Ev.No. 18906  Date: 11 June 2018

SELECTED LIST OF ISSUES ON THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE UNITED NATIONS CONVENTION ON THE ELIMINATION OF ALL FORMS OF DISCRIMINATION AGAINST WOMEN IN THE REPUBLIC OF SERBIA
Preface

This submission is prepared by the Protector of Citizens (Ombudsman) of the Republic of Serbia, and contains selected input to the UN Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women on relevant topics concerning Serbia for the adoption of List of Issues. Each issue is followed by recommendations for the Committee’s List of Issues for Serbia.

This submission concerns eight specific rights which are sorted according to the relevant articles in the Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW): legal framework for gender equality and protection from discrimination an violence (Art 2), stereotypes (Art 5), participation in public and political life (Art 7), education (Art 10), employment (Art 11), health (Art 12), rural women (Art 14), marriage and family relation (Art 16)

About the Protector of Citizens (Ombudsman)

The Protector of Citizens of the Republic of Serbia is an independent and autonomous public authority, introduced in the legal system of the Republic of Serbia in 2005 under the Law on the Protector of Citizens. The position of this institution was substantially reinforced by the Constitution of the Republic of Serbia of 2006, which made the Protector of Citizens a constitutional category, in line with best international practices. Since 2011, in accordance with the Law amending the Law on Ratification of the Optional Protocol to the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, the Protector of Citizens has been designated as the National Preventive Mechanism.

The Protector of Citizens (Ombudsman) is mandated to control the legality and regularity of operations of public authorities with respect to the exercise of individual and collective rights of citizens and to protect and promote human and minority freedoms and rights. The Protector of Citizens is the National Human Rights Institution of Serbia, established and functioning in accordance with the UN Paris Principles. The Protector of Citizens has been accredited as an A-status National Human Rights Institution by the International Coordinating Committee of National Human Rights Institutions.

The Protector of Citizens regularly submits its Annual Report to the National Assembly. The Annual Report contains general and specific assessments and information on the respect of the rights of citizens (including in particular human and minority rights), deficiencies identified in the work of public authorities, proposals for improvement of citizens’ position vis-à-vis public authorities and account of the activities carried out and the costs incurred by the Protector of Citizens. Every annual report contains a specific section devoted to the gender equality.

In 2017 National Assembly elected MSc Zoran Pašalić as Protector of Citizens for the five years term. According to the Law, the Protector of Citizens has four deputies, where one is specifically responsible for the gender equality. The Deputy Protector of Citizens for the gender equality is Ms. Gordana Stevanović, since 2013.

1 Law on Protector of Citizens („Official Gazette of RS“, Issue No. 79/05 and 54/07).
In the area of gender equality, the Protector of Citizens, inter alia, has:

- issued the Initiative for amending Criminal Code in the area of criminal protection of domestic violence and sexual abuse victims\(^2\) in 2011 and 2012.

- submitted Opinion with Recommendations for adopting Special Protocols on conduct and cooperation of institutions, bodies and organization in the situations of violence against women within the family and in intimate partner relations\(^3\) in 2012.

- made Recommendations for amending regulations important for the legal status of transgender persons\(^4\) in 2012.

- issued the Bills for amending the Labour Law and the Law on Financial Support to Families with Children to the National Assembly in 2013.

- drafted a Model Law on Gender Equality\(^5\) and submitted it to the Coordination Body for Gender Equality of the Government of the Republic of Serbia in 2014.


- conducted research and directed Special Report on the Trainings for Acquisition and Improvement of Knowledge and Competencies in the Prevention and Suppression of Domestic and Intimate Partner Violence and Protection of Women from such Violence with Recommendations\(^7\) in 2015.

- submitted a proposal to the Constitutional Court\(^8\) to declare unconstitutional the Provision of the Law on the Method of Determining the Maximum Number of Employees in the Public Sector which has placed women in a more unfavourable position than men in 2015. The Proposal was adopted by the Constitutional Court.

- submitted to the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women in 2015 the Alternative Report on the Implementation of Recommendations section 23 (a), (b), (c), (d), (e), (f) of Concluding Observation on the Combined Second and Third Periodic Reports of the Republic of Serbia adopted in 2013.

- issued dozens of systemic recommendations to the government bodies due to the omissions of a number of government bodies in 47 cases of domestic and intimate partner relations and abuse and neglect of children in 2016.

- issued dozens of systemic recommendations to the same bodies due to the omissions of a number of government bodies in 12 cases of women murders in 2016.

- organized debates on the topic of Protection of Women against Violence in domestic and intimate partner relations and Protection of Children against Abuse and Neglect within a family, over the course of 2017.


\(^3\) Available on: [http://www.ombudsman.rs/attachments/2643_Miš%20%20sa%20preporukama.doc](http://www.ombudsman.rs/attachments/2643_Miš%20%20sa%20preporukama.doc).


- conducted research on the inclusion of women in decision making in local self-government units and gender equality mechanisms in local self-government units in 2017 and 2018.
- conducted research on the measures of additional support in children education in 2016 and 2017.
- issued a large number of individual and systemic recommendations over a decade of work to the government bodies due to the violation of child’s rights on the protection against violence, abuse and neglect within a family and child’s rights on both parents’ care and accomplishing personal relations with the parent with whom the child does not live.
- submitted numerous opinions on Bills from the aspect of gender equality during a decade of work (for example: the Bill on Gender Equality, the Bill on Police, the Bill on Higher Education, the Bill on the Foundations of the Education System, Criminal Code, the Bill on Financial Support to Families with Children, the Bill on the Employees in the Public Service etc).
SELECTED LIST OF ISSUES ON THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE UNITED NATIONS CONVENTION ON THE ELIMINATION OF ALL FORMS OF DISCRIMINATION AGAINST WOMEN IN THE REPUBLIC OF SERBIA

The Protector of Citizens,

- starting from the complaints hitherto received, handled and resolved, as well as the facts learned through continual monitoring and research of the exercise of human rights in the territory of the Republic of Serbia and cooperation with other authorities,

- assured that full and unbiased evaluation of the level of respect for human rights is key for proper focusing of activities carried out by government and other entities to improve the existing situation, which is an ongoing issue,

hereby submits to the United Nations Committee on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women a Selected List of Issues with regard to the Implementation of the UN Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women

SPECIFIC ISSUES

Article 2 - Legal Framework for Gender Equality and Protection against Discrimination and Violence

The existing Law on Gender Equality does not prescribe mechanisms for the implementation of legal provisions and the sanctions in case they are not implemented, whereas the ways in which the gender equality mechanisms are regulated, established and implemented are not appropriate. The Republic of Serbia has not yet adopted the law which guarantees incorporation of gender perspective in all segments of the society, and the respect of international standards and separate measures for the implementation of gender equality. Furthermore, there is no legislation regulating either legal consequences of gender reassignment and change of gender identity, or same-sex relationships. Sexual orientation and gender identity are not explicitly prescribed in the Criminal Code under Racial and Other Discrimination\(^9\) and Injury to Reputation Due to Racial, Religious, Ethnic, or Other Affiliation\(^10\) as the grounds for committing criminal offense nor the institute of hate crime is implemented in practice. Also, the Criminal Code is not fully compliant with the Council of Europe Convention on Preventing and Combating Violence against Women and Domestic Violence. Despite numerous recommendations by the international bodies and organisations, as well as by the Protector of Citizens, no law has yet been adopted which regulates free legal aid, which is one of significant causes for not ensuring access to justice for all, in particular for vulnerable social groups.

\(^9\) “Official Gazette of RS”, Issue No. 104/09
\(^10\) Article 387 of the Criminal Code.
\(^11\) Article 174 of the Criminal Code.
The existing regulations do not prescribe the obligation to establish gender equality mechanisms in the local self-government units (hereinafter LSG units) or ensure their permanence and continuity, complexity and efficiency. In a large number of LSG units no possibility was provided for these mechanisms to influence the process of making decisions significant for exercising gender equality.

The Action Plan for the Implementation of the Strategy of Prevention and Protection against Discrimination has not yet been fully implemented, whereas the deadlines for the implementation of the activities from the Strategy have either passed or it refers to continuous activities. Evaluation of the degree to which the activities have been implemented by the competent bodies, on the basis of the indicators of their fulfilment, has not been adequately carried out either.

In compliance with the recommendations and initiatives by the Protector of Citizens from the previous years, new measures and obligations were introduced with the Law on Domestic Violence Prevention in 2016, such as urgent protection measures, mandatory co-ordination and co-operation between the services, and the establishment of the co-ordination and co-operation groups. Although the organised specialised training on the implementation of the Law is worthy of praise, the people employed in the social care sector have been excluded, despite their significant role in this area. The National Strategy for Preventing and Combating Violence against Women in the Family and in Intimate Partnerships expired in 2015; the Action Plan for its implementation has never been adopted; and the new Strategy has not yet been adopted despite the recommendations by the Protector of Citizens.

Although the Law on Domestic Violence Prevention has been passed, there are still deficiencies in the protection of women against violence which represent a significant obstacle in providing efficient, timely and effective protection to female victims.

The Protector of Citizens recommends that the following questions are added to the List of Issues for Serbia:

- When is it expected to pass the law on gender equality which will prescribe full implementation of this principle in all segments of public and private life; incorporation of gender perspective in all segments of the society; the respect of gender equality international standards and the equal opportunity principle; and which will prescribe separate measures for the implementation of the gender equality principle?

- When is it expected to pass the law regulating legal consequences of gender reassignment and change of gender identity, or same-sex relationships?

- What measures have been undertaken in order to explicitly incriminate criminal offences committed on the grounds of sexual orientation and gender identity as

stipulated by the Criminal Code under *Racial and Other Discrimination* and *Injury to Reputation Due to Racial, Religious, Ethnic, or Other Affiliation*?

- What measures have been undertaken in order to fully harmonise the Criminal Code with the Council of Europe Convention on Preventing and Combating Violence against Women and Domestic Violence and the Council of Europe Convention on the Protection of Children against Sexual Exploitation and Sexual Abuse?

- When is it expected to pass the law on Free Legal Aid which will also include the vulnerable groups of people, especially women, children, LGBTI people and victims of violence in the family and in intimate partnerships, and victims of human trafficking?

- What measures have you undertaken in order to prescribe both the obligation for the LSG units to establish gender equality mechanisms in a way which will ensure permanence and continuity of the mechanisms and their operation, and the sanctions in case they fail to meet their obligation?

- What measures have you undertaken with regard to the following:
  - Implementation of the full evaluation of the activities carried out hitherto according to the Action Plan for the Implementation of the Strategy of Prevention and Protection against Discrimination?
  - Commencement and implementation of the activities set out in the Action Plan for the Implementation of the Strategy of Prevention and Protection against Discrimination (hereafter AP) within the set deadlines?
  - Timely adoption of the anti-discrimination strategy and the AP for the coming period?

- What measures have you undertaken with regard to the following:
  - Adoption of the *National Strategy for Preventing and Combating Violence against Women in the Family and in Intimate Partnerships* and the relevant AP?
  - Provision of comprehensive and efficient protection of women and children — victims of violence?
  - Provision of human, technological and financial resources for the implementation of the protection of women and children against violence?
  - Ensuring strict implementation of the regulations and operation standards in the protection of women and children against violence?
  - Seeing to it that domestic violence is adequately sanctioned?
  - Provision of full protection and rehabilitation of the victims of violence?
  - Calling for the employees and heads of administrative authorities to take responsibility for their failure to provide protection against violence?
  - Provision of the services network for women and children — victims of violence?
  - Provision of mandatory specialised training for the employees on the protection against violence and the implementation of the Law on Domestic Violence Prevention?
Article 5 - Stereotypes

Reporting by the media on women is burdened with gender stereotyping, without respect for privacy, dignity, and integrity of women and children, while children as TV viewers are exposed to harmful content which also includes gender stereotypes. The Ministry of Culture and Information and the Regulatory Body of Electronic Media (REM) are the bodies authorised to take action in case the media violate relevant regulations, yet they do not do it, which the Protector of Citizens has been recognising for a longer period and has been submitting its recommendations therefore. Despite numerous recommendations and initiatives by the Protector of Citizens, no organised campaign has been launched so far to reduce violence against women and children, and to raise public awareness about violence, its impermissibility and zero tolerance of violence.

The LGBTI women are especially vulnerable, and among them in particular vulnerable are young people, who are in their social environment still facing intolerance, discrimination, and violence because of their sexual orientation and gender identity. The employees in public services do not have adequate knowledge on the status and the rights of the LGBTI people. The services they should help young homeless LGBTI people, such as safe houses, temporary accommodation services, and other, have not been developed.

The Protector of Citizens recommends that the following questions are added to the List of Issues for Serbia:

- Are national campaigns continually run for the purpose of raising public awareness about gender equality; situation and the rights of the LGBTI people; banning violence against women and children, and their protection measures; the importance of economic empowerment of women?

- Do the competent authorities effectively and timely monitor the operation of the media and do they undertake measures in cases of violating the regulations by the media?

- What measures have you undertaken:
  o with regard to the implementation of the mandatory specialised training for all civil servants on how to deal with LGBTI people and their rights?
  o with regard to the development of the services network for LGBTI people, especially for the young, children and the homeless?

Article 7 - Participation in Political and Public Life

Representation of women in decision making in the administrative bodies of the LSG units is insufficient and decreases with the increase of the level of authority and competence in making key decisions and creation of policy. Thus, in 85.6% of cases the president of the municipality assembly in LSG units is a man, and in 14.4% of cases it is a woman. Only in 12 LSG units the position of the president of the municipality/mayor is held by women, and in 129 (92.1% ) LSG units by a man. In the municipal councils in LSG units there are 20.42% of women, and in 16 LSG units there is not one woman in the council. Participation of women in the community councils is only 11.4%, and in only 4.3% of community councils women are presidents. Among the total number of councillors in all municipalities and towns of Serbia there are only 7
women with disabilities and two Roma women, whereas among the appointed persons there is only one disabled woman and no Roma woman.

The Protector of Citizens recommends that the following questions are added to the List of Issues for Serbia:

- Is the state undertaking any measures in order to prescribe mandatory representation of the less represented gender in all public authorities and administrative bodies in the public sector in the scope of at least 40%?

- Is the state undertaking special measures in order to increase the representation of women with disabilities and Roma women in the public authorities and administrative bodies in the public sector?

**Article 10 - Education**

Only 6% of Roma children up to 5.5 years of age are included in pre-school education programmes (in the general population it is around 50%). The rate of enrolment into compulsory preparatory preschool programmes in the general population is about 98%, while in the Roma community it is only 63%, and for Roma children living in poverty, only 46%. Roma children often attend preparatory preschool programmes for a shorter period of time than prescribed or irregularly, making them insufficiently prepared for primary education\(^{13}\). Only 64% of Roma children complete primary education (compared to 93% of children in the general population). About 10% of Roma children do not continue their education after fourth grade, and only 22% of Roma children attend high school (compared to 89% of children in the general population). Roma girls drop out of school at higher rates: as many as 43% of girls in this age group stop attending (compared to only 4% of girls in the general population)\(^{14}\). Roma children are still unjustifiably prevalent in schools and departments for children with impairments and disabilities. A survey conducted by the Protector of Citizens has shown that Roma children were not provided with adequate support services in education. Their education and training on the human rights is not sufficient, which is also valid for civil servants.

The Protector of Citizens recommends that the following questions are added to the List of Issues for Serbia:

- What measures have been planned in order to do the following:
  o Establish and develop the services for Roma children in order to encourage their inclusion in education, prevent dropping out of school, change the pattern with regard to the Roma girls, encourage the enrolment of children at an early age into preschool institutions, encourage high-school education and social inclusion of Roma children?

---

\(^{13}\) Strategy for Social inclusion of Roma for the period 2016-2015

\(^{14}\) Same.
Decrease the enrolment rate of Roma children into schools and departments intended for the education of children with impairments and disabilities, and increase their inclusion into the regular system of education and upbringing?

- What measures have been planned in order to do the following:
  - Introduce the content on human rights, tolerance, non-discrimination, and diversity in all educational plans and programmes?
  - Provide systematic implementation of specialised training about human rights, in particular on the rights of the citizens in a specially vulnerable situation?
  - Provide the widest possible inclusion of the employees with the administrative authorities in specialised training?
  - Provide the system for training efficiency monitoring and for the application of the gained knowledge in practice?

Article 11 – Employment

Due to the non-harmonised regulations, the scope of the exercised rights of female entrepreneurs may be reduced on the grounds of pregnancy and maternity leave, and absence from work for child care, because they are not allowed to appoint manager in order to exercise their right to salary compensation while on a leave. It just so happens that salary compensation during pregnancy and maternity leave is reduced or is not paid at all, and labour inspectors do not sanction such behaviour but they instruct the women to go to court instead. Women on pregnancy and maternity leave find themselves in a particularly difficult situation if their employers ceased to exist while they are on a leave, but had not provided adequate documentation for such women which they were obliged to do according to the law, so as to enable them to exercise their rights before the administrative authorities. With its regulations concerning compensation other than income during pregnancy leave, absence from work for child care, and special child care, the Law on Financial Support to Families with Children puts the employed women, female entrepreneurs, female farmers and women performing temporary work into an unequal position when they are exercising that right.

The Protector of Citizens recommends that the following questions are added to the List of Issues for Serbia:

- What measures have you undertaken with regard to ensuring regular payment of salary compensation during pregnancy and maternity leave, and absence from work for child care, and special child care?

- What measures have you undertaken in order to provide equal treatment of women on pregnancy and maternity leave, regardless of the job they perform?

---

15 „Official Gazette of RS“, Issue No. 113/17
16 Article 17 of the Law on Financial Support to Families with Children, „Official Gazette of RS“, Issue No. 113/17
Article 12 – Health Care

Although the Action Plan for the Implementation of the National Strategy for Gender Equality\(^\text{17}\) prescribed that by September 2017 the content on reproductive health, sexual education, gender relations, and gender roles should be introduced in educational programmes, it has not been introduced yet. In 2016, counselling centres for the young were available in only 40 community health centres out of a total of 151\(^\text{18}\). In 2017, the Ministry of Education, Science and Technological Development revoked the developed educational programme on sexual education due to public disapproval.

Although the legal framework for exercising the rights by Roma women to the protection of their reproductive health has been improved, and the work of health female mediators has significantly contributed to the increased number of health insurance coverage among Roma women and Roma children, information on reproductive health protection is not available enough. The activities related to the prevention of reproductive health problems, and education of Roma women are not implemented systemically, but mostly through the projects developed by the civil society organisations. The Ministry of Health did not regulate the status of health female mediators in a sustainable and permanent way. The services of the counselling centres for young Roma boys and girls have not been developed either.

The Protector of Citizens recommends that the following questions are added to the List of Issues for Serbia:

- What measures have you undertaken in order to introduce the content about reproductive health, sexuality, responsible sexual behaviour, gender relations, gender identity, and gender roles, and the status of LGBTI people into the educational programmes that will be age-appropriate and paired with the needs of the pupils and students?

- What steps have you undertaken in order to do the following:
  o Permanently employ health female mediators and provide their sufficient number?
  o Ensure accessibility to health and social care and insurance, preventive health care, services for children, education, and counselling services for the young on sexual and reproductive health for the Roma national minority?
  o Introduce and develop measures for employment, self-employment, and economic emancipation and strengthening of Roma women?

Article 14 - Rural Women

Health and social care, public transportation, services for the children, education, and infrastructure are not accessible to women living in rural environment with pronounced patriarchal patterns in behaviour. They are often unemployed, without health and social


insurance, and are socially excluded. Women appear as the holders of agricultural holding more rarely than men (17.3%); women make up a vast majority of the family members and relatives performing agricultural activities on the holding (62.9%; men 37.1%); while among permanently employed people on the holdings they make up a vast minority (14.8%; men 85.2%)\(^{19}\). Men prevail as persons registered as the owners of the household in case of shared households\(^ {20}\).

The Protector of Citizens recommends that the following questions are added to the List of Issues for Serbia:

- What steps have you undertaken in order to do the following:
  - Ensure accessibility to health and social care and insurance, services for children, education and services in the field of infrastructure and public transportation for all women?
  - Introduce and develop the measures for employment, self-employment, economic emancipation and empowerment of rural women?

### Article 16 - Marriage and Family Relations (Child Marriage, Arranged Marriage)

Systemic measures have not been established to eliminate child, arranged and forced marriages in the Roma community, although the problem has long been recognised, and the Protector of Citizens has in a number of cases identified deficiencies in the work of competent authorities. The Criminal Code prescribes a lower level of children protection from harmful practices and violation of their rights in early and forced marriages when compared with the improved protection prescribed for other forms of criminal offence such as sexual harassment, abuse and exploitation, committed against children\(^ {21}\).

The services intended for children, and their families, who due to illness, impaired development or disabilities are in need of permanent assistance and care, have not been sufficiently developed, so the parents have to choose between the two possibilities: not to get employed or to leave their job and continue to provide care for their child, thus being left without any income, whereby they most often bear the high costs of treatment, daily care, and rehabilitation of their child; or to use the services of the health care system (place their child in a social care institution or into a foster family) in order to find a job or keep on working to provide livelihood for other family members. Five years ago, the Protector of Citizens submitted to the National Assembly the legislative proposal on the amendments and supplements to the Labour Law\(^ {22}\), and the Law on Financial Support to Families with Children\(^ {23}\), which should introduce additional rights for these families. The proposals have not been discussed to date, and the position of the families and their children has further

---


\(^{21}\) See Article 1 - Legal Framework for Gender Equality.


worsened due to the regulation of the Law on Financial Support to Families with Children\textsuperscript{24} which revokes the right of the parent to salary compensation during absence for special child care if the child already receives assistance and care financial benefits\textsuperscript{25}. The remark by the Protector of Citizens that this regulation is illegal, incorrect and harmful in many ways has not been acknowledged.

The Protector of Citizens recommends that the following questions are added to the List of Issues for Serbia:

- What measures have you undertaken to do the following:
  - Prevent child, early and forced marriages?
  - Amend the criminal legislation and ensure better criminal and justice protection of children — victims of child, early, and forced marriages?

- What measures have you undertaken in order to establish services intended for children, and their families, who due to illness, impaired development or disabilities are in need of permanent assistance and care, in such a way to provide child care while the parents are at work earning income, but also to provide adequate financial support to the parents pending the establishment of such services?

\textsuperscript{24} "Official Gazette of RS" Issue No. 113/17

\textsuperscript{25} Article 12 of the Law on Financial Support to Families with Children.