Committee against Torture

Concluding observations on the sixth periodic report of Bosnia and Herzegovina*

1. The Committee against Torture considered the sixth periodic report of Bosnia and Herzegovina (CAT/C/BIH/6) at its 1578th and 1581st meetings, held on 10 and 13 November 2017 (see CAT/C/SR.1578 and 1581), and adopted the following concluding observations at its 1602nd meeting (CAT/C/SR.1602), held on 28 November 2017.

A. Introduction

2. The Committee welcomes the submission of the sixth periodic report of Bosnia and Herzegovina and the information contained therein. It, however, regrets that the report was submitted one and a half years late.

3. The Committee appreciates having had the opportunity to engage in a dialogue with the State party’s delegation and the responses provided to the questions and concerns raised during the consideration of the report.

B. Positive aspects

4. The Committee welcomes the ratification of or accession to the following international human rights instruments by the State party:

   (a) The International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance, in 2012;


5. The Committee also welcomes the following legislative measures taken by the State party in areas of relevance to the Convention, i.e. the adoption of the following laws:

   (a) The Law on Witness Protection Programme in Bosnia and Herzegovina, in 2014;

   (b) The Law on Amendments to the Criminal Code of Bosnia and Herzegovina, in 2015;

   (c) The Law on Aliens, in 2015 and the Law on Asylum, in 2016;

   (d) The Law on Free Legal Aid Provision in Bosnia and Herzegovina, in 2016.

* Adopted by the Committee at its sixty-second session (6 November-6 December 2017).
6. The Committee welcomes the State party’s efforts to adjust its policies and procedures in order to give effect to the Convention, including:
   (a) The 2015-2018 Action Plan for Children of Bosnia and Herzegovina, in 2015;
   (b) The Official Strategy for 2015-19 to Combat Domestic Violence and Violence against Women, in 2015;
   (c) The 2016-2019 National Anti-Trafficking Action Plan, in 2015;

C. Principal subjects of concern and recommendations

Pending follow-up questions from the previous reporting cycle

7. In paragraph 28 of its previous concluding observations (CAT/C/BIH/CO/2-5), the Committee requested the State party to provide further information regarding areas of particular concern identified by the Committee. The Committee expresses its appreciation to the State party for providing information to the Committee on these issues (CAT/C/BIH/CO/2-5/Add.1). The Committee considers that its recommendations relating to amending the Criminal Code on a definition of sexual violence and compiling data on cases of war-time rape and sexual violence (CAT/C/BIH/CO/2-5, para. 9) have been fully implemented. The Committee, however, regrets that the recommendations concerning impunity for war crimes, redress for torture victims and enforced disappearances (ibid., paras. 12, 18 and 24, respectively) have been only partially implemented.

Definition of torture

8. While welcoming the 2015 amendment to the Criminal Code of Bosnia and Herzegovina which aims to bring article 190 in line with the Convention, the Committee remains concerned that an offence of torture in the Criminal Code of the Republika Srpska does not contain all the elements set out in article 1 of the Convention and that criminal codes of Federation of Bosnia and Herzegovina and Brčko District do not define a separate offence of torture. It also regrets that penalties for an offence of torture are not consistent throughout the State party (arts. 1 and 4).

9. Recalling the recommendations in its previous concluding observations (see CAT/C/BIH/CO/2-5, para. 8), the Committee urges the State party to reinforce its efforts to harmonize the legal definition of torture in the Republika Srpska and Brčko District with the Criminal Code of Bosnia and Herzegovina, to be fully in line with the definition contained in article 1 of the Convention. The State party should ensure that acts of torture are punishable by appropriate penalties commensurate with their grave nature, in accordance with article 4 (2) of the Convention and that the penalties are consistent throughout the State party.

Fundamental legal safeguards

10. Taking into account the procedural guarantees established in the domestic legislation, the Committee is concerned at reports that, in practice, detained persons do not always enjoy all the fundamental legal safeguards from the outset of their detention. It notes with concern that the newly adopted Law on Free Legal Aid Provision in Bosnia and Herzegovina is yet to be effectively implemented. It is further concerned at reports that persons held in police stations are not explicitly guaranteed the right to request and receive a medical examination by an independent doctor, and that police officers are often present during medical examinations. It also regrets information that a report drawn from medical assessment upon admission to the prison omits statements of prisoners or explanations of injuries found, and that this medical examination often takes place in the presence of prison staff (arts. 2, 11 and 12).

11. The State party should ensure, in law and in practice, that all detainees are afforded all fundamental legal safeguards from the outset of the deprivation of liberty, including the safeguards mentioned in paragraphs 13 and 14 of the Committee’s
general comment No. 2 (2007) on the implementation of article 2. In particular, it should:

(a) Adopt legislative, administrative and other measures to ensure that all detained persons, including those held in police facilities, have the right to request and receive a medical examination by an independent medical doctor from the outset of the deprivation of liberty, and that the examination should be conducted out of hearing and sight of police and prison staff unless the doctor concerned explicitly requests otherwise in a given case. The State party should also ensure that the record drawn up after the medical examination contains, inter alia: (i) an account of statements made by the person that are relevant to the medical examination (including his or her state of health and any allegations of ill-treatment); (ii) a full account of objective medical findings based on a thorough examination; and (iii) the health-care professional’s observations in the light of (i) and (ii), indicating the consistency between any allegations made and the objective medical findings. The results of the examination should be made available to the detained person concerned and his or her lawyer. Health-care professionals should not be exposed to any form of undue pressure or reprisals from management staff when they fulfil this duty, nor should the detained persons concerned;

(b) Reinforce the system of free legal aid, including by effectively implementing the Law on Free Legal Aid Provision in Bosnia and Herzegovina, to ensure that the right to access to a competent and independent lawyer applies to anyone who is deprived of liberty from the outset of the deprivation of liberty, including persons held in police custody;

(c) Monitor regularly the compliance with the legal safeguards by all public officials and ensuring that those who do not respect those safeguards are duly disciplined.

Ill-treatment by the police

12. While taking note of the information provided by the State party during the dialogue, the Committee is seriously concerned at the findings of the report by the European Committee for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (CPT) following its visit to the State party in 2015 indicating that detainees were routinely ill-treated or even tortured at police holding facilities and that such practice of repeated slaps, punches, kicks and blows with a truncheon in order to extort a confession was even considered as normal. It is gravely concerned at reports that some detainees were threatened with a pistol in their mouths and subjected to a mock execution. It regrets that this dire situation has not changed since the previous visits by the CPT in 2011 and 2012 (arts. 12 and 13).

13. The Committee urges the State party to take all the necessary measures to:

(a) Send a clear message from the highest possible office that torture and ill-treatment is unacceptable and that perpetrators will be held criminally responsible for their acts;

(b) Ensure that all the allegations of torture or ill-treatment by law enforcement officials are promptly, thoroughly and impartially investigated by an independent body, and that perpetrators are duly prosecuted, and if found guilty, convicted with penalties that are commensurate with the grave nature of their crimes;

(c) Develop training modules for the police on non-coercive interview and investigation techniques with a view to reducing the reliance on confession to secure convictions;

(d) Ensure the installation of video recording equipment in all rooms used for police interrogations, except in cases in which the rights of detainees to privacy or to confidential communication with their lawyer or doctor may be violated. Independent monitoring of video recording of police interrogations should be conducted on a regular basis, and recordings made available to victims of torture or ill-treatment and their lawyers and accepted in court proceedings.
Impunity for acts of torture and ill-treatment

14. The Committee is concerned at the reported lack of a unified procedure for handling complaints by prisoners and at the absence of a fully independent body to receive and act on complaints against the police. It particularly regrets that in the Canton of Sarajevo, the Police Complaints Unit is directly under the Police Director and is part of the police force, and that perpetrators are often appointed as crime investigators of complaints against themselves. It is also concerned at reports that the authorities fail to undertake investigations into allegations of ill-treatment and at the extremely low number of resolved cases; only 2 cases were resolved formally out of 269 complaints filed between 2010 and 2013 in Republika Srpska. It also regrets reports that medical examinations requested by a complainant of ill-treatment are often conducted in the presence of an alleged perpetrator (arts. 12 and 13).

15. The Committee urges the State party to take all the necessary measures to change the culture of impunity of torture and ill-treatment by ensuring that:

(a) All complaints of torture and ill-treatment are promptly, impartially and effectively investigated, and that those accused are prosecuted and, if found guilty, sentenced to penalties proportionate to the gravity of their acts;

(b) A fully independent body is established to receive and act on allegations of torture and ill-treatment and that such body does not have any institutional or hierarchical connection with alleged perpetrators;

(c) Public officials under criminal or disciplinary investigation for allegedly having committed acts of torture or ill-treatment are immediately suspended from their duties and remain so throughout the investigation, subject to the observance of the principle of presumption of innocence;

(d) Victims are protected against ill-treatment or intimidation that may arise as a consequence of their complaints, are duly informed of the progress and results of their complaints and are able to exercise their right to judicial remedy and participation in proceedings whenever they disagree with the prosecution’s inaction.

War crimes including conflict-related crimes of sexual violence

16. While noting the delegation’s update on amendment to the State War Crimes Strategy that a working group has been formed to decide new deadlines for processing war crime cases, the Committee is concerned that the number of pending cases remains high and that numerous judgments made by the Constitutional Court are yet to be implemented. It is seriously concerned at information that convicted perpetrators of war crimes of sexual violence routinely receive diminished sentences without an individual assessment and are allowed to pay fines in lieu of serving in the prison. While noting progress made to witness protection in courtrooms, the Committee remains concerned that the 2014 Law on Witness Protection Programme applies only to witnesses testifying before the Court of Bosnia and Herzegovina (arts. 2, 12 and 16).

17. The Committee urges the State party to expedite its prosecution and processing of war crime cases and ensure that:

(a) All persons suspected of having been complicit in, and perpetrators of, war crimes including rape and sexual violence are effectively and promptly brought to justice;

(b) Domestic legislation on war crimes is harmonized throughout the State party and consistently applied in accordance with international legal standards;

(c) Legislative measures are taken to preclude convicted perpetrators of war crimes from being exempted from their sanctions, including routine reduction of sentences and replacement of imprisonment by fines;

(d) Prompt, effective and impartial investigations are undertaken into allegations of ill-treatment, reprisals and intimidations against victims and witnesses and that the highest standard of protection is provided to witnesses and their families
throughout the criminal proceedings, including by extending the application of the 2014 Law on the Witness Protection Programme to all domestic courts.

Redress for victims of war crimes including sexual violence

18. While acknowledging the State party’s efforts to establish a national reparation mechanism since 2012, the Committee is seriously concerned at the prolonged delay in adopting the Draft National Strategy on Transitional Justice, the Draft Law on the Protection of Victims of Torture and Civil Victims of War and the Programme for Survivors of Conflict-related Sexual Violence. It regrets that the absence of a national reparation mechanism forces victims of war crimes, especially survivors of war-time sexual violence, to go through complex and lengthy proceedings at the entity levels to obtain limited assistance including social welfare benefits. The Committee is also concerned at reports that certain provisions in the Republika Srpska’s pre-draft law on the protection of victims of wartime torture potentially exclude many victims of non-Serb ethnicity from exercising their rights to compensation (art. 14).

19. The Committee, recalling its general comment No. 3 (2013) on the implementation of article 14 by States parties, urges the State party to take all the necessary measures to enable victims of torture and ill-treatment, including victims of wartime sexual violence, to exercise their right to redress. In particular, it should take steps to:

(a) Establish an effective reparation scheme at a national level to provide all forms of redress to victims of war crimes, including sexual violence, particularly by expediting the adoption of the Draft National Strategy on Transitional Justice and the Programme for Survivors of Conflict-related Sexual Violence;

(b) Develop and adopt a framework law that clearly defines criteria for obtaining the status of victims of war crimes, including sexual violence, and provides a set of specific rights and entitlements guaranteed to victims throughout the State party;

(c) Ensure that authorities at the entity level remove restrictive and discriminatory provisions in their legislation and policies relating to redress for civilian victims of war, including survivors of wartime sexual violence;

(d) Compile data, disaggregated by age, sex and ethnicity, on the number of victims in order to fully assess their needs, and to provide holistic rehabilitation services to victims without discrimination on account of their place of residence.

Ombudsman and the establishment of the National Preventive Mechanism

20. The Committee is concerned, like by the GANHRI’s Sub-Committee on Accreditation, about the Ombudsman’s limited mandate on promoting human rights, the lack of independence resulting from the Parliamentary Assembly’s authority to appoint and dismiss the Ombudsman, and the insufficient funds following significant budget cuts. The Committee is concerned at the prolonged delay in adopting amendments to the Law on Ombudsperson for Human Rights and the failure to establish a national preventive mechanism. It also regrets the lack of explanation by the State party concerning the extremely low number of staff assigned to the Department for the Protection of Detained and Imprisoned Persons (art. 2).

21. The State party should take all the necessary measures to:

(a) Expedite the adoption of the draft amendments to the Law on Ombudsperson for Human Rights;

(b) Ensure that (i) the Ombudsman has sufficient financial and human resources to fully carry out its mandate in an effective and independent manner, in full conformity with the principles relating to the status of national institutions for the promotion and protection of human rights (the Paris Principles), (ii) the recommendations by the Office of the Ombudsman are effectively implemented, and (iii) a national preventive mechanism is promptly established.
Conditions of detention

22. While noting the construction of a new State prison in Vojkovici and renovations underway at existing facilities, the Committee remains concerned at the reported substandard, sometimes life-threatening, living conditions at places of detention. It is concerned that extremely poor conditions are pervasive in police holding facilities, including a lack of natural light, inadequate ventilation and deplorable hygienic conditions. While noting the increased use of alternative measures such as house arrest with electronic surveillance and community service, the Committee remains concerned at the severe overcrowding at the Correctional Facility Sarajevo and also at insufficient access by prisoners to health care services, full-time doctors and meaningful activities. While noting the recent recruitment of new staff, it still regrets the low level of staffing at most prisons in the Federation of Bosnia and Herzegovina. It also takes note of a frequent occurrence of inter-prisoner violence and regrets the lack of information on preventive measures taken by the State party and on the impact thereof (arts. 2, 11 and 16).

23. The State party should strengthen its efforts to enhance conditions in prisons and police holding facilities and ensure that they are in conformity with the United Nations Standard Minimum Rules for the Treatment of Prisoners (the Nelson Mandela Rules). In particular, it should:

(a) Reduce the level of prison overcrowding including by using alternatives to imprisonment in accordance with the United Nations Standard Minimum Rules for Non-custodial Measures (the Tokyo Rules) and the United Nations Rules for the Treatment of Women Prisoners and Non-custodial Measures for Women Offenders (the Bangkok Rules), and by speeding up the construction of the new State prison in Vojkovici;

(b) Improve material conditions in prisons and police holding facilities, including with regard to natural light, ventilation and beds necessary for an overnight detention, and guarantee detainees access to adequate food and water;

(c) Provide adequate access to health care services of high quality and ensure that access to medical doctors in the prison is comparable to that outside of the prison;

(d) Adopt preventive measures to reduce inter-prisoner violence including by increasing the number of prison staff and providing prison officers with trainings on appropriate and effective responses to cases of inter-prisoner violence, and ensure that all incidents of inter-prisoner violence are registered and investigated and those found guilty are punished with penalties proportional to the gravity of the offence;

(e) Improve the vocational and physical activities provided to detainees in order to facilitate their reintegration into society.

Special regime department and enhanced supervision unit in the Republika Srpska

24. The Committee is concerned at the absence of procedural safeguards in cases where a detainee found to be disruptive or provocative is placed in a special regime department with enhanced supervision in close-type prisons of the Republika Srpska (arts. 2, 11 and 16).

25. The Committee recommends that the State party amend the Law on the Special Regime to ensure that a decision to place a prisoner in the enhanced supervision unit is not arbitrarily made and that prisoners subjected to this placement are guaranteed the right of appeal to an independent authority.

Enforced disappearances

26. While noting the steps taken to establish a central register of missing persons (CEN), the Committee remains concerned at reports that more than half of cases of missing persons have not been verified, that the Missing Persons Institute continues to experience budget cuts, understaffing and lack of necessary equipment, and that a fund for families of missing persons has not been established due to political disagreement. It regrets the lack of record on assistance provided to families of missing persons (arts. 1, 4, 14 and 16).
27. The Committee urges the State party to complete the establishment of a central register of missing persons and establish a fund for families of missing persons without delay, in accordance with the Law on Missing Persons. The State party should also provide the Missing Persons Institute with sufficient financial and human resources necessary to discharge its functions without any restraint, and ensure that the Institute has adequate technology and equipment necessary to detect and exhume graves. It should also compile data on the provision of assistance to families of missing persons and accurately assess their needs, including for rehabilitative services.

Refugees and non-refoulement

28. The Committee is concerned at the extremely low rate of successful asylum applications in the State party and notes with concern that no refugee status was granted in 2015 and 2016. While the domestic legislation on asylum provides for access to rights of refugees and asylum-seekers, the Committee is concerned that in practice, inadequate legal aid and low quality interpretation service prevent asylum seekers from accessing asylum procedure and being identified at an early stage. It notes with concern that in 2016, 42 percent of asylum seekers applied for asylum only after they were placed in an immigration detention facility. The Committee is also concerned at information that the State party detains asylum-seekers with a pending asylum application and that neither the appeal proceedings before the Court of Bosnia and Herzegovina nor the Constitutional Court have automatic suspensive effect on a deportation order (arts. 2, 3 and 16).

29. The State party should ensure full protection from refoulement by establishing the necessary legal and administrative safeguards and remedies in forced return procedures and thereby guarantee at all times that no person in need of international protection will be returned to a country where he or she is in danger of being subjected to acts of torture or cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment, conditions or punishment. To this end, the State party should:

(a) Facilitate access to a prompt and fair individualized refugee determination procedure, including by ensuring a timely identification of asylum seekers and by training the border police and immigration officials on promptly providing information on the right to seek asylum;

(b) Guarantee, in law and in practice, access to independent, qualified and free-of-charge legal assistance and interpretation services for asylum seekers throughout the asylum procedure;

(c) Enhance the capacity of immigration officials on thoroughly assessing country of origin information and applying reasonable standards of proof of persecution faced by asylum applicants;

(d) Refrain from detaining refugees, asylum seekers and undocumented migrants for prolonged periods and use detention only as a measure of last resort and for as short a period as possible, including by promoting alternatives to detention.

Juvenile Justice

30. While commending the adoption by the Republika Srpska of the 2011 Law on the Protection and Treatment of Children and Juveniles in Contact with the Law and welcoming the opening of the Juvenile Educational and Correctional Facility of Orasje, the Committee remains concerned at reports that juveniles seldom benefit from rehabilitation services and alternative measures to detention, are occasionally detained together with adults, and may be subject to pretrial detention for extended durations (art. 11).

31. The State party should bring its juvenile justice system fully into line with international standards, including the United Nations Standard Minimum Rules for the Administration of Juvenile Justice (the Beijing Rules), including by:

(a) Increasing the use of alternative measures to conviction and imprisonment for juveniles, and ensuring that imprisonment is used only as a measure of last resort for the shortest appropriate period of time, in accordance with the United
Nations Rules for the Protection of Juveniles Deprived of their Liberty (the Havana Rules);

(b) Providing educational and rehabilitative programmes specially designed for juveniles;

(c) Ensuring a separate detention of juveniles from adults in all places of detention.

Violence against women and domestic violence

32. While noting the improvement in State party’s legal framework on domestic violence, the Committee is concerned at reports that violence against women remains widely prevalent and underreported. It is also concerned at reports of inadequate protection measures and insufficient assistance for victims. The Committee regrets the lack of data, disaggregated by the age and ethnicity of victims, on cases of violence against women (arts. 2, 12-14 and 16).

33. The State party should enhance its efforts to combat violence against women and domestic violence, inter alia, by ensuring that:

(a) All incidents of violence against women are registered and promptly, effectively and impartially investigated and that those accused are prosecuted and, if found guilty, are punished in accordance with the gravity of their acts;

(b) Victims of domestic violence benefit from urgent and effective protection measures and have prompt access to sufficient and adequately funded shelters, medical and legal aid, psychosocial counselling and social support schemes;

(c) Relevant authorities compile data, disaggregated by age and ethnicity, on all forms of violence against women in order to facilitate risk assessments, improve protection and evaluate the situation and the impact of measures taken.

Trafficking in persons

34. While noting the introduction of a separate criminal offence of human trafficking into criminal codes of all entities during the reporting period, the Committee remains concerned that the State party convicted only two perpetrators in 2016 and none in 2014 and 2015. It is also concerned at reports that only after law enforcement initiates an investigation and a prosecutor provides an official victim status, can victims access assistance and support. It is further concerned at reports that referral mechanisms for victims are ineffective and that judges and law enforcement officials handling trafficking cases need more training (arts. 2, 12–14 and 16).

35. The State party should:

(a) Vigorously enforce the anti-trafficking legislation to combat human trafficking by promptly, thoroughly and impartially investigating all allegations of trafficking, prosecuting those accused and, if found guilty, punishing with penalties proportionate to the gravity of their acts;

(b) Ensure that victims’ access to all forms of redress, including compensation, shelters and counselling services, is not dependent on the conclusion of a criminal proceeding, and should allocate sufficient funding for assistance and rehabilitation services for victims of trafficking;

(c) Improve victim referral mechanisms between service providers and relevant authorities;

(d) Effectively implement the 2016-2019 National Anti-Trafficking Action Plan and undertake an impact assessment of the previous anti-trafficking action plan;

(e) Continue its efforts to provide specialized trainings to the judiciary and law enforcement officials on handling trafficking cases and protecting victims.
Violence against lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and intersex persons

36. The Committee is concerned at reports that lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and intersex persons and advocates for these groups continue to be attacked, threatened and intimidated and that none of those cases reported to the police and prosecutor’s office has been tried before courts since 2015. The Committee also regrets the lack of data systematically compiled on hate crimes on account of sexual orientation and gender identity (arts. 2, 12, 13 and 16).

37. The Committee calls on the State party to publicly condemn threats and attacks on lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and intersex persons and advocates and to effectively protect these groups from threats and attacks on account of their gender identities, sexual orientation and activities. To this end, the State party should:

(a) Promptly, thoroughly and impartially investigate all threats and attacks targeting these groups and prosecute perpetrators and, if found guilty, punish in accordance with the gravity of their acts;

(b) Provide trainings to law enforcement officials and the judiciary on hate crimes, particularly on the basis of sexual orientation and gender identity, and undertake systematic monitoring of such crimes;

(c) Compile statistical data, disaggregated by age, sex and ethnicity of victims, on complaints, investigations, prosecutions and convictions in cases of hate crimes against lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and intersex persons, raise awareness to counter prejudice and stereotypes, and adopt relevant policies to combat and prevent hate crimes.

Training

38. While welcoming the State party’s introduction of professional training for prison staff, the Committee regrets that training on the provisions of the Convention is not provided on a regular and mandatory basis to all public officials involved in the treatment of persons deprived of their liberty. It is also concerned at the absence of training on documenting and reporting injuries and other health consequences resulting from torture and ill-treatment, based on the Manual on the Effective Investigation and Documentation of Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (the Istanbul Protocol) (art. 10).

39. The State party should take steps to:

(a) Make training on the provisions of the Convention, the absolute prohibition of torture and non-coercive interrogation methods mandatory for all law enforcement personnel and other public officials who come into contact with persons deprived of their liberty, migrants and asylum seekers;

(b) Ensure that the Istanbul Protocol is made an essential part of the training of all medical professionals and other public officials involved in work with persons deprived of their liberty;

(c) Develop and implement specific methodologies to assess the effectiveness and impact of the training on preventing torture and ill-treatment, particularly on the Convention.

Follow-up procedure

40. The Committee requests the State party to provide, by 6 December 2018, information on follow-up to the Committee’s recommendations contained in paragraphs 13, 19 and 21(b). In that context, the State party is invited to inform the Committee about its plans for implementing, within the coming reporting period, some or all of the remaining recommendations in the concluding observations.
Other issues

41. The State party is requested to disseminate widely the report submitted to the Committee and the present concluding observations, in appropriate languages, through official websites, the media and non-governmental organizations.

42. The State party is invited to submit its next report, which will be its seventh periodic report, by 6 December 2021. For that purpose, the Committee will, in due course, transmit to the State party a list of issues prior to reporting, considering that the State party has accepted to report to the Committee under the optional reporting procedure.