Convention. However, the statistical information provided by the State Party does not indicate the percentage of the trained personnel in light of the total number of personnel available in each sector. The statistical information also does indicate the geographical locations from which the trained personnel came.

13. In addition, the State Party has not indicated whether or not the efforts to capacity build its personnel working with children are sustainable – i.e. are they long-term or short-term strategies? is funding sourced from within or outside the State Party's budgetary plans?

Recommendations

14. The State Party is urged to address the foregoing shortcomings, by particulary undertaking the folliwing measures:

(a) the State Party should provide statistical information dissegragated by percentage of the trained and untrained personnel, gender, subject, and geographical locations;

(b) the State Party should ensure that child rights are made a compulsory subject in all levels of basic schooling as well as in tertiary education, particularly in higher learning institutions training lawyers, educationists/teachers, social workers, and law enforcement officials – as a long-term strategy to enhance capacity of professionals working with children; and

(c) as a short-term strategy, the State Party should undertake concrete measures to ensure that professionals working with children who are already employed are adequately capacity built – whereby it should ensure that it allocates adequate funding from its own coffers, supplemented by funding from other sources.

(d) Information on Budgetary Allocations for Children

15. The State Party is commended for its candid efforts to provide budgetary allocations concerning budgeting for children every sector in light of the sectoral Medium Term Expenditure Review Frameworks (MTEF's). The State Party is also commended for its admission that the MTEF's does not provide separate budgetary information for children, which is only done in respect of certain ministries like the MCDGC.

Recommendation

16. The State Party is urged to review its fiscal policies and budgeting guidelines so as to ensure that every ministry/sector touching on issues relating to indicates specific budgetary allocations for children.

(e) Measures to ensure that extractive industries are translated into investment prioritizing children

17. The State Party is applauded for undertaking varuous measures to ensure that extractive industries are translated into inestment prioritising children. However, it is to be noted from the State Party's responses to the List of Issues that these efforts are founded in pilot projects only, which are located in few areas so they do not benefit as many children as possible. The State Party has also yet to ensure that there are policy, legislative and/or administrative measures that would ensure that extractive industries are translated into inestment prioritising children.

Recomendations

18. The State Party is called upon to undertake concrete measures to ensure that there are policy, legislative and/or administrative frameworks that would ensure that extractive industries are translated into inestment prioritising children. It should ensure that such measures are rolled out in all areas in its jurisdiction where extractive industries exist so that all children positively benefit from this investment.

(f) Measures to Regulate the Impact of the Operations and Activities of Business Enterprises on Children's Rights

19. The State Party is applaued for its efforts undertaken to regulate the impact of the operations and activities of business enterprises on the rights of the child in both Zanzibar and in the Mainland. However, there are yet to be put in place concrete legislative and administrative measures to regulate the impact of the operations and activities of business enterprises on children's rights, particularly in mining, plantation, fishing, and liqueur industries. There are yet to be undertaken serious prosecutions of those business operators who indulge children in their operations and activities as well as there is no monitoring and inspection system to check the operations and activities of these business enterprises.

Recommendations

20. The State Party is called upon to undertake concrete legislative and administrative measures to regulate the impact of the operations and activities of business enterprises on children's rights, particularly in mining, plantation, fishing, and liqueur industries. In addition, should ensure that it enhances its investigation, prosecutorial and adjudicatory bodies so that

they could undertake effective prosecutions of those business operators who indulge children in their operations and activities that have a negative impact on children's rights. It should also establish and strengthen a monitoring and inspection system to check the operations and activities of these business enterprises.

(f) Information on the Amendment of the Law of Marriage Act

21. The State Party is commended for its efforts to ensure that the definition of thechild is constitutionalised and further that the Law of Marriage Act (1971) will be amended to harmonise it with the new Constitution of the United Republic of Tanzania to be adopted at a nationwide referendum scheduled to take place in April 2015. The State Party is applauded for undertaking several administrative measures aimed at, *inter alia*, raising awareness of the negative consequences of child marriages.

22. However, these measures have not been rolled out in all parts of the country, particularly in rural areas. The implementation of these measures is hampered by such factors such as the over-reliance on funding from development partners and lack of adequate, specialised personnel to carry out these initiatives. Long-held cultural norms and beliefs leaning towards child marriage are still prevalent, particularly in rural areas, which adversely impact on the implementation of these efforts.

Recommendations

23. The State Party is urged to ensure that the foregoing administrative measures it has undertaken on a pilot basis should be rolled out to all parts of the countr, particularly in rural areas. It is also urged to not only allocate adequate resources to implement these initiatives, but also combat long-held adverse cultural norms and beliefs leaning towards child marriage are still prevalent, particularly in rural areas.

(\mathbf{g}) Measures to Eliminate Discrimination and Social Stigma against Pregnant Girls and Teenage Mothers

24. The State Party is commended for undertaking several measures to raise awareness of the negative consequences of child marriages and to eliminate discrimination and social stigma against pregnant girls and teenage mothers, children with disabilities, children with HIV/AIDS and street children in the Mainland, in addition to the two child laws.

Recommendations

25. The State Party is urged to expedite the preparation and adoption of a policy on reinstating pregnant school girls back to school in the Mainland. It should also introduce to every part of the country its programme to capacitate families in income generation activities (IGAs). Furthermore, the establishment of 417 Gender and Children Desks at Police Stations at Regional and District level should go hand in hand with the provision of specialised training to personnel manning these desks and provision of adequate requisite facilities and equipment. The State Party is also urged to ensure it undertakes regular rapid assessments of Street Children throughout the country in order to enable it and relevant stakeholders to understand the specific needs and challenges facing these children and how to formulate relevant strategies to address these challenges.

26. In respect of Zanzibar, the State Party is commended for undertakeing several mesures, including enacting the HIV/AIDS (Prevention and Management) Act in 2013⁵; and the

⁵ Act No. 18 of 2013. Under Sections 32, 33, and 34, this law, *inter alia*, addresses the issue of discrimination, social stigma, education, person with disabilities and affected with HIV/AIDS.

establishment of six One Stop Centres at Chakechake, Wete, Mnazi Mmoja, Makunduchi, Kivunge and Micheweni serves as a safety valve for children victims of discrimination and social stigma. However, these facilities are still at its formative stage and face a number of challenges, including lack of Standard Operating Procedures (SOP's), lack of specialised training on the part of personnel, inadequate personnel, lack of coordination amongst state institutions and personnel and lack of adequate and sufficient facilities and budget.

Recommendation

27. The State Party is urged to undertake administrative measures to make sure that the established One Stop Centres do effectively function, by particularly adopting of SOP's, providing specialised training to personnel manning these facilities, deploying sufficient personnel, strengthening coordination amongst state institutions and personnel, and allocating adequate and sufficient facilities and budget to these facilities.

(h) Measures to Stop Violations of the Right to Life, Survival and Development of Children with Albinism

28. The State Party is hialed for undertaking a number of administrative and judicial measures to stop gross violations of the right to life, survival and development of children with albinism (CWAs). However, CWAs still suffer gross violations of the right to life, survival and development of such children. The State Party also continues to concentrate such children in centres or schools where they suffer a number of violations: exclusion from mainstream society; poor hygiene and lack of special facilities and equipment for persons with albinism (PWAs).

Recommendation

29. The State Party should be urged to address the foregoing challenges facing CWAs, by particularly raising public awareness on the rights of PWAs, and integrating CWAs who are in concentration camps or schools back to society that will also have to be accompanied with the strengthening of provision of security to them.

(i) Measures to Improve Birth Registration Coverage

30. Although the State Party has undertaken a number of proactive administrative measures to improve birth registration coverage, including allocation of implementation funds for the U5BRS and the 6-18; birth registration and certification are still low. The State Party also still retains the Births and Deaths Registration Act, which is not in sync with the Convention.

Recommendations

31. The State Party should advised to scale up the process of birth registration and certification so as to ensure that every child who is born in its jurisdiction is duly registered and given a certificate to that effect. In addition, the State should also be advised to make sure that its endeavours to review, repeal and replacing the Births and Deaths Registration Act immediately comes to fruition.

(j) Measures to Eliminate Corporal Punishment

32. Despite undertaking several administrative measures to eliminate corporal punishment in all settings, the State Party has not legislated against corporal punishment. As result, corporal punishment is still a chellenge to some of the schools here in Tanzania. Even in

some schools that have started to practise discipline without canning, still teachers, parents and guardians have not been able to be inculcated with prerequisite skills and alternative disciplines.

Recommendations

33. The State Party is urged to outlaw corporal punishment in all settings. It is also urged to conduct a comprehensive consultation process on the alternative disciplines to be introduced in its jurisdiction in light of the country's existing best practices and training teachers, parents, and guardians on alternative discipline to corporal punishment.

(k) Measures to Prevent and Eliminate Violence against Children

34. The State Party is commended for undertaking various administrative and other measures to prevent and eliminate violence against children in its jurisdiction in light of the 2006 UN Study on Violence against Children (VAC). However, there is little legislative support for these measures, which has resulted in the proliferation of VAC in the State Party. Besides, the State Party has not been able to adequately budget for the effective implementation of these measures, as a result of which the State has been highly dependening on donor funding to implement these measures.

Recommendations

35. The State Party should be urged to undertake measures aimed at harmonising adminsitrative measures with legislative action to prevent and eliminate VAC. It should also be encouraged to allocate sufficient budgetary allocations from its coffers to be able to effectively implement these measures.

(1) Measures to Eliminate Female Genital Mutilation

34. The State Party is commended for undertaking several measures to eliminate female genital mutilation (FGM) and to target policies and campaigns to end its prevalence in rural areas, which have resulted in the decrease of FGM from 18% in 2005 to 15% in 2010. Despite these efforts FGM is still widely practised in the State Party.

Recommendation

35. It is recommended that Committee should encourage the State Party to scale up its efforts to completely eliminate FGM, by particularly mainstreaming public awareness-raising in all spheres of learning (at the family, community, religious and school levels) and effectively prosecute perpetrators of FGM as well as assist victims of this vice.

(m) Measures to Provide Appropriate Care and Protection to Children deprived of a Family

37. Although the State Party has put in place several administrative measures that aim at providing appropriate care and protection to children deprived of a family, there are still many children living and working in the streets in the State Party. In addition, the implementation of most of these measures is carried out by non-state actors under financial support from donors, with limited financial support from the State Party's regular budget.

Recommendation

38. The State Party should be advised to allocate adequate resources to the implementation of measures aimed at providing appropriate care and protection to children deprived of a family.

(n) Measures to Provide Sexual and Reproductive Health to Adolescents

39. Despite its concerted efforts to combat sexual violence, harassment, sexual exploitation of girls in the State Party and to change attitude that condone such violence against children; the State Party has not been able to address the challenges facing children in its jurisdiction in relation to high prevalence of HIV amongst adolescents and early pregnancies. This has been largely due to lack country-wide awareness-raising campaigns and inaquate funding allocated to the implementation of these programmes.

Recommendations

40. The State Party should be advised to scale up its efforts to ensure that adolescents and teenagers are adequately provided with requisite awareness on sexual and reproductive health to address the facing them in relation to high prevalence of HIV amongst adolescents and early pregnancies. The State Party should also be advised to increase budgetary allocations from its regular budget in respect of the implementation of these programmes.

(o) Making Education a Guaranteed Right under the "Proposed" Constitution

41. The State Party is commended for its move to enshrine child rights in the "Proposed" Constitution, which include the right to education⁶ and the definition of the child as any person under 18 years in line with the Convention.⁷

'53.-(1) Every child has the right to:

- (a) a name, citizenship and birth registration;
- (b) express his/her opinions, be listened and be protected against abuse, violence, degrading or inhuman treatment, exploitation, and harmful traditional practices;
- (c) safe environment for recreation and leisure and to be provided with primary education;
- (d) be placed in appropriate environment when in conflict with the law;
- (e) nutritious food, adequate health service, shelter and to live in an environment that ensures that the child appropriately grows physically, mentally and morally;
- (f) participate in activities appropriate to his or her age; and
- (g) be cared for and protected by parents, guardians, community members or state authority without any discrimination.
- (2) It shall the responsibility of every parent, guardians, community members and state authority to ensure that children are brought up in acceptable values commensurate with their age.
- (3) For the purpose of this article, a "child" mean any person who is under eighteen years old."

It should be noted that, under the Tanzanian legal regime, the Kiswahili version of the Constitution overrides the English version (See particularly DPP v Daudi Pete [1993] TLR 22 (CA)). So, the translation

⁶ The right to education for *everyone* (adults and children alike) is specifically enshrined in Article 52 of the Proposed Constitution. For children, the right to primary education is enshrined in Article 53(1)(c).

⁷ Articles 53 of the Proposed Constitution categorically provides that:

Recommendation

42. It recommended that, for this constitutional provision to be effectively realised, the State Party should make sure that after the Proposed Constitution is adopted by the people during the referendum slated to take place on 30 April 2015 and enters into force thereafter, all laws relating to children should be reviewed, repealed and replaced by new provisions that are compatible with this constitutional provision.⁸

(p) Measures to Protect the Rights of Children with Disabilities

50. Although the State Party has undertaken several commendable policy, legislative and adminsitrative measures geared towards the elimination and prevention of stigma, discrimination, violence and exclusion of children with disabilities (CWDs) particularly in rural areas; CWDs still suffer a number of violations of their rights in all settings in the State Party. In particular, public buildings as well as health and education facilities are still not friendly to children with disabilities; as a result of which children suffer total exclusion to access these social amenities. Besides, some programmes, such the Educational Support and Resource Centre (ESRAC), are only implemented in few areas in the State Party. This is challenge is excerbated by the fact that the State Party still largely depend on donors to implement these programmes.

Recommendations

51. The State Party should be advised to scale up its efforts to protect the rights and welfare of CWDs, by particularly raising awareness amongst members of the public on the rights of CWDs, it should ensure that all public buildings as well as health and education facilities are friendly to children with disabilities, and it should allocate adequate resources for the effective implementation of these programmes.

(r) Measures to Prevent and Combat Child Labour

52. The State Party is commended for undertaking several administrative measures to prevent and combat child labour in its jurisdiction. In spite of these efrorts children in State Party still fall victim to worst forms of child labour, which constitute exploitation and gross violation of human rights for such children. Although the State Party has deployed labour inspectors to ensure that provisions of the labour laws on prohibition of child labour are complied with, labour inspection in the workplace is still not effective. As a result, few employers employing children contrary to the law have been brought to justice. In addition, the State Party has continued to over-rely on CSOs and donor funding for the protecting children from child labour in its jurisdiction. It has also undertaken limited public awareness-raising campaigns against child labour.

Recommendations

53. The State Party should be advised to effectively scale up its efforts to prevent and combat child labour in its jurisdiction, by particulary strengthening labour inspection in the workplace and bring to justice all employers employing children contrary to the law. In

hereunder is a literal one aimed at providing a general understanding what the provisions of Article mean in relation to children's rights.

⁸ Article 295(1) of Proposed Constitution establishes the Constitutional Implementation Committee to oversee the implementation of the Constitution within the transitional period, which is four years from 2014 (Article 293(1) and can be enlarged by Parliament upon garnering a two-thirds majority up to a period of up to two years thereafter (Article 293(2)). According to Article 294(b), laws that are repugnant to the "new" Constitution shall be amended and new laws shall be enacted in line with the new constitutional order within the transitional period.

addition, the State Party should decrease its continued to overreliance on CSOs and donor funding for the protecting children from child labour in its jurisdiction by specifically increasing budgetary allocations for the effective implementation of these measures. It should be advised to undertake country-wide public awareness-raising campaigns against child labour.

(s) Measures to Prevent and Combat Sale, Trafficking and Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children

54. Although enacted the Anti-trafficking in Persons Act since 2008, it has yet to adopt Regulations for the implementation of this law. Besides, despite the fact that the State Party has carried out several measures to combat the sale, trafficking and commercial sexual exploitation of children, in particular to combat internal trafficking; the said practice still persits in the State Party. Like in the implementation of other programmes relating to the implementation of the Convention, the State Party has continued to over-rely on CSOs, particularly the International Organization for Migration (IOM), in its bid to prevent and combat sale, trafficking ad commercial exploitation of children. In addition, the resources allocated by the State Party for the protection and support services for children within the National Anti-Trafficking in Persons Action Plan 2013-2017 are far too insufficient to bring about the desired outcome.

Recommendations

55. In order to address the foregoing challenges, it is recommended that the State Party should undertake the following measures:

- (i) adopting and *gazetting* the Regulations for the implementation of the Antitrafficking in Persons Act;
- (ii) the State Party should scale up its administrative efforts to effectively to combat the sale, trafficking and commercial sexual exploitation of children; and
- (iii) the State Party should allocate adequate resources for the implementation of these programmes and, in particular, the National Anti-Trafficking in Persons Action Plan 2013-2017.

(t) Measures to Reform the Juvenile Justice System

56. The State Party is commended for undertaking various policy, legislative and administrative measures for the reform of the juvenile justice system, which include the adoption of Strategies for Progressive Child Justice Reform in both the Mainland and Zanzibar. However, there are still many challenges facing the administration of juvenile justice in the State Party, including:

- (i) lack of adequate funding for the administration of juvenile justice;
- (ii) lack of clear legal provisions in the two child laws on the fundamental principles about juvenile justice as contempolated in Articles 37 and 40 of the Convention;
- (iii) lack of adequate specialised facilities and personnel for juvenile justice;

- (iv) lack of measures to prevent juvenile delinquency;
- (v) lack of special protection measures for children below the minimum age of criminal responsibility (MACR);
- (vi) low MACR and retention of the doli capax and doli incapax doctrines;
- (vii) lack of state-sponsored legal aid scheme for children in contact with the law; and
- (viii) lack of regular training/awareness-raising for juvenile justice personnel.

Recommendation

57. The State Party should be advised to appropriately and promply address the foregoing and other emerging challenges facing the administration of juvenile justice in its jurisdiction.