



TURKMENISTAN:

SUBMISSION TO THE UNITED NATIONS COMMITTEE AGAINST TORTURE (CAT)

For the CAT's review of Turkmenistan's implementation of the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment at its 59th session in Geneva on 7 November-7 December 2016 This document has been prepared as a submission to the United Nations Committee against Torture (CAT) for its review of the second period report submitted by Turkmenistan under the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment. The review will take place at the CAT's 59th session in Geneva on 7 November-7 December 2016.

The submission has been jointly prepared by Turkmen Initiative for Human Rights (TIHR) and International Partnership for Human Rights (IPHR). It does not constitute a comprehensive review of Turkmenistan's implementation of the provisions of the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (hereafter the Convention against Torture), but focuses on a number of key issues of concern to TIHR and IPHR. Particular emphasis is placed on follow-up on concerns and recommendations included in the concluding observations adopted by the CAT following its review of Turkmenistan in May 2011.

The submission is based on information obtained by TIHR through its monitoring of developments in Turkmenistan with the help of an in-country network of activists, as well as analyses of national legal instruments and other relevant information about the situation in the country that is accessible in spite of the serious restrictions imposed by Turkmenistani authorities in this respect.

Turkmen Initiative for Human Rights (TIHR) is the successor organisation of the Helsinki Group of Turkmenistan and was registered as an independent association in Vienna in November 2004. Through a network of local experts and activists inside Turkmenistan, TIHR monitors and reports on the human rights situation in this country. It also disseminates independent news, comments and analysis from and about Turkmenistan.

Turkmen Initiative for Human Rights Vienna, Austria Tel.: +43-699-1 944 13 27

Email: turkmen.initiative@gmail.com Website: http://www.chrono-tm.org

International Partnership for Human Rights (IPHR) is an independent, non-governmental organization founded in 2008. Based in Brussels, IPHR works closely together with civil society groups from different countries to raise human rights concerns at the international level and promote respect for the rights of vulnerable communities in repressive environments. IPHR has special consultative status with the UN Economic and Social Council.

International Partnership for Human Rights Brussels, Belgium

Tel.: +32 (0) 2 880 03 99 Email: IPHR@IPHRonline.org

Website: http://www.IPHRonline.org

Contents

1.	Brief overview of the human rights situation	1
2.	National human rights institution	1
3.	Enforcement of the ban on torture and ill-treatment	2
4.	Monitoring of places of detention	3
5.	Independence of the judiciary, the right to a fair trial and the prohibition of enforced	
disa	appearances	5
6.	The right of civil society representatives to freedom from persecution	7
7.	Prohibition of forced evictions	9

1. Brief overview of the human rights situation

- 1.1. Five years after the CAT reviewed the first periodic report submitted by Turkmenistan under the Convention against Torture, Turkmenistan **remains one of the most closed countries in the world**, where fundamental rights and freedoms are systematically violated.
- 1.2. For the stated purpose of improving compliance with international human rights standards, the Turkmenistani authorities recently adopted a first-ever National Human Rights Action Plan, which sets out tasks to be implemented by different-level authorities, public organizations and state media in the 2016-2020 period. The authorities have also carried out a constitutional reform, resulting in the adoption of a new Constitution in September 2016 and brought into effect a series of new legislation. However, while these steps have resulted in certain improvements at the regulatory level, they have **not resulted in any significant improvements in practice**.
- 1.3. As previously, the constitutional principle of separation of powers is not enforced in Turkmenistan, and the presidential administration controls all branches of power. The new Constitution will enable current President Gurbanguly Berdymukhamedov to remain in office for life and the personality cult surrounding him is increasingly promoted. There are no opposition political parties and independent human rights NGOs cannot operate openly in the country. Media is tightly controlled by the government and access to foreign sources of information is restricted. Journalists working with foreign media, civil society activists and others who publicly criticize the government, as well as their family members face a serious risk of persecution, including arrest and imprisonment following unfair trials. There is currently no independent oversight of detention facilities and prisons, and independent international human rights monitors have continued to be denied access to the country. Although torture has been criminalized, the authorities have failed to take effective measures to combat torture and ill-treatment in practice, as well as to disclose information about dozens of individuals who have disappeared in prison. It is also of serious concern that forced evictions have continued to be carried out without due legal safeguards.

2. National human rights institution

- 2.1. Following its previous review of Turkmenistan's implementation of the Convention against Torture, the CAT recommended the Turkmenistani State party to establish an independent national human rights institution, in accordance with the Paris Principles (par. 12 of the concluding observations¹).
- 2.2. The new Constitution adopted in Turkmenistan in September 2016² states that the country's parliament will elect a **Human Rights Commissioner** on the basis of the president's proposal (article 81, par. 8). In its comments on the draft Constitution³, the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR) noted that the introduction of a first-ever national human rights institution in Turkmenistan is an important first step toward addressing recommendations made by international human rights bodies in this respect (par. 115 of the ODIHR's comments). However, the ODIHR also pointed out that the draft Constitution did **not elaborate on the institutional status and competence assigned to the new entity** and did **not provide**

the required safeguards to guarantee its institutional independence in line with the Paris Principles (par. 116). It recommended that the Constitution be revised to specify the institution's role, functions, powers, funding and lines of accountability, as well as the appointment mechanism for, and terms of office of the Commissioner (par. 118). These recommendations were not addressed prior to the adoption of the Constitution.

Recommendations

- 2.3. The Turkmenistani authorities should be requested to:
 - Regulate in detail the status and competence of the new Human Rights Commissioner institution and guarantee its independence in line with the Paris Principles.

3. Enforcement of the ban on torture and ill-treatment

- 3.1. In its 2011 concluding observations on Turkmenistan, the CAT expressed concern that the country's Constitution appears to allow for suspending the absolute ban on torture during a state of emergency or martial law (par. 8-9).
- 3.2. Turkmenistan's **new Constitution** adopted in September 2016 prohibits torture and ill-treatment (article 33). However, similarly to the previous Constitution, it also contains a provision (article 65) that allows for suspending the rights and freedoms of citizens "during a state of emergency or martial law in a manner and within the limits established by the Constitution and laws." In spite of the previous recommendation made by the CAT, as well as a recommendation made by the ODIHR when reviewing the draft Constitution (par. 144 of the ODIHR's comments on the draft Constitution), this provision **does not spell out that non-derogable rights such as the prohibition on torture and ill-treatment may not be suspended** under any circumstances.
- 3.3. In its 2011 concluding observations on Turkmenistan, the CAT also criticized the lack in domestic law of the crime of torture as defined in article 1 of the Convention (par. 8) and said that it was "deeply concerned that allegations of torture and ill-treatment by State officers are seldom investigated and prosecuted, and that there appears to be a climate of impunity (...)" (par. 11).
- 3.4. In August 2012, Turkmenistan's Criminal Code was amended to incorporate an article criminalizing "torture" (article 182-1).⁴ This article provides for a definition of torture on the basis of article 1 of the Convention, which had previously been lacking. It establishes penalties of three to eight years in prison for the use of torture, and of up to 15 years in prison in aggravated circumstances. The adoption of this amendment was a welcome development. However, we are seriously concerned about the apparent failure of the Turkmenistani authorities to apply this new article and ensure that cases of torture are duly investigated and prosecuted under it. In its report to the CAT⁵, the Turkmenistani State party claims that it has taken "effective measures for the prevention of acts of torture and cruel treatment throughout the national territory" (par. 24) but it also states that no cases involving torture offences have been examined by the courts since the

adoption of the new Criminal Code provision (par. 25). In view of persistent allegations of the widespread use of torture in Turkmenistan, this statement raises serious questions about the commitment of the Turkmenistani authorities to undertake prompt, thorough and impartial investigations into allegations of torture or ill-treatment and ensure that the new Criminal Code provision also results in progress on the fight against torture in practice.

Recommendations

- 3.5. The Turkmenistani authorities should be requested to:
 - As previously called for by the CAT, ensure that the absolute prohibition against torture is nonderogable under national law.
 - Ensure that the new Criminal Code provision on torture is applied in practice and, in accordance with the previous recommendations of the CAT, establish an independent and effective mechanism to undertake prompt, thorough and impartial investigations into allegations of torture or ill-treatment by police and other public officials and to punish offenders.

4. Monitoring of places of detention

- 4.1. In its concluding observations on Turkmenistan adopted in 2011, the CAT called on the Turkmenistani State party to establish a national system for independent, effective and regular monitoring of all places of detention without prior notice. The Committee also called on the State party to grant independent governmental and non-government organizations, in particular the International Committee of the Red Cross (ICRC) access to all detention facilities in the country (par. 14).
- 4.2. Among the tasks set out in Turkmenistan's National Human Rights Action Plan for 2016-2020 is to "continue the dialogue with relevant authorities in order to establish a system of independent, effective and regular monitoring and inspection of all detention facilities without prior notice" and to "carry out monitoring of detention facilities and publish the results of conducted investigations" (section 2, par. 19 and 20).
- 4.3. Currently there is **no** independent and effective national mechanism for monitoring detention facilities in Turkmenistan. In its report to the CAT, the Turkmenistani State party states that monitoring commissions have been established under a 2010 presidential decree to supervise the compliance with relevant legislation in penitentiary facilities, as well as respect of the rights of prisoners (par. 127). According to the information provided, these commissions are made up of representatives of law enforcement bodies, the parliament, the Democratic Party of Turkmenistan, the Turkmenistan Trade Union, the Women's Union of Turkmenistan, and the Magtymguly Youth Organization (par. 129). While we have no further information about the activities of these commissions, it is clear that they do not constitute independent bodies given that they are made up of representatives of the authorities, the presidential party and state-controlled public associations. There are also serious doubts that they can carry out their mandate in any effective way in the current climate where anyone who criticizes government policies, including officials risk persecution.

- 4.4. The Turkmenistani government has **not ratified the Optional Protocol to the Convention against Torture** and proceeded to establish an independent national preventive mechanism under this protocol, in spite of the CAT's 2011 recommendation to this end (par. 12) and the commitment made by the Turkmenistani government in connection with the Universal Periodic Review (UPR) of Turkmenistan in 2013.⁶
- 4.5. In its report to the CAT, the Turkmenistani State party notes that it has organized a number of visits for ICRC representatives to prison facilities (par. 132-134). However, to our knowledge and as described by the State party, these visits have only been aimed at familiarizing ICRC delegates with selected detention facilities and sites without any opportunities for proper monitoring. The ICRC has yet to be granted unhindered access to the country's detention facilities, which would enable it to conduct thorough monitoring in correspondence with its basic conditions, including through private discussions with detainees of its choice and repeat visits as often as deemed necessary.
- 4.6. At a press conference held during a Berlin visit by Turkmenistan's President Berdymukhamedov in August 2016, German Chancellor Angela Merkel stated that the two parties had discussed opportunities for foreign diplomats to visit prisons in Turkmenistan.⁷ Such visits would be most welcome and important but they cannot replace monitoring by international monitoring bodies such as the ICRC through unhindered access to detention facilities.
- 4.7. In its 2011 concluding observations, the CAT also called on the State party to allow visits by UN special procedures that have requested to visit the country, in particular the Special Rapporteur on torture and the Working Group on Arbitrary Detention, in conformity with the terms of reference for fact-finding missions by special rapporteurs and representatives (par. 14).
- 4.8. Turkmenistan's National Human Rights Action Plan for 2016-2020 sets out that **invitations for UN special rapporteurs will be initiated** (section 2, par. 6). The implementation period for this task is 2016-2017. To date, the UN Special Rapporteur on the right to religion or belief is the only special procedure mandate holder to have visited Turkmenistan in 2008. As of the end of 2015, **thirteen requests to visit the country by special mechanisms were pending.**⁸ Many of the initial requests of these mechanisms have been pending for ten years and more, including those of the the Special Rapporteur on torture and the Working Group on Arbitrary Detention.

Recommendations

- 4.9. The Turkmenistani authorities should be requested to implement the recommendations made by the CAT on these issues following its 2011 review of Turkmenistan, including by:
 - Establishing a national system for independent, effective and regular monitoring of all places of detention without prior notice.
 - Granting the ICRC unhindered access to the country's detention facilities and enabling it to carry out monitoring in accordance with its standard procedures.

• Facilitating visits to the country by all UN special mechanisms that have requested to visit Turkmenistan, including the Special Rapporteur on torture and the Working Group on Arbitrary Detention, in conformity with their terms of reference.

5. Independence of the judiciary, the right to a fair trial and the prohibition of enforced disappearances

- 5.1. Following its 2011 review of Turkmenistan's compliance with the Convention against Torture, the CAT expressed concern about the independence and functioning of the country's judiciary, including the fact that responsibility for the appointment and promotion of judges rests with the president (par. 10). The Committee was also alarmed that a number of persons have been arrested and sentenced at closed trials without proper defence and imprisoned incommunicado and that the State party has failed to provide information about progress made in ascertaining their fate and whereabouts (par. 15).
- 5.2. Turkmenistan's new Constitution states that judges "are independent" and that "interference with the work of judges, by whichever side, shall be unacceptable and punishable by law" (article 98). However, at the same time, the Constitution provides that judges are "appointed and dismissed by the president", in spite of the concerns voiced by the CAT and other international human rights bodies about this arrangement. When commenting on the draft Constitution, the ODIHR also recommended that it be revised to specify the selection criteria for judges or set out broader principles regulating the appointment procedure, stressing that this would be essential in order to guarantee the independence and impartiality of judges and the judiciary (par. 94 of the ODIHR's comments on the draft Constitution). However, this recommendation was not implemented.
- 5.3. As previously, **Turkmenistan's justice system lacks independence and transparency** and is **open to politically motivated abuse** whereby individuals deemed inconvenient to the authorities are tried and convicted in closed, unfair trials. One recent example is that of freelance journalist **Saparmamed Nepeskuliev**, who was sentenced to three years in prison last year:
 - Saparmamed Nepeskuliev went missing in the city of Avaza in July 2015 in a connection with a trip he undertook for his journalist work. Only several weeks later did his family find out that he was being held incommunicado by law enforcement authorities on spurious narcotics possession charges. At the end of August 2015, Nepeskuliev was sentenced to three years in prison in a closed trial at a Turkmenbashi court that his family learned about only afterwards. International human rights organizations have expressed serious concerns about the health and safety of Nepeskuliev in the absence of information about him following his imprisonment. When asked about this case at an OSCE meeting in September 2015, a representative of the Turkmenistani government insisted that Nepeskuliev is not a journalist and declined to provide any additional information. In an opinion adopted at its November-December 2015 session, the UN Working Group on Arbitrary Detention concluded that Nepeskuliev has been arbitrarily detained in contravention of articles 9, 14 and 19 of the ICCPR and called on the Turkmenistani State party to release him and grant him compensation.

- 5.4. As previously, the Turkmenistani authorities have failed to provide information about dozens of individuals imprisoned following secret, unfair trials who have disappeared in prison. Family members have often not received any information about these prisoners for years and do not know whether they are still alive. In a 2016 report, the International Prove They are Alive campaign an NGO initiative that focuses on addressing the issue of disappearances in Turkmenistan listed close to 90 individuals who have disappeared in national prisons.¹⁴
- 5.5. In its 2011 concluding observations, the CAT mentioned in particular the lack of information about those convicted after the alleged 2002 assassination attempt on late President Saparmurat Niyazov, including Boris Shikhmuradov and Batyr Berdyev, as well as the cases of Gulgeldy Annaniazov and Ovezgeldy Ataev (par. 15).
- 5.6. The fate of Boris Shikhmuradov, Batyr Berdyev and others imprisoned after the alleged assassination attempt on the former president remains unknown. In a decision issued in October 2014 in response to an individual complaint submitted on the case of Boris Shikhmuradov, 15 the UN Human Rights Committee found that his rights to life, freedom from torture, liberty and security and a fair trial had been violated under the ICCPR. It also found a violation of the right of his wife, Tatiana Shikhmuradova not to be subjected to torture and ill-treatment in view of the anguish and distress caused by the incommunicado detention and disappearance of her husband. The Human Rights Committee requested the Turkmenistani authorities to release Shikhmuradov if he is still being detained or hand over his remains in the event that he has died, as well as to prosecute and punish those responsible for the violations committed. This has not happened.
- 5.7. There has also been no reliable information from the side of the authorities about the fate of opponent Gulgeldy Annaniazov¹⁶, who was sentenced to 11 years in prison on charges of illegally crossing the border when returning to Turkmenistan from exile in 2008. The UN Working Group on Arbitrary Detention has declared his detention unlawful and called for his release.¹⁷
- 5.8. During the UN Human Rights Committee's review of Turkmenistan in March 2012, the head of the Turkmenistani government delegation stated that former Turkmen Parliament Speaker Ovezgeldy Ataev and his wife both of whom were imprisoned in 2007 had been released. He did not specify when this had happened or what were the circumstances of the releases.

Recommendations

- 5.9. The Turkmenistani authorities should be requested to:
 - As called for by the CAT in its 2011 concluding observations, establish and ensure the independence and impartiality of the judiciary in the performance of duties in conformity with international standards, notably the Basic Principles on the Independence of the Judiciary.
 - Ensure that the justice system is not abused to hand down politically motivated sentences in trials held in violation of international due process and fair trial standards.
 - Put an end to incommunicado detention and enforced disappearances; provide information about all those who have disappeared in prison and release them or hand over their remains to relatives in the

- event that they have died; and prosecute and punish those responsible for human rights violations perpetrated against victims of disappearances.
- Comply with the decisions of UN human rights bodies issued in the individual cases mentioned above.

6. The right of civil society representatives to freedom from persecution

- 6.1. In its 2011 concluding observations, the CAT noted with concern "numerous and consistent allegations of serious acts of intimidation, reprisals and threats against human rights defenders, journalists and their relatives, as well as the lack of information provided on any investigations into such allegations" (par 13). The Committee highlighted in particular its concerns about threats against TIHR Chair Farid Tuhbatullin and attacks against the website of his organization, while noting an oral assurance given by the Turkmenistani State party's representative that he will not be intimidated or threatened by the Turkmenistani government or its agents.
- 6.2. The civil society environment in Turkmenistan remains highly repressive. The few local journalists who contribute to foreign media, in particular the Prague-based Turkmenistani service of Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty (Radio *Azatlyk*), civil society activists and others who challenge government policies are highly vulnerable to persecution, including surveillance, intimidation, arbitrary restrictions on travel abroad and arrest and imprisonment on trumped-up charges. Critical voices who have fled Turkmenistan and now live in exile, as well as their family members back in Turkmenistan have been subjected to growing pressure.
- 6.3. TIHR's Austria-based Chair **Farid Tuhbatullin** has recently faced renewed intimidation in connection with TIHR's independent and critical reporting on human rights developments in Turkmenistan. In late 2015, he learned about serious threats against his person. TIHR's website, chrono-tm.org has repeatedly been the target of attacks that the organization suspects have been orchestrated by Turkmenistani security services. A December 2012 attack brought TIHR's website offline for a month. In connection with this attack, material insulting and intimidating Farid Tubhatullin and his family members were also posted on the site. The attack took place shortly after TIHR published a story about two students who died after contradicting pneumonia when they were forced to participate in prolonged rehearsals for official holiday celebrations, dressed in light clothes despite chilly weather.
- 6.4. These are a number of other recent cases that illustrate the pattern of persecution against journalists, civil society activists and government critics both in- and outside the country:
 - Saparmamed Nepeskuliev, a freelance journalist who has been working with Radio *Azatlyk* and the Netherlands-based Alternative Turkmenistan News and who has written on issues such as corruption, problems in the health care system and water shortages, was sentenced to three years in prison in August 2015 on spurious narcotics possession charges. There are serious concerns about his health and safety given the lack of information about him. (For more details, see the section on the

independence of the judiciary, the right to a fair trial and the prohibition of enforced disappearances above).

- Former independent journalist **Chary Annamuradov**, who obtained refugee status after fleeing Turkmenistan sixteen years ago and now lives in Sweden, was arrested in Minsk (Belarus) in mid-July 2016 at the request of Turkmenistani authorities. Thanks to international interventions on his behalf, he was released in mid-September and able to return to Sweden, thus avoiding extradition to Turkmenistan where he would have been at great danger. In October 2016, Human Rights Watch learned that Chary Annamuradov's brother, **Altymurad Annamuradov** had died on 4 September 2016, four days after being kidnapped from his home in Turkmenistan by unknown men. Before he died, he was deposited in a weak state near his home. He told his relatives that he had been questioned about his brother and brutally beaten and humiliated by his kidnappers.¹⁹
- Former Turkmen political prisoner **Akmuhammet Baihanov**, who resides in Russia, was reportedly attacked by unidentified individuals in a city close to Moscow on 18 August 2016. Baihanov noted that the perpetrators, who ran off after he managed to use pepper spray against them, were speaking in Russian and Turkmen. He believed that this was an attempt to abduct him and bring him back to Turkmenistan. In July 2016, Baihanov published a book about his time in the notorious Turkmenistani high-security prison Ovadan Depe, where many political prisoners are believed to have been held.²⁰
- Geldy Kyarizov, an internationally acclaimed horse-breeding expert who fell out of favour with the Turkmenistani government over a decade ago, was imprisoned on charges considered to be politically motivated in 2002-2007 after being accused of having links to the exiled opposition. He has witnessed about the harsh treatment to which he and other prisoners were subjected at the high-security prison *Ovadan Depe*, including by being deprived all contacts with the outside world, basically being starved (resulting in that he lost some 40 kilograms in five months) and being denied adequate medical assistance.²¹ Following his release, he continued to be subjected to pressure and was prohibited from travelling abroad until he finally was allowed to leave the country in September 2015, in what appeared to be the result of international pressure. However, even abroad, he has been subjected to intimidation.²²
- In June 2015, **Osmankuly Hallyev**, a Radio *Azatlyk* correspondent, resigned from his job, citing an unprecedented campaign of intimidation. Hallyev said that he had been interrogated by antiterrorism officials, pressed to disclose his sources, publicly denounced, and threatened with criminal charges of harming the country's reputation if he did not renounce his cooperation with the RFE/RL.²³
- Former government minister **Geldimurat Nurmuhammedov** was arrested and forcibly held in a drug treatment clinic in October 2012-July 2013. This happened after he openly criticized the political situation in the country and sought to register an initiative group to nominate candidates for the December 2013 parliamentary elections.²⁴
- Radio Azatlyk journalist Rovshen Yazmuhamedov was detained without explanation for two weeks in May 2013 after publishing several articles that generated active discussion on the service's website.²⁵

Recommendations

- 6.5. The Turkmenistani authorities should be requested to:
 - Put an end to the persecution of independent journalists, civil society activists and other critical voices, including those who live in exile and their family members who are still in Turkmenistan.
 - Carry out prompt, impartial and thorough investigations into all cases of persecution, including the cases described above and hold the perpetrators accountable.

7. Prohibition of forced evictions

- 7.1. It is of serious concern that the Turkmenistani authorities have carried out forced evictions of residents without granting those affected adequate advance notice and opportunities to legally challenge such decisions prior to their execution and without promptly providing them with adequate alternative accommodation or compensation.
- 7.2. TIHR has learned about an increasing number of evictions that appear to be related to construction projects implemented ahead of the Asian Indoor Games a major international sports event to be held in the capital Ashgabat in September 2017. Starting in spring 2015, authorities carried out mass evictions and demolitions of cottages claimed to have been illegally constructed in holiday villages close to Ashgabat, such as the Shoganly and Chor villages without due advance notice or process. These measures have also affected people residing in the cottages on an ongoing basis, including those who have re-settled there after selling incity housing, as well as families who have come to the capital in search of jobs.
- 7.3. House demolitions and forced evictions have similarly been carried out in residential districts in the capital. For example, in November 2015, the inhabitants of several apartment buildings located in the Bagtiyarlyk district were given only a few days' notice to pack up their belongings and leave before these houses were demolished. One resident with whom TIHR's monitors spoke said that some of those evicted had been told to "stay with relatives" or "rent housing" until they could be provided alternative accommodation.²⁶
- 7.4. According to TIHR's information, evicted residents are often promised alternative accommodation only in a few years' time. This has resulted in that evicted families in some cases have been forced to stay in makeshift facilities for extended periods of time. For example, in mid-2014, TIHR reported about over 300 families living in barracks in deplorable conditions at the outskirts of Ashgabat after their houses were demolished.²⁷

Recommendations:

7.5. The Turkmenistani authorities should be requested to:

- Carry out any evictions in full accordance with due process requirements and promptly grant those affected appropriate, alternative accommodation or other adequate compensation.
- Provide detailed information about measures taken to safeguard the rights of individuals and families who have been forcibly evicted during the preparations for the 2017 Asian Indoor Games to be held in Ashgabat.

- ¹ Concluding observations of the CAT on Turkmenistan (CAT/C/TKM/CO/1), June 2011, available at: http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CAT%2fC%2fTKM%2fCO%2f1&Lang=en
- ² The new Constitution (in Russian) is available at: http://infoabad.com/zakonodatelstvo-turkmenistana/konstitucija-turkmenistana-novaja-redakcija.html
- ODIHR Comments on the Draft Constitution of Turkmenistan, July 2016, at http://www.osce.org/odihr/262476?download=true
- ⁴ Law adopted on 11 August 2012, available (in Russian) at: http://infoabad.com/zakonodatelstvo-turkmenistana/v-ugolovnyi-kodeks-turkmenistana-vnesena-novaja-statja-pytka.html
- ⁵ The report by the Turkmenistani State party, received by the CAT in July 2015, is available at: http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CAT%2fC%2fTKM%2f2&Lang=en
- ⁶ See UPR recommendations accepted by Turkmenistan (among others recommendation 113.2), http://www.upr-info.org/IMG/pdf/recommendations_and_pledges_turkmenistan_2013.pdf
- ⁷ See write-up (in German) of press conference held by Merkel and Berdymukhamedov on 29 August 2016, at https://www.bundesregierung.de/Content/DE/Mitschrift/Pressekonferenzen/2016/08/2016-08-29-pk-merkel-berdimuhamedow.html
- ⁸ Update on country visits by Special Procedures as of 30 December 2015, http://www.ohchr.org/EN/HRBodies/SP/Pages/CountryvisitsN-Z.aspx
- 9 See Fergana News, "В Туркменистане арестован нештатный корреспондент Радио Свобода", 29 July 2015, http://www.fergananews.com/news/23693
- ¹⁰ See RFE/RL, "Concerns Raised Over Fate Of RFE/RL Correspondent In Turkmenistan", 8 September 2015, http://www.rferl.org/content/turkmenistan-rferl-correspondent-rsf-concern/27233417.html
- ¹¹ Joint Letter on the Detention of Saparmamed Nepeskuliev, 30 June 2016, https://www.hrw.org/news/2016/07/05/joint-letter-detention-saparmamed-nepeskuliev
- 12 TIHR, "Хаджиев отрицает снос спутниковых антенн и призывает правозащитников выбирать выражения, говоря о Бердымухамедове", 22 September 2015, http://www.chrono-tm.org/2015/09/hadzhiev-otritsaet-snos-sputnikovyih-antenn-i-prizyivaet-pravozashhitnikov-vyibirat-vyirazheniya-govorya-o-berdyimuhamedove/
- 13 Opinion No. 40/2015 concerning Saparmamed Nepeskuliev adopted by the Working Group on Arbitrary Detention at its seventy-fourth session, 30 November–4 December 2015.
- 14 The report is available at: http://provetheyarealive.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/08/Disappeared-Report-2016.pdf
- 15 Human Rights Committee Communication No. 2069/2011,
- $http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CCPR/C/112/D/2069/2011\&Lang=ender.ohchr.org/_layouts/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CCPR/C/112/D/2069/2011\&Lang=ender.ohchr.org/_layouts/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CCPR/C/112/D/2069/2011\&Lang=ender.ohchr.org/_layouts/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CCPR/C/112/D/2069/2011\&Lang=ender.ohchr.org/_layouts/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CCPR/C/112/D/2069/2011\&Lang=ender.ohchr.org/_layouts/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CCPR/C/112/D/2069/2011\&Lang=ender.ohch$
- 16 See case update at https://provetheyarealive.org/the-disappeared/8-annaniyazov-gulgeldy/
- 17 See Freedom Now, "United Nations Declares Continued Detention of Gulgeldy Annaniyazov Arbitrary; Calls for Release," December 2013, at http://www.freedom-now.org/news/united-nations-declares-continued-detention-of-gulgeldy-annaniyazov-arbitrary-calls-for-release/
- ¹⁸ TIHR, "Ovezgeldy Ataev released from imprisonment," 20 March 2012, http://www.chrono-tm.org/en/2012/03/ovezgeldy-ataev-released-from-imprisonment/
- ¹⁹ Human Rights Watch, "Turkmenistan: Dissident's Brother Dies After Beating," 17 October 2016, https://www.hrw.org/news/2016/10/17/turkmenistan-dissidents-brother-dies-after-beating
- ²⁰ Prove They Are Alive, "Turkmen Dissident Attacked in Moscow," 24 August 2016, http://provetheyarealive.org/turkmen-dissident-attacked-in-moscow
- ²¹ ТІНR, "Пять месяцев в секретной тюрьме Овадан-депе. Из воспоминаний Гельды Кяризова," 22 January 2016, http://www.chrono-tm.org/2016/01/pyat-mesyatsev-v-sekretnoy-tyurme-ovadan-depe-iz-vospominaniy-geldyi-kyarizova/. For information in English, see RFE/RL, "Torture By Hunger': Horse Breeder Describes Desperate Days In Turkmen Prison," 5 December 2015, at http://www.rferl.org/a/turkmenistan-tortured-by-hunger-prison-kyarizov/27408793.html
- **22** TIHR, "Гельды Кяризову и его семье угрожают неизвестные", 5 October 2015, http://www.chrono-tm.org/2015/10/geldyi-kyarizovu-i-ego-seme-ugrozhayut-neizvestnyie/
- ²³ See RFE/RL, "RFE/RL Turkmen Journalist Quits, Citing Mounting Official Pressure", 8 June 2015, http://www.rferl.org/content/journalists-in-trouble-turkmen-journalist-harassed/27060935.html
- ²⁴ TIHR, "Geldymurat Nurmukhamedov released from imprisonment," 19 July 2013, at http://www.chrono-tm.org/en/2013/07/geldymurat-nurmukhamedov-released-from-imprisonment/
- ²⁵ "RFE/RL Correspondent Detained In Turkmenistan", 22 March 2014, at http://www.rferl.org/content/turkmenistan-rferl-correspondent-detained/24981293.html; and "Detained RFE/RL Turkmen Correspondent Released", 22 May 2014, at http://www.rferl.org/content/rferl-turkmen-correspondent/24993898.html
- ²⁶ For more information, see TIHR news bulletin, 4 November 2015, at http://www.chrono-tm.org/en/2015/11/looters-plunder-property-of-the-inhabitants-of-demolished-houses/
- ²⁷ TIHR, "Powerful and happy", but homeless Turkmen", 15 May 2014, at http://www.chrono-tm.org/en/2014/05/powerful-and-happy-but-homeless-turkmen/